

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of Ohio (Columbus)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:20-cv-03707-ALM-EPD**

Subramanya v. United States Citizenship and
Immigration Services et al
Assigned to: Chief Judge Algenon L. Marbley
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Elizabeth Preston
Deavers
Demand: \$0
Cause: 05:551 Administrative Procedure Act

Date Filed: 07/22/2020
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 899 Other Statutes:
Administrative Procedures
Act/Review or Appeal of Agency
Decision
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government
Defendant

Plaintiff

Ranjitha Subramanya
*individually and on behalf of a class
of those similarly situated*

represented by **Robert Howard Cohen**
Porter, Wright, Morris & Arthur
LLP
41 South High Street, Suite 3200
Columbus, OH 43215
614/227-2066
Fax: 614/227-2100
Email: rcohen@porterwright.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ana P. Crawford
Porter Wright Morris & Arthur - 3
PO Box 1805
One S Main Street
Suite 1600
Dayton, OH 45401-1805
937-449-6726
Fax: 937-449-6820
Email:
acrawford@porterwright.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Caroline Gentry
Porter Wright Morris & Arthur
One Dayton Centre
One South Main Street
Suite 1600

Dayton, OH 45402-2028
937-449-6748
Email: cgentry@porterwright.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David P Shoumlin
Porter Wright Morris & Arthur - 2
41 S High Street
Suite 2800
Columbus, OH 43215-6194
614-227-2000
Email: dshoumlin@porterwright.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kirsten R. Fraser
Porter Wright Morris & Arthur LLP
41 South High Street
29th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
614-227-2014
Fax: 614-227-2100
Email: kfraser@porterwright.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

**Carlos Francisco Rodriguez
Martinez**
*individually and on behalf of those
similarly situated*

represented by **Robert Howard Cohen**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ana P. Crawford
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Caroline Gentry
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David P Shoumlin
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kirsten R. Fraser
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Lucrecia Rosa Ramos

*individually and on behalf of those
similarly situated*

represented by **Robert Howard Cohen**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ana P. Crawford

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Caroline Gentry

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David P Shouvlin

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kirsten R. Fraser

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Kebin Palma Sanchez

*individually and on behalf of those
similarly situated*

represented by **Robert Howard Cohen**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ana P. Crawford

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Caroline Gentry

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David P Shouvlin

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kirsten R. Fraser

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Rene Kejang Ngenkeng

represented by **Caroline Gentry**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ana P. Crawford
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**United States Citizenship and
Immigration Services**

represented by **Christopher R Yates**
United States Attorney's Office - 2
303 Marconi Boulevard
2nd Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
614-469-5715
Fax: 614-469-5240
Email: christopher.yates@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Ken Cuccinelli
*in his official capacity as the Acting
Director of U.S. Citizenship and
Immigration Services*

represented by **Christopher R Yates**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Ernest Destefano
*in his official capacity as the Chief
of the Office of Intake and
Document Production, USCIS*

represented by **Christopher R Yates**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
07/22/2020	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Ranjitha Subramanya (Filing fee \$ 400 paid - receipt number: 0648-7568329), filed by Ranjitha Subramanya. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D) (Cohen, Robert) (Entered: 07/22/2020)

07/22/2020	<u>2</u>	MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order by Plaintiff Ranjitha Subramanya. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D) (Cohen, Robert) (Entered: 07/22/2020)
07/22/2020	<u>3</u>	DECLARATION of Ranijitha Subramanya re Motion for Temporary Restraining Order by Plaintiff Ranjitha Subramanya. (Cohen, Robert) Modified text and termed Motion on 7/23/2020 (jlk). (Entered: 07/22/2020)
07/22/2020	<u>4</u>	DECLARATION of Catherine Kang in Support of <u>2</u> MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order by Plaintiff Ranjitha Subramanya. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E) (Cohen, Robert) Modified text and termed Motion on 7/23/2020 (jlk). (Entered: 07/22/2020)
07/22/2020	<u>5</u>	DECLARATION of Andrea La Manna in Support of <u>2</u> MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order by Plaintiff Ranjitha Subramanya. (Cohen, Robert) Modified text and termed motion on 7/23/2020 (jlk). (Entered: 07/22/2020)
07/22/2020	<u>6</u>	REQUEST for Issuance of Summons. (Cohen, Robert) (Entered: 07/22/2020)
07/22/2020	<u>7</u>	REQUEST for Issuance of Summons. (Cohen, Robert) (Entered: 07/22/2020)
07/22/2020	<u>8</u>	REQUEST for Issuance of Summons. (Cohen, Robert) (Entered: 07/22/2020)
07/23/2020	<u>9</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Caroline Gentry for Plaintiff Ranjitha Subramanya (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/23/2020)
07/23/2020	<u>10</u>	ORDER Setting 65.1 Virtual Conference on Motion <u>2</u> MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order : Motion Hearing set for 7/29/2020 03:00 PM Virtually before Chief Judge Algenon L. Marbley. Signed by Chief Judge Algenon L. Marbley on 07/23/2020. (cw) (Entered: 07/23/2020)
07/24/2020	<u>11</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Christopher R Yates for Defendants Ken Cuccinelli, Ernest Destefano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services (Yates, Christopher) (Entered: 07/24/2020)

