

CLOSED

**U.S. District Court
Western District of Pennsylvania (Pittsburgh)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:05-cv-00404-TFM**

EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPP v. NOVARTIS
PHARMACEUTI, et al
Assigned to: Judge Terrence F. McVerry
Demand: \$0
Cause: 42:2000 Civil Rights: Other

Date Filed: 03/24/2005
Date Terminated: 10/15/2008
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 442 Civil Rights: Jobs
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Plaintiff

Plaintiff

**EQUAL EMPLOYMENT
OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION**

represented by **Jacqueline H. McNair**
Equal Employment Opportunity
Commission
21 South Fifth Street
Suite 400, The Bourse Building
Philadelphia, PA 19106
(215) 440-2666
Email: Jacqueline.McNair@eeoc.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Judith A. O'Boyle
Equal Employment Opportunity
Commission
21 South Fifth Street
Suite 400, The Bourse Building
Philadelphia, PA 19106
(215) 440-2666
Email: Judith.Ob Boyle@EEOC.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

M. Jean Clickner
Equal Employment Opportunity
Commission
1000 Liberty Avenue
William S. Moorhead Federal Building,
Suite 1112
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
(412) 395-5843
Fax: (412) 395-5749
Email: jean.clickner@eeoc.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rachel M. Smith
United States Equal Employment
Opportunity Commission
801 Market Street
Suite 1300
Philadelphia, PA 19107
215-440-2642
Fax: 215-440-2848
Email: rachel.smith@eeoc.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Intervenor Plaintiff

represented by

BETHANY L. BRANDSTATTER
TERMINATED: 02/14/2006

BETHANY L. BRANDSTATTER
PRO SE

Kristen T. Fawcett
Griffith, McCague & Fernsler
707 Grant Street
The Gulf Tower, 38th Floor
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 803-3690
Fax: (412) 803-3678
Email: ktf@gmwpcclaw.com
TERMINATED: 02/14/2006
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark A. Griffith
Griffith, McCague & Wallace
707 Grant Street
The Gulf Tower, 38th Floor
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 803-3690
Email: mag@gmwpcclaw.com
TERMINATED: 02/14/2006
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter G. Nychis
Griffith, McCague & Wallace
707 Grant Street
The Gulf Tower, 38th Floor
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 803-3690
Email: pgn@gmwpcclaw.com
TERMINATED: 02/14/2006
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS
CORPORATION**

represented by **Abigail D. Flynn-Kozara**
Damon Morey LLP
200 Delaware Avenue
Suite 1200
Buffalo, NY 14202-2150
716-856-5500
Fax: 716-856-5510
Email: akozara@damonmorey.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Martha Hartle Munsch
Reed Smith
225 Fifth Avenue
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
412-288-4118
Fax: 412-288-3063
Email: mmunsch@reedsmith.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Virginia Lazala
Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation
One Health Plaza

East Hanover, NJ 07936
 TERMINATED: 12/29/2005
 LEAD ATTORNEY
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kim M. Watterson
 Reed Smith LLP
 Reed Smith Centre
 225 Fifth Avenue
 Suite 1200
 Pittsburgh, PA 15222
 (412) 288-3131
 Email: kwatterson@reedsmith.com
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
03/24/2005	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT with summons issued; jury demand (ces) (key,). (Entered: 03/24/2005)
04/11/2005	<u>2</u>	MOTION by BETHANY L. BRANDSTATTER to Intervene with Proposed Order. (ces) (key,). (Entered: 04/11/2005)
04/12/2005	<u>3</u>	ORDER, Response to Motion set to 4/25/05 for <u>2</u> motion to Intervene (signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 4/12/05) CM all parties of record. (ces) (key,). (Entered: 04/12/2005)
04/14/2005	<u>4</u>	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance for NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTI by Martha Hartle Munsch (ces) (key,). (Entered: 04/14/2005)
04/20/2005	<u>6</u>	Stipulation by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPP, NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTI Extending Time to 5/25/05 for deft to answer complaint with proposed order. (ces) (key,). (Entered: 04/21/2005)
04/20/2005		Deadline updated; reset Answer deadline to 5/25/05 for NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTI (ces) (Entered: 04/21/2005)
04/21/2005	<u>5</u>	RESPONSE by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPP to <u>2</u> motion to Intervene by BETHANY L. BRANDSTATTER (ces) (key,). (Entered: 04/21/2005)
04/22/2005	<u>7</u>	RESPONSE by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTI to <u>2</u> motion to Intervene by BETHANY L. BRANDSTATTER (jsp) (key,). (Entered: 04/22/2005)
04/22/2005		ORDER upon stipulation granting <u>6</u> stipulation Extending Time to answer ; reset Answer deadline to 5/25/05 for NOVARTIS. (signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 4/22/05) CM all parties of record. (tt) Modified on 12/29/2009. (jv) (Entered: 04/25/2005)
04/22/2005		ORDER upon motion granting <u>2</u> motion to Intervene and the movant is instructed to file her complaint by 5/6/05 and properly serve the parties. (signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 4/22/05) CM all parties of record. (ksa) (Entered: 04/25/2005)
04/29/2005	<u>8</u>	RETURN OF SERVICE executed as to NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTI 4/6/05 Answer due on 4/26/05 for NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTI (ces) (key,). (Entered: 04/29/2005)
05/06/2005	<u>9</u>	Intervenor's COMPLAINT by BETHANY L. BRANDSTATTER against NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTI (ces) (key,). (Entered: 05/09/2005)
05/25/2005	<u>10</u>	ANSWER to Complaint by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTI (Attorneys Abigail D. Flynn-Kozara and Virginia Lazala) (ces) (key,). (Entered: 05/25/2005)
05/25/2005	<u>11</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed as to NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTI on 5/6/05 Answer due on 7/5/05 for NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTI (ces) (key,). (Entered: 05/25/2005)
07/05/2005	<u>12</u>	<i>Defendant's</i> ANSWER to Complaint of <i>Intervenor</i> by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION.(Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 07/05/2005)

