

1 BARRETT S. LITT, SBN 45527  
2 blitt@kmbllaw.com  
3 DAVID S. McLANE, SBN 124952  
4 dmclane@kmbllaw.com  
5 LINDSAY BATTLES, SBN 262282  
6 lbattles@kmbllaw.com  
7 KAYE, MCLANE, BEDNARSKI & LITT  
8 975 East Green Street  
9 Pasadena, California 91106  
10 Telephone: (626) 844-7600  
11 Facsimile: (626) 844-7670

12 MELISSA GOODMAN, SBN 289464  
13 MGoodman@aclusocal.org  
14 BRENDAN M. HAMME, SBN 285293  
15 BHamme@aclusocal.org  
16 PETER J. ELIASBERG, SBN 189110  
17 PEliasberg@aclusocal.org  
18 AMANDA C. GOAD, SBN 297131  
19 AGoad@aclusocal.org  
20 ADITI FRUITWALA, SBN 300362  
21 AFruitwala@aclusocal.org  
22 ACLU FOUNDATION OF SOUTHERN CA  
23 1313 West 8th Street  
24 Los Angeles, California 90017  
25 Telephone: (213) 977-9500  
26 Facsimile: (213) 977-5299

27 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

NOTE: CHANGES MADE BY THE COURT

28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
560  
561  
562  
563  
564  
565  
566  
567  
568  
569  
570  
571  
572  
573  
574  
575  
576  
577  
578  
579  
580  
581  
582  
583  
584  
585  
586  
587  
588  
589  
590  
591  
592  
593  
594  
595  
596  
597  
598  
599  
600  
601  
602  
603  
604  
605  
606  
607  
608  
609  
610  
611  
612  
613  
614  
615  
616  
617  
618  
619  
620  
621  
622  
623  
624  
625  
626  
627  
628  
629  
630  
631  
632  
633  
634  
635  
636  
637  
638  
639  
640  
641  
642  
643  
644  
645  
646  
647  
648  
649  
650  
651  
652  
653  
654  
655  
656  
657  
658  
659  
660  
661  
662  
663  
664  
665  
666  
667  
668  
669  
670  
671  
672  
673  
674  
675  
676  
677  
678  
679  
680  
681  
682  
683  
684  
685  
686  
687  
688  
689  
690  
691  
692  
693  
694  
695  
696  
697  
698  
699  
700  
701  
702  
703  
704  
705  
706  
707  
708  
709  
710  
711  
712  
713  
714  
715  
716  
717  
718  
719  
720  
721  
722  
723  
724  
725  
726  
727  
728  
729  
730  
731  
732  
733  
734  
735  
736  
737  
738  
739  
740  
741  
742  
743  
744  
745  
746  
747  
748  
749  
750  
751  
752  
753  
754  
755  
756  
757  
758  
759  
760  
761  
762  
763  
764  
765  
766  
767  
768  
769  
770  
771  
772  
773  
774  
775  
776  
777  
778  
779  
780  
781  
782  
783  
784  
785  
786  
787  
788  
789  
790  
791  
792  
793  
794  
795  
796  
797  
798  
799  
800  
801  
802  
803  
804  
805  
806  
807  
808  
809  
810  
811  
812  
813  
814  
815  
816  
817  
818  
819  
820  
821  
822  
823  
824  
825  
826  
827  
828  
829  
830  
831  
832  
833  
834  
835  
836  
837  
838  
839  
840  
841  
842  
843  
844  
845  
846  
847  
848  
849  
850  
851  
852  
853  
854  
855  
856  
857  
858  
859  
860  
861  
862  
863  
864  
865  
866  
867  
868  
869  
870  
871  
872  
873  
874  
875  
876  
877  
878  
879  
880  
881  
882  
883  
884  
885  
886  
887  
888  
889  
890  
891  
892  
893  
894  
895  
896  
897  
898  
899  
900  
901  
902  
903  
904  
905  
906  
907  
908  
909  
910  
911  
912  
913  
914  
915  
916  
917  
918  
919  
920  
921  
922  
923  
924  
925  
926  
927  
928  
929  
930  
931  
932  
933  
934  
935  
936  
937  
938  
939  
940  
941  
942  
943  
944  
945  
946  
947  
948  
949  
950  
951  
952  
953  
954  
955  
956  
957  
958  
959  
960  
961  
962  
963  
964  
965  
966  
967  
968  
969  
970  
971  
972  
973  
974  
975  
976  
977  
978  
979  
980  
981  
982  
983  
984  
985  
986  
987  
988  
989  
990  
991  
992  
993  
994  
995  
996  
997  
998  
999  
1000

