

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW MEXICO

05 OCT 27 AM 9: 59

OLERK-ALBUQUERQUE

THE AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION OF NEW MEXICO; and BARBARA GROTHUS.

Plaintiffs.

v.

No.

JUDY CHAVEZ, ALBUQUERQUE CITY CLERK;

CIV - 05 _ 1136

LFG WDS

Defendants.

COMLAINT FOR DECLARATORY AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

COME NOW Plaintiffs, by and through their undersigned counsel, and for their Complaint state:

THE PARTIES

- 1. Plaintiff the American Civil Liberties Union of New Mexico ("ACLUNM") is a non-profit membership organization with standing to vindicate the interests of its members whose rights, status or other legal relations are affected by the Defendants' actions. Among its other many interests, the ACLUNM and its members work to protect the constitutional rights of American citizens, including the fundamental right to vote.
- 2. The ACLUNM is an organization composed of members who would have standing to sue in their individual right for the allegations set forth in this Complaint. Further, the interests which each of the ACLUNM and its members seek to protect are

germane to the purpose of each of the organizational members, and neither the claim nor the relief sought requires participation by the individual members of the organizational plaintiffs.

- 3. Plaintiff Barbara Grothus is an individual and qualified registered voter residing in Albuquerque who chooses not to vote by absentee ballot in city and other elections so that she may make a decision informed by the full course of the election campaign, and who objects to being subject to increased burdens on the exercise of her right to vote because she chooses to vote in the traditional manner, by going personally to the polls.
- 4. Defendant Judy Chavez is the Clerk of the City of Albuquerque, New Mexico, and, pursuant to the New Mexico Municipal Election Code, NMSA § 3-8-7 (1978), is charged with administering municipal elections for the City of Albuquerque.
- 5. Defendant is sued in her official capacity for declaratory and injunctive relief.

 At all times material hereto. Defendant has acted or will act under color of state law.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 6. This case arises under the Constitution and laws of the United States of America, as protected by 42 U.S.C. § 1983.
- 7. The Court has subject matter jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to 42 U.S.C. §§ 1971(d), 1973(f) and 1983 and also 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1343(3) & (4) and 1367(a).
- 8. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 2201 and 2102, this Court has jurisdiction to grant the requested declaratory and injunctive relief.

9. Venue lies in this district pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1391(b) because the Defendants reside in this district and the matters complained of arose here.

ALLEGATIONS COMMON TO ALL COUNTS

- amendment to the Election Code of the Albuquerque City Charter that requires all voters who vote in person in any municipal election to present at the polling place one form from of a list of mandatory forms of photographic personal identification. A complete and correct copy of the amendment in its entirety is attached hereto as Exhibit A and incorporated herein by reference (hereinafter referred to as "Voter I.D. Amendment."). Upon information and belief, although it has been adopted as law by the City of Albuquerque, it has not yet been codified within the Election Code of the City Charter.
- 11. The Voter I.D. Amendment, while requiring the presentation of photographic personal identification for voters voting in person in municipal elections, does not impose similar burdens, procedures and qualifications upon the right to vote of those persons who vote by absentee ballot.
 - 12. The Voter I.D. Amendment states, in pertinent part:

When a voter approaches the election polling place seeking to vote, the Voter must identify himself or herself audibly by name. The Municipal Election Clerk shall locate in the election rolls the name spoken and ask the individual seeking to vote for one current valid identification card containing the voter's name and photograph.

13. As to the meaning of a "current valid identification card," the Voter I.D Amendment, does not define "current" or "valid" but lists examples of documents that would be acceptable:

Such photo identification card may include any card issued by a government agency, driver's license, student identification card, commercial transaction card such as a credit or debit card, insurance card, union card, a professional association card or the voter identification card issued by the City Clerk.