07/24/2020	<u>12</u>	Summons Issued as to United States Citizenship and Immigration Services. (jlk) (Main Document 12 replaced on 7/24/2020) (jlk). (Entered: 07/24/2020)
07/24/2020	<u>13</u>	Summons Issued as to Ken Cuccinelli. (jlk) (Entered: 07/24/2020)
07/24/2020	<u>14</u>	Summons Issued as to Ernest Destefano. (jlk) (Entered: 07/24/2020)
07/24/2020	<u>15</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiff Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Civil Cover Sheet</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/24/2020)
07/27/2020	<u>16</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Kirsten R. Fraser for Plaintiff Ranjitha Subramanya (Fraser, Kirsten) (Entered: 07/27/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>18</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Wajdi M. Ammarah</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>19</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Yoan Martinez Ayala</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>20</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Sirelene Moura Da Costa; Norberto Bernardes Da Fonseca; and Samuel Moura Fonseca</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>21</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Nicolas Joseph Bell Fabregat</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>22</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Abraham Blay Gayetaye</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>23</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Mohsen Haghighatpour</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>24</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha

		Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Syeda Fareeza Karimushan</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>25</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Meng Huan Lee</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>26</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Ching-Min Lin</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>27</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>28</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Richard Patrick McNulty</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>29</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Swetha Muralidhara</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>30</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Tania Patricia Carcamo Oseguera</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>31</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Michael Propper, Director, Chess NYC</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>32</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Lucrecia Rosa Ramos</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>33</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya / <i>Declaration of Kebin Antonio Palma Sanchez</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)

07/28/2020	<u>34</u>	Amended MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order <i>and Mandatory Injunction</i> by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya. (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>35</u>	MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>PLAINTIFFS AMENDED COMPLAINT FOR TEMPORARY RESTRAINING ORDER, PRELIMINARY AND PERMANENT INJUNCTIVE RELIEF, DECLARATORY RELIEF AND WRIT OF MANDAMUS, AND OBJECTION TO CERTIFICATION AS A CLASS ACTION (ECF NOS. 1, 2, 5, 17, and 34)</i> by Defendants Ken Cuccinelli, Ernest Destefano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Services. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Goodwin, USCIS/DHS Decl., # <u>2</u> Affidavit Troy, NBC/USCIS/DHS Decl.) (Yates, Christopher) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>36</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya <i>/Declaration of Rene Kejang Ngenkeng</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/28/2020	<u>37</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya, Rene Kejang Ngenkeng <i>/Notice of Adding Rene Kejang Ngenkeng as a Plaintiff and Class Representative</i> (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/28/2020)
07/29/2020	<u>38</u>	Emergency MOTION to Certify Class by Plaintiffs Rene Kejang Ngenkeng, Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya. (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/29/2020)
07/29/2020	<u>39</u>	NOTICE of Hearing:Preliminary Pretrial Conference set for 9/1/2020 11:00 AM in Teleconference before Magistrate Judge Elizabeth Preston Deavers. (sln) (Entered: 07/29/2020)
07/31/2020	<u>40</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Rene Kejang Ngenkeng, Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya <i>/NOTICE OF FILING REDACTED FIRST AMENDED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit FIRST AMENDED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT - REDACTED) (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 07/31/2020)
08/03/2020	<u>41</u>	REDACTED Version of 17 Amended Complaint. (sln) (Entered: 08/03/2020)

08/03/2020	42	<p>ORDER Setting Virtual Hearing on Motion 34 Mandatory Injunction : Motion Hearing set for 8/10/2020 09:30 AM in Virtual Courtroom 331 - Columbus before Chief Judge Algenon L. Marbley United States: +1 (646) 749-3112; Access Code: 347-407-869; and DENYING 35 Defendants Motion to Dismiss.</p> <p>GRANTING 2 34 Motion for Temporary Restraining Order. Signed by Chief Judge Algenon L. Marbley on 8/3/2020. (cw) (Entered: 08/03/2020)</p>
08/04/2020	43	<p>NOTICE of Appearance by Ana P. Crawford for Plaintiffs Rene Kejang Ngenkeng, Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya (Crawford, Ana) (Entered: 08/04/2020)</p>
08/04/2020	44	<p>Transcript of Motion for Temporary Restraining Order Proceedings held on July 29, 2020, before Judge Algenon L. Marbley. Court Reporter/Transcriber Shawna J. Evans, Telephone number 614-719-3316. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. <P>NOTICE RE: REDACTION OF TRANSCRIPTS: Within 5 business days of this filing, each party shall inform the Court, by filing a Notice of Redaction, of the party's intent to redact personal data identifiers from the electronic transcript of the court proceeding. The policy is located on our website at www.ohsd.uscourts.gov (Forms - Electronic Availability of Transcripts). Please read this policy carefully. <P> For a complete copy of a transcript, please contact the Court Reporter or the Clerk's Office. Redaction Request due 8/25/2020. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 9/4/2020. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 11/2/2020. (Evans, Shawna) (Entered: 08/04/2020)</p>
08/05/2020	45	<p>Joint MOTION to Continue <i>Preliminary Injunction Hearing and Associated Deadlines</i> by Plaintiffs Rene Kejang Ngenkeng, Lucrecia Rosa Ramos, Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez, Kebin Palma Sanchez, Ranjitha Subramanya. (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 08/05/2020)</p>
08/06/2020	46	<p>SCHEDULING ORDER AND ORDER granting 45 Motion to Continue; Preliminary Injunction Hearing reset for 8/24/2020 at 9:30 a.m. Signed by Chief Judge Algenon L. Marbley on 8/6/2020. (cw) (Entered: 08/06/2020)</p>