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

DAN MCKIBBEN, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

JOHN MCMAHON, et al.,

Defendants

Case No. EDCV 14-2171-JGB-SP

[Hon. Jesus G. Bernal]

**PRELIMINARY APPROVAL  
ORDER**

1           The parties have submitted this joint Preliminary Approval Order of the  
2           Class Settlement for the Court’s review. Upon review and consideration of the  
3           Settlement Agreement (Exhibit A hereto) (the “Settlement Agreement”) and the  
4           exhibits attached thereto made and entered into by counsel for the parties, who  
5           represent that their respective clients have approved the settlement.

6           The Named Plaintiffs/Class Representatives<sup>1</sup> are Pedro Guzman, Nick Ou,  
7           Sean Lint, Anthony Oliver, Timothy Walker, Ilich Vargas, William Kennedy,  
8           Jonathan, Robertson, Steve Aka Lynn Price, Bryan Bagwell, Christopher  
9           Crawford, Frederick Crockan, Taheash White, Michael Aka Madison Hatfield, and  
10          Kevin Aka Veronica Pratt.

11          Plaintiffs are former or current (at the time of the filing of the complaint)  
12          inmates of jails operated by the San Bernardino County Sheriff’s Department  
13          (“SBCSD”). SBCSD maintained and maintains an “Alternative Lifestyle Tank”  
14          (hereafter “ALT”) at the West Valley Detention Center (“WVDC”), which houses  
15          inmates who self-identify as gay, bisexual, and/or transgender (“GBT inmates”).  
16          The WVDC is the only SBCSD jail facility that houses self-identified GBT  
17          inmates who were assigned male at birth.

18          The Defendants are the County of San Bernardino, the San Bernardino  
19          County Sheriff’s Department, San Bernardino County Sheriff John McMahon,  
20          Greg Garland, Jeff Rose, James Mahan and Armando Castillo.

21          Plaintiffs, and the classes they represent, contend that Defendants engage in  
22          systematic discrimination and denial of equal treatment against Gay, Bisexual, and  
23          Transgender (“GBT”) inmates at the WVDC. Plaintiffs contend, inter alia, that  
24          GBT inmates 1) were automatically placed in the ALT if they self-identified as  
25          GBT; 2) would have been at risk for their safety if admitted to the general  
26

---

27          <sup>1</sup> Plaintiff Dan McKibben passed away while this lawsuit was pending, and so is not listed as a  
28          Class Representative Plaintiff, although his name is still used as the Case Name.

1 population as openly GBT inmates because SBCSD did not have any plans or  
 2 programs to ensure their safety; 3) had no or inadequate PREA programs in place  
 3 to protect GBT inmates or address particular vulnerabilities of GBT inmates placed  
 4 in the general population; 4) were limited in their time out of cell generally to an  
 5 hour and a half per day, and often less, in contrast to similarly situated (by  
 6 classification or sentencing status) general population inmates; 5) were denied the  
 7 same work opportunities that were provided to similarly situated (by classification  
 8 or sentencing status) general population inmates; 6) were denied the same  
 9 programming opportunities<sup>2</sup> that were provided to similarly situated (by  
 10 classification or sentencing status) general population inmates; and 7) a  
 11 comparable range of religious services to those available to the general population.  
 12 Plaintiffs also contend that certain aspects of this disparate treatment continue to  
 13 this day. Defendants dispute Plaintiffs' allegations, but the parties have agreed to  
 14 enter into this Settlement Agreement to avoid the mutual risks of litigation.