- 14. The "voter identification card issued by the City Clerk" can be obtained without charge if the voter presents themselves to the City Clerk and produces "two of the following identification documents that show the name and address of the voter: a state issued identification card, social security card, student identification card, library card, insurance card, selective service card, union card, professional association card, utility bill, bank statement, government check or a paycheck." If the voter is unable to present the required documentation, the City Clerk is required to issue a "voter photo identification card upon confirmation with the County Clerk that such person is presently registered to vote."
- 15. In the event an individual appears at the election polling place without the required photo identification, they shall be allowed to vote on a provisional ballot,

but only if he or she swears or affirms under penalty of perjury in an affidavit provided by the City Clerk that he or she is registered voter listed on the voter registration rolls at the precinct at which he or she presented himself or herself to vote and provides his or her date of birth and the last four digits of his or her social security number."

The provisional ballot shall only be counted if, within the ten day canvassing period following the election the voter presents to the City Clerk one of the "photo identification cards" listed in the Voter I.D. Amendment, specifically one of those forms of photo identification listed above in paragraph 15.

16. None of these requirements for a "current valid identification card containing the voter's name and photograph" apply to individuals who vote by absentee ballot. In order to cast their vote, an absence voter need only request, in mail, in person or by telephone, an application for an absentce ballot; which they must complete providing no more personal identification information than a name; address and the last four digits of their social security number. They then are issued an absence ballot that may be east by mail or delivered in person. The absentee ballot itself does not require any additional personal identification information or the possession of any of the forms of documentation required of in-person voters by the Voter I.D. Amendment.

Undue, Discriminatory Burden on the Fundamental Right to Vote In Violation of the Right to Equal Protection of the Law

- 17. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by reference the allegations of paragraphs 1
- 18. The Voter I.D. Amendment imposes undue burdens on the fundamental right through 16 as though fully restated herein. to vote that are neither justified by, nor necessary to promote a substantial and compelling state interest that was not already being adequately protected by existing criminal laws and election procedures, or which cannot be accomplished by other, less

19. The Voter I.D. Amendment discriminates unconstitutionally against persons who choose to vote in person, is overbroad and is not narrowly tailored to the goal of restrictive means. preventing voter fraud, which was the stated purpose for the Voter I.D. Amendment.

20. The Voter I.D. Amendment violates the Equal Protection Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution, and 42 U.S.C. § 1983, and thereby deprives the members of the ACLUNM and Plaintiff Grothus of their constitutional rights as United States citizens.

WHEREFORE Plaintiffs pray this Court to:

- a. Declare the Voter I.D. Amendment to be unconstitutional, illegal, null and void;
- b. Enjoin Defendant, or persons acting under her supervision and direction, from implementing, administering and enforcing the Voter I.D. Amendment;
- c. Award Plaintiffs their reasonable attorney fees under 42 U.S.C. §§ 1973*l*(e) and 1988, and interest as allowed by law; and
- d. Grant Plaintiffs such other and further relief to which they may be entitled and which is necessary to give full effect to the Court's order.

COUNT II

Violation of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, 42 U.S.C. §§ 1971(a)(2)(Λ) and 1971(a)(2)(Β)

- 21. Plaintiffs incorporate by reference the allegations of paragraphs 1 through 16 as though fully restated herein.
- 22. The Voter I.D. Amendment violates the Civil Rights Act of 1964, 42 U.S.C. §§ 1971(a)(2)(A). which provides:

No person acting under color of law shall -

(A) in determining whether any individual is qualified under State law or laws to vote in any election, apply any standard, practice, or procedure different from the standards, practices, or procedures applied under such

law or laws to other individuals within the same county, parish, or similar political subdivision who have been found by State officials to be qualified to vote....

