U.S. District Court District of Idaho (LIVE Database) Version 6.2.2 (Boise – Southern) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:12-cv-00030-BLW

Smith v. Reinke et al

Assigned to: Judge B. Lynn Winmill

Referred to: Judge Dee V Benson (Settlement) Cause: 42:12101 Americans with Disabilities Act Date Filed: 01/23/2012 Date Terminated: 01/29/2015 Jury Demand: Defendant Nature of Suit: 446 Civil Rights: Americans with Disabilities – Other Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Randolph O. Smith

ASL INTERPRETER, Debbie Arment, debbiearment@gmail.com, 208–630–3200 and Brenna Andrew, bandrew7@gmail.com, 208–934–8564, Elizabeth Morgan, dandhalliance@gmail.com, 509–769–9328

represented by Randolph O. Smith

INTERPRETER

Debbie Arment, Brenna Andrew, Elizabeth

Morgan

Email: debbiearment@gmail.com

PRO SE

Amy Cunningham

Disability Rights Idaho 1246 Yellowstone Avenue, Ste. A3 Pocatello, ID 83201 (208) 232–0922x3 Fax: (208) 232–0938

Email: amy@disabilityrightsidaho.org

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Courtney Rose Holthus

DisAbility Rights Idaho 4477 Emerald Street, Ste. B–100 Boise, ID 83706 208–336–5353x19 Email: courtney@disabilityrightsidaho.org ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

J Carl Mickelsen

DisAbility Rights Idaho 200 South Almon St., Suite 101 Moscow, ID 83843 (208) 882–0962 Fax: (208) 883–4241 Email: carl@disabilityrightsidaho.org TERMINATED: 05/17/2012 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mary Jo Butler

DisAbility Rights Idaho 4477 Emerald St #B–100 Boise, ID 83706 (208) 336–5353 Fax: (208) 336–5359 Email: maryio@disabilityrightsidaho.org TERMINATED: 02/04/2014 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Brent Reinke

Krista Lynn Howard

Office of Attorney General POB 83720 Boise, ID 83720–0010 (208) 332–3095

Èmail: krista.howard@ag.idaho.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leslie Marie Hayes

Idaho Attorney General's Office 954 W. Jefferson, 2nd Floor Boise, ID 83702 208–334–4538

Email: leslie.hayes@ag.idaho.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark Alan Kubinski

IDAHO DEPT OF CORRECTION

1299 N Orchard #110 Boise, ID 83706 (208) 658–2117 Fax: (208) 327–7485

Email: mkubinsk@idoc.idaho.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

William Michael Loomis

OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL 1299 N Orchard Ste 10 Boise, ID 83706

(208) 658–2097

Fax: 1-208-327-7485

Email: wloomis@idoc.idaho.gov TERMINATED: 09/18/2014 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Johanna Smith

represented by Krista Lynn Howard

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leslie Marie Haves

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark Alan Kubinski

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

William Michael Loomis

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/18/2014
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
01/23/2012	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith (Filing fee \$ 350 receipt number 0976–839600.), filed by Randolph O. Smith. (Attachments: # 1 Cover Sheet Cover