07/11/2005	<u>13</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER/INITIAL CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE set for 7/22/2005 11:30 AM in Courtroom 6C before Terrence F. McVerry.Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 7/11/2005. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Proposed Case Management Order)(kll) (Entered: 07/11/2005)
07/12/2005		TEXT NOTICE of Hearing: Case Management reset from 7/22/2005 11:30 to 8/5/2005 08:30 AM in Courtroom 6C before Terrence F. McVerry. (Per telephone request of Pltf's counsel with consent from dft's counsel) Text only entry; no PDF document will issue.(kll) (Entered: 07/12/2005)
07/28/2005	<u>16</u>	NOTICE of Change of Address by Mark A. Griffith to read Griffith, McCague & Wallace, Gulf Tower, 38th Floor, 707 Grant St., Pgh., PA 15219 (412) 803-3690 (ces,) (Entered: 08/09/2005)
08/05/2005		Text Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Terrence F. McVerry : Case Management Conference held on 8/5/2005. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. (Court Reporter none.) (kll) (Entered: 08/08/2005)
08/05/2005	<u>15</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Peter G. Nychis on behalf of BETHANY L. BRANDSTATTER (ces,) (Entered: 08/08/2005)
08/08/2005	<u>14</u>	ORDER STAYING CASE, Case stayed for thirty days. Counsel shall report their progress to the Court on or before the expiration of said thirty days.Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 8/8/2005. (kll) (Entered: 08/08/2005)
09/08/2005	<u>17</u>	STIPULATION of Counsel for all parties, filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 09/08/2005)
09/13/2005	<u>18</u>	ORDER re <u>17</u> Stipulation filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION, counsel shall report their progress to the Court on or before October 31, 2005.Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 9/13/2005. (kll) (Entered: 09/13/2005)
10/14/2005		TEXT NOTICE of Hearing: Settlement Conference set for 11/21/2005 09:00 AM in Courtroom 6C before Terrence F. McVerry. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue.(kll) (Entered: 10/14/2005)
10/17/2005	<u>19</u>	SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE ORDER re Notice of Hearing. ?No later than November 15, 2005, each party shall submit a confidential settlement statement to the judge. The settlement statement shall not become part of the file of the case, but shall be for the exclusive use of the judge in preparing for and conducting the settlement conference. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 10/17/2005. (kll) (Entered: 10/17/2005)
11/21/2005		Text Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Terrence F. McVerry : Settlement Conference held on 11/21/2005. Order will follow. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. (Court Reporter None.) (kll) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
11/21/2005	<u>20</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT/SCHEDULING ORDER: Exchange of required Rule 26(a)(1) information due by 12/5/2005. Amended Pleadings due by 2/17/2006. Joinder of Parties due by 12/21/2005. Discovery due by 3/21/2006. Post Discovery Status Conference set for 3/24/2006 08:30 AM in Courtroom 6C before Terrence F. McVerry.Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 11/21/2005. (kll) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
12/29/2005	<u>21</u>	NOTICE by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION of Withdrawal of Appearance of Attorney Lazala (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 12/29/2005)
01/11/2006	<u>22</u>	STIPULATION And Protective Order by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION, NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION, BETHANY L. BRANDSTATTER. (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 01/11/2006)
01/12/2006	<u>23</u>	ORDER granting <u>22</u> Stipulation filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION, NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION, BETHANY L. BRANDSTATTER . Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 1/12/2006. (kll) (Entered: 01/12/2006)