15 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED THAT:**

16 **I. PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF SETTLEMENT**

17 1. This Order incorporates by reference the definitions in the Settlement  
 18 Agreement, a copy of which is attached to this Order as Exhibit A, and also  
 19 incorporates Exhibits B through E, thereto. All terms defined therein shall have the  
 20 same meaning in this Order.

21 2. The Settlement Agreement is hereby preliminarily approved, subject  
 22 to further consideration thereof at the Fairness Hearing provided for below. The  
 23 Court finds that the non-reversionary class settlement fund of \$950,000 and its  
 24 proposed allocation, plus substantial injunctive relief and attorney's fees of  
 25

26 <sup>2</sup> Programming opportunities include classes in anger management, thinking for change, living  
 27 skills, parenting skills, substance abuse, GED, high school diploma, literacy, automobile  
 28 mechanics, bakery occupations, culinary/reading enrichment classes, computer skills, HVAC  
 training, fire camp vocational training, employment readiness, and re-entry services.

\$1,100,000 are within the range of what would constitute a fair, reasonable, and adequate settlement in the best interests of the Class as a whole, and that the terms of the Settlement Agreement otherwise satisfy the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 23(e) and due process requirements.

**II. DEADLINES FOR NOTICE, FILING OBJECTIONS AND OPT-OUTS, AND DATE OF FAIRNESS HEARING**

3. The Court has set the following dates for purposes of this class action:
- (a) Final class identifying information will be provided to the Class Administrator no later than September 10, 2018;
  - (b) Mailing Class and Settlement Notice to Class: Must be postmarked by October 15, 2018 [four weeks from latest date of approval order of September 17, 2018, for this scheduled to apply];
  - (c) Publication of summary notice by other methods: Must be effected by no later than October 22, 2018 [one week later];
  - (d) Filing of Plaintiffs' Motion for Award of Attorneys' Fees and Costs: Must be filed by November 12, 2018 [eight (8) weeks after mailing of class notice];
  - (e) Filing of Class Members' Objections to any aspect of the Settlement (including Plaintiffs' Motion for Award of Attorneys' Fees and Costs): Must be filed by January 7, 2019 [sixteen (16) weeks after mailing of class notice];
  - (f) Deadline to opt-out: Must be postmarked or received by January 7, 2019 [sixteen (16) weeks after mailing of class notice];
  - (g) Deadline for filing class claims: Must be postmarked or received by January 7, 2019 [sixteen (16) weeks after mailing of class notice];
  - (h) Opposition or Reply to Objections (including to objections to award of attorneys' fees and costs): Must be filed by January 28, 2019 [three (3) weeks after last day to object, opt out, file claims];

- 1 (i) Proposed Final Approval Order: Must be filed by January 28, 2019  
2 (j) [three (3) weeks after last day to object, opt out, file claims]; and  
3 (k) Final Approval Hearing: February 11, 2019 [two (2) weeks after filing  
4 of responses to objections and proposed Final Approval Order] at 9  
5 a.m. in Courtroom 1 of the United States District Court for the Central  
6 District of California, Eastern Division located at 3470 12th Street,  
7 Riverside, California 92501.

8 4. The Court requires a separate motion for final approval of the  
9 settlement and for attorneys' fees. Parties must file these motions by January 14,  
10 2019.

11 5. In the event that the class notice is not mailed and initially published  
12 within the time specified herein, the subsequent dates contained herein will be  
13 deferred for the number of additional days before such notice occurs without the  
14 need for additional Court approval. However, the Court must approve any change  
15 of the date of the Final Approval Hearing.