- 23. The Voter I.D. Amendment violates 42 U.S.C. §§ 1971(a)(2)(A) because it applies different standards to qualified voters who vote in person than it does to qualified voters who vote by absentee ballot. In effect, the Voter I.D. Amendment imposes additional qualifications (e.g., passing a New Mexico driver's examination and paying for a valid current driver's license, having credit sufficient to receive a commercial transaction card, belonging to a professional organization or union, etc.) upon the right to vote for those voters who vote in person than required of voters who vote by absentee ballot.
- 24. The Voter I.D. Amendment also violates the Civil Rights Act of 1964, 42 U.S.C. § 1971 (a)(2)(B), which provides:

No person acting under color of state law shall –

(B) depy the right of any individual to you in any also

- (B) deny the right of any individual to vote in any election because of an error or omission on any record or paper relating to any application, registration, or other act requisite to voting, if such error or omission is not material in determining whether such individual is qualified under State law to vote in such election....
- 25. The Voter I.D. requirement violates 42 U.S.C. § 1971 (a)(2)(B) because it denies individuals who are fully qualified and lawfully registered to vote in person the right to vote based solely on whether they possess with them when they go to the polls the required personal photo identification, particularly when their identity can be confirmed by other means, including but not limited to asking them for the last four digits of their social security number, which is all that is required of absentee voters.

WHEREFORE Plaintiffs pray this Court to:

- a. Declare the Voter I.D. Amendment to be unconstitutional, illegal, null and void;
- b. Enjoin Defendant, or persons acting under her supervision and direction, from implementing, administering and enforcing the Voter I.D. Amendment;
- c. Award Plaintiffs their reasonable attorney fees under the 42 U.S.C. §§ 1973*l*(e) and 1988, and interest as allowed by law; and
- d. Grant Plaintiffs such other and further relief to which they may be entitled and which is necessary to give full effect to the Court's order.

Respectfully submitted.

JOSEPH P. KENNEDY
SHANNON L. OLIVER
KENNEDY & OLIVER, P.A.
Cooperating Attorneys for NM Civil
Liberties Foundation
1000 Second St. NW
Albuquerque, NM 87104-1138
505-244-1400
F: 505-244-1406
kolawjpk@qwest.net

GEORGE BACH
Staff Attorney
ACLU of New Mexico
P.O. Box 566
Albuquerque, NM 87103-5916
505-243-0046
F: 505-266-5916
gbach@ACLU-NM.org

Gooperating Attorney for NM Civil

714 Montelaire NE Albuquerque, NM 87110 505-250-8754

F: 505-268-0947

jrscarantino@yahoo.com

COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFFS

EXHIBIT A ALBUQUERQUE VOTER I.D. AMENDMENT

CITY of ALBUQUERQUE SIXTEENTH COUNCIL

COUNCIL BILL NO. R-05-295 ENACTMENT NO. R-205-099

SPONSORED BY: Sally Mayer

1 RESOLUTION

- 2 ADOPTING A PROPOSITION TO BE SUBMITTED TO THE VOTERS AT THE
- 3 NEXT MUNICIPAL ELECTION CONCERING A PHOTO VOTER IDENTIFICATION
- 4 REQUIREMENT FOR ALBUQUERQUE MUNICIPAL ELECTIONS, PROVIDING
- 5 FOR ISSUANCE OF VOTER PHOTO IDENTIFICATION CARDS, PROVIDING FOR
- 6 PROVISIONAL BALLOTS AND DESIGNATING THE TIME FOR CERTIFICATION
- 7 OF ELECTION RESULTS.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Deletion

+ Bracketed/Underscored Material +] - New

-Bracketed/Strikethrough Material-]

- 8 WHEREAS, the integrity of the voting process is essential for the public to
- 9 have confidence in the election process; and
 - WHEREAS, present law has no general requirement for presenting a photo identification when voting so as to prevent voting fraud; and
 - WHEREAS, Louisiana, South Carolina, South Dakota, Florida, Indiana and Hawaii currently require voters to provide photo identification before he or she may vote; and

WHEREAS, the use of photo voter identification will help to eliminate the fraudulent voter registration that exists in Albuquerque and prevent vote from becoming fraudulent as shown by these 2004 examples:

- 1. A community organization admitted that one of its employees submitted falsified voter registrations forms for a 13-year-old boy and a 15-year-old neighbor;
- 2. A voter registration card arrived in the name of a resident's father who had been dead for two and one-half years;
- 3. The Albuquerque Police Department's Gang Unit, while executing a search warrant, found voter registration forms. The occupant admitted to being paid to have people fill out these forms;