08/10/2020	47	CONSENT to Mediation by Defendant United States Citizenship and Immigration Services (Yates, Christopher) (Entered: 08/10/2020)
08/11/2020	48	NOTICE of Hearing: Settlement Conference set for 8/12/2020 11:00 AM in Teleconference before Magistrate Judge Elizabeth Preston Deavers. (sln) (Entered: 08/11/2020)
08/11/2020		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Elizabeth Preston Deavers: Status Conference held on 8/11/2020. (sln) (Entered: 08/11/2020)
08/12/2020	49	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Elizabeth Preston Deavers: Settlement Conference held on 8/12/2020. Negotiations not at impasse. Parties continue to confer. (sln) (Entered: 08/14/2020)
08/13/2020	50	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Elizabeth Preston Deavers: Continued mediation held on 8/13/2020. Parties continuing to mediate. (sln) (Entered: 08/17/2020)
08/13/2020	51	NOTATION ORDER : Joint Status Report regarding status, but not substance of settlement negotiations due by 8/18/2020. By Magistrate Judge Elizabeth Preston Deavers on 8/13/2020. (sln) (Entered: 08/17/2020)
08/18/2020	52	NOTICE of Voluntary Dismissal by Plaintiff Carlos Francisco Rodriguez Martinez (Gentry, Caroline) (Entered: 08/18/2020)
08/18/2020	53	STATUS REPORT <i>Joint Status Report RE: Parties' Proposed Consent Order, Pursuant to Notation Order ECF No. 51, to file Notice of/Proposed Consent Order 8-20-2020</i> by Defendant United States Citizenship and Immigration Services. (Yates, Christopher) (Entered: 08/18/2020)
08/19/2020	54	NOTICE by Defendant United States Citizenship and Immigration Services re 53 Status Report, <i>Joint Notice of Filing Proposed Consent Order</i> (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order [Proposed] Consent Order) (Yates, Christopher) (Entered: 08/19/2020)
08/21/2020	55	CONSENT ORDER. Signed by Chief Judge Algenon L. Marbley on 8/21/2020. (cw) (Entered: 08/21/2020)
08/21/2020	56	STATUS REPORT <i>Defendants' Report Pursuant to Consent Order (ECF No. 55), 08/21/2020</i> by Defendant United States Citizenship

		and Immigration Services. (Yates, Christopher) (Entered: 08/21/2020)
08/24/2020		NOTICE : The PPTC set for 9/1/2020 at 11:00 AM is VACATED. (sln) (Entered: 08/24/2020)
09/09/2020	57	STATUS REPORT <i>Defendants' Report Pursuant to Consent Order (ECF No. 55)</i> , 09/09/2020 by Defendant United States Citizenship and Immigration Services. (Yates, Christopher) (Entered: 09/09/2020)
09/30/2020	58	STATUS REPORT <i>Defendants' Report Pursuant to Consent Order (ECF No. 55)</i> , 09/30/2020, with next report due 10/09/2020 Pursuant to Consent Order (ECF No. 55) by Defendant United States Citizenship and Immigration Services. (Yates, Christopher) (Entered: 09/30/2020)
10/09/2020	59	STATUS REPORT <i>Defendants' Report Pursuant to Consent Order (ECF No. 55)</i> , 10/09/2020, with next report due 10/16/2020 Pursuant to Consent Order (ECF No. 55) by Defendant United States Citizenship and Immigration Services. (Yates, Christopher) (Entered: 10/09/2020)

PACER Service Center

Transaction Receipt

10/10/2020 11:18:53

PACER Login:	CRCClearinghouse:2563377:0	Client Code:	Simeck
Description:	Docket Report	Search Criteria:	2:20-cv-03707-ALM-EPD
Billable Pages:	8	Cost:	0.80