

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of Ohio (Columbus)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:20-cv-02471-EAS-KAJ**

Smith et al v. DeWine et al  
Assigned to: Judge Edmund A. Sargus  
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Kimberly A. Jolson  
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 05/15/2020  
Date Terminated: 12/02/2020  
Jury Demand: Plaintiff  
Nature of Suit: 555 Habeas Corpus  
(Prison Condition)  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Ashunte Smith**  
A330043  
MARION CORRECTIONAL  
INSTITUTION  
P.O. Box 57  
Marion, OH 43301-0057

represented by **Joseph C Patituce**  
16855 Foltz Parkway  
Strongsville, OH 44149  
440-471-7784  
Fax: 440-398-0536  
Email: [jpatituce@patitucelaw.com](mailto:jpatituce@patitucelaw.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Kimberly Kendall**  
4403 St. Clair Avenue  
Cleveland, OH 44103  
216-926-7285  
Fax: 216-803-2700  
Email: [KKC@KimLawCrimLaw.com](mailto:KKC@KimLawCrimLaw.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Megan Marie Patituce**  
16855 Foltz Industrial Parkway  
Strongsville, OH 44149  
440-471-7784  
Fax: 440-398-0536  
Email: [attorneypatituce@patitucelaw.com](mailto:attorneypatituce@patitucelaw.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**Kaiqin Wang**

represented by **Joseph C Patituce**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Kimberly Kendall**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Megan Marie Patituce**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Christopher Martin**  
A770038  
RICHLAND CORRECTIONAL  
INSTITUTION  
1001 Olivesburg Road  
P.O. Box 8107  
Mansfield, OH 44905

represented by **Joseph C Patituce**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kimberly Kendall**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Megan Marie Patituce**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Travis Williams**  
A428428  
MARION CORRECTIONAL  
INSTITUTION  
P.O. Box 57  
Marion, OH 43301-0057

represented by **Joseph C Patituce**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kimberly Kendall**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Megan Marie Patituce**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**Mike DeWine**  
Governor of the State of Ohio  
Riffe Center, 30th Floor  
77 South High Street

represented by **Michael Allan Walton**  
Office of the Ohio Attorney General  
30 E. Broad Street  
16th Street

Columbus, OH 43215  
*TERMINATED: 08/03/2020*

Columbus, OH 43215  
614-466-2872  
Fax: 866-239-0078  
Email:  
michael.walton@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Julie M Pfeiffer**  
Ohio Attorney General's Office  
Constitutional Offices Section  
30 E. Broad Street, 16th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
614-466-2872  
Fax: 614-728-7592  
Email:  
Julie.Pfeiffer@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Zachary M. Holscher**  
Office of the Ohio Attorney General  
Constitutional Offices  
30 E. Broad Street  
16th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
(614) 466-2872  
Fax: (614)728-7592  
Email:  
zachary.holscher@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**Annette Chambers-Smith**

represented by **Thomas E Madden**  
Office of the Ohio Attorney General  
Criminal Justice Section  
Capital Crimes Unit  
150 E. Gay St., 16th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
614-728-7055  
Fax: 614-728-8600  
Email:  
thomas.madden@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Byron D. Turner**

Office of the Ohio Attorney General  
150 E. Gay Street  
16th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
614-644-7661  
Fax: 844-237-7628  
Email: byron.turner@odrc.state.oh.us  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Charles Allen Schneider**  
Ohio Attorney General's Office  
Criminal Justice Section  
150 E. Gay Street, 16th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
614-644-7233  
Email:  
charles.schneider@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Tracy L Bradford**  
Ohio Attorney General's Office  
150 East Gay St, 16th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
614-466-7991  
Fax: 866-823-9400  
Email:  
Tracy.Bradford@OhioAttorneyGeneral.gov  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

<b>Date Filed</b>	<b>#</b>	<b>Docket Text</b>
05/15/2020	<a href="#">1</a>	COMPLAINT with JURY DEMAND against All Defendants ( Filing fee \$ 400 paid - receipt number: 0648-7468158), filed by Travis Williams, Ashunte Smith, Christopher Martin, Kaiqin Wang. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Civil Cover Sheet Cover Sheet, # <a href="#">2</a> Summons Form Summons, # <a href="#">3</a> Summons Form Summons) (Patituce, Joseph) (Entered: 05/15/2020)
05/18/2020	<a href="#">2</a>	NOTICE OF NON-ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS. (daf) (Entered: 05/18/2020)
05/19/2020	<a href="#">3</a>	REQUEST for Issuance of Summons. (Patituce, Joseph) (Entered: 05/19/2020)
05/19/2020	<a href="#">4</a>	REQUEST for Issuance of Summons. (Patituce, Joseph) (Entered: 05/19/2020)

