

[Create an Alert for This Case on RECAP](#)

CASREF,CLOSED,JURY,LC3,PROTO

U.S. District Court

Southern District of Ohio (Cincinnati)

CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:17-cv-00521-TSB

Meyers et al v. Cincinnati Board Of Education et al  
Assigned to: Judge Timothy S. Black  
Referred to: Judge Michael R. Barrett (Settlement)

Date Filed: 08/07/2017  
Date Terminated: 06/21/2021  
Jury Demand: Both  
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Case in other court:

Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

**Plaintiff**

**Karen Meyers  
as Administratrix of the Estate  
on behalf of  
Gabriel Taye**

represented by

**Alphonse Adam Gerhardstein  
Gerhardstein & Branch Co. LPA  
441 Vine Street  
Suite 3400  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
513-621-9100  
Fax: 513-345-5543  
Email: [al@FGGfirm.com](mailto:al@FGGfirm.com)  
LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Carla Leader  
The Law Office of Carla Loon Leader,  
LLC  
10999 Reed Hartman Hwy, #213  
Cincinnati, OH 45242  
513-502-3299  
Fax: 513-206-9994  
Email:  
[carla@cincinnatieducationlaw.com](mailto:carla@cincinnatieducationlaw.com)  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Christine Marie Hammond  
Gregory S. Young Co., LPA  
600 Vine Street  
Suite 402  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
513-721-1077  
Fax: 513-721-1919  
Email:  
[chammond@younginjurylaw.com](mailto:chammond@younginjurylaw.com)  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

		<p> <b>Christopher Dale Byers</b>  <b>Gregory S. Young Co., L.P.A.</b>  <b>600 Vine Street</b>  <b>Suite 402</b>  <b>Cincinnati, OH 45202</b>  <b>513-721-1077</b>  <b>Fax: 513-721-1919</b>  <b>Email: <a href="mailto:cbyers@younginjurylaw.com">cbyers@younginjurylaw.com</a></b>  <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b> </p> <p> <b>Gregory Scott Young</b>  <b>David J. Young Company, L.P.A. - 1</b>  <b>632 Vine Street</b>  <b>Cincinnati, OH 45202</b>  <b>513-721-1077</b>  <b>Fax: 513-721-1077</b>  <b>Email: <a href="mailto:gyoung@younginjurylaw.com">gyoung@younginjurylaw.com</a></b>  <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b> </p> <p> <b>Janaya Trotter Bratton</b>  <b>Gerhardstein &amp; Branch</b>  <b>441 Vine Street, Suite 3400</b>  <b>Cincinnati, OH 45202</b>  <b>United States</b>  <b>5136219100</b>  <b>Fax: 5133455543</b>  <b>Email: <a href="mailto:jtbratton@gbfirm.com">jtbratton@gbfirm.com</a></b>  <b>TERMINATED: 11/26/2019</b> </p> <p> <b>Jennifer Lynn Branch</b>  <b>Gerhardstein &amp; Branch Co. LPA</b>  <b>441 Vine Street, Suite 3400</b>  <b>Cincinnati, OH 45202</b>  <b>513-621-9100 x13</b>  <b>Fax: 513-345-5543</b>  <b>Email: <a href="mailto:jbranch@gbfirm.com">jbranch@gbfirm.com</a></b>  <b>TERMINATED: 02/05/2021</b> </p> <p> <b>Mary Caroline Hyatt</b>  <b>Gerhardstein &amp; Branch Co LPA</b>  <b>441 Vine Street</b>  <b>Suite 3400</b>  <b>Cincinnati, OH 45202</b>  <b>United States</b>  <b>513-621-9100</b>  <b>Email: <a href="mailto:caroline@FGGfirm.com">caroline@FGGfirm.com</a></b>  <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b> </p>
--	--	---

		Michele Young Gregory S. Young Co, LPA 600 Vine Street Suite 402 513-721-1077 Fax: 513-721-1919 Email: <a href="mailto:MYoung721@aol.com">MYoung721@aol.com</a> ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED
<b><u>Plaintiff</u></b>		
<b>Cornelia Reynolds</b>	represented by	Alphonse Adam Gerhardstein (See above for address) <b>LEAD ATTORNEY</b> <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  Carla Leader (See above for address) <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  Janaya Trotter Bratton (See above for address) <b>TERMINATED: 11/26/2019</b>  Jennifer Lynn Branch (See above for address) <b>TERMINATED: 02/05/2021</b>  Mary Caroline Hyatt (See above for address) <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>
<b><u>Plaintiff</u></b>		
<b>Benyam Taye</b>	represented by	Christine Marie Hammond (See above for address) <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  Christopher Dale Byers (See above for address) <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  Gregory Scott Young (See above for address) <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  Jennifer Lynn Branch (See above for address)

		<b>TERMINATED: 02/05/2021</b>  <b>Michele Young</b> <b>(See above for address)</b> <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>
V.		
<b><u>Defendant</u></b>		
<b>Cincinnati Board Of Education</b>	represented by	<b>Aaron Mark Herzig</b> <b>Taft Stettinius &amp; Hollister LLP</b> <b>425 Walnut Street</b> <b>Suite 1800</b> <b>Cincinnati, OH 45202</b> <b>513-357-8768</b> <b>Fax: 513-381-0205</b> <b>Email: <a href="mailto:aherzig@taftlaw.com">aherzig@taftlaw.com</a></b> <b>LEAD ATTORNEY</b> <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  <b>Daniel Joseph Hoying</b> <b>Cincinnati Public Schools</b> <b>2651 Burnet Avenue</b> <b>Cincinnati, OH 45219</b> <b>513-363-0114</b> <b>Fax: 513-363-0055</b> <b>Email: <a href="mailto:hoyingd@cps-k12.org">hoyingd@cps-k12.org</a></b> <b>LEAD ATTORNEY</b> <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  <b>Ian R. Smith</b> <b>McCaslin, Imbus &amp; McCaslin</b> <b>600 Vine Street, Suite 800</b> <b>Cincinnati, OH 45202</b> <b>(513) 421-4646</b> <b>Fax: (513) 421-7929</b> <b>Email: <a href="mailto:irsmith@mimlaw.com">irsmith@mimlaw.com</a></b> <b>TERMINATED: 04/02/2021</b> <b>LEAD ATTORNEY</b>  <b>Ralph Gary Winters</b> <b>McCaslin, Imbus &amp; McCaslin</b> <b>The Provident Bank Building</b> <b>600 Vine Street</b> <b>Suite 800</b> <b>Cincinnati, OH 45202</b> <b>513-421-4646</b>