01/31/2006		TEXT NOTICE of Hearing: Settlement Conference set for 2/1/2006 09:00 AM in Courtroom 6C before Terrence F. McVerry. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's notice on the matter.(kll) (Entered: 01/31/2006)
02/01/2006		Text Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Terrence F. McVerry : Settlement Conference held on 2/1/2006. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's notice on the matter. (Court Reporter None.) (kll) (Entered: 02/01/2006)
02/13/2006	<u>24</u>	MOTION to Dismiss <i>Intervenor's Complaint filed by Intervenor Bethany L. Brandstatter and by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION.</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 02/13/2006)
02/14/2006	<u>25</u>	ORDER granting <u>24</u> Motion to Dismiss . Bethany L. Brandstatter's claims in this case are dismissed with prejudice. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 2/14/2006. (kll) (Entered: 02/14/2006)
03/16/2006	<u>26</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order Proposed order)(Clickner, M.) (Entered: 03/16/2006)
03/20/2006	<u>27</u>	AMENDED CASE MANAGEMENT/SCHEDULING ORDER granting <u>26</u> Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery: Amended Pleadings due by 6/21/2006. Discovery due by 7/21/2006. Post Discovery Status Conference set for 7/28/2006 09:30 AM in Courtroom 6C before Terrence F. McVerry. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 3/20/2006. (kll) (Entered: 03/20/2006)
04/06/2006	<u>28</u>	MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1)</i> by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 04/06/2006)
04/06/2006	<u>29</u>	BRIEF in Support re <u>28</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1)</i> filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 04/06/2006)
04/06/2006	<u>30</u>	AFFIDAVIT re <u>28</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1)</i> by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 04/06/2006)
04/07/2006	<u>31</u>	ORDER Response/Briefing Schedule re <u>28</u> Motion to Dismiss/Lack of Jurisdiction. Plaintiff's Response and brief to Motion due by 5/8/2006. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 4/7/06. (cc) (Entered: 04/07/2006)
04/12/2006	<u>32</u>	MOTION for Discovery -- <i>For Stay of Discovery Pending Disposition Of Defendant's Motion To Dismiss</i> -- by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 04/12/2006)
04/13/2006		TEXT ORDER Response/Briefing Schedule re <u>32</u> Motion for Discovery. Response to Motion due by 4/24/2006. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 4/13/2006. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's notice on the matter.(kll) (Entered: 04/13/2006)
04/20/2006	<u>33</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>32</u> MOTION for Discovery -- <i>For Stay of Discovery Pending Disposition Of Defendant's Motion To Dismiss</i> -- <i>Response on Opposition</i> filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 04/20/2006)
04/25/2006	<u>34</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>32</u> MOTION for Discovery -- <i>For Stay of Discovery Pending Disposition Of Defendant's Motion To Dismiss</i> -- filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 04/25/2006)
04/26/2006	<u>35</u>	BRIEF in Opposition re <u>28</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1)</i> filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 04/26/2006)
04/26/2006	<u>36</u>	Appendix to <u>35</u> Brief in Opposition to Motion by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of M. Jean Clickner # <u>2</u>

		EEOC Exhibit A # <u>3</u> EEOC Exhibit B # <u>4</u> EEOC Exhibit C # <u>5</u> EEOC Exhibit D # <u>6</u> EEOC Exhibit E # <u>7</u> EEOC Exhibit G # <u>8</u> EEOC Exhibit F # <u>9</u> EEOC Exhibit H # <u>10</u> EEOC Exhibit I # <u>11</u> Certificate of Service)(Clickner, M.) Modified on 4/28/2006 (jv). (Entered: 04/26/2006)
04/28/2006		CLERK'S OFFICE QUALITY CONTROL MESSAGE. re <u>36</u> Appendix.. ERROR: Attachments not described correctly or no description was provided. CORRECTION: Attachment description corrected. Please Describe Attachments with future documents that have attachments. This message is for informational purposes only. (jv) (Entered: 04/28/2006)
05/02/2006	<u>37</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Reply To Plaintiff's Memorandum In Opposition To Defendant's Motion To Dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint Pursuant To Federal Rule Of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1) by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order # <u>2</u> Exhibit)(Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 05/02/2006)
05/05/2006		TEXT ORDER granting <u>37</u> Motion for Leave to File Reply to Plaintiff's Memorandum in Opposition to Defendant's Motion to Dismiss. NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICAL CORPORATION SHALL FILE SAID REPLY FORTHWITH. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 5/5/2006. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's order on the matter. (kl) (Entered: 05/05/2006)
07/11/2006	<u>38</u>	REPLY BRIEF by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION re <u>35</u> Brief in Opposition to Motion <i>To Dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1)</i> filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 07/11/2006)
07/18/2006	<u>39</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Clickner, M.) (Entered: 07/18/2006)
07/18/2006	<u>40</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>39</u> MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 07/18/2006)
07/19/2006		CLERK'S OFFICE QUALITY CONTROL MESSAGE. re <u>39</u> MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery. ERROR: Typed name omitted by s/. CORRECTION: Attorney advised of signature requirements. Attorney to resubmit with signature, using Errata event. This message is for informational purposes only. (jv) (Entered: 07/19/2006)
07/20/2006		TEXT ORDER granting <u>39</u> Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery. Discovery due by 8/21/2006. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 7/20/2006. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's order on the matter. (kl) (Entered: 07/20/2006)
07/20/2006		TEXT NOTICE of Hearing: Post Discovey Status Conference reset from 7/28/2006 to 8/25/2006 01:30 PM in Courtroom 6C before Terrence F. McVerry. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's notice on the matter.(kl) (Entered: 07/20/2006)
08/08/2006	<u>41</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER OF COURT denying <u>28</u> Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 08/08/2006. (bsc) (Entered: 08/08/2006)
08/24/2006	<u>42</u>	MOTION to Compel Response to Commission's Third Request for Production of Documents by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Certificate of Compliance w/ LR 37.1# <u>2</u> Exhibit Proposed Order of Court# <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit A)(Clickner, M.) (Entered: 08/24/2006)
08/25/2006		Text Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Terrence F. McVerry : Status Conference held on 8/25/2006. Plaintiffs Motion to Compel will be held in abeyance. Defendants are given until 9/30/2006 to provide information to Plaintiffs. (Court Reporter None.) Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's notice on the matter. (kl) (Entered: 08/25/2006)

