

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO
EASTERN DIVISION**

PLAINTIFFS MOISES JAVIER AGUILAR
PERALTA, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND
SECURITY, *et al.*,

Defendants.

No.: 2:26-cv-00337

District Judge Sarah D. Morrison
Magistrate Judge Chelsey M. Vascura

**MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER REGARDING IDENTIFICATION OF
PSEUDONYMOUS WITNESSES**

On the evening of April 29, 2026, 24 hours prior to this filing, the Defendants asked the Plaintiffs to provide their names and personal identifying information, as well as the names and personal identifying information of witnesses whose declarations in support of the Plaintiffs' prior filings were submitted using pseudonyms and/or initials to protect their identities. The Court previously granted the Plaintiffs' motion for two parties to proceed pseudonymously, with the stipulation that their identifying information would be provided to the Defendants upon request, but that Defendants would not be permitted to share or use that information except for purposes directly and immediately related to this matter. Accordingly, Plaintiffs' counsel have provided the Plaintiffs' information as requested.

However, the Court's prior order does not cover the pseudonymous declarants. The Plaintiffs ask that the same protection be provided, for the same reasons, to the pseudonymous declarants, so that their information can safely be provided to Defendants' counsel. A memorandum in support and proposed order extending confidentiality to the pseudonymous Plaintiffs and witnesses are attached.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Jeffrey P. Vardaro
Frederick M. Gittes (0031444)
Jeffrey P. Vardaro (0081819)
THE GITTES LAW GROUP
723 Oak Street
Columbus, Ohio 43205
Phone: (614) 222-4735
Fax: (614) 221-9655
fgittes@gitteslaw.com
jvardaro@gitteslaw.com

Freda J. Levenson (0045916)
Amy Gilbert (0100887)
ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC.
4506 Chester Avenue
Cleveland, Ohio 44103
(216) 541-1376 (Levenson)
(216) 770-6704 (Gilbert)
flevenson@acluohio.org
agilbert@acluohio.org

David J. Carey (0088787)
ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC.
1108 City Park Avenue, Suite 203
Columbus, Ohio 43206
(380) 215-1972
dcarey@acluohio.org

Vincent W. Wells (0101765)
Jesse H. Vogel (0102292)
COMMUNITY REFUGEE & IMMIGRATION
SERVICES
4645 Executive Drive
Columbus, Ohio 43220
Phone: 614-955-9505
vwells@cris-ohio.org
jvogel@cris-ohio.org

/s/ John S. Marshall (per email authority)
John S. Marshall (0015160)
Trial Attorney for Plaintiffs
Helen M. Robinson (0097070)
Edward R. Forman (0076651)
Samuel M. Schlein (0092194)
Madeline J. Rettig (0098816)
MARSHALL, FORMAN AND SCHLEIN, LLC
250 Civic Center Drive, Suite 480
Columbus, Ohio 43215-5296
Phone: (614) 463-9790
Fax (614) 463-9780
jmarshall@marshallforman.com
hrobinson@marshallforman.com
eforman@marshallforman.com
sschlein@marshallforman.com
mrettig@marshallforman.com

OF COUNSEL
Louis A. Jacobs (002101)
MARSHALL, FORMAN AND SCHLEIN, LLC
177 19th Street, Apt. 9C
Oakland, CA 94612
Phone: (614) 203-1255
Fax (510) 250-9007
LAJOhio@aol.com

Kathleen Kersh (0091198)
Maria Otero (0093841)
Gwen Short (0102151)
Rebecca Bundy (0101572)
ADVOCATES FOR BASIC LEGAL EQUALITY, INC.
525 Jefferson Avenue, Suite 300
Toledo, OH 43604
Phone: (937) 535-4408
kkersh@ablelaw.org
motero@ablelaw.org
gshort@ablelaw.org
rbundy@ablelaw.org

Counsel for Plaintiffs

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER
REGARDING IDENTIFICATION OF PSEUDONYMOUS WITNESSES

The names and identifying information of declarants whose identities have not been included in their declarations supporting the Plaintiffs' prior filings were withheld for the reasons stated in their declarations, and are similar or identical to those supporting the Plaintiffs' prior motion to proceed pseudonymously: reasonable fear that disclosing their identities for any reason not directly and immediately related to this case could result in retaliation, including adverse immigration consequences. [See Motion for Leave to Proceed Pseudonymously, Doc. #: 4, and Declarations of Plaintiff F.M., Plaintiff S.T., I.A., M.A.R., YR, and J.R., Docs #: 4-1, 4-2, 12-1, 12-4, 12-10 and 12-11]. The attached order ensures that the Court's protection of their identities extends to the declarants to the same extent that it does to the pseudonymous Plaintiffs.