		<p>Fax: 513-421-7929  Email: <a href="mailto:rgwinters@mimlaw.com">rgwinters@mimlaw.com</a>  TERMINATED: 04/02/2021  LEAD ATTORNEY</p> <p>Spencer S Cowan  Taft Stettinius and Hollister  425 Walnut Street  Suite 1800  Cincinnati, OH 45202  513-357-9464  Email: <a href="mailto:scowan@taftlaw.com">scowan@taftlaw.com</a>  LEAD ATTORNEY  ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</p> <p>Philip D. Williamson  Taft, Stettinius, &amp; Hollister LLP  425 Walnut Street  Cincinnati, OH 45202  513-381-2838  Fax: 513-381-0205  Email: <a href="mailto:pwilliamson@taftlaw.com">pwilliamson@taftlaw.com</a>  ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</p>
<b><u>Defendant</u></b>		
<p><b>Superintendent Mary Ronan</b>  In her Official Capacity as  Superintendent of Cincinnati Public  Schools</p>	<p>represented by</p>	<p>Aaron Mark Herzig  (See above for address)  LEAD ATTORNEY  ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</p> <p>Daniel Joseph Hoying  (See above for address)  LEAD ATTORNEY  ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</p> <p>Ian R. Smith  (See above for address)  TERMINATED: 04/02/2021  LEAD ATTORNEY</p> <p>Ralph Gary Winters  (See above for address)  TERMINATED: 04/02/2021  LEAD ATTORNEY</p> <p>Spencer S Cowan  (See above for address)  LEAD ATTORNEY</p>

		<b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  <b>Philip D. Williamson</b> (See above for address) <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>
<b><u>Defendant</u></b>		
<b>Ruthenia Jackson</b> <b>Individually and in her Official</b> <b>Capacity as Principal of Carson</b> <b>Elementary School</b>	represented by	<b>Aaron Mark Herzig</b> (See above for address) <b>LEAD ATTORNEY</b> <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  <b>Daniel Joseph Hoying</b> (See above for address) <b>LEAD ATTORNEY</b> <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  <b>Ian R. Smith</b> (See above for address) <b>TERMINATED: 04/02/2021</b> <b>LEAD ATTORNEY</b>  <b>Ralph Gary Winters</b> (See above for address) <b>TERMINATED: 04/02/2021</b> <b>LEAD ATTORNEY</b>  <b>Spencer S Cowan</b> (See above for address) <b>LEAD ATTORNEY</b> <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  <b>Philip D. Williamson</b> (See above for address) <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>
<b><u>Defendant</u></b>		
<b>Jeffrey McKenzie</b> <b>Individually and in his Official Capacity</b> <b>as Assistant Principal of Carson</b> <b>Elementary School</b>	represented by	<b>Aaron Mark Herzig</b> (See above for address) <b>LEAD ATTORNEY</b> <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>  <b>Daniel Joseph Hoying</b> (See above for address) <b>LEAD ATTORNEY</b> <b>ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</b>

		<p>Ian R. Smith (See above for address) TERMINATED: 04/02/2021 LEAD ATTORNEY</p> <p>Ralph Gary Winters (See above for address) TERMINATED: 04/02/2021 LEAD ATTORNEY</p> <p>Spencer S Cowan (See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</p> <p>Philip D. Williamson (See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</p>
<b><u>Defendant</u></b>		
<p><b>Margaret McLaughlin</b> In her individual capacity, as nurse at Carson Elementary School</p>	<p>represented by</p>	<p>Emily E Woerner City of Cincinnati 801 Plum St., Rm. 214 Cincinnati, OH 45202 513-684-3711 Email: <a href="mailto:emily.woerner@cincinnati-oh.gov">emily.woerner@cincinnati-oh.gov</a> LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</p> <p>John B Welch Arnold Todaro &amp; Welch 580 Lincoln Park Blvd. Suite 222 Dayton, OH 45429-3493 937-296-1600 Fax: 937-296-1644 Email: <a href="mailto:jwelch@arnoldlaw.net">jwelch@arnoldlaw.net</a> LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED</p> <p>Peter J Stackpole Gottesman, Stackpole 404 E. 12th Street First Floor Cincinnati, OH 45202 513-543-0720 Email:</p>

		<a href="mailto:peterjustinstackpole@gmail.com">peterjustinstackpole@gmail.com</a> <b>TERMINATED: 07/20/2020</b>

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/07/2017	<a href="#"><u>1</u></a>	COMPLAINT with JURY DEMAND against All Defendants ( Filing fee \$ 400 paid - receipt number: 0648-6070486), filed by Karen Meyers, Benyam Taye, Cornelia Reynolds. (Attachments: # <a href="#"><u>1</u></a> Civil Cover Sheet) (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/07/2017)
08/07/2017	<a href="#"><u>2</u></a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Alphonse Adam Gerhardstein for Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 08/07/2017)
08/07/2017	<a href="#"><u>3</u></a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Janaya Trotter Bratton for Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds (Bratton, Janaya) (Entered: 08/07/2017)
08/07/2017	<a href="#"><u>4</u></a>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye re <a href="#"><u>1</u></a> <i>Complaint of manual filing of Ex. A "Video of Carson Elementary School boy's bathroom January 24, 2017" and Ex. B "911 Call Made by Ms. Reynolds on January 26, 2017"</i> (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/07/2017)
08/07/2017	<a href="#"><u>5</u></a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Carla Leader for Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds (Leader, Carla) (Entered: 08/07/2017)
08/07/2017		DVD (Ex. A) & CD (Ex. B) re <a href="#"><u>1</u></a> Complaint received this date from Plaintiff and forwarded to the chambers of Judge Timothy