05/19/2020	<a href="#">5</a>	Notice by Clerk of Southern District of Ohio of Pro Hac Vice Rules as to Attorney Megan M. Patituce (daf) (Entered: 05/19/2020)
05/20/2020	<a href="#">6</a>	Summons Issued as to Annette Chambers-Smith, and Mike DeWine. (daf) (Entered: 05/20/2020)
05/29/2020	<a href="#">7</a>	CERTIFICATE of Mailing by Clerk. The Clerk of the United States District Court, Southern District of Ohio, mailed a copy of the Summons and Complaint via certified mail on May 29, 2020 to the following Defendants: Mike DeWine,Riffe Center, 30th floor, 77 South High Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215(7019 2970 0000 7294 2780) and Annette Chambers-Smith, ODRC,4545 Fisher Road, Ste D, Columbus, Ohio 43228(7019 2970 0000 7294 2773). (mdr) (Entered: 05/29/2020)
06/08/2020	<a href="#">8</a>	SUMMONS Returned Executed as to Defendant Mike DeWine. The Defendant was served on 6/3/2020, answer due 6/24/2020. (daf) (Entered: 06/09/2020)
06/11/2020	<a href="#">9</a>	SUMMONS Returned Executed as to Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith. The Defendant was served on 6/5/2020, answer due 6/26/2020. (daf) (Entered: 06/15/2020)
06/16/2020	<a href="#">10</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Michael Allan Walton for Defendant Mike DeWine (Walton, Michael) (Entered: 06/16/2020)
06/16/2020	<a href="#">11</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Zachary M. Holscher for Defendant Mike DeWine (Holscher, Zachary) (Entered: 06/16/2020)
06/18/2020	<a href="#">12</a>	NOTICE of Hearing: Pretrial Conference set for 7/16/2020 @ 1:45 PM before Magistrate Judge Kimberly A. Jolson. (jr) (Entered: 06/18/2020)
06/19/2020	<a href="#">13</a>	MOTION for Preliminary Injunction by Plaintiffs Christopher Martin, Ashunte Smith, Kaiqin Wang, Travis Williams. (Patituce, Joseph) (Entered: 06/19/2020)
06/22/2020	<a href="#">14</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Thomas E Madden for Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith (Madden, Thomas) (Entered: 06/22/2020)
06/22/2020	<a href="#">15</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Megan Marie Patituce for Plaintiffs Christopher Martin, Ashunte Smith, Kaiqin Wang, Travis Williams (Patituce, Megan) (Entered: 06/22/2020)
06/22/2020	<a href="#">16</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Tracy L Bradford for Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith (Bradford, Tracy) (Entered: 06/22/2020)
06/22/2020	<a href="#">17</a>	NOTICE of Hearing: Rule 65.1 Telephone Conference set for 6/23/2020 at 10:00 AM via Teleconference before Judge Edmund A. Sargus. (cmw) (Entered: 06/22/2020)

06/23/2020	<a href="#">18</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Julie M Pfeiffer for Defendant Mike DeWine (Pfeiffer, Julie) (Entered: 06/23/2020)
06/23/2020	19	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Edmund A. Sargus: Rule 65.1 Telephone Conference held on 6/23/2020. (Court Reporter: Darla Coulter) (cmw) (Entered: 06/23/2020)
06/23/2020	<a href="#">20</a>	ORDER - Defendants Motion to Dismiss and Response to Plaintiffs  Motion for Preliminary Injunction ECF No. <a href="#">13</a> shall be submitted in seven (7) days. Plaintiffs Reply shall be submitted seven (7) days after Defendants file their Motions to Dismiss and Responses. Signed by Judge Edmund A. Sargus on 6/23/2020. (cmw) (Entered: 06/23/2020)
06/23/2020		NOTICE TERMINATING DEADLINES/HEARINGS - The Preliminary Pretrial Conference set for 7/16/20 is VACATED. (jr) (Entered: 06/23/2020)
06/26/2020	<a href="#">21</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Byron D. Turner for Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith (Turner, Byron) (Entered: 06/26/2020)
06/26/2020	<a href="#">22</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Charles Allen Schneider for Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith (Schneider, Charles) (Entered: 06/26/2020)
06/26/2020	<a href="#">23</a>	MOTION to Dismiss by Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith. (Madden, Thomas) (Entered: 06/26/2020)
06/26/2020	<a href="#">24</a>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply New date requested 7/6/2020. by Plaintiffs Christopher Martin, Ashunte Smith, Kaiqin Wang, Travis Williams. (Patituce, Joseph) (Entered: 06/26/2020)
06/29/2020	<a href="#">25</a>	ORDER granting <a href="#">24</a> Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply. Plaintiffs shall file their response by July 6, 2020. Signed by Judge Edmund A. Sargus on 6/29/2020. (cmw) (Entered: 06/29/2020)
06/30/2020	<a href="#">26</a>	MOTION TO DISMISS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM , MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>Defendant Ohio Governor Mike Dewines Combined Motion To Dismiss And Memorandum In Opposition To Plaintiffs Motion For Preliminary Injunction</i> ( Responses due by 7/21/2020) by Defendant Mike DeWine. (Walton, Michael) (Entered: 06/30/2020)
06/30/2020	<a href="#">27</a>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <a href="#">13</a> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith. (Attachments:

		# <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A Declaration of Director Chambers-Smith, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B Declaration of Asst. Chief Inspector Riehle, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit C Declaration of Eller, RN, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit D Declaration of Rossi Azmoun, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit E Declaration of Audrie Bender, # <a href="#">6</a> Exhibit F Declaration of Christine Borkosky, # <a href="#">7</a> Exhibit G Declaration of Michell Dunkle, # <a href="#">8</a> Exhibit H Declaration of Joanna Factor, # <a href="#">9</a> Exhibit I Declaration of Katherine Hamilton) (Madden, Thomas) (Entered: 06/30/2020)
07/01/2020	<a href="#">28</a>	MOTION for Extension of Time New date requested 7/1/2020. <i>to file attachments to Director Chambers-Smith's Declaration</i> by Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith. (Madden, Thomas) (Entered: 07/01/2020)
07/01/2020	<a href="#">29</a>	ORDER granting <a href="#">28</a> Motion for Extension of Time. Signed by Judge Edmund A. Sargus on 7/1/2020. (cmw) (Entered: 07/01/2020)
07/01/2020	<a href="#">30</a>	MOTION for Leave to File <i>manually, on disc, attachments to Exhibit A - Director Chamber-Smith's Declaration (Doc. 27-1)</i> by Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Text of Proposed Order proposed Order) (Madden, Thomas) (Entered: 07/01/2020)
07/02/2020	<a href="#">31</a>	Second MOTION for Extension of Time New date requested 7/21/2020. by Plaintiffs Christopher Martin, Ashunte Smith, Kaiqin Wang, Travis Williams. (Patituce, Joseph) (Entered: 07/02/2020)
07/02/2020	32	NOTATION ORDER - For good cause shown, Defendant Chambers-Smith's Motion for Leave to Manually File (Doc. <a href="#">30</a> ) is GRANTED, and counsel is permitted file the documents described in the motion manually with the Clerk's Office. Signed by Magistrate Judge Kimberly A. Jolson on 7/2/20. (jr) (Entered: 07/02/2020)
07/02/2020		***Clerk is in receipt of 4 disc concerning doc 27-1 from the Office of the Attorney General. (er) (Entered: 07/02/2020)
07/02/2020	<a href="#">33</a>	MOTION for Leave to File <i>and substitute Exhibit G with attachments</i> by Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit G - Michelle Dunkle's Declaration with attachments, # <a href="#">2</a> Text of Proposed Order) (Madden, Thomas) (Entered: 07/02/2020)
07/06/2020	<a href="#">34</a>	ORDER Granting ECF No. <a href="#">30</a> Plaintiffs Motion for Leave to File Attachments to Exhibits in Support of Its Response in Opposition. Signed by Judge Edmund A. Sargus on 7/6/2020. (cmw) (Entered: 07/06/2020)
07/06/2020	<a href="#">35</a>	ORDER granting <a href="#">31</a> Plaintiffs Motion to Consolidate and Extend Filing Deadlines. Plaintiffs shall file their responses to the pending