16 6. In the event that the number of Opt Outs exceeds ten (10) but is less  
17 than twenty-five (25), i.e., where the number of Opt Outs is between 11-24, the  
18 parties agree that, Defendants will receive a credit against the Class Damages  
19 Fund based on the amount that each Opt Out was due under the initial class  
20 distribution formula (explained in ¶ 8 of the Settlement Agreement) when applied  
21 to the Damages Class and as calculated by Plaintiffs' counsel, i.e., the amount due  
22 that class member if all class members filed claims. (To the extent that the final  
23 distribution formula results in different allocations because not all class members  
24 filed claims, the credit would be based on the initial distribution formula, not the  
25 formula adjusted to the claims made.) This credit is only available if the number of  
26 Opt Outs exceeds ten.

27 7. If the number of Opt Outs amounts to 25 or more or if any Named  
28 Plaintiff opts out, Defendants shall have the option of using the same credit

formula as set out in the previous paragraph where the number of Opt Outs is between 11-24, or of rescinding the Agreement.

### III. INJUNCTIVE AND DAMAGES CLASSES

8. The Court has simultaneously with the entry of this order conditionally granted Plaintiffs' motion to certify classes under F.R.Civ.P. Rule 23(b)(2) and (b)(3) as follows.

(a) **Rule 23(b)(2) Injunctive Relief Class:** individuals who currently are, or in the future will be, GBT inmates housed in the San Bernardino County jails, including but not limited to those housed in the ALT.

(b) **Rule 23(b)(3) Damages Class:** individuals who, between October 22, 2012, and March 31, 2018, were GBT inmates housed in the Alternative Lifestyles Tank (hereafter "ALT") of the San Bernardino County jail facility known as West Valley Detention Center ("WVDC").

9. Damages Class Members have a right to opt out of the settlement. Injunctive Class Members cannot opt out of the injunctive relief portion of the settlement.

10. The Parties have identified exclusively from San Bernardino County Jail records Damages Class Members based on who was housed in the ALT during the damages period. Only persons so identified are Damages Class members.

11. The basic term of the settlement as it relates to Damages Class Members is that the County of San Bernardino will provide payment of a total of \$950,000. From that amount, the following awards will be made by the Class Administrator, subject to court approval:

(a) Incentive awards to the 15 Named Plaintiffs, if and to the extent approved by the Court, in the amount of \$60,500.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> Although Dan McKibben was a Named Plaintiff, he is now deceased, and is therefore being treated purely as a class member and is not included as a Class Representative.

1 (b) Payments of the third-party class settlement administration costs,  
2 which are estimated at \$40,000 or less.

3 (c) Certain litigation costs, specifically the consultant/expert and  
4 mediation fees advanced by Plaintiffs' counsel, estimated at  
5 approximately \$37,000. (Other litigation costs will be absorbed by  
6 counsel and included in the Attorney's Fees and Costs Award.)

7 12. The remainder of the Class Fund shall be distributed to the class  
8 members (including Named Plaintiffs/Class Representatives) under a formula  
9 contained in Paragraphs 5-10 of the Settlement Agreement (Exhibit A hereto).  
10 The formula is based on awarding a certain number of points for each day a  
11 Damages Class Member spent in the ALT. Because conditions varied over time,  
12 and the alleged severity of what Damages Class Members experienced varied by  
13 both time and virtue of what opportunities they would have received when  
14 compared to comparably classified general population inmates, points vary by  
15 which category an inmate fit into in any given day. Only one set of points apply to  
16 a given day. (See the Settlement Agreement for an itemization of the categories.)