		S. Black. (eh) (Entered: 08/07/2017)
08/08/2017		If this case is referred, it will be to Magistrate Judge Stephanie K. Bowman. (jlw) (Entered: 08/08/2017)
08/14/2017	<a href="#">6</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Christine Marie Hammond for Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Benyam Taye (Hammond, Christine) (Entered: 08/14/2017)
09/07/2017	<a href="#">7</a>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed. Waiver sent to Cincinnati Board Of Education on 8/7/2016, answer due 10/6/2016; Ruthenia Jackson on 8/7/2016, answer due 10/6/2016; Jeffrey McKenzie on 8/7/2016, answer due 10/6/2016. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 09/07/2017)
10/06/2017	<a href="#">8</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Ian R. Smith for Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan (Smith, Ian) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017	<a href="#">9</a>	*DISREGARD THIS ENTRY IT WAS FILED IN ERROR* NOTICE of Appearance by Ian R. Smith for Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan (Smith, Ian) Modified to restrict entry to court users only on 10/6/2017 (jlw). (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017		Notice of Correction re: <a href="#">9</a> Notice of Appearance, This document was filed in error and restricted at request of counsel. Counsel will refile the correct document and Clerk restricted <a href="#">9</a> to court users only. (jlw) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017	<a href="#">10</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Ralph Gary Winters for Defendants

		Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan (Winters, Ralph) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017	<a href="#"><u>11</u></a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Daniel Joseph Hoying for Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan (Hoying, Daniel) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017	<a href="#"><u>12</u></a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Aaron Mark Herzig for Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017	<a href="#"><u>13</u></a>	MOTION to Dismiss by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017	<a href="#"><u>14</u></a>	Corporate Disclosure Statement by Defendant Cincinnati Board Of Education. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017	<a href="#"><u>15</u></a>	Corporate Disclosure Statement by Defendant Mary Ronan. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017	<a href="#"><u>16</u></a>	Corporate Disclosure Statement by Defendant Ruthenia Jackson. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017	<a href="#"><u>17</u></a>	Corporate Disclosure Statement by Defendant Jeffrey McKenzie. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/25/2017	<a href="#"><u>18</u></a>	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <a href="#"><u>13</u></a> MOTION to Dismiss New date requested 11/13/2017. by Plaintiff Karen Meyers. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 10/25/2017)

11/13/2017	<a href="#"><u>19</u></a>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <a href="#"><u>13</u></a> MOTION to Dismiss filed by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 11/13/2017)
12/04/2017	<a href="#"><u>20</u></a>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <a href="#"><u>13</u></a> MOTION to Dismiss filed by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 12/04/2017)
07/06/2018	<a href="#"><u>21</u></a>	MOTION to Amend/Correct <i>Amend Complaint</i> by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Attachments: # <a href="#"><u>1</u></a> Exhibit Amended Complaint) (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/06/2018)
07/10/2018	<a href="#"><u>22</u></a>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye re <a href="#"><u>21</u></a> MOTION to Amend/Correct <i>Amend Complaint of Filing Affidavit of Merit</i> (Attachments: # <a href="#"><u>1</u></a> Affidavit of Merit) (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/10/2018)
07/27/2018	<a href="#"><u>23</u></a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Philip D. Williamson for Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan (Williamson, Philip) (Entered: 07/27/2018)
07/27/2018	<a href="#"><u>24</u></a>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <a href="#"><u>21</u></a> MOTION to Amend/Correct <i>Amend Complaint CPS Defendants' Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Amend the Complaint</i> filed by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Attachments: # <a href="#"><u>1</u></a> Exhibit A - Comparison) (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 07/27/2018)

08/10/2018	<a href="#"><u>25</u></a>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <a href="#"><u>21</u></a> MOTION to Amend/Correct <i>Amend Complaint</i> filed by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/10/2018)
09/24/2018	<a href="#"><u>26</u></a>	ORDER granting <a href="#"><u>21</u></a> Motion to Amend the complaint. Plaintiffs shall file the amended complaint forthwith. Granting in part and denying in part <a href="#"><u>13</u></a> Defendants' Motion to Dismiss as follows: Defendants motion to dismiss Counts II and XI is GRANTED, and those claims are DISMISSED. Defendants motion to dismiss Counts I, III, IV, VI, VIII, X, and XII are DENIED, and those claims shall proceed. Defendants motion to dismiss Plaintiffs claim for municipal liability (Count V) is GRANTED as to ground one (unconstitutional policy) and DENIED as to grounds two, three, and four (custom, inadequate training/supervision, ratification). Count V shall so proceed. Defendants motion to dismiss Plaintiffs claim for negligent infliction of emotional distress (Count IX) is DENIED as to ground one (Doc. 21-1 at 202) and GRANTED as to ground two ( <i>Id.</i> at 203). Count IX shall so proceed. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 9/24/2018. (ss) (Entered: 09/24/2018)
09/25/2018	<a href="#"><u>27</u></a>	AMENDED COMPLAINT against All Defendants, filed by Karen Meyers, Benyam Taye, Cornelia Reynolds. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 09/25/2018)
10/09/2018	<a href="#"><u>28</u></a>	NOTICE OF APPEAL re <a href="#"><u>26</u></a> Order on Motion to Amend/Correct,,,, Order on Motion to Dismiss,,,, (Filing fee has been paid, receipt

		number 0648-6631218) by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 10/09/2018)
10/09/2018	<a href="#"><u>29</u></a>	MOTION for Leave to Appeal ( Responses due by 10/30/2018), MOTION to Stay <i>Defendants' Motion for Leave to Appeal and Motion for Stay Pending Appeal</i> by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 10/09/2018)
10/11/2018	<a href="#"><u>30</u></a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Peter J Stackpole for Defendant Margaret McLaughlin (Stackpole, Peter) (Entered: 10/11/2018)
10/11/2018	<a href="#"><u>31</u></a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Emily E Woerner for Defendant Margaret McLaughlin (Woerner, Emily) (Entered: 10/11/2018)
10/11/2018	<a href="#"><u>32</u></a>	USCA Case Number 18-3974 for <a href="#"><u>28</u></a> Notice of Appeal, filed by Ruthenia Jackson, Cincinnati Board Of Education, Jeffrey McKenzie and Mary Ronan; case manager Amy E. Gigliotti, 513-564-7012. (er) (Entered: 10/15/2018)
10/17/2018	<a href="#"><u>33</u></a>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed. Waiver sent to Margaret McLaughlin on 9/25/2018, answer due 11/26/2018. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 10/17/2018)
10/29/2018	<a href="#"><u>34</u></a>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <a href="#"><u>29</u></a> MOTION for Leave to Appeal MOTION to Stay <i>Defendants' Motion for Leave to Appeal and Motion for Stay Pending Appeal</i> New date requested 11/13/2018. by Plaintiffs Karen

		Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 10/29/2018)
10/30/2018		Notation Order: This civil action is before the Court on Plaintiffs' unopposed motion for an extension of time to respond to CPS Defendants' motion to certify appeal and motion to stay proceedings. For good cause shown, that motion (Doc. <a href="#">34</a> ) is GRANTED. Plaintiffs shall file their response to CPS Defendants' motions (Doc. <a href="#">29</a> ) on or before 11/13/18. IT IS SO ORDERED. (bjc) (Entered: 10/30/2018)
11/13/2018	<a href="#">35</a>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <a href="#">29</a> MOTION for Leave to Appeal MOTION to Stay <i>Defendants' Motion for Leave to Appeal and Motion for Stay Pending Appeal</i> filed by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 11/13/2018)
11/20/2018	<a href="#">36</a>	ANSWER with Jury Demand to <a href="#">27</a> Amended Complaint filed by Margaret McLaughlin. (Welch, John) Modified docket txt on 11/21/2018 (eh). (Entered: 11/20/2018)
11/27/2018	<a href="#">37</a>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <a href="#">29</a> MOTION for Leave to Appeal MOTION to Stay <i>Defendants' Motion for Leave to Appeal and Motion for Stay Pending Appeal Defendants' Reply in Support of Their Motion for Leave to Appeal and Motion for Stay Pending Appeal</i> filed by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 11/27/2018)

02/05/2019	<a href="#">38</a>	ORDER granting <a href="#">29</a> Motion for Leave to Appeal and for Stay pending appeal. The Court hereby STAYS the current action until the Sixth Circuit has ruled on Defendants' appeal. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 2/5/2019. (ss) (Entered: 02/05/2019)
04/03/2019	<a href="#">39</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Mary Caroline Hyatt for Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds (Hyatt, Mary) (Entered: 04/03/2019)
04/19/2019	<a href="#">40</a>	MOTION to Lift Stay by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 04/19/2019)
05/10/2019	<a href="#">41</a>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <a href="#">40</a> MOTION to Lift Stay <i>Defendants' Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Lift Stay</i> filed by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 05/10/2019)
05/24/2019	<a href="#">42</a>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <a href="#">40</a> MOTION to Lift Stay filed by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/24/2019)
05/29/2019	<a href="#">43</a>	ORDER granting <a href="#">40</a> Plaintiffs' Motion to Lift Stay. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 5/29/19. (rrs) (Entered: 05/29/2019)
06/12/2019	<a href="#">44</a>	ANSWER to <a href="#">27</a> Amended Complaint <i>Defendants Cincinnati Board of Education, Mary Ronan, Ruthenia Jackson, and Jeffrey McKenzie's Answer to First Amended Complaint</i> filed by Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson,

		Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 06/12/2019)
06/18/2019		<p>Notation Order and Notice of Hearing: A Preliminary Pretrial Conference by telephone is set before Judge Timothy S. Black for 7/17/2019 at 10:30 a.m. COUNSEL SHALL CALL: 1-888-684-8852; Access Code: 8411435; Security Code: 123456, and wait for the Court to join the conference. Before the pretrial conference, counsel shall comply with the MANDATORY pre-preliminary pretrial conference between counsel, as required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(f). THE REPORT MUST BE FILED 7 DAYS PRIOR TO THE PRELIMINARY PRETRIAL CONFERENCE. Pretrial procedures and forms can be found on our website at: <a href="https://www.ohsd.uscourts.gov/FPBlack">https://www.ohsd.uscourts.gov/FPBlack</a>. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 6/18/19. (rrs) (Entered: 06/18/2019)</p>
07/10/2019	<a href="#">45</a>	RULE 26(f) REPORT by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/10/2019)
07/17/2019		Minute Entry: This civil action came before the Court for a Preliminary Pretrial Conference by telephone on 7/17/2019 at 10:30 a.m. Christine Hammond, Michele Young, and Jennifer Branch appeared on behalf of Plaintiffs; Aaron Herzig, Philip Williamson, Ian Smith, and Ralph Winters appeared on behalf of Defendants Cincinnati Board of Education, Superintendent Mary Ronan, Ruthenia Jackson, and Jeffrey



		McKenzie; Emily Woerner and John Welch appeared on behalf of Defendant Margaret McLaughlin. A Calendar Order will issue by separate entry. (rrs) (Entered: 07/17/2019)
07/17/2019	<a href="#">46</a>	<b>**VACATED**</b> CALENDAR ORDER: Initial Disclosures due by 8/9/2019. Motions directed to the pleadings due by 30 days following Sixth Circuit ruling on appeal. Motions to amend due by 30 days following Sixth Circuit ruling on appeal. Lay Witness due by 11/1/2019. Status Conference set for 12/31/2019 02:00 PM in Teleconference before Judge Timothy S. Black. Discovery (Fact) due by 1/30/2020. Plaintiff Primary Expert due by 2/28/2020. Defendant Primary Expert due by 4/30/2020. Plaintiff Rebuttal Expert due by 6/15/2020. Discovery (Expert) due by 7/15/2020. Dispositive motions due by 8/14/2020. Final Pretrial Conference set for 1/4/2021 01:00 PM in Chambers before Judge Timothy S. Black. Jury Trial set for 1/11/2021 09:30 AM in Courtroom 1 - Cincinnati before Judge Timothy S. Black. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 7/17/19. (rrs) (Entered: 07/17/2019)
11/26/2019	<a href="#">47</a>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds <i>of Withdrawal Of Attorney Janaya Trotter Bratton</i> (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 11/26/2019)
12/31/2019		Minute Entry and Notation Order: This civil action came before the Court for a status conference by telephone on 12/31/2019 at 2:00 p.m. Christine Hammond, Michele

		<p>Young, and Jennifer Branch appeared on behalf of Plaintiffs; Aaron Herzig, Philip Williamson, and Ralph Winters appeared on behalf of Defendants Cincinnati Board of Education, Superintendent Mary Ronan, Ruthenia Jackson, and Jeffrey McKenzie; John Welch appeared on behalf of Defendant Margaret McLaughlin. The parties agreed on the need to adjust the case calendar. Accordingly, the Calendar Order (Doc. <a href="#">46</a>) is VACATED. An Amended Calendar Order shall issue by separate entry. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 1/2/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 01/02/2020)</p>
01/02/2020	<a href="#">48</a>	<p><b>**VACATED**AMENDED CALENDAR ORDER:</b> Discovery (Fact) due by 3/30/2020. Plaintiff Primary Expert due by 4/30/2020. Defendant Primary Expert due by 6/30/2020. Rebuttal Expert due by 7/30/2020. Discovery (Expert) due by 8/31/2020. Dispositive motions due by 8/31/2020. Final Pretrial Conference set for 1/4/2021 01:00 PM in Chambers before Judge Timothy S. Black. Jury Trial set for 1/11/2021 09:30 AM in Courtroom 1 - Cincinnati before Judge Timothy S. Black. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 1/2/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 01/02/2020)</p>
01/31/2020	<a href="#">49</a>	<p>STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER for the protection of confidential information. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 1/31/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 01/31/2020)</p>

