CLOSED

U.S. District Court United States District Court for the Southern District of New York (Foley Square) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:03-cv-08821-NRB

Equal Employment v. Sephora USA, LLC Assigned to: Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald

Demand: \$0

Cause: 42:2000e Job Discrimination (Employment)

Date Filed: 11/07/2003

Date Terminated: 08/07/2007

Jury Demand: Plaintiff

Nature of Suit: 442 Civil Rights: Jobs Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Plaintiff

<u>Plaintiff</u>

Equal Employment Opportunity Commission

represented by Katherine E. Bissell

U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission New York District Office 33 Whitehall Street, 5th Floor New York, NY 10004 (212) 336-3696

Email: katherine.bissell@eeoc.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

Lauren Gayle Dreilinger

U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission 33 Whitehall St., 5th Floor New York, NY 10004 (212)336-3678 Fax: (212) 336-3623

Email: lauren.dreilinger@eeoc.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

Raechel Lee Adams

U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission 33 Whitehall St., 5th Floor New York, NY 10004 (212) 336-3707

Fax: (212) 336-3623

Email: raechel.adams@eeoc.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

V.

Defendant

1 of 10 3/6/2008 2:41 PM

Sephora USA, LLC

represented by Allen Ian Fagin

Proskauer Rose LLP (New York) 1585 Broadway New York, NY 10036

212.969.3030

Fax: 212.969.2900

Email: afagin@proskauer.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

Joseph Baumgarten

Proskauer Rose LLP (New York) 1585 Broadway New York, NY 10036 (212) 969-3002

Fax: (212) 969-2900

Email: jbaumgarten@proskauer.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

Peter M. Avery

Proskauer Rose LLP One Newark Center Newark, NJ 07102-5211 (973) 274-3223 Fax: (973) 274-3299 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jody Sue Riger

Proskauer Rose LLP (Newark) One Newark Center 18th floor Newark, NJ 07102 973-274-3200

Fax: 973-274-3299

Email: JRiger@proskauer.com

Defendant

Richard Tran

represented by Joseph Baumgarten

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

Peter M. Avery

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jody Sue Riger

(See above for address)

2 of 10 3/6/2008 2:41 PM

Defendant

Misa Gjonbalaj

represented by Joseph Baumgarten

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

Peter M. Avery

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jody Sue Riger

(See above for address)

Defendant

Diana Saini

represented by Joseph Baumgarten

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

Peter M. Avery

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jody Sue Riger

(See above for address)

Defendant

Frank Cimitile

represented by Elise Michelle Bloom

Proskauer Rose LLP (New York) 1585 Broadway New York, NY 10036 (212)969-3000 x3410 Fax: (212)969-2900 Email: ebloom@proskauer.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

Miriam Lieberson

Jackson, Lewis, L.L.P. 59 Maiden Lane New York, NY 10038-4052 (212) 545-4000 Fax: (212) 972-3213 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Diane Windholz

Jackson Lewis, LLP (NYC) 59 Maiden Lane New York, NY 10038

3 of 10 3/6/2008 2:41 PM

(212) 545-4000 Fax: (212)-972-3213

Email: windhold@jacksonlewis.com ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor Plaintiff