17 13. Once daily points are assigned to all Damages Class Members, the  
18 points will be totaled, and a total point value will be calculated for the class as a  
19 whole and for each individual class member. Each class member's recovery will  
20 then be determinable based on that class member's percentage of the total points.  
21 It is likely that not all class members will make Timely Claims. Accordingly, a  
22 claiming class member's percentage of the available funds will be determined  
23 based on that class member's total points in relation to the total points for those  
24 who made timely claims. (The Settlement Agreement provides how to determine  
25 what claims are timely.)

26 14. Despite the foregoing, no class member who qualifies for payment  
27 will receive less than a total of \$40 or more than a total of \$10,000. The purpose of  
28 this Minimum/Maximum provision is to ensure that every qualifying Damages



1 Class member receives some meaningful compensation, and to ensure that outliers  
2 who have outsized claims do not distort the meaningfulness of the recovery to the  
3 remaining class members. None of the \$950,000 Damages Class Fund shall revert  
4 to the County. Any funds claimed but not cashed by a Class Member within one  
5 year of payment shall be paid to an agreed-upon *cy pres* organization.

6 15. In addition, the parties have agreed to the entry of an injunction,  
7 whose terms are set forth in Exhibit D to the Proposed Preliminary Approval  
8 Order.

9 16. Finally, the Settlement Agreement provides that the County of San  
10 Bernardino shall pay Attorney's Fees and Costs in the amount of \$1,100,000 as  
11 compensation for statutory fees and certain costs pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 1988.  
12 (The costs included in this award shall include all costs incurred except for  
13 mediation costs, consultant/expert costs and Class Administration costs.) This fee  
14 shall be the subject of a separate Motion for Attorney's Fees to be heard at the  
15 Final Approval Hearing, to be analyzed under the standards for an award of fees  
16 and costs to a prevailing plaintiff under 42 U.S.C. § 1988 and Civil Code §  
17 52.1(h). The Class Notice will advise class members of this motion and their right  
18 to object to it (as well as to other terms of the settlement).

19 **IV. CLASS ADMINISTRATOR**

20 17. The Court approves the retention of JND Legal Administration  
21 ("JND") as Class Administrator, to administer the distribution of the Class and  
22 Settlement Notice and publication of the Class and Settlement Notice, and to  
23 distribute the proceeds of the settlement to all eligible Class Members pursuant to  
24 the Plan set out in the Settlement Agreement (Exhibit A) should the Court grant  
25 final approval. Exhibit E (the Class Administrator bid) includes the qualifications  
26 of JND, which establishes to the Court's satisfaction the qualifications of JND to  
27 act as the Class Administrator.

28 18. The Class Administrator shall preserve all written communications



1 from Class Members in response to the Class and Settlement Notice at least until  
2 December 31, 2021, or pursuant to further order of the Court. All written  
3 communications received by the Class Administrator from Class Members relating  
4 to the Settlement Agreement shall be available at all reasonable times for  
5 inspection and copying by Counsel for the Parties, and copies shall be regularly  
6 provided to Counsel for the Parties.

7 19. The Class Administrator shall be compensated from the \$950,000  
8 Class Damages Fund for its services in connection with notice and administration  
9 and for the costs of giving mailed and published notice, and the other services it  
10 performs, pursuant to such orders as the Court may enter from time to time.

11 20. Within two weeks after this Preliminary Approval Order is signed by  
12 the Court, the County of San Bernardino shall deposit or cause to be deposited into  
13 an account designated by the Class Administrator by check sent by overnight mail  
14 an amount of same day available funds equal to the amount requested by the Class  
15 Administrator to cover the costs of notice as provided herein, and will provide  
16 additional funds for its administrative work pursuant to the terms of its accepted  
17 bid, a copy of which is attached as Exhibit E. Prior to entry of the Final Order of  
18 Approval of Settlement, the Class Administrator will not accrue any costs not  
19 itemized in Exhibit E unless agreed to by the Plaintiffs' counsel and approved by  
20 the Court. If the Court does not enter the Final Order of Approval and Settlement,  
21 then all such funds paid to the Class Administrator, to the extent they are available  
22 after payment of all accrued class administration expenses, shall be returned to  
23 Defendants.