05/26/2020	<a href="#">50</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Christopher Dale Byers for Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Benyam Taye (Byers, Christopher) (Entered: 05/26/2020)
05/27/2020	<a href="#">51</a>	NOTICE to Take Deposition of Josh Havens, Nili Gubin, Lainey Bush, Linda Hissett, Gabrielle Yancy, and Bradley Tamplin by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/27/2020)
06/02/2020	<a href="#">52</a>	NOTICE to Take Deposition of Janice Pitts, Shannon Keach, and Claire Frank by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 06/02/2020)
06/09/2020	<a href="#">53</a>	NOTICE to Take Deposition of Sheila Jenkins by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 06/09/2020)
06/11/2020	<a href="#">54</a>	NOTICE to Take Deposition of Antonio Smith by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 06/11/2020)
06/19/2020		Notation Order: At the parties' request and pursuant to S.D. Ohio Civ. R. 37.1, this civil action is set for an informal discovery conference by telephone on 6/24/2020 at 1:00 p.m. COUNSEL SHALL CALL: 1-888-684-8852; Access code: 8411435; Security code: 123456, and wait for the Court to join the conference. Counsel for both parties shall each submit a 1-3 page explanation of the issues presented via email to chambers ( <a href="mailto:black_chambers@ohsd.uscourts">black_chambers@ohsd.uscourts</a> )

		<p><a href="#">s.gov</a>) and opposing counsel by 6/22/2020. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 6/19/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 06/19/2020)</p>
06/24/2020		<p>Notation Order: The informal discovery conference by telephone set for 6/24/2020 in this civil action is hereby VACATED and RESCHEDULED for 6/25/2020 at 1:00 p.m. COUNSEL SHALL CALL: 1-888-684-8852; Access code: 8411435; Security code: 123456, and wait for the Court to join the conference. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 6/23/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 06/24/2020)</p>
06/25/2020		<p>Minute Entry and Notation Order: Pursuant to S.D. Ohio Civ. R. 37.1, this civil action came before the Court for an informal discovery conference by telephone on 6/25/2020 at 1:00 p.m. Jennifer Branch, Al Gerhardstein, Christine Hammond, Christopher Byers, Mary Hyatt, and Michele Young appeared for Plaintiffs; Aaron Herzig, Gary Winters, Philip Williamson, Spencer Cowan, Stephanie Scott, and John Welch appeared for Defendants. The Court provided its recommendations regarding the discovery issues, to wit: (i) On Plaintiffs' deposition limit, the Court instructed Plaintiffs to prioritize key witnesses first and if Plaintiffs need to depose more than fifteen (15) witnesses, Plaintiffs should file a motion for leave to conduct additional depositions. (ii) On Plaintiffs' request for student discipline and behavior logs, the Court found requiring the</p>

		<p>production of 125 students behavior logs for three school years to be burdensome, however the Court found additional production of student discipline and behavior logs to be appropriate. The parties confirmed that they are open to finding a compromise on the production of additional student discipline and behavior logs. (iii) On Plaintiffs' request for access to the underlying facts gathered from an internal investigation conducted by Defendants, the Court stated that it is open to ordering the Defendants to produce the report for <i>in camera</i> review. The Defendants agreed to affirm by 6/30/2020 whether they will produce the internal investigation report with necessary redactions of privileged information. If the Defendants agree to produce the internal investigation with redactions, they will produce it by 6/30/2020. If the Defendants do not provide the Plaintiffs with the redacted internal investigation report, the Court may order it to be submitted to the Court for <i>in camera</i> review. Defendants stated that if they produce the redacted internal investigation report, they would need to enter a stipulation or agreed order confirming that production of the redacted internal investigation does not waive privilege over other materials or work product. Moreover, the Court directed the Defendants to produce forthwith a privilege log that, at a minimum, reflects when the internal investigation was</p>
--	--	---

		<p>conducted. (iv) On Plaintiffs' contention that Defendants are in possession of responsive, relevant documents that have not been produced, the Court directed the Defendants to affirm that they are not in possession of any responsive, relevant documents that have not been produced. Separately, the Court CONTINUED the fact discovery deadline to 8/31/2020, and directed the parties to confer and submit a proposed amended calendar order to the Court. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 6/25/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 06/26/2020)</p>
07/10/2020	<a href="#">55</a>	<p>NOTICE by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan <i>Notice of Filing Subpoena Service Return</i> (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Subpoena to Linda Hunter, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - Delivery notice) (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 07/10/2020)</p>
07/20/2020	<a href="#">56</a>	<p>NOTICE by Defendant Margaret McLaughlin <i>of Withdrawal of Counsel</i> (Woerner, Emily) (Entered: 07/20/2020)</p>
08/04/2020	<a href="#">57</a>	<p>NOTICE by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan <i>Notice of Filing Subpoena Service Return</i> (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Subpoena to Antonio Smith, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - Return receipt) (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 08/04/2020)</p>
08/13/2020	<a href="#">58</a>	<p>NOTICE by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan <i>Notice of Filing Subpoena Service</i></p>

		<i>Return</i> (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Subpoena to Hamilton County Coroner, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - Service confirmation) (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/13/2020	<a href="#">59</a>	NOTICE by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan <i>Notice of Filing Subpoena Service Return</i> (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Subpoena to CPD Det. Eric Karaguleff, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - Service confirmation) (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 08/13/2020)
08/26/2020	<a href="#">60</a>	NOTICE by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan <i>Notice of Filing Subpoena Service Return</i> (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Subpoena to Irene Hunter, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - Return receipt) (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 08/26/2020)
08/26/2020	<a href="#">61</a>	NOTICE by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan <i>Notice of Filing Subpoena Service Return</i> (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Subpoena to Julie Rachford-Sullivan, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - Return receipt) (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 08/26/2020)
10/06/2020	<a href="#">62</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Spencer S Cowan for Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan (Cowan, Spencer) (Entered: 10/06/2020)
10/16/2020		Notation Order: This civil action is set for status conference by telephone on 10/20/2020 at 12:00 p.m. COUNSEL SHALL CALL: 1-888-684-8852; Access