		Sheet, # 2 Summons Reinke Summons, # 3 Summons Warden Smith Summons)(Mickelsen, J)
01/24/2012	2	Summons Issued as to Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith. (Print attached Summons for service.) (Attachments: # 1 Summons issued)(dks)
02/02/2012	<u>3</u>	SUMMONS Returned Executed by Randolph O. Smith. Brent Reinke served on 1/30/2012, answer due 2/21/2012; Johanna Smith served on 1/30/2012, answer due 2/21/2012. (Attachments: # 1 Affidavit Proof of Service)(Mickelsen, J)
02/13/2012	<u>4</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by William Michael Loomis on behalf of Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith (Loomis, William)
02/15/2012	<u>5</u>	NOTICE of Assignment to Magistrate Judge and Requirement for Consent sent to counsel for Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith, Randolph O. Smith re <u>1</u> Complaint, <u>4</u> Notice of Appearance. Consent/Objection to Magistrate due by 4/19/2012. (jm)
02/17/2012	<u>6</u>	ANSWER to 1 Complaint, Complaint by Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith.(Loomis, William)
03/12/2012	7	REQUEST FOR REASSIGNMENT TO DISTRICT JUDGE AND REASSIGNMENT OF CASE. Case reassigned to Judge B. Lynn Winmill for all further proceedings. Judge Candy W Dale no longer assigned to case. Please use this case number on all future pleadings, 1:12–cv–30–BLW(jm)
04/16/2012	8	Docket entry only – CONSENT to Magistrate Judge filed. (jm) (Entered: 04/17/2012)
05/16/2012	2	SCHEDULING ORDER. ADR Plan to be filed by 8/31/2012. Factual Discovery due by 12/28/2012. Dispositive Motions due by 6/28/2013. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (cjm) (Entered: 05/17/2012)
05/17/2012	<u>10</u>	NOTICE of Substitution – Attorney Mary Jo Butler, Courtney Rose Stottler for Randolph O. Smith added. Attorney J Carl Mickelsen terminated. (Mickelsen, J)
09/13/2012	11	DOCKET ENTRY ORDER – The parties have agreed to a settlement conference to be held in this matter on October 31, 2012. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT this matter shall be referred to The Honorable Larry M. Boyle, U.S. Magistrate Judge for the District of Idaho, for the purpose of conducting a Settlement Conference. Local Rule 16.4. The Settlement Conference shall be held in Courtroom #1 on the 6th Floor of the James A. McClure Federal Building and U.S. Courthouse in Boise, Idaho, and shall begin at 9:30 a.m. A separate Settlement Questionnaire will be forthcoming from Judge Boyle, as well as a separate Order of Transport. If the parties have questions, they may contact Brandon Karpen, Judge Boyle's Law Clerk at 334–9010. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (sbh)
09/13/2012		Set Hearings: Settlement Conference set for 10/31/2012 09:30 AM in Boise – Courtroom 1 before Judge Larry M. Boyle. Per Order dkt #11.(cjm)
09/13/2012	<u>12</u>	ORDER SETTING SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE re 11 Order. A settlement conference is set for 9:30 am (MDT), Wednesday, October 31, 2012, at the United States Courthouse in Boise, Idaho. Each party shall prepare and submit to the Court on or before Wednesday, October 24, 2012, at 5:00 p.m. (MDT), a candid summation of its assessment of the strengths of its case and the strengths of the opposing party's case Signed by Judge Larry M. Boyle. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (krb) (Entered: 09/14/2012)
09/25/2012	<u>13</u>	MOTION Appoint ASL Interpreter <i>Plaintiff's Motion to Appoint an ASL Interpreter</i> Courtney Rose Holthus appearing for Plaintiff Randolph O. Smith. Responses due by 10/19/2012 (Attachments: # 1 Memorandum in Support)(Holthus, Courtney)
09/26/2012	<u>14</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re 13 MOTION Appoint ASL Interpreter <i>Plaintiff's Motion to Appoint an ASL Interpreter Defendants' Notice of Non-Opposition</i> filed by Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith. Replies due by 10/15/2012.(Loomis, William)
09/28/2012	15	DOCKET ENTRY ORDER granting 13 Motion for Attendance of an ASL Interpreter. The Clerk's office shall arrange for attendance and payment of an ASL interpreter at the settlement conference. Signed by Judge Larry M. Boyle. (caused to be mailed to