24 21. If this settlement does not go through for any reason, a new settlement  
25 is not reached, the case goes to trial, and Plaintiffs are not successful in their  
26 prosecution of the case, Defendants shall not seek reimbursement from Plaintiffs  
27 of class administration funds paid under this settlement.  
28

1 **V. CLASS COUNSEL**

2 22. Barrett S. Litt, David McLane and Lindsay Battles of Kaye, McLane,  
3 Bednarski & Litt, and Melissa Goodman, Amanda Goad, Brendan Hamme and  
4 Aditi Fruitwala of the ACLU Foundation of Southern California are hereby  
5 confirmed as counsel for the Class Representatives and the Class (“Class  
6 Counsel”).

7 23. Class Counsel are authorized to act on behalf of the Class with respect  
8 to all acts or consents required by or which may be given pursuant to the  
9 Settlement, and such other acts reasonably necessary to consummate the  
10 Settlement.

11 24. At the Fairness Hearing, Class Counsel shall make an application for  
12 Attorney’s Fees and certain litigation costs to be paid by Defendants separate from  
13 the Class Damages Fund (the “Motion for Attorneys’ Fees and Costs”). Plaintiffs’  
14 counsel’s costs of expert/consultant and mediation fees, and the costs of class  
15 notice and administration will be paid from the Class Damages Fund.

16 **VI. CLASS AND SETTLEMENT NOTICE**

17 25. Class Counsel shall provide the Class and Settlement Notice to the  
18 Class Administrator for distribution according to the schedule set forth above.  
19 Such notice shall be in substantially the form as proposed in Exhibit B to the  
20 Settlement Agreement and shall be sent by United States mail to the class  
21 members at their last known address; returned mail shall be subject to follow up  
22 mailings after appropriate searches of the available databases. In addition, email  
23 notice shall be sent to those Damages Class Members can be obtained by standard  
24 searches. No notice by publication shall be required because such notice has not  
25 proven effective at reaching class members, and the resources are better spent on  
26 attempting to reach class members through electronic email. See revisions to  
27 F.R.Civ.P 23 (c)(2)(B) effective December 2018 (acknowledging that notice “may  
28 be by ... electronic means, or other appropriate means” in addition to or in lieu of

United States mail).

26. Defendants represent that they have already provided the name, address, social security number, date of birth, driver's license information, and any other identifying information of Damages Class Members, to Plaintiffs' counsel, who will transmit it to the Class Administrator. Such information shall be confidential and may not be disclosed to anyone except counsel of record, the Class Administrator, and designated representatives of Defendants. Should the Defendants discover at any time any additional information containing relevant class information, they shall promptly provide it to Plaintiffs' counsel and the Class Administrator.

27. At least seven days before the Fairness Hearing, Class Counsel and/or the Class Administrator shall serve and file a sworn statement by the Class Administrator attesting to compliance with the provisions of this Order governing Class and Settlement Notice. This shall include a list of all people who have opted out of the class.

28. The Court approves the Class and Settlement Notice attached as Exhibit B.

29. The Court approves the Claim Form attached as Exhibit C.

30. The Court approves the Class Administrator Bid attached as Exhibit E.

31. The Court finds that the notice required by the foregoing provisions of this Order is the best notice practicable under the circumstances and shall constitute due and sufficient notice of the Settlement and the Fairness Hearing to all Class Members and other persons affected by and/or entitled to participate in the settlement, in full compliance with the notice requirements of Rule 23 Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and due process.

## **VII. THE FAIRNESS HEARING**

32. A Fairness Hearing shall be held on February 11, 2019 to consider: (a)

1 the fairness, reasonableness, and adequacy of the Settlement; (b) whether a Final  
2 Order of Approval and Settlement should be entered in its current or some  
3 modified form; and (c) the application by Class Counsel for attorneys' fees and  
4 expenses (the "Fee Motion").