09/01/2006	<u>43</u>	MOTION to Modify <u>41</u> Order on Motion to Dismiss/Lack of Jurisdiction by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 09/01/2006)
09/01/2006	<u>44</u>	BRIEF in Support re <u>43</u> MOTION to Modify <u>41</u> Order on Motion to Dismiss/Lack of Jurisdiction filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit)(Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 09/01/2006)
09/08/2006		ORDER Response/Briefing Schedule re <u>43</u> Motion to Modify. Plaintiff shall file a response to Defendant's Motion to Amend the Court's August 8, 2006 Order to Certify An Issue for Interlocutory Appeal on or before 9/15/2006. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text-only entry constitutes the Court's Order on the matter. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 09/08/2006. (bsc) (Entered: 09/08/2006)
09/15/2006	<u>45</u>	BRIEF in Opposition re <u>43</u> MOTION to Modify <u>41</u> Order on Motion to Dismiss/Lack of Jurisdiction filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Letter to Attorney Clickner from Mr Cipoletti # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, Commission's First Request For Production of Documents to Deft.)(Clickner, M.) Modified on 9/18/2006 (jv). (Entered: 09/15/2006)
09/18/2006		CLERK'S OFFICE QUALITY CONTROL MESSAGE. re <u>45</u> Brief in Opposition to Motion. ERROR: Attachments not described correctly or no description was provided. CORRECTION: Attachment description corrected. This message is for informational purposes only. (jv) (Entered: 09/18/2006)
09/19/2006	<u>46</u>	AMENDED ORDER OF COURT granting <u>43</u> Motion to Modify Order of Court issued 8/8/06. This litigation is hereby stayed pending resolution of the application of Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation for leave to appeal this Order to the United States Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 9/19/2006. (kll) (Entered: 09/19/2006)
11/03/2006	<u>47</u>	ORDER OF USCA denying Petition for Leave to Appeal filed by Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Information Sheet) (carh3,) Filed in Error: Correction: Removed from public view and refiled at <u>48</u> ORDER of USCA denying Petition for Leave to Appeal Modified on 11/6/2006 (jv). (Entered: 11/03/2006)
11/03/2006	<u>48</u>	ORDER OF USCA denying Petition for Leave to Appeal filed by Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp. (carh3,) Additional attachment(s) added on 11/6/2006 (jv) (Attachments # <u>1</u> Information Sheet). (Entered: 11/06/2006)
11/06/2006		TEXT NOTICE of Hearing: Telephone Status Conference set for 11/8/2006 10:00 AM in Courtroom 6C before Terrence F. McVerry. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's notice on the matter.(kll) (Entered: 11/06/2006)
11/08/2006		Text Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Terrence F. McVerry : Telephone Conference held on 11/8/2006. (Court Reporter None.) Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's notice on the matter. (kll) (Entered: 11/08/2006)
11/08/2006	<u>49</u>	ORDER OF COURT: Summary Judgment due by 1/8/2007. Response to Summary Judgment due by 3/9/2007. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 11/8/2006. (kll) (Entered: 11/08/2006)
01/08/2007	<u>50</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 01/08/2007)
01/08/2007	<u>51</u>	STATEMENT OF FACTS <i>In Support of Defendant's</i> <u>50</u> Motion for Summary Judgment. by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION.. (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 01/08/2007)
01/08/2007	<u>52</u>	BRIEF in Support re <u>50</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 01/08/2007)
01/08/2007	<u>53</u>	Appendix to <u>50</u> Motion for Summary Judgment by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix, Volume II of V# <u>2</u> Appendix, Volume III of V# <u>3</u> Appendix, Volume IV of V# <u>4</u> Appendix, Volume V of V)(Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 01/08/2007)