31

32

33

1

2

3

4

5

13

14

15

16

- 4. Voter Registration cards were turned in to the County Clerk containing faulty or no addresses, no social security numbers and bogus signatures. The Bernalillo County Clerk estimated that the County had 3,000 voter registration cards with problems that may have rendered them invalid; and
- WHEREAS, requiring all voters to show photo identification eliminates the possibility of having a person's vote stolen by an impostor, as was the case with at least one Albuquerque citizen in the 2004 election; and
- 9 WHEREAS, voting is one of our most important rights and no one should
 10 lose that right through the fraudulent behavior of another.
- 11 BE IT RESOLVED BY THE COUNCIL, THE GOVERNING BODY OF THE CITY OF 12 ALBUQUERQUE:
 - Section 1. The City Clerk is instructed to place the following proposal on the next municipal election ballot, October 4, 2005, and the qualified voters of the City of Albuquerque shall be permitted to vote "for" or "against" the following proposal:

PROPOSITION

Amending the Election Code of the Albuquerque City Charter creating a new Section to provide the following: When a voter approaches the election polling place seeking to vote, the voter must identify himself or herself audibly by name. The Municipal Election Clerk shall locate in the election rolls the name spoken and ask the individual seeking to vote for one current valid identification card containing the voter's name and photograph. Such photo identification card may include any card issued by a government agency, driver's license, student identification card, commercial transaction card such as a credit or debit card, insurance card, union card, a professional association card or the voter identification card issued by the City Clerk. If the individual is unable to provide a photo identification card, he or she shall be allowed to vote on a provisional ballot, but only if he or she swears or affirms under penalty of perjury in an affidavit provided by the City Clerk that he or she is the registered voter listed on the voter registration rolls at the precinct at which he or she presented himself or herself to vote and provides his or her date of birth and the last four digits of his or her social security number.

31

32

33

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

Provisional ballots shall be issued for no other reason than the failure to present photo identification. Provisional ballots shall be counted only by the Municipal Canvassing Board and only upon the voter's presentation to the City Clerk within the ten day canvassing period one of the photo identification cards described in this section. The Municipal Canvassing Board shall also verify that the voter who cast the provisional ballot was registered to vote for the election and did not vote elsewhere in the same election. If a voter who cast a provisional ballot under this section swears or affirms under penalty of perjury in an affidavit provided by the City Clerk within the ten day canvassing period that he or she has a religious objection to being photographed, such voter shall not be required to submit photo identification. The Municipal Canvassing Board shall otherwise verify that the provisional ballot was valid. The City Clerk shall develop and provide instructions for elections judges concerning the requirements of this Section and a method of complaint and resolution for individuals who feel they have been discriminated against by election officials' or the City Clerk's administration of this Section, in accordance with federal intimidation guidelines. Knowingly executing a false statement constitutes periury as provided in Section 30-25-1 NMSA 1978 and voting on the basis of a falsely executed statement constitutes false voting as provided in Section 1-20-8 NMSA 1978. Voter photo identification cards shall be issued by the City Clerk without charge to any voter who presents any two of the following identification documents that show the name and address of the voter: a state issued identification card, social security card, student identification card, library card, insurance card, selective service card, union card, professional association card, utility bill, bank statement, government check or a paycheck. If the individual is unable to present any two of these documents to the City Clerk, then the voter shall swear or affirm in writing under penalty of perjury that he or she is the registered voter and shall be issued a voter photo identification card upon confirmation with the County Clerk that such person is presently registered to vote. The City Clerk issued voter photo identification card shall state on its face that it shall not be valid for identification other than for the purpose of voting in City Elections and shall not be valid if the voter is subsequently purged from the voter rolls.

- 1 The Municipal Canvassing Board shall certify the results of the Municipal
- 2 Election by the end of the tenth day after the day on which the election is held.
- 3 Pursuant to Article II, Section 2 (b) of the City Charter, this Section shall take
- 4 precedence over the State Municipal Election Code. The provisions of this
- 5 Section shall apply only to City of Albuquerque Municipal Elections.