Mariela Del Rosario represented by Eugene M. Bellin

Eugene M. Bellin 233 Broadway

New York, NY 10279

(212) 267-9100 Fax: (212) 267-4148

Email: embellin@aol.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

Intervenor Plaintiff

Julissa Bautista represented by Eugene M. Bellin

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

Intervenor Plaintiff

Solange Bernal represented by Eugene M. Bellin

(See above for address) *LEAD ATTORNEY*

Intervenor Plaintiff

Angela Samboy represented by Eugene M. Bellin

(See above for address) *LEAD ATTORNEY*

Intervenor Plaintiff

Leydis Rodriguez represented by Eugene M. Bellin

(See above for address) *LEAD ATTORNEY*

Date Filed	#	Docket Text	
11/07/2003	1	COMPLAINT filed. Summons issued and Notice pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 636(c). (jjm) (Entered: 11/12/2003)	
11/07/2003		Magistrate Judge Frank Maas is so designated. (jjm) (Entered: 11/12/2003)	
01/28/2004	2	STIPULATION AND ORDER; The time within which defendant shall be required to answer or move in response to the Complaint is extended to and including 2/12/04.(Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 1/27/04) (sb,) (Entered: 02/03/2004)	
01/28/2004		Set Answer Due Date purs. to 2 Stipulation and Order as to Sephora USA, LLC answer due on 2/12/2004. (sb,) (Entered: 02/03/2004)	

4 of 10 3/6/2008 2:41 PM

02/03/2004	3	NOTICE OF INITIAL PRETRIAL CONFERENCE; counsel are directed to appear for an initial pretrial conference with the Court on 2/20/2004, at 9:30 a.m at the United States Court House, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY, in Courtroom 21A (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 1/30/2004) (kkc. (Entered: 02/06/2004)		
02/11/2004	4	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Buchwald from Allen I. Fagin dated 2/6/2004 re: The initial pretrial conference in this case scheduled for 2/20/2004 is hereby adjourned until 3/5/04 at 10:45 am. as ordered by the Court (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 2/9/2004) (jsa,) (Entered: 02/13/2004)		
02/11/2004		Set/Reset Hearings: Initial Conference set for 3/5/2004 10:45 AM before Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald. (jsa,) (Entered: 02/13/2004)		
02/13/2004	5	RULE 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. Document filed by Sephora USA, LLC.(kw,) (Entered: 02/17/2004)		
02/13/2004	6	ANSWER to Complaint. Document filed by Sephora USA, LLC.(kw,) (Entered: 02/17/2004)		
02/24/2004	7	Notice of Filing of NOTICE of Appearance by Lauren Gayle Dreilinger on behof Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (dle,) Modified on 2/26/2004 (dle,). (Entered: 02/26/2004)		
03/02/2004	8	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Buchwald from Eugene M. Bellin dated 02/20/04 re: granting counsel's request for permission to attend discovery scheduling conference on behalf of his clients pending the court's determination their motion to intervene; (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 2/27/04 (djc,) (Entered: 03/05/2004)		
03/12/2004	9	ORDER; that Leydis Rodriguez, Angela Samboy, Solange Bernal, Julissa Bautista and Mariela Del Rosario are granted permission to intervene in this matter; the Clerk of the Court is directed to accept filing of a Summons and a Complaint by the intervening parties. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 3/10/04) (pl,) (Entered: 03/18/2004)		
03/16/2004	10	INTERVENOR COMPLAINT against Richard Tran, Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini, Frank Cimitile, Sephora USA, LLC.Document filed by Mariela Del Rosari Julissa Bautista, Solange Bernal, Angela Samboy, Leydis Rodriguez.(kw,) (Entered: 03/23/2004)		
03/22/2004	11	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Joseph Baumgarten dated 3/16/04. Granting parties' request that preliminary discovery be limited to Sephora's alleged "English-Only" language rule and that all such discovery be completed by 6/30/04. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 3/18/04) Copies Mailed By Chambers.(kw,) (Entered: 03/26/2004)		
03/22/2004		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Discovery due by 6/30/2004. (kw,) (Entered: 03/26/2004)		
04/15/2004	<u>12</u>	FILING ERROR - ELECTRONIC FILING IN NON-ECF CASE - ANSWER to Intervenor Complaint. Document filed by Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini, Sephora USA, LLC, Richard Tran.(Baumgarten, Joseph) Modified on 5/13/2004 (mj,). (Entered: 04/15/2004)		