03/09/2007	<u>54</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>50</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 03/09/2007)
03/09/2007	<u>55</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>50</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Clickner, M.), Document removed from public view and ORIGINALLY Docketed at <u>54</u> RESPONSE to <u>50</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment Modified on 3/12/2007 (jv). (Entered: 03/09/2007)
03/09/2007	<u>56</u>	RESPONSE <i>In Opposition to Defendant's Statement of Undisputed Facts and EEOC's Counter Statement of Facts</i> to <u>51</u> Statement of Facts filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 03/09/2007)
03/09/2007	<u>57</u>	EEOC's APPENDIX to <u>56</u> Response To filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix Appendix to Commission's Response to Defendant's Statement of Undisputed Facts and EEOC's Counterstatement of Facts # <u>2</u> Exhibit # <u>3</u> Exhibit 1a # <u>4</u> Exhibit 2 # <u>5</u> Exhibit 2a # <u>6</u> Exhibit 2b # <u>7</u> Exhibit 2c # <u>8</u> Exhibit 3 # <u>9</u> Exhibit 4 # <u>10</u> Exhibit 5 # <u>11</u> Exhibit 6 # <u>12</u> Exhibit 7 # <u>13</u> Exhibit 8 # <u>14</u> Exhibit 9 # <u>15</u> Exhibit 10 # <u>16</u> Exhibit 11 # <u>17</u> Exhibit 12 # <u>18</u> Exhibit 13 # <u>19</u> Exhibit 14 # <u>20</u> Exhibit 15 # <u>21</u> Exhibit 16 # <u>22</u> Exhibit 17 # <u>23</u> Exhibit 18)(Clickner, M.), Eliminated double entry of Exhibit on each attachment and eliminated the word Response for Title of Entry (this is an Appendix) Modified on 3/12/2007 (jv). (Entered: 03/09/2007)
03/12/2007		CLERK'S OFFICE QUALITY CONTROL MESSAGE. re <u>55</u> Response to Motion ERROR: Document was duplicate to <u>54</u> RESPONSE to MOTION. CORRECTION: Duplicate document No. <u>55</u> RESPONSE to <u>50</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment removed from public view. This message is for informational purposes only. (jv) (Entered: 03/12/2007)
03/12/2007		CLERK'S OFFICE QUALITY CONTROL MESSAGE. re <u>57</u> Response To. ERROR: Attachments not described correctly (double entry of "Exhibit"). CORRECTION: Attachment description corrected. This message is for informational purposes only., CLERK'S OFFICE QUALITY CONTROL MESSAGE. ERROR: Wrong event selected. CORRECTION: ORIGINAL entry Re-docketed as an Appendix. This message is for informational purposes only. (jv) (Entered: 03/12/2007)
03/13/2007	<u>58</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 03/13/2007)
03/20/2007	<u>59</u>	BRIEF in Opposition re <u>58</u> MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 03/20/2007)
03/22/2007		TEXT ORDER granting <u>58</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply re <u>50</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment. Responses due by 3/26/2007. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 3/22/2007. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's order on the matter.(kll) (Entered: 03/22/2007)
03/26/2007	<u>60</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Kim M. Watterson on behalf of NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION (Watterson, Kim) (Entered: 03/26/2007)
03/26/2007	<u>61</u>	REPLY BRIEF by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION re <u>50</u> Motion for Summary Judgment filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Watterson, Kim) (Entered: 03/26/2007)
09/28/2007	<u>62</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER denying <u>50</u> Motion for Summary Judgment. Plaintiff shall file its Pretrial Statement on or before October 18, 2007. Defendant shall file its Pretrial Statement on or before November 7, 2007. The Court shall conduct a Pretrial Conference on November 9, 2007 at 2:30 P.M. in Courtroom 6C, 6th Floor, U.S. Courthouse, 700 Grant Street, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 9/28/2007. (kll) (Entered: 09/28/2007)
09/28/2007		Defendant Pretrial Statement due by 11/7/2007.,Plaintiff Pretrial Statement due by 10/18/2007. (kll) (Entered: 09/28/2007)