X:\SHARE\Legislation\Sixteen\R-295fin.doc

1	PASSED AND ADOPTED THIS <u>20th</u> DAY OF <u>June</u> 2005										
2	BY A VOTE OF: 5 FOR 2 AGAINST.										
3	·										
4	Yes: 5										
5	No: Griego, Heinrich Excused: Gomez, O'Malley										
6											
7											
8											
9 10	Brad Winter										
11	Brad Winter, President										
12	City Council '										
13	•										
14											
15	1214 1 100										
16	APPROVED THIS DAY OF, 2005										
17											
] - New Deletion 81											
	Bill No. R-05-295										
	1 2 1 m 1 1 an										
[+Bracketed/Underscored Material- [-Bracketed/Strikethrough Material-]	January Char	ve									
∑ \$ 22	Martin J. Chavez, Mayor/	/									
el (23	City of Albuquerque										
the second											
1 1 2 2 S											
4/St 22	ATTECT										
e de de	ATTEST:										
+ Bracketed/Underscored -Bracketed/Strikethrough S	\sim . \sim \sim \sim										
· 中 29 30	City Clerk										
30 31	Oity Oie it										
3 <i>1</i> 32											
32											

CIV - 05-1136

LFG WUS

SJS 44 (Rev. 11/04)

CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herin neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the JudiciaConference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON THE REVERSE OF THE FORM.)