		code: 8411435; Security code: 123456, and wait for the Court to join the conference. The parties also informed the Court that they have reached an impasse regarding a discovery issue. Counsel shall each submit a 1-2 page explanation of the issues presented via email to chambers ( <a href="mailto:black_chambers@ohsd.uscourts.gov">black_chambers@ohsd.uscourts.gov</a> ) and opposing counsel by 10/19/2020. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 10/16/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 10/16/2020)
10/26/2020	<a href="#">63</a>	MOTION to Compel <i>Student Records</i> by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1 Pltfs First RFPD, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 2 Branch ltr Herzig 7.1.20, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 3 Branch ltr Herzig 9.25.20, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit 4 Branch ltr Court 10.19.20) (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 10/26/2020)
10/26/2020	<a href="#">64</a>	MOTION to File Document Under Seal <i>Exhibits A through F in support of Motion to Compel</i> by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 10/26/2020)
10/27/2020		Notation Order: This civil action is before the Court on the Plaintiffs' motion for leave to file documents under seal (Doc. <a href="#">64</a> ). In order to seal court records, a district court must set forth specific findings and conclusions which justify filing documents under seal. See <i>Shane Grp. Inc. v. Blue Cross Blue Shield</i> , 825 F.3d 299, 306 (6th Cir. 2016). The Court cannot make such a finding at this time, thus the Court



		TEMPORARILY GRANTS Plaintiffs leave to file the documents at issue under seal. The Court will review the sealed documents once they are filed and will rule on Plaintiffs' motion at that time. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 10/27/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 10/27/2020)
10/28/2020	<a href="#">66</a>	NOTICE to Take Deposition of Dr. Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Margaret McLaughlin, Laura Mitchell, and Carolyn Jones by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 10/28/2020)
10/29/2020	<a href="#">67</a>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to Extend Deadlines</i> by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) Modified Docket Text to remove requested date, multiple dates requested to be extended on 10/29/2020 (bjc). (Entered: 10/29/2020)
11/02/2020		Notation Order: This civil action is before the Court on the parties' joint motion for extension of time. (Doc. <a href="#">67</a> ). For good cause shown, that motion (Doc. <a href="#">67</a> ) is GRANTED. The Amended Calendar Order (Doc. <a href="#">48</a> ) is hereby VACATED. The Second Amended Calendar Order will issue by separate entry. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 11/2/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 11/02/2020)
11/02/2020	<a href="#">68</a>	<b>**VACATED**</b> CALENDAR ORDER: Discovery (Fact) due by 12/11/2020. Plaintiff Primary Expert due by 1/11/2021. Defendant Primary Expert due by 3/12/2021. Rebuttal Expert

		due by 4/12/2021. Discovery (Expert) due by 5/12/2021. Dispositive motions due by 5/12/2021. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 11/2/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 11/02/2020)
11/02/2020	<a href="#">69</a>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <a href="#">63</a> MOTION to Compel <i>Student Records</i> filed by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 11/02/2020)
11/06/2020	<a href="#">70</a>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <a href="#">63</a> MOTION to Compel <i>Student Records</i> filed by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 11/06/2020)
11/09/2020	<a href="#">71</a>	ORDER granting <a href="#">64</a> Motion to File Document Under Seal. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 11/9/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 11/09/2020)
11/12/2020	<a href="#">72</a>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye re <a href="#">63</a> MOTION to Compel <i>Student Records of Supplemental Authority</i> (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 11/12/2020)
11/16/2020	<a href="#">73</a>	Response re <a href="#">72</a> Notice (Other) <i>CPS Defendants' Response to Plaintiffs' Notice of Supplemental Authority</i> re <a href="#">63</a> MOTION to Compel Student Records by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Herzig, Aaron) Modified to create link to motion on 11/17/2020 (eh). (Entered: 11/16/2020)
11/23/2020	<a href="#">74</a>	ORDER granting in part and denying in part <a href="#">63</a> Motion to Compel. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on

		11/23/2020. (rrs) (Entered: 11/23/2020)
12/29/2020	<a href="#">75</a>	USCA OPINION AND JUDGMENT as to <a href="#">28</a> Notice of Appeal: The Sixth Circuit ORDERS that the district courts denial of Ruthenia Jackson and Jeffrey McKenzies motion to dismiss is AFFIRMED. <b>Note: Mandate to issue.</b> (er) (Entered: 12/30/2020)
01/04/2021	<a href="#">76</a>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time New date requested 2/15/2021. <i>to Extend Deadlines</i> by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 01/04/2021)
01/20/2021	<a href="#">77</a>	MANDATE of USCA as to <a href="#">28</a> Notice of Appeal: No costs taxed. (er) (Entered: 01/22/2021)
01/22/2021		Notation Order: This civil action is before the Court on the parties' joint motion for extension of time. (Doc. <a href="#">76</a> ). For good cause shown, that motion (Doc. <a href="#">76</a> ) is GRANTED. The Second Amended Calendar Order (Doc. <a href="#">68</a> ) is hereby VACATED. The Third Amended Calendar Order will issue by separate entry. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 1/22/2021. (rrs) (Entered: 01/22/2021)
01/22/2021	<a href="#">78</a>	<b>**VACATED**THIRD AMENDED CALENDAR ORDER:</b> Plaintiff Primary Expert due by 2/15/2021. Defendant Primary Expert due by 4/15/2021. Rebuttal Expert due by 5/17/2021. Discovery (Expert) due by 6/18/2021. Dispositive motions due by 6/18/2021. Signed by Judge Timothy S.