09/28/2007		Calendar Entry :Pretrial Conference set for 11/9/2007 02:30 PM in Courtroom 6C before Terrence F. McVerry. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's notice on the matter. (kll) (Entered: 09/28/2007)
10/17/2007	<u>63</u>	Unopposed MOTION to Extend Time to File Pretrial Statements by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Clickner, M.) (Entered: 10/17/2007)
10/18/2007		TEXT ORDER granting <u>63</u> Motion to Extend Time for Filing Pretrial Statements. Plaintiff Pretrial Statement due by 10/29/2007. Defendant Pretrial Statement due by 11/16/2007. Pretrial Conference reset for 11/16/2007 10:30 AM in Courtroom 6C before Terrence F. McVerry. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 10/18/2007. Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's order on the matter. (kll) (Entered: 10/18/2007)
10/29/2007	<u>64</u>	PRETRIAL STATEMENT filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 10/29/2007)
11/15/2007	<u>65</u>	PRETRIAL STATEMENT filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 11/15/2007)
11/16/2007		Text Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Terrence F. McVerry : Final Pretrial Conference held on 11/16/2007. A bench trial will be scheduled in early February 2008. Trial estimated to last 4 days. (Court Reporter: None) Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's notice on the matter. (kll,) (Entered: 11/16/2007)
12/07/2007	<u>66</u>	TRIAL SCHEDULING ORDER – NON–JURY: Plaintiffs witness list due by 1/14/2008, Defendants Witness list due by 1/21/2008, Designation of discovery due by 1/21/2008, Motions in Limine due by 1/14/2008, Response to Motions in Limine due by 1/21/2008, Bench Trial set for 2/4/2008 08:30 AM in Courtroom 6C before Terrence F. McVerry. Exhibit List due by 1/28/2008. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 12/7/2007. (kll) (Entered: 12/07/2007)
12/14/2007	<u>67</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Rachel M. Smith on behalf of EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION (Smith, Rachel) (Entered: 12/14/2007)
12/27/2007	<u>68</u>	MOTION to Take Deposition from Ivorey Gethers by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order # <u>2</u> Appendix) (Clickner, M.) Modified by removing Appendix from public view since it was refiled at <u>70</u> Errata on 1/8/2008 (jv). (Entered: 12/27/2007)
12/28/2007		TEXT ORDER: Response re <u>68</u> Motion to Take Deposition. Defendant's Response to Motion due by 1/3/2008. Text–only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text–only entry constitutes the Order of the Court or Notice on the matter. (cc) Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 12/28/07. (cc) Modified on 12/28/2007 (cc,). (Entered: 12/28/2007)
01/03/2008	<u>69</u>	BRIEF in Opposition re <u>68</u> MOTION to Take Deposition from Ivorey Gethers filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A # <u>2</u> Exhibit B # <u>3</u> Exhibit C # <u>4</u> Proposed Order) (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 01/03/2008)
01/07/2008	<u>70</u>	Errata re <u>68</u> MOTION to Take Deposition from Ivorey Gethers by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. Reason for Correction: Amendment to Appendix. (Smith, Rachel) (Entered: 01/07/2008)
01/08/2008	<u>71</u>	ORDER granting in part and denying in part <u>68</u> Motion to Take Deposition of Ivory Gethers. Plaintiff may proceed to take the deposition of Ivory Gethers either in South Carolina or Pittsburgh, PA. It is further ORDERED that Exhibit C of the original Appendix to EEOC's Motion to Reopen Discovery for the Limited Purpose of Taking the Deposition Testimony of Ivory Gethers is hereby stricken from the record and the Clerk of Court shall remove it from the docket because it violates both the Protective Order entered by this Court and Local Rule 5.1.1.D. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 1/8/2008. (kll) (Entered: 01/08/2008)
01/14/2008	<u>72</u>	MOTION in Limine to Exclude Testimony and Report of Plaintiff's Proposed Expert by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>