		non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (bk)
10/12/2012	<u>16</u>	ORDER to Transport Prisoner. IDOC to take appropriate measures to transport Randolph Smith to Courtroom #1 in Boise on 10/31/2012 beginning at 9:00 a.m. for Settlement Conference at 9:30 a.m. (Notice sent to USMS) Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (cjm)
10/12/2012		CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Clerk of Court of emailing <u>16</u> Order to Transport Prisoner to dbromley@idoc.idaho.gov, vbates@idoc.idaho.gov, sthompso@idoc.idaho.gov (cjm)
10/31/2012	17	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Larry M. Boyle: Settlement Conference held on 10/31/2012: The parties and their counsel met and engaged in meaningful negotiations. No settlement was reached at this time and the parties agreed to recess the conference for two weeks. The Settlement Conference will be continued on November 15, 2012, at 1:30 pm. The order granting attendance and payment of the ALS interpreter 15 shall remain in effect. (Court Reporter/ESR bk.) (bk)THESE MINUTES SHALL STAND AS THE ORDER OF THE COURT
10/31/2012		Reset Hearings: re: 17 Minute Entry Settlement Conference set for 11/15/2012 01:30 PM in Boise – Courtroom 1 before Judge Larry M. Boyle. (krb)
11/05/2012	18	ORDER to Transport; IDOC to take appropriate measures to transport Randolph Smith to Courtrooom #1 on 11/15/12 for a second settlement conference set for 1:30 PM before The Honorable Larry M. Boyle. It will be necessary for the Idaho Department of Correction (IDOC) to transport inmate Randolph Smith on Thursday, November 15, 2012 at 1:00 p.m. (30 minutes ahead of the 1:30 p.m. conference start time)(Notice sent to USMS). Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (cc: dbromley@idoc.idaho.gov, vbates@idoc.idaho.gov, sthompson@idoc.idaho.gov; paper copy to USMS)(caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (ja)
11/15/2012	19	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Larry M. Boyle: On November 15, 2012, the Court reconvened the judicially supervised settlement conference. All counsel of record, Plaintiff, and a authorized representatives for Defendant, appeared, negotiated and participated in good faith. The parties committed to continued negotiations and will report to the should the case settle. (Court Reporter/ESR bk.) (bk)
11/20/2012	<u>20</u>	STIPULATION <i>Motion to Extend Discovery Deadlines</i> by Randolph O. Smith. (Holthus, Courtney)
12/26/2012	21	AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER Discovery due by 6/28/2013. Dispositive Motions due by 8/30/2013. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (jp)
04/25/2013	<u>22</u>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery Courtney Rose Holthus appearing for Plaintiff Randolph O. Smith. Responses due by 5/20/2013 (Holthus, Courtney)
04/29/2013	23	ORDER re: <u>22</u> Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery . Discovery due by 9/30/2013. Dispostive Motions due by 11/29/2013. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (cjm)
02/04/2014	<u>24</u>	NOTICE of Substitution – Attorney Amy Cunningham for Randolph O. Smith added. Attorney Mary Jo Butler terminated. (Holthus, Courtney)
02/19/2014	<u>25</u>	MOTION to Strike <u>6</u> Answer to Complaint <i>Defendants' Demand for Jury Trial</i> Courtney Rose Holthus appearing for Plaintiff Randolph O. Smith. Responses due by 3/17/2014 (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support Memorandum in Support of Motion to Strike Defendants' Demand for Jury Trial)(Holthus, Courtney)
02/20/2014	<u>26</u>	NOTICE OF HEARING: A Telephonic Status Conference is set for 3/5/2014 at 10:00 AM before Judge B. Lynn Winmill for the purpose of setting a trial date. Plaintiff is