		Black on 1/22/2021. (rrs) (Entered: 01/22/2021)
01/24/2021	<a href="#">79</a>	MOTION to Take an Additional Deposition of Mother of Student Who Defendant CPS Claims Attached Gabriel Taye by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1. Dr. Ruthenia Jackson Deposition Excerpts, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 2. Linda Hissett Deposition Excerpts, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 3. Jeffrey McKenzie Deposition Excerpts, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit 4. Nili Mitrovich Deposition Excerpts, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit 5. Detective Eric Karaguleff Deposition Excerpts, # <a href="#">6</a> Exhibit 6. Gabrielle Yancey Deposition Excerpts, # <a href="#">7</a> Exhibit 7. Claire Frank Deposition Excerpts) (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 01/24/2021)
01/24/2021	<a href="#">80</a>	MOTION to File Document Under Seal by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 01/24/2021)
02/05/2021	<a href="#">81</a>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds <i>Of Withdrawal From Case Of Jennifer L. Branch As Trial Attorney For Plaintiffs And Notice Of Substitution Of Trial Attorney For Plaintiffs By Alphonse A Gerhardstein</i> (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit Cornelia Reynolds Signed Consent for Withdrawal, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit Karen Meyers Signed Consent for Withdrawal) (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 02/05/2021)
02/15/2021	<a href="#">82</a>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye re <a href="#">78</a> Preliminary Pretrial Order, <i>of Compliance</i>

		<p><i>with Calendar Order</i></p> <p>(Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Affidavit Declaration of Dr. Beth Brant, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit Expert Report of Dr. Beth Brant, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit Expert Report Attachments to Report of Dr. Beth Brant, # <a href="#">4</a> Affidavit Declaration of Dr. George Shaw, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit Expert Report of Dr. George Shaw, # <a href="#">6</a> Exhibit Expert Report Attachments to Report of Dr. George Shaw, # <a href="#">7</a> Affidavit Declaration of Dr. Thomas Sullivan, # <a href="#">8</a> Exhibit Expert Report of Dr. Thomas Sullivan, # <a href="#">9</a> Exhibit Expert Report Attachments to Expert Report of Dr. Thomas Sullivan, # <a href="#">10</a> Affidavit Declaration of Dr. Lisa Pescara-Kovach, # <a href="#">11</a> Exhibit Expert Report of Dr. Lisa Pescara-Kovach, # <a href="#">12</a> Exhibit Expert Report Attachments to Expert Report of Dr. Lisa Pescara-Kovach, # <a href="#">13</a> Affidavit Declaration of Dr. Steven Sunderland, # <a href="#">14</a> Exhibit Expert Report of Dr. Steven Sunderland, # <a href="#">15</a> Exhibit Expert Report Attachments to Expert Report of Dr. Steven Sunderland) (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 02/15/2021)</p>
02/16/2021	<a href="#">83</a>	<p>RESPONSE in Opposition re <a href="#">79</a> MOTION to Take an Additional Deposition of Mother of Student Who Defendant CPS Claims Attached Gabriel Taye <i>Defendants Cincinnati Board of Education, Mary Ronan, Ruthenia Jackson, and Jeffrey McKenzie's Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Exceed the Deposition Limit</i> filed by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary</p>

		Ronan. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Deposition Transcript Excerpts of Jeffrey McKenzie, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - Deposition Transcript Excerpts of Cornelia Daniels) (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 02/16/2021)
02/19/2021	<a href="#">84</a>	MOTION to Amend/Correct <a href="#">44</a> Answer to Amended Complaint, <i>Defendants Cincinnati Board of Education, Mary Ronan, Ruthenia Jackson, and Jeffrey McKenzie's Motion to Amend Their Answer</i> by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Amended Answer, # <a href="#">2</a> Text of Proposed Order) (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 02/19/2021)
02/22/2021	<a href="#">85</a>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <a href="#">79</a> MOTION to Take an Additional Deposition of Mother of Student Who Defendant CPS Claims Attached Gabriel Taye filed by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 02/22/2021)
02/22/2021	<a href="#">86</a>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <a href="#">84</a> MOTION to Amend/Correct <a href="#">44</a> Answer to Amended Complaint, <i>Defendants Cincinnati Board of Education, Mary Ronan, Ruthenia Jackson, and Jeffrey McKenzie's Motion to Amend Their Answer</i> filed by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A Excerpts from Cornelia (Reynolds) Daniels Depo, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B Excerpts from Julie Rachford-Sullivan Depo) (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 02/22/2021)

02/23/2021		<p>Notation Order: This civil action is before the Court on the Plaintiffs' motion for leave to conduct an additional deposition (Doc. <a href="#">79</a> ) pursuant to the Court's 6/25/2020 Minute Entry, and motion to file documents under seal in support of the motion (Doc. <a href="#">80</a> ). Having considered the motion for leave (Doc. <a href="#">79</a> ), Defendants' opposition (Doc. <a href="#">83</a> ), and reply in support (Doc. <a href="#">85</a> ) under Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 26 and 30, and for Plaintiffs' good cause shown, the motion for leave is GRANTED. Plaintiffs are granted leave to conduct <u>one</u> additional deposition of the mother of Student 23. Plaintiffs SHALL limit the scope of the deposition to the identity of P.A. Plaintiffs' motion to file documents under seal (Doc. <a href="#">80</a> ) in support of the motion for leave is denied as MOOT. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 2/23/2021. (rrs) (Entered: 02/23/2021)</p>
02/25/2021	<a href="#">87</a>	<p>NOTICE to Take Deposition of Mother of Student 23 by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds, Benyam Taye. (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 02/25/2021)</p>
02/25/2021	<a href="#">88</a>	<p>NOTICE by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds <i>Of Filing Proof Of Service Of Subpoena</i> (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 02/25/2021)</p>
03/04/2021		<p>Notation Order: At the parties' request and pursuant to S.D. Ohio Civ. R. 37.1, this civil action is set for an informal discovery conference by telephone on 3/10/2021 at 2:00 p.m. COUNSEL SHALL CALL: 1-888-</p>

		684-8852; Access code: 8411435; Security code: 123456, and wait for the Court to join the conference. Counsel for both parties shall each submit a 1-3 page explanation of the issue(s) presented via email to chambers ( <a href="mailto:black_chambers@ohsd.uscourts.gov">black_chambers@ohsd.uscourts.gov</a> ) and opposing counsel by 3/8/2021. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 3/4/2021. (rrs) (Entered: 03/04/2021)
03/08/2021	<a href="#">89</a>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <a href="#">84</a> MOTION to Amend/Correct <a href="#">44</a> Answer to Amended Complaint, <i>Defendants Cincinnati Board of Education, Mary Ronan, Ruthenia Jackson, and Jeffrey McKenzie's Motion to Amend Their Answer Defendants Cincinnati Board of Education, Mary Ronan, Ruthenia Jackson, and Jeffrey McKenzie's Reply in Support of Their Motion to Amend Their Answer</i> filed by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Deposition Transcript Excerpts of Cornelia Daniels, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - Deposition Transcript Excerpts of Dr. Ruthenia Jackson, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit C - Deposition Transcript Excerpts of Jeffrey McKenzie, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit D - Deposition Transcript Excerpts of Benyam Taye) (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 03/08/2021)
03/10/2021		Minute Entry and Notation Order: This civil action came before the Court for an informal discovery conference by telephone on 3/10/2021 at 2:00 p.m. Al Gerhardstein, Carla