5 of 10 3/6/2008 2:41 PM

04/16/2004	13	ANSWER to Intervenor Complaint. Document filed by Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini, Sephora USA, LLC, Richard Tran.(jge,) (Entered: 04/19/2004)			
06/09/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald: Telephone Conference held on 6/9/2004. (jco,) (Entered: 06/15/2004)			
06/14/2004	14	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Buchwald from Lauren Dreilinger dated 06/09/04 re: granting counsel's request for an extension of time until Aug 13, 2004 to complete discovery regarding Defendant's English-only rule. (Signe by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 6/10/04) (djc,) (Entered: 06/15/2004)			
07/23/2004	15	ANSWER to Intervenor Complaint. Document filed by Frank Cimitile.(db,) (Entered: 07/26/2004)			
08/10/2004	17	MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) for Raechel Lee Adams to Appear Pr Hac Vice. Document filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (db, (Entered: 08/18/2004)			
08/12/2004	16	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Buchwald from Elizabeth Grossman dated 8/5/2004 re: discovery deadline on the limited issue of Defendant's alleged English-only rule be extended until 9/30/2004. Application granted. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 8/10/2004) (jsa,) (Entered: 08/16/2004)			
08/12/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines: Discovery due by 9/30/2004. (jsa,) (Entered: 08/16/2004)			
08/20/2004		ORDER granting 17 Motion for Raechel L. Adams to Appear Pro Hac Vice . (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 8/20/04) (yv,) (Entered: 08/25/2004)			
08/20/2004		Transmission to Attorney Admissions Clerk. Transmitted re: Order on Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, to the Attorney Admissions Clerk for updating of Attorney Information. (yv,) (Entered: 08/25/2004)			
09/24/2004	18	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Raech L. Adams dated 9/23/04 re: request an additional extension of the initial discover period until 11/19/04, If Your Honor is amenable to that date. So Ordered. Discovery due by 11/19/2004. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 9/23/04) (dfe,) (Entered: 09/27/2004)			
10/13/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald : Interim Pretrial Conference held on 10/13/2004. (pa,) (Entered: 10/20/2004)			
11/04/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald: Interim Pretrial Conference held on 11/4/2004. (kw,) (Entered: 11/08/2004)			
12/09/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald : Telephone Conference held on 12/9/2004. (cd,) (Entered: 01/04/2005)			
12/21/2004	19	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Naomi R. Buchwald from Raechel Adams dated 12/14/04 re: counsel for parties propose the following briefing schedule for summary judgment motion: dft file motion on 2/28/05, plaintiff's opposition by 4/8/05, and dft's reply by 4/29/05. Application granted. Howeve further extensions will be granted. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald of 12/20/04) (dle,) (Entered: 12/23/2004)			

6 of 10 3/6/2008 2:41 PM

12/21/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines: Motions due by 2/28/2005. Replies due by 4/29/2005. Responses due by 4/8/2005 (dle,) (Entered: 12/23/2004)			
02/28/2005	20	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Motion for Partial Summary Judgment and Supporting documents served on E.E.O.C. on 2/28/05. Service was made by first class mail. Document filed by Sephora USA, LLC, Richard Tran, Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini. Received in night deposit box on 2/28/05 at 9:09 p.m. (db,) (Entered: 03/04/2005)			
02/28/2005	21	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Motion for Partial Summary Judgment and Supporting documents served on E.E.O.C. on 2/28/05. Service was made by UPS Next Day Air. Document filed by Sephora USA, LLC, Richard Tran, Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini. Received in night deposit box on 2/28/05 at 9:10 p.m.(db,) (Entered: 03/04/2005)			
02/28/2005	22	MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) for Partial Summary Judgment. Document filed by Sephora USA, LLC, Richard Tran, Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini. (pf,) (Entered: 03/08/2005)			
02/28/2005	23	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 22 MOTION (FILED ON SERVIC DATE) for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Sephora USA, LLC, Richard Tran, Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini. (pf,) (Entered: 03/08/2005)			
04/08/2005	24	MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) for an order granting dfts partial summary judgment dismissing the claim that Sephora maintains an unlawful English only rule. Document filed by Frank Cimitile. (dle,) (Entered: 04/19/2005)			
04/08/2005	27	DECLARATION of Raechel L. Adams with Exhibits 16-49. Document filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (ll,) (Entered: 04/21/2005)			
04/15/2005	25	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 24 MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) for Summary Judgment., 22 MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, Julissa Bautista, Solange Bernal. (II,) (Entered: 04/21/2005)			
04/15/2005	26	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, Julissa Bautista, Solange Bernal. (ll,) (Entered: 04/21/2005)			
04/28/2005	28	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Buchwald from Jody S. Riger dated 4/26/05 re: defendants are granted until May 6, 2005 in which to file the reply brier. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 4/26/05) (djc,) (Entered: 04/29/2005)			
05/06/2005	29	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Further Support re: 22 MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Sephora USA, LLC, Richard Tran, Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini. (mde,) (Entered: 05/11/2005)			
05/06/2005	30	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Joseph Baumgarten in Further Support re: 22 MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Sephora USA, LLC, Richard Tran, Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini. (mde,) (Entered: 05/11/2005)			