		motions by July 14, 2020. Signed by Judge Edmund A. Sargus on 7/6/2020. (cmw) (Entered: 07/06/2020)
07/06/2020	<a href="#">36</a>	ORDER granting <a href="#">33</a> Motion for Leave to File Attachments to Exhibit G in Support of Response in Opposition to Motion for Preliminary Injunction. Signed by Judge Edmund A. Sargus on 7/6/2020. (cmw) (Entered: 07/06/2020)
07/14/2020	<a href="#">37</a>	RESPONSE to Motion re <a href="#">23</a> MOTION to Dismiss , <a href="#">26</a> MOTION TO DISMISS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>Defendant Ohio Governor Mike Dewines Combined Motion To Dismiss And Memorandum In Opposition To Plaintiffs Motion For Preliminary Injunction</i> filed by Plaintiffs Christopher Martin, Ashunte Smith, Kaiqin Wang, Travis Williams. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit Declarations, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit Repleves, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit Additional Documents, # <a href="#">4</a> Affidavit McCort Affidavit, # <a href="#">5</a> Affidavit Witchey Affidavit, # <a href="#">6</a> Affidavit Corral Affidavit) (Patituce, Joseph) (Entered: 07/14/2020)
07/21/2020	<a href="#">38</a>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <a href="#">26</a> MOTION TO DISMISS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>Defendant Ohio Governor Mike Dewines Combined Motion To Dismiss And Memorandum In Opposition To Plaintiffs Motion For Preliminary Injunction</i> filed by Defendant Mike DeWine. (Walton, Michael) (Entered: 07/21/2020)
07/21/2020	<a href="#">39</a>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <a href="#">23</a> MOTION to Dismiss filed by Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith. (Madden, Thomas) (Entered: 07/21/2020)
08/03/2020	<a href="#">40</a>	OPINION AND ORDER denying <a href="#">13</a> Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction; granting in part and denying in part <a href="#">23</a>  Director's Motion to Dismiss and granting <a href="#">26</a> The Governor's Motion to Dismiss. Governor Mike DeWine is terminated from this case. Signed by Judge Edmund A. Sargus on 8/3/2020. (cmw) (Entered: 08/03/2020)
08/14/2020	<a href="#">41</a>	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer re <a href="#">1</a>  Complaint, New date requested 8/24/2020. by Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith. (Madden, Thomas) (Entered: 08/14/2020)



08/17/2020	42	NOTATION ORDER - Defendant Chambers-Smith's Unopposed Motion for Extension (Doc. <a href="#">41</a> ) is GRANTED, and Defendant shall have until August 24, 2020, to respond to the Complaint. Signed by Magistrate Judge Kimberly A. Jolson on 8/17/20. (jr) (Entered: 08/17/2020)
08/24/2020	<a href="#">43</a>	<i>Defendant Chambers-Smith's</i> ANSWER to <a href="#">1</a> Complaint, filed by Annette Chambers-Smith. (Madden, Thomas) (Entered: 08/24/2020)
11/13/2020	<a href="#">44</a>	NOTICE of Voluntary Dismissal by Plaintiffs Christopher Martin, Ashunte Smith, Kaiqin Wang, Travis Williams (Patituce, Joseph) (Entered: 11/13/2020)
11/17/2020	45	NOTATION ORDER - The notice of dismissal (Doc. <a href="#">44</a> ) does not comply with this Court's Local Rules. Plaintiffs shall file a proper stipulation of dismissal within fourteen (14) days of the date of this Order. Signed by Magistrate Judge Kimberly A. Jolson on 11/17/20. (jr) (Entered: 11/17/2020)
11/30/2020	<a href="#">46</a>	NOTICE of Voluntary Dismissal by Plaintiffs Christopher Martin, Ashunte Smith, Kaiqin Wang, Travis Williams (Patituce, Joseph) (Entered: 11/30/2020)
12/02/2020	<a href="#">47</a>	RESPONSE re <a href="#">46</a> NOTICE of Voluntary Dismissal filed by Defendant Annette Chambers-Smith. (Madden, Thomas) Modified on 12/3/2020 (jr). (Entered: 12/02/2020)
12/02/2020		***Civil Case Terminated. (jr) (Entered: 12/03/2020)
12/03/2020	<a href="#">48</a>	ORDER - This case is DISMISSED WITHOUT PREJUDICE. Signed by Judge Edmund A. Sargus on 12/3/2020. (cmw) (Entered: 12/03/2020)
12/03/2020	<a href="#">49</a>	CLERK'S JUDGMENT. Signed by Deputy Clerk on 12/3/2020. (cmw) (Entered: 12/03/2020)

**PACER Service Center**

**Transaction Receipt**

12/15/2020 15:34:54

<b>PACER Login:</b>	CRClearinghouse	<b>Client Code:</b>	Hart-McGonigle
<b>Description:</b>	Docket Report	<b>Search Criteria:</b>	2:20-cv-02471-EAS-KAJ

<b>Billable Pages:</b>	6	<b>Cost:</b>	0.60
<b>Exempt flag:</b>	Not Exempt	<b>Exempt reason:</b>	Not Exempt