		<p>Leader, Christine Hammond, Mary Hyatt, and Michele Young appeared for Plaintiffs; Aaron Herzig and John Welch appeared for Defendants. The parties discussed Plaintiffs' request for the Court to conduct an <i>in camera</i> review of Defendants' investigation report following the deposition of Student 23's mother. Given Plaintiffs' showing of good cause for their request, the question of privilege, the small amount necessary for this Court to review, and the nature of the issues presented in this case, the Court concludes that an <i>in camera</i> review of the report and redacted attachments is appropriate. On or before 3/17/2021, Defendants SHALL provide the Court via email (<a href="mailto:black_chambers@ohsd.uscourts.gov">black_chambers@ohsd.uscourts.gov</a>) with (1) an unredacted copy of the report and attachments; (2) a redacted copy of the report and attachments; and (3) a privilege log that describes the basis for each redaction. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 3/10/2021. (rrs) (Entered: 03/10/2021)</p>
03/18/2021	<a href="#">90</a>	<p>ORDER granting in part and denying in part <a href="#">84</a> Motion to Amend/Correct. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 3/18/2021. (rrs) (Entered: 03/18/2021)</p>
03/22/2021	<a href="#">91</a>	<p>AMENDED ANSWER to <a href="#">27</a> Amended Complaint <i>Amended Answer of Defendants Cincinnati Board of Education, Mary Ronan, Ruthenia Jackson, and Jeffrey McKenzie to First Amended Complaint by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of</i></p>

		Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 03/22/2021)
03/29/2021	<a href="#">92</a>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time New date requested 5/17/2021. <i>Joint Motion to Extend Deadlines</i> by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Text of Proposed Order) (Herzig, Aaron) (Entered: 03/29/2021)
03/29/2021		Notation Order: This civil action is before the Court on the parties' joint motion for extension of time (Doc. <a href="#">92</a> ) in order for the parties to pursue settlement discussions. For good cause shown, that motion (Doc. <a href="#">92</a> ) is GRANTED. The Third Amended Calendar Order (Doc. <a href="#">78</a> ) is hereby VACATED. A calendar order will issue by separate entry. IT IS SO ORDERED. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 3/29/2021. (rrs) (Entered: 03/29/2021)
03/29/2021	<a href="#">93</a>	FOURTH AMENDED CALENDAR ORDER: Defendant Primary Expert due by 5/17/2021. Rebuttal Expert due by 6/18/2021. Discovery (Expert) due by 7/19/2021. Dispositive motions due by 8/20/2021. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 3/29/2021. (rrs) (Entered: 03/29/2021)
03/29/2021	<a href="#">94</a>	ORDER OF REFERRAL. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 3/29/2021. (rrs) (Entered: 03/29/2021)
04/01/2021	<a href="#">95</a>	NOTICE by Defendants Cincinnati Board Of Education, Ruthenia Jackson, Jeffrey McKenzie, Mary Ronan <i>Notice</i>

		<i>of Withdrawal of Co-Counsel</i> (Smith, Ian) (Entered: 04/01/2021)
04/06/2021		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael R. Barrett: Status Conference held on 4/6/2021; Al Gerhardstein, Carla Leader, Michele Young and Christine Hammond appeared for plaintiffs; John Welch appeared for defendant McLaughlin; and Aaron Herzig appeared for defendants Cincinnati Board of Education; ex parte positions statements shall be due no later than 4/13/21 and can be emailed to <a href="mailto:barrett_chambers@ohsd.uscourts.gov">barrett_chambers@ohsd.uscourts.gov</a> ; a Settlement Conference is set for 4/19/2021 at 01:30 PM in ADR Suite, Room 203, Cincinnati before Judge Michael R. Barrett with a back up date of 4/23/21; a follow up Status Conference is set for 4/16/2021 at 01:00 PM by teleconference before Judge Michael R. Barrett; <b>NOTE: parties shall refer to the entry on 3/31/21 for conferencing instructions.</b> (ba) (Entered: 04/06/2021)
04/16/2021		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael R. Barrett: Status Conference held on 4/16/2021; Al Gerhardstein, Christine Hammond, Caroline Hyatt and Michele Young appeared for plaintiffs; Aaron Herzig appeared for dfts Cincinnati Bd of Ed; and John Welch appeared for dft McLaughlin; logistical matters discussed related to the Settlement Conference set for 4/19/2021 at 01:30 PM before Judge Michael R. Barrett; the parties shall report to

		Courtroom 109 - Cincinnati on 4/19/21 at 1:30 pm. (ba) (Entered: 04/16/2021)
04/19/2021		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael R. Barrett: Settlement Conference held on 4/19/2021; Al Gerhardstein and his representatives appeared; Aaron Herzig and Daniel Hoying appeared with his representatives; and John Welch appeared with his representative; the matter is continued as ongoing. (ba) (Entered: 04/21/2021)
06/08/2021	<a href="#">96</a>	Joint MOTION Establish Qualified Settlement Fund by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit Order) (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 06/08/2021)
06/08/2021	<a href="#">97</a>	ORDER Establishing Qualified Settlement Fund and Appointing Fund Administrator. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 6/8/2021. (rrs) (Entered: 06/08/2021)
06/14/2021	<a href="#">98</a>	NOTICE by Plaintiff Karen Meyers <i>Of Deposit Into The Gabriel Benyam Taye Qualified Settlement Fund</i> (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 06/14/2021)
06/16/2021	<a href="#">99</a>	STIPULATION of Dismissal by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds. (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 06/16/2021)
06/16/2021	<a href="#">100</a>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Karen Meyers, Cornelia Reynolds <i>Of Filing Settlement Agreement</i> (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit Settlement Agreement) (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 06/16/2021)

06/21/2021	<a href="#">101</a>	STIPULATION OF DISMISSAL. Signed by Judge Timothy S. Black on 6/21/2021. (rrs) (Entered: 06/21/2021)
------------	---------------------	---

PACER Service Center			
Transaction Receipt			
09/19/2021 11:13:59			
<b>PACER Login:</b>	CRClearinghouse	<b>Client Code:</b>	Juge
<b>Description:</b>	Docket Report	<b>Search Criteria:</b>	1:17-cv-00521-TSB
<b>Billable Pages:</b>	17	<b>Cost:</b>	1.70