In response to the Defendants' request for the declarants' information, Plaintiffs' counsel have made reasonable attempts to obtain the Defendants' consent to such an order, but have been offered only informal assurances that Defendants' counsel will protect the declarants' personal identifying information. Defendants' counsel have rejected consideration of the attached proposed order and refused to provide any alternative language that would serve the same purpose. Meanwhile, they have made it clear that they will seek to use any delay resulting from the declarants' unwillingness to disclose their identities without the protection of this order as a justification for asking the Court to delay further proceedings in this time-sensitive action. As there is no dispute among the parties about the substance of the protection the declarants deserve, and any delay could prejudice one or both sides, Plaintiffs request that the Court grant the requested order.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Jeffrey P. Vardaro
Frederick M. Gittes (0031444)
Jeffrey P. Vardaro (0081819)
THE GITTES LAW GROUP
723 Oak Street
Columbus, Ohio 43205
Phone: (614) 222-4735
Fax: (614) 221-9655
fgittes@gitteslaw.com
jvardaro@gitteslaw.com

Freda J. Levenson (0045916)
Amy Gilbert (0100887)
ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC.
4506 Chester Avenue
Cleveland, Ohio 44103
(216) 541-1376 (Levenson)
(216) 770-6704 (Gilbert)
flevenson@acluohio.org
agilbert@acluohio.org

David J. Carey (0088787)
ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC.
1108 City Park Avenue, Suite 203
Columbus, Ohio 43206
(380) 215-1972
dcarey@acluohio.org

Vincent W. Wells (0101765)
Jesse H. Vogel (0102292)
COMMUNITY REFUGEE & IMMIGRATION
SERVICES
4645 Executive Drive
Columbus, Ohio 43220
Phone: 614-955-9505
vwells@cris-ohio.org
jvogel@cris-ohio.org

/s/ John S. Marshall (per email authority)
John S. Marshall (0015160)
Trial Attorney for Plaintiffs
Helen M. Robinson (0097070)
Edward R. Forman (0076651)
Samuel M. Schlein (0092194)
Madeline J. Rettig (0098816)
MARSHALL, FORMAN AND SCHLEIN, LLC
250 Civic Center Drive, Suite 480
Columbus, Ohio 43215-5296
Phone: (614) 463-9790
Fax (614) 463-9780
jmarshall@marshallforman.com
hrobinson@marshallforman.com
eforman@marshallforman.com
sschlein@marshallforman.com
mrettig@marshallforman.com

OF COUNSEL
Louis A. Jacobs (002101)
MARSHALL, FORMAN AND SCHLEIN, LLC
177 19th Street, Apt. 9C
Oakland, CA 94612
Phone: (614) 203-1255
Fax (510) 250-9007
LAJOhio@aol.com

Kathleen Kersh (0091198)
Maria Otero (0093841)
Gwen Short (0102151)
Rebecca Bundy (0101572)
ADVOCATES FOR BASIC LEGAL EQUALITY, INC.
525 Jefferson Avenue, Suite 300
Toledo, OH 43604
Phone: (937) 535-4408
kkersh@ablelaw.org
motero@ablelaw.org
gshort@ablelaw.org
rbundy@ablelaw.org

Counsel for Plaintiffs

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 30th day of April 2026, I served a copy of the foregoing notice of deposition by email upon the following counsel for Defendants:

Christopher R. Yates
Assistant United States Attorney
christopher.yates@usdoj.gov
Attorney for Defendants

/s/Jeffrey P. Vardaro
Jeffrey P. Vardaro