I.(a) PLAINTIFFS Union of Ne	American C ew Mexico; an	ivil Liber d Barbara	ties	DEFENDANA City C		Albuque	rque			
	F	Bernalillo			200	E	Be rna li	11o		
(b) County of Residence	_			County of Resider		ed Detendant				
3)	XCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CA	SES)			(IN U.S. I	LAINTIFF CASES	ONLY)			
				NOTE: IN L	LAND CONDEM	NATION CASES, U	SE THE LOCAT	JON OF TH	HE	
				LA	ND INVOLVED					
		T-maa D								
(c) Attorney's (Firm Name,	Address, and Telephone Number	odmes K.		Attorneys (If Know	vn)					
Scarantino.	Address, and Telephone Number 714 Montclai	re NE, ABQ								
NM 87110 (9	505) 250-8754									
				L						
II. BASIS OF JURISD	ICTION (Place an "X" is	One Box Only)		TIZENSHIP O		AL PARTIES				
1 U.S. Government	X 3 Federal Question		(For Diversity Cases On			and One Box	lor Defenda PTF	ant) DEF	
Plaintiff	(U.S. Government	(U.S. Government Not a Party)			TF DEF	Incorporated or P	rincipal Place		DE.R □ 4	
	***************************************	,		n of This State		of Business In Th				
		,		n of Another State						
2 U.S. Government	☐ 4 Diversity	☐ 4 Diversity			02 02	Incorporated and		O 5	□ 5	
Defendant	(Indicate Citizensh	ip of Parties in Item III)				of Business In	Another State			
		·	Citize	n or Subject of a	03 03	Foreign Nation	0 6 0 6			
				eign Country		1 oreign (valion		0 0	_ U	
IV. NATURE OF SUIT	(Place an "X" in One Box On	lv)							-	
CONTRACT		RTS	FOR	FEITURE/PENALTY	BA	KRUPTCY	OTHER	STATUT	ES	
110 Insurance	PERSONAL INJURY	PERSONAL INJURY	0 6	10 Agriculture	☐ 422 App	eal 28 USC 158	☐ 400 State R			
120 Marine	☐ 310 Airplane	☐ 362 Personal Injury -		20 Other Food & Drug	O 423 Wid		J 410 Antitru		nient	
☐ 130 Miller Act	315 Airplane Product			25 Drug Related Seizure		28 USC 157		430 Banks and Banking		
☐ 140 Negotiable Instrument	Liability	365 Personal Injury -	1	of Property 21 USC 8			☐ 450 Comm	erce		
150 Recovery of Overpayment	☐ 320 Assault, Libel &	Product Liability		30 Liquor Laws		RTY RIGHTS	🔲 🗇 460 Deport			
& Enforcement of Judgment		☐ 368 Asbestos Personal		ORR & Truck	[□ 820 Cop		☐ 470 Racket			
151 Medicare Act	☐ 330 Federal Employers	Injury Product		50 Airline Regs	830 Pate			Organizati	ons	
☐ 152 Recovery of Defaulted	□ 340 Marine	Liability Liability		50 Occupational	U 840 Mad	□ 840 Trademark		ner Credit		
Student Loans (Excl. Veterans)	345 Marine Product	PERSONAL PROPERT 370 Other Fraud		Safety/Health 90 Other	i		☐ 490 Cable/5 ☐ 810 Selection			
153 Recovery of Overpayment	Liability	371 Truth in Lending	15 0	LABOR	SOCIAL	SECURITY			ditiae/	
of Veteran's Benefits	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		0.71	LABOR SOCIAL SECURITY 5 850 Securities/Commo					umes/	
160 Stockholders' Suits	355 Motor Vehicle	Property Damage		Act	□ 862 Blac	k Lung (923)	☐ 875 Custon		uc .	
☐ 190 Other Contract	Product Liability	D 385 Property Damage] 🖸 7:	20 Labor/Mgmt, Relatio	ns 🔯 863 DIW	C/DIWW (405(g))	12 USC	3410		
195 Contract Product Liability	☐ 360 Other Personal	Product Liability	D 7:	30 Labor/Mgmt Reporting			890 Other S	itatutory Ad	ctions	
196 Franchise	CIVIL RIGITS	PRISONER PETITION	<u> </u>	& Disclosure Act	☐ 865 RS1		1 891 Agricu			
REAL PROPERTY 210 Land Condemnation	A 441 Voting	510 Motions to Vacate		10 Railway Labor Act 90 Other Labor Litigatio		AL TAX SUITS s (U.S. Plaintiff	892 Econor			
220 Foreclosure	442 Employment	Sentence) I Empl. Ret. Inc.	,	fendant)	B94 Energy			
230 Rent Lease & Ejectment	443 Housing/	Hubeas Corpus:		Security Act		Third Party	B95 Freedon	m of inform	nation	
240 Torts to Land	Accommodations	☐ 530 General		,		SC 7609	Act		, and the same	
245 Tort Product Liability	J 444 Welfare						3 900Appeal of Fee Determination			
1 290 All Other Real Property	445 Amer. w/Disabilities -							Under Equal Access		
	Employment	☐ 550 Civil Rights					to Justic			
	446 Amer. w/Disabilities -	555 Prison Condition					950 Canstit		ıf	
	Other 440 Other Civil Rights		ł		1		State Sta	inites		
Øl _{Original} □2 _R	an "X" in One Box Only) emoved from	Remanded from	Kents	stated or 🗀 🤰 and	ansferred from	□ 6 _{Multidisti}	. 🗇 🤈 🖯	Appeal to Judge from Magistrate	n	
Proceeding St	late Court	Appellate Court	Reop	ened (sp	occify)_	Litigation)	<u>Judgment</u>		
	Cite those Succession St	Hoffe Gruder Johns 2011 at	e ming(I	o not cite jurisdict	ionai statutės i	iniess diversity):				
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO	Brichdesalftiehole	eto voter	i.d.	require	ments	-				
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:	CHECK IF THIS UNDER F.R.C.P	IS A CLASS ACTION 23	DE	mandsn/a		HECK YES only URY DEMAND:	_	complair No	nt:	
VIII. RELATED CASE IF ANY	(See instructions).	JUDGE 1/A			DOCKE	T NUMBER				
DATE		SIGNATURE OF ATT	ORNEY C	F RECORD						
0/07/05	(16 1	1							
1. 1 1 - /		TXCa	nas	Low						
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY		17/7	7							
RECEIPT # AI	MOUNT	APPLYING IFP		JUDGE		MAG. JUD)ĞE			