## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF MISSISSIPPI NORTHERN DIVISION

**BILLIE FAYE KEYES, et al.** 

**PLAINTIFFS** 

V.

CIVIL ACTION NO. 3:16cv228 CWR-LRA

PHILIP GUNN, et al.

**DEFENDANTS** 

ORAL ARGUMENT REQUESTED

## MOTION TO DISMISS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM ON THE BASIS OF IMMUNITY

Pursuant to Fed.R.Civ.P. 12(b)(6), defendants respectfully move this Court to dismiss this action as the House and its Members are protected by legislative immunity and thus cannot be sued under 42 U.S.C. § 1983 for their conduct in resolving the election contest at issue in the complaint filed herein [Dkt. 1], and the complaint therefore fails to state a claim upon which relief may be granted. In support thereof, defendants would show as follows:

1. Five registered Smith County voters have sued five Members of the Mississippi House of Representatives and the House itself under 42 U.S.C. § 1983, alleging that defendants "deprived plaintiffs of their federal constitutional right to vote and to have equal protection of the law." Complaint ¶ 3. This deprivation allegedly resulted from the disposition of an election contest filed with the House by Mark Tullos to contest the apparent election of Blaine "Bo" Eaton as Representative from District 79. Complaint ¶¶ 5-6. Defendant Speaker Philip Gunn appointed Defendants Mark Baker, Richard Bennett, Charles Jim Beckett, and Bill Denny as members of a Special Committee to consider the contest. Complaint ¶¶ 16-17.¹ That committee adopted a resolution recommending the seating of Representative Tullos and reporting that five ballots had

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The fifth member of the Special Committee, Representative Linda Coleman, is no longer a Member of the House, having been appointed by Governor Bryant as a Circuit Judge.

been illegally counted, contrary to the provisions of Miss. Code Ann. § 23-15-13 (Rev. 2015). The

full House thereafter voted to seat Representative Tullos.

2. The complaint contains no allegation that any defendant did anything outside of the

official functions of the House. As set forth more fully in the brief in support of motion to dismiss

for failure to state a claim on the basis of immunity, incorporated fully herein, the five defendant

Members of the House, and the House itself, are all entitled to legislative immunity, and this action

should thus be dismissed.

3. In adopting the Civil Rights Act of 1871, now codified as 42 U.S.C. § 1983,

Congress did not intend to abrogate the immunity for legislative conduct that had been recognized

for centuries, and this immunity protects both the defendant Members as well as the House. See

Tenney v. Brandhove, 341 U.S. 367 (1951); Supreme Court of Virginia v. Consumers Union of the

U.S., Inc., 446 U.S. 719 (1980). Here, defendants did not usurp "functions exclusively vested in

the Judiciary or the Executive," Tenney, 341 U.S. at 378, but rather acted in accordance with

authority vested exclusively in the House by Art. 4, § 38, of the Mississippi Constitution.

FOR THESE REASONS, as more fully discussed in the supporting brief submitted

herewith, defendants respectfully submit that all defendants herein are entitled to legislative

immunity, the complaint thus fails to present a claim upon which relief may be granted, and this

Court should dismiss the complaint in accordance with Fed.R.Civ.P. 12(b)(6).

This 10th day of May, 2016.

Respectfully submitted,

PHILIP GUNN, et al.

BY: s/Michael B. Wallace

MICHAEL B. WALLACE (MSB #6904)

REBECCA W. HAWKINS (MSB #8786)

CHARLES E. COWAN (MSB #104478)

2

WISE CARTER CHILD & CARAWAY, P.A.

Post Office Box 651

Jackson, Mississippi 39205-0651

Telephone: 601-968-5534

Fax: 601-944-7738 mbw@wisecarter.com rwh@wisecarter.com cec@wisecarter.com

T. RUSSELL NOBILE (MSB #100682) WISE CARTER CHILD & CARAWAY, P.A. 1105 30th Avenue, Suite 300 Gulfport, Mississippi 39501-1817 Telephone: 228-867-7141

Fax: 228-867-7142 trn@wisecarter.com

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANTS

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Michael B. Wallace, hereby certify that I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system which will automatically send e-mail notification of such filing to the following:

> John G. Corlew CORLEW MUNFORD & SMITH, PLLC P. O. Box 16807 Jackson, MS 39236-6807 jcorlew@cmslawyers.com

William R. Ruffin P.O. Box 565 Bay Springs, MS 39422-0565 attywrr@bayspringstel.net

This the 10th day of May, 2016.

s/Michael B. Wallace MICHAEL B. WALLACE