		directed to initiate the conference call. The Court can be reached at 208–334–9145. (jlg)
02/24/2014	27	DOCKET ENTRY NOTICE OF VACATED HEARING – The Telephonic Status Conference scheduled for March 5, 2014 is VACATED. The Status Conference will be rescheduled after the Court's ruling regarding <u>25</u> Motion to Strike Defendants' Demand for Jury Trial. (jlg)
03/10/2014	28	DOCKET ENTRY ORDER – IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the Motion to Strike 25 shall be referred to The Honorable Robert J. Bryan, Senior United States District Judge for the Western District of Washington, sitting by special designation. The Motion will be submitted on the briefs without oral argument. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill (sbh).
03/11/2014	<u>29</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>25</u> MOTION to Strike <u>6</u> Answer to Complaint <i>Defendants' Demand for Jury Trial</i> filed by Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith. Replies due by 3/28/2014.(Loomis, William)
03/11/2014	<u>30</u>	MOTION Empanel advisory jury William Michael Loomis appearing for Defendants Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith. Responses due by 4/4/2014 (Attachments: # 1 Memorandum in Support)(Loomis, William)
03/12/2014	31	The Court hereby VACATES its March 11, 2014 order referring the pending motion to strike (Dkt. 25) to Judge Bryan. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (mls)
04/02/2014	<u>32</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition re <u>30</u> MOTION Empanel advisory jury filed by Randolph O. Smith. Replies due by 4/21/2014.(Holthus, Courtney)
04/14/2014	<u>33</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re 30 MOTION Empanel advisory jury filed by Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith.(Loomis, William)
04/14/2014	<u>34</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>30</u> MOTION Empanel advisory jury filed by Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith.(Loomis, William)
04/14/2014		CORRECTIVE ENTRY – The entry docket number <u>33</u> Reply to Response to Motion filed by Johanna Smith, Brent Reinke was filed incorrectly in this case. The filing party correctly filed at docket 34. (cjm)
05/27/2014	<u>35</u>	MEMORANDUM DECISION AND ORDER. Plaintiff's unopposed Motion to Strike Defendant's Demand for a Jury Trial <u>25</u> is GRANTED. Defendant's Motion to Empanel an Advisory Jury <u>30</u> is DENIED Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (st)
05/28/2014	<u>36</u>	NOTICE OF HEARING: A Telephonic Status Conference is set for 6/17/2014 at 11:00 AM before Judge B. Lynn Winmill for the purpose of setting a trial date. The Court can be reached at 208–3334–9145. (jlg)
06/19/2014	<u>37</u>	ORDER SETTING TRIAL. Parties shall notify the Court on or before 12/8/2014 that the case has either settled or will definitely go to trial. (Motions in Limine due by 12/15/2014. Bench Trial set for 1/20/2015 09:00 AM in Boise – Courtroom 3 before Judge B. Lynn Winmill. Telephonic Pretrial Conference set for 1/6/2015 10:00 AM before Judge B. Lynn Winmill.). Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (st)
06/19/2014	<u>38</u>	ORDER VACATING REFERRAL, SETTING SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE AND SETTLEMENT QUESTIONNAIRE. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the Order of Referral filed on 9/13/2012 11 for the Honorable Larry M. Boyle to conduct a Settlement Conference is hereby vacated. This matter shall be referred for a Settlement Conference to Senior United States District Judge Dee V. Benson. Parties shall file a summation of its assessment of the strengths of it's case and the opposing party's case by 8/8/2014 at 5:00 p.m. (MT). (Settlement Conference set for 8/21/2014 09:30 AM in Boise – Courtroom 1 before Judge Dee V Benson.). Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (st)