09/13/2005	31	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER: For the foregoing reasons, the Court finds the policy on the use of English outlined in the Recap is legally permissible and therefore grants defendants' 22 motion for partial summary judgment on that issue (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 9/12/2005) Copies Mailed By Chambers.(lb,) (Entered: 09/14/2005)			
09/28/2005	32	MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) for Reconsideration re; <u>31</u> Order on Motion for Partial Summary Judgment,, Order on Motion for Summary Judgment,. Document filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (c (Entered: 10/03/2005)			
09/29/2005	33	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 32 MOTION (FILED ON SERVIC DATE) for Reconsideration re; 31 Order on Motion for Partial Summary Judgment,, Order on Motion for Summary Judgment, Document filed by Equa Employment Opportunity Commission. (cd,) (Entered: 10/03/2005)			
10/17/2005	34	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 32 MOTION (FILED ON SERVICE DATE) for Reconsideration re; 31 Order on Motion for Partial Summary Judgment,, Order on Motion for Summary Judgment, Document filed by Sephora USA, LLC, Richard Tran, Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini. (djc,) (Entered: 10/18/2005)			
12/16/2005	35	ORDER denying 32 Motion for Reconsideration. As plaintiff's motion neither meets the standard of our Local Civil Rule 6.3 nor the applicable case law on motions for reconsideration, the motion is DENIED. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 12/16/05) (kco,) (Entered: 12/19/2005)			
01/11/2006	36	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge naomi Reice Buchwald from Raechel L. Adams dated 12/29/2005 re: The parties request permission to continue discussions for an additional week and to submit a proposed pretrial discovery schedule to the Court on 1/13/2006. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 1/6/2006) (lb,) (Entered: 01/11/2006)			
01/31/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald: Telephone Conference held on 1/31/2006. (cd,) (Entered: 02/09/2006)			
03/13/2006	37	MOTION for an order, admitting Peter M. Avery to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Sephora USA, LLC, Richard Tran, Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini. (sac,) (Entered: 03/14/2006)			
03/27/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald: Subsequent Conference held on 3/27/2006. (sac,) (Entered: 03/30/2006)			
04/20/2006	38	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 3/27/2006 before Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald. (jar,) (Entered: 04/20/2006)			
04/26/2006	39	ORDER granting 37 Motion for Peter M. Avery to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 4/25/2006) (jmi,) (Entered: 04/26/2006)			
05/08/2006	40	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Joseph Baumgarten dated 5/1/2006 re: we believe that the population to whom the questionaire is to be sent should be limited in 2 respects ENDORSEMENT: Application denied. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on			