5 33. At least four weeks prior to the Fairness Hearing, Plaintiffs shall move  
6 for final approval and submit a proposed Final Approval Order, which shall be  
7 approved by Defendants. That proposed order will contain the final provisions the  
8 Parties seek the Court to finally approve and the Parties' proposed court orders  
9 related to any objections that have been filed.

10 34. The date and time of the Fairness Hearing shall be set forth in the  
11 Class and Settlement Notice but shall be subject to adjournment by the Court  
12 without further notice to the Class Members other than that which may be posted  
13 at the Court and on the Court's web site.

14 35. Any Class Member who objects to the approval of the Settlement  
15 Agreement, the Fee Motion, the Named Plaintiffs' incentive awards or the  
16 proposed allocation of damages among class members may appear at the Fairness  
17 Hearing and show cause why any one of the foregoing should not be approved as  
18 fair, reasonable, and adequate, and why the Final Order of Approval and  
19 Settlement should not be entered, except that no such Class Member may appear at  
20 the Fairness Hearing unless the Class Member, no later than January 7, 2019 [the  
21 date to file objections to the Settlement] (a) files with the Clerk of the Court a  
22 notice of such person's intention to appear, a statement that indicates the basis and  
23 grounds for such person's objection to the Settlement Agreement, the Fee Petition,  
24 the Named Plaintiffs' incentive awards or the proposed allocation of damages  
25 among class members, and all documentation, papers, or briefs in support of such  
26 objection; and by the same date (b) serves upon all Counsel to the Parties (as listed  
27 in the Class Notice), either in person or by mail, copies of such notice of intention  
28 to appear, statement of objections and all documentation, papers, or briefs that

1 such person files with the Court. The required documentation shall include the  
 2 information requested on the Claim Form. Final determination of whether any  
 3 such objector is a Class Member who has standing to object shall be determined  
 4 solely from the Defendants' records, from which the list of Class Members has  
 5 been compiled. In the absence of the timely filing and timely service of the notice  
 6 of intention to appear and all other materials required by this paragraph, any  
 7 objection shall be deemed untimely and denied.

8 36. Pending final approval of the Settlement Agreement, no Class  
 9 Member shall, either directly, representatively, or in any other capacity,  
 10 commence, prosecute against any Defendant or participate in any action or  
 11 proceeding in any court or tribunal asserting any of the matters, claims, or causes  
 12 of action that are to be released by the Settlement Agreement upon final approval.

13 37. In the event of final approval of the Settlement Agreement, all  
 14 Damages Class Members (except those who have opted out) shall be forever  
 15 enjoined and barred from asserting any of the matters, claims or causes of action  
 16 released by the Settlement Agreement, and all such Class Members shall be  
 17 deemed to have forever released any and all such matters, claims and causes of  
 18 action as provided for in the Settlement Agreement.

19 **VIII. OTHER PROVISIONS**

20 38. In the event the Settlement is not finally approved or is otherwise  
 21 terminated in accordance with the provisions of the Settlement Agreement, the  
 22 Settlement and all proceedings had in connection therewith shall be null and void,  
 23 except insofar as expressly provided to the contrary in the Settlement Agreement,  
 24 and without prejudice to the status quo ante rights of Plaintiffs, Defendants, and  
 25 Class Members.

26  
 27 DATED: September 21, 2018

28   
 JESUS G. BERNAL  
 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

1 SUBMITTED BY:

2 **KAYE, McLANE, BEDNARSKI & LITT**  
3 **ACLU FOUNDATION OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA**

4  
5 By:       /s/ Barrett S. Litt        
6 Barrett S. Litt  
7 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

8 **BURKE, WILLIAMS & SORENSEN**

9  
10 By:       /s/ Nathan A. Oyster        
11 Nathan A. Oyster  
12 Attorneys for Defendants