06/19/2014	<u>39</u>	ORDER TO TRANSPORT INMATE. IT IS ORDERED that the Idaho Department of Correction officials shall take appropriate measures to transport inmate Randolph O. Smith on 8/21/2014 to arrive at 9:00 a.m. The inmate shall be transported to the James A. McClure Federal Building and United States Courthouse, 550 West Fort Street, 6th Floor, Courtroom #1, Boise, Idaho. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (st)
06/20/2014	<u>40</u>	ORDER FOR INTERPRETER SERVICES. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT interpreter services shall be provided for Plaintiff Smith, who is hearing impaired, as noted in § 255.10(c), with costs to be incurred at judiciary expense. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (st)
08/21/2014	41	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Dee V Benson: Settlement Conference held on 8/21/2014 Case not settled. Time in Court 5 hours. (Court Reporter Ed Young.) (so) (Entered: 08/26/2014)
09/18/2014	<u>42</u>	NOTICE of Substitution – Attorney Mark Alan Kubinski, Leslie Marie Hayes for Brent Reinke, Mark Alan Kubinski, Leslie Marie Hayes for Johanna Smith added. Attorney William Michael Loomis terminated. (Kubinski, Mark)
09/26/2014	43	MOTION in Limine to Exclude Proffered Evidence or Argument Regarding the IDOC's Inmate Kiosks and Video Visitation Feature Courtney Rose Holthus appearing for Plaintiff Randolph O. Smith. Responses due by 10/20/2014 (Attachments: # 1 Memorandum in Support Memorandum in Support of Plaintiffs Motion in Limine, # 2 Affidavit Affidavit of Courtney R. Holthus in Support of Plaintiff's Motion in Limine, # 3 Exhibit Exhibit A, # 4 Exhibit Exhibit B, # 5 Exhibit Exhibit C, # 6 Exhibit Exhibit D, # 7 Exhibit Exhibit E, # 8 Exhibit Exhibit F, # 9 Exhibit Exhibit G, # 10 Exhibit Exhibit H, # 11 Exhibit Exhibit I)(Holthus, Courtney)
09/30/2014	<u>44</u>	MOTION to Continue <i>Trial</i> Leslie Marie Hayes appearing for Defendants Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith. Responses due by 10/24/2014 (Attachments: # 1 Memorandum in Support, # 2 Affidavit of Juliet McKay, # 3 Affidavit of Leslie Hayes)(Hayes, Leslie)
10/08/2014	45	DOCKET ENTRY ORDER: The Court hereby expedites the briefing schedule for the pending motion to continue trial (Dkt. 44) as follows: The response brief shall be filed by Tuesday, October 14, 2014 by 5:00 p.m., Mountain Time. The reply brief, if any, shall be filed within seven calendar days after the response brief is filed. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (mls)
10/08/2014		Set/Reset Deadlines as to <u>44</u> MOTION to Continue <i>Trial</i> . Responses due by 10/14/2014. (Per dkt #45) (st)
10/14/2014	<u>46</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>44</u> MOTION to Continue <i>Trial Plaintiffs Response in Opposition to Defendants Motion to Continue Trial</i> filed by Randolph O. Smith. Replies due by 10/31/2014. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Affidavit of Courtney R. Holthus In Support of Plaintiffs Response in Opp to Defendants Motion to Continue Trial)(Holthus, Courtney)
10/14/2014	<u>47</u>	AMENDED DOCUMENT by Randolph O. Smith. Amendment to <u>43</u> MOTION in Limine to Exclude Proffered Evidence or Argument Regarding the IDOC's Inmate Kiosks and Video Visitation Feature Amended Affidavit of Courtney R. Holthus in Support of Motion in Limine. (Holthus, Courtney)
10/20/2014	<u>48</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>44</u> MOTION to Continue <i>Trial</i> filed by Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith.(Hayes, Leslie)
10/24/2014	<u>49</u>	MEMORANDUM DECISION AND ORDER. IT IS ORDERED that Defendants' Motion to Continue Trial <u>44</u> is DENIED. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (st)
11/10/2014	<u>50</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Krista Lynn Howard on behalf of All Defendants (Howard, Krista)

12/08/2014	<u>51</u>	STIPULATION re <u>37</u> Order, Set Deadlines/Hearings,,,, to continue trial by Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith, Randolph O. Smith. (Kubinski, Mark)
12/09/2014	<u>52</u>	ORDER GRANTING STIPULATION TO CONTINUE TRIAL & TRIAL—SETTING ORDER. The 1/20/2014 trial in this action, as well as all deadlines set forth in the Court's 6/19/2014 Trial—Setting Order (Dkt. 37), are hereby VACATED. The pending motion in limine 43 is DEEMED MOOT. The parties shall notify the Court on or before 2/2/2015 that the case has either settled or will definitely go to trial. (Motions in Limine due by 2/9/2015. Bench Trial reset for 3/16/2015 09:00 AM in Boise—Courtroom 3 before Judge B. Lynn Winmill. Telephonic Pretrial Conference set for 2/24/2015 10:00 AM in Boise Chambers before Judge B. Lynn Winmill.). Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (st)
01/28/2015	<u>53</u>	STIPULATION of Dismissal with prejudice by Brent Reinke, Johanna Smith. (Kubinski, Mark)
01/29/2015	<u>54</u>	ORDER FOR DISMISSAL WITH PREJUDICE. Based on the stipulation of the parties <u>53</u> , it is hereby ORDERED that this case be dismissed with prejudice. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (st)
01/29/2015	<u>55</u>	JUDGMENT. In accordance with the Order issued concurrently herewith, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that judgment be entered and that this case be dismissed in its entirety, with prejudice. Signed by Judge B. Lynn Winmill. (caused to be mailed to non Registered Participants at the addresses listed on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) by (st)