5/3/2006) (lb,) (Entered: 05/09/2006)					
05/17/2006		CASHIERS OFFICE REMARK on 39 Order on Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice in the amount of \$25.00, paid on 5/4/2006, Receipt Number 578232. (jd,) (Entered: 05/17/2006)			
05/23/2006	<u>41</u>	FILING ERROR - ELECTRONIC FILING FOR NON-ECF CASE - NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Diane Windholz on behalf of Frank Cimitile (Windholz, Diane) Modified on 5/24/2006 (gf,). (Entered: 05/23/2006)			
05/24/2006		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT - NON-ECF CASE ERROR. Note to Attorney Diane Windholz to MANUALLY RE-FILE Document Notice of Appearance, Document No. 41. This case is not ECF. (gf,) (Entered: 05/24/2006)			
06/01/2006	42	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Rae L. Adams dated 5/19/2006 re: requesting an extension of the discovery period this action. ENDORSEMENT: The time to complete discovery is extended ur 9/1/2006. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 5/26/2006 (lb,) (Entered: 06/02/2006)			
08/22/2006	43	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald from Robe D. Rose dated 8/7/06 re: The parties jointly request an extension of the discov deadline to December 1, 2006 to complete all discovery. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwa on 8/21/06) (js,) (Entered: 08/23/2006)			
11/22/2006	44	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Buchwald from Raechel L. Adams dated 11/17/06 re: counsel requests that the Court set a revised discovery deadline of January 5, 2006. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 11/22/06) (djc,) (Entered: 11/27/2006)			
01/19/2007	45	STIPULATION AND ORDER ON CONFIDENTIALITYregarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 1/16/2007) (lb) (Entered: 01/22/2007)			
01/25/2007	<u>46</u>	FILING ERROR - ELECTRONIC FILING IN NON-ECF CASE - NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jody Sue Riger on behalf of Sephora USA, LLC, Richard Tran, Misa Gjonbalaj, Diana Saini (Riger, Jody) Modified on 3/2/2007 (lb). (Entered: 01/25/2007)			
03/02/2007		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT - NON-ECF CASE ERROR. Note to Attorney Jody Sue Riger to MANUALLY RE-FILE Docume NOTICE OF APPEARANCE, Document No. 46. This case is not ECF. (lb) (Entered: 03/02/2007)			
04/12/2007		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald : Interim Pretrial Conference held on 4/12/2007. (pl) (Entered: 04/23/2007)			
04/17/2007	47	ORDER REFERRING CASE TO MAGISTRATE JUDGE. Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for Settlement. Referred to Magistrate Judge Frank Maas. (Signed by Judge Naom Reice Buchwald on 4/13/07) (pl) (Entered: 04/18/2007)			

05/31/2007		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Frank Maas: Settlement Conference held on 5/31/2007. Parties are unable to reach a settlement. (tro) (Entered: 06/07/2007)		
06/11/2007		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Frank Maas: Settlement Conference held on 6/11/2007. Parties are unable to reach a settlement; referral closed for Mag. purposes. (tro) (Entered: 06/14/2007)		
07/24/2007	CASE NO LONGER REFERRED to Magistrate Judge Frank Maas. I have the above reference for magistrate judge statistical purposes. Reason: No Settlement. (ae) (Entered: 08/06/2007)			
08/07/2007	48	CONSENT JUDGMENT AND DECREE # 07,1532 in favor of Equal Employment Opportunity Commission against Sephora USA, LLC in the amount of \$ 565,000.00. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 8/7/07) (ml) (Entered: 08/07/2007)		
09/04/2007	50	STIPULATION AND ORDER OF DISMISSAL WITH PREJUDICE, by and between the undersigned Counsel for the parties herein that the Complaint in Intervention filed herein by Plaintiffs-Intervenors on March 16, 2004 shall be dismissed with prejudice and without costs or attorney's fees to any party. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Naomi Reice Buchwald on 8/30/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 09/05/2007)		

PACER Service Center					
	Tran	saction Receipt	t		
03/06/2008 15:40:41					
PACER Login:	wu0079	Client Code:	eeoc		
Description:	Docket Report	Search Criteria:	1:03-cv-08821-NRB		
Billable Pages:	6	Cost:	0.48		