		Proposed Order) (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) Modified to title description field for Attachment 1 on 1/15/2008 (jv). (Entered: 01/14/2008)
01/14/2008	<u>73</u>	BRIEF in Support re <u>72</u> MOTION in Limine to <i>Exclude Testimony and Report of Plaintiff's Proposed Expert</i> filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A # <u>2</u> Exhibit B) (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) (Entered: 01/14/2008)
01/14/2008	<u>74</u>	First MOTION in Limine by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order) (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 01/14/2008)
01/14/2008	<u>75</u>	Second MOTION in Limine by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order) (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 01/14/2008)
01/14/2008	<u>76</u>	Third MOTION in Limine by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order # <u>2</u> Appendix Unified Appendix-Part 1 # <u>3</u> Appendix Unified Appendix - Part 2 # <u>4</u> Appendix Unified Appendix-Part 3) (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 01/14/2008)
01/14/2008	<u>77</u>	Fourth MOTION in Limine by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order) (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 01/14/2008)
01/14/2008	<u>78</u>	PRETRIAL STATEMENT filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 01/14/2008)
01/15/2008		CLERK'S OFFICE QUALITY CONTROL MESSAGE re <u>72</u> MOTION in Limine to Exclude Testimony and Report of Plaintiff's Proposed Expert. ERROR: Attachment not described. CORRECTION: Attachment description corrected. This message is for informational purposes only. (jv) (Entered: 01/15/2008)
01/22/2008	<u>79</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>72</u> MOTION in Limine to <i>Exclude Testimony and Report of Plaintiff's Proposed Expert</i> filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix) (Clickner, M.) Modified by naming Attachment on 1/23/2008 (jv). (Entered: 01/22/2008)
01/22/2008	<u>80</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>74</u> First MOTION in Limine filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) (Entered: 01/22/2008)
01/22/2008	<u>81</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>75</u> Second MOTION in Limine filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) (Entered: 01/22/2008)
01/22/2008	<u>82</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>76</u> Third MOTION in Limine filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) (Entered: 01/22/2008)
01/22/2008	<u>83</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>77</u> Fourth MOTION in Limine filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) (Entered: 01/22/2008)
01/22/2008	<u>84</u>	AMENDED <u>65</u> PRETRIAL STATEMENT filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) Modified entry to reflect title of Actual Document on 1/23/2008 (jv). (Entered: 01/22/2008)
01/23/2008	<u>85</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>82</u> Response to Motion in limine, filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order) (Clickner, M.) Modified by naming attachment on 1/24/2008 (jv). (Entered: 01/23/2008)
01/24/2008		CLERK'S OFFICE QUALITY CONTROL MESSAGE re <u>85</u> Reply to Response to Motion. ERROR: Attachments not described. CORRECTION: Attachment description corrected. This message is for informational purposes only. (jv) (Entered: 01/24/2008)
01/24/2008	<u>86</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>80</u> Response to Motion in <i>Limine (First)</i> , filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>

		Appendix) (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 01/24/2008)
01/24/2008	<u>87</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Surreply to EEOC's Reply to Defendant's Response to EEOC's Third Motion in Limine to Exclude D-1958 by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Surreply # <u>2</u> Proposed Order) (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) (Entered: 01/24/2008)
01/25/2008		TEXT ORDER granting <u>87</u> Motion for Leave to File Surreply. Counsel shall file said surreply forthwith as a separate document. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 1/25/2008. Text-only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text-only entry constitutes the Order of the Court or Notice on the matter. (kll) (Entered: 01/25/2008)
01/25/2008	<u>88</u>	Sur-Reply Brief by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION re <u>85</u> Reply to Response to Motion <i>in Limine to Exclude D-1958 (Third)</i> filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) (Entered: 01/25/2008)
01/28/2008	<u>89</u>	STIPULATION <i>Joint Stipulation</i> by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) (Entered: 01/28/2008)
01/29/2008	<u>90</u>	MEMORANDUM ORDER denying <u>74</u> EEOC'S First Motion in Limine; denying as moot <u>75</u> EEOC's Second Motion in Limine; denying <u>76</u> EEOC's Third Motion in Limine; denying as moot <u>77</u> EEOC's Fourth Motion in Limine. See Memorandum Order for details. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 01/29/08. (bsc) (Entered: 01/29/2008)
01/29/2008	<u>91</u>	MEMORANDUM ORDER denying <u>72</u> Defendant's Motion in Limine To Exclude Testimony and Report of Plaintiff's Proposed Expert. See Memorandum Order for details. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 1/29/08. (bsc) (Entered: 01/29/2008)
02/03/2008	<u>92</u>	MOTION sequester witnesses by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order) (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 02/03/2008)
02/04/2008		ORAL ORDER granting <u>92</u> Motion to Sequester Witnesses. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 2/4/2008. Text-only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text-only entry constitutes the Order of the Court or Notice on the matter. (kll) (Entered: 02/04/2008)
02/04/2008		Text Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Terrence F. McVerry : Bench Trial held on 2/4/2008. <u>92</u> Granted. Witnesses – Bethany Brandstatter by deposition. Joseph Palumbo and Maria Larosa. (Court Reporter: Virginia Pease) Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's notice on the matter. (kll) Modified on 2/6/2008 (kll). (Entered: 02/05/2008)
02/05/2008		Text Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Terrence F. McVerry : Bench Trial completed on 2/5/2008. Witnesses – Maria Larosa, Gary Bench. EEOC rests. The record shall remain open for the Court to review 2 video depositions (Richard Cipoletti and Ivory Gethers). The Transcript will be ordered and Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law will be due 20 days thereafter. (Court Reporter: Virginia Pease) Text only entry; no PDF document will issue. This text only entry constitutes the Court's notice on the matter. (kll) Modified on 2/6/2008 (kll). (Entered: 02/06/2008)
02/06/2008	<u>93</u>	TRIAL BRIEF <i>re: objections to portions of Gethers' testimony and exhibits</i> by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 02/06/2008)
02/07/2008	<u>94</u>	RESPONSE to EEOC's <i>Objections to Portions of Ivory Gethers' Trial Testimony</i> to <u>93</u> Trial Brief, filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) (Entered: 02/07/2008)
02/07/2008	<u>95</u>	TRIAL BRIEF <i>Objections to Defendant's designations of Bethany Brandstatter's deposition</i> by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 02/07/2008)
02/08/2008	<u>96</u>	RESPONSE to <i>Plaintiff's Objections to Defendant's Designations of Bethany Brandstatter's Deposition Transcript</i> to <u>95</u> Trial Brief, filed by NOVARTIS

		PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Flynn-Kozara, Abigail) (Entered: 02/08/2008)
04/03/2008	<u>97</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Non-Jury Trial Proceedings held on 2/4/08 before Judge Terrence F. McVerry. Court Reporter: Virginia Pease. The parties have five (5) business days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely, electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days. For redaction purposes, or otherwise, during this 90 day period a copy of the transcript may be purchased from the court reporter/transcriber or viewed at the clerk's office public terminal. Notice of Intent for Redaction of Personal Data Identifiers due by 4/14/2008, Transcript to be made public on 7/3/2008 (jv) (Entered: 04/03/2008)
04/03/2008	<u>98</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Non-Jury Trial Proceedings held on 2/5/2008 before Judge Terrence F. McVerry. Court Reporter: Virginia Pease. The parties have five (5) business days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely, electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days. For redaction purposes, or otherwise, during this 90 day period a copy of the transcript may be purchased from the court reporter/transcriber or viewed at the clerk's office public terminal. Notice of Intent for Redaction of Personal Data Identifiers due by 4/14/2008, Transcript to be made public on 7/3/2008 (jv) (Entered: 04/03/2008)
04/09/2008	<u>99</u>	ORDER OF COURT: Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law due by 5/5/2008. Rebuttal or Response due by 5/19/2008. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 4/9/2008. (kll) (Entered: 04/09/2008)
04/09/2008	<u>100</u>	RULINGS ON OBJECTIONS TO DEPOSITION EXHIBITS AND TESTIMONY OF BETHANY LYNN BRANDSTATTER re <u>95</u> Trial Brief filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 4/9/2008. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Submissions) (kll) (Entered: 04/09/2008)
04/09/2008	<u>101</u>	RULINGS ON OBJECTIONS TO DEPOSITION EXHIBITS AND TESTIMONY OF IVORY GETHERS. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 4/9/2008. (kll) (Entered: 04/09/2008)
04/09/2008	<u>102</u>	RULINGS ON ADMISSIBILITY OF EXHIBITS. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 4/9/2008. (kll) (Entered: 04/09/2008)
05/05/2008	<u>103</u>	EEOC's Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order) (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 05/05/2008)
05/05/2008	<u>104</u>	Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 05/05/2008)
05/19/2008	<u>105</u>	RESPONSE to <u>103</u> Proposed Findings of Fact, filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 05/19/2008)
10/15/2008	<u>106</u>	FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Judgment is entered in favor of Defendant, Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation, and against Plaintiff, Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 10/15/08. (bsc) (Entered: 10/15/2008)
10/15/2008	<u>107</u>	JUDGMENT in favor of Defendant, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation, and against Plaintiff, Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 10/15/08. (bsc) (Entered: 10/15/2008)
12/23/2008	<u>108</u>	BILL OF COSTS by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION in the amount of \$6675.04 against Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Itemization of costs) (Munsch, Martha) (Entered: 12/23/2008)
12/29/2008	<u>109</u>	Letter from the Clerk of Court calling for objections to the Bill of Costs. Objections to Bill of Costs due by 1/16/2009. (jv) (Entered: 12/29/2008)

01/08/2009	<u>110</u>	RESPONSE <i>in Opposition</i> to <u>108</u> Bill of Costs, filed by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 01/08/2009)
01/08/2009	<u>111</u>	MOTION to Strike <u>108</u> Bill of Costs by EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order) (Clickner, M.) (Entered: 01/08/2009)
01/12/2009	<u>112</u>	OPPISITION to <u>111</u> MOTION to Strike regarding <u>108</u> Bill of Costs, filed by NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit) (Munsch, Martha) Modified to reflect document Title on 1/13/2009. (jv) (Entered: 01/12/2009)
01/13/2009	<u>113</u>	Costs Taxed in the amount of \$3,863.60 against Pltf, Equal Employment Opportunity Commission and in favor of Deft. Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation. (jv) (Entered: 01/13/2009)
01/15/2009	<u>114</u>	Remark: Items returned to Marhta Hartle Munsch, Esquire. (kly) (Entered: 01/15/2009)
01/21/2009	<u>115</u>	ORDER denying <u>111</u> Motion to Strike Defendant's Bill of Costs Pursuant to F.R.C.P. 54(d) filed by Plaintiff. Signed by Judge Terrence F. McVerry on 1/21/09. (bsc) (Entered: 01/21/2009)