U.S. District Court SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS (Houston) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 4:06-cv-03004

Equal Employment Opportunity Commission v. Bellair Cleaners

Assigned to: Judge Lee H Rosenthal

Cause: 42:1981 Sex Discrimination

Date Filed: 09/25/2006

Date Terminated: 02/29/2008

Jury Demand: Plaintiff

Nature of Suit: 442 Civil Rights: Jobs Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Plaintiff

Plaintiff

Equal Employment Opportunity Commission

represented by Kathy D Boutchee

EEOC

1201 Louisiana Street

6th Floor

Houston, TX 77002

713-651-4913

Fax: 713-651-7995

Email: kathy.boutchee@eeoc.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Timothy M Bowne

EEOC

1919 Smith

7th Fl

Houston, TX 77002

713-209-3395

Fax: 713-209-3402

Email: timothy.bowne@eeoc.gov ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Bellair Cleaners Inc

doing business as Park Avenue Cleaners doing business as **Bellair Cleaners** doing business as

Your Valet

represented by William F Harmeyer

W F Harmeyer & Associates

7322 SW Fwy

Ste 475

Houston, TX 77074

713-270-5552

Fax: 713-270-7128

Email: wharmeyer@harmeyerlaw.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Denville Business Inc

Defendant

Heaven Star Enterprises LLC

Defendant

Heaven Star Enterprises I, LP

Defendant

Anna Naaz Inc

| Date Filed | # | Docket Text | | |
|------------|-----------|--|--|--|
| 09/25/2006 | 1 | COMPLAINT against Bellair Cleaners Inc filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission.(rwestmoreland,) Additional attachment(s) added on 9/25/2006 (mmapps,). (Entered: 09/25/2006) | | |
| 09/25/2006 | | Summons Issued as to Bellair Cleaners Inc , filed.(rwestmoreland,) (Entered: 09/25/2006 | | |
| 09/25/2006 | 2 | ORDER for Initial Pretrial and Scheduling Conference and Order to Disclose Interested Persons. Initial Conference set for 1/26/2007 at 08:45 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judg Lee H Rosenthal. (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified. (mmapps,) (Entered: 09/25/2006) | | |
| 10/11/2006 | 3 | CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PARTIES by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, filed.(Boutchee, Kathy) (Entered: 10/11/2006) | | |
| 11/07/2006 | 4 | ANSWER to Complaint with Jury Demand by Bellair Cleaners Inc, filed.(sbyrum,) (Entered: 11/09/2006) | | |
| 01/12/2007 | <u>5</u> | Joint JOINT DISCOVERY/CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, filed.(Boutchee, Kathy) (Entered: 01/12/2007) | | |
| 01/24/2007 | 6 | ORDER entered Cancelling initial pretrial and scheduling conference set for 1/26/07. Docket control order to be entered.(Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified. (leddins,) (Entered: 01/24/2007) | | |
| 01/24/2007 | 7 | SCHEDULING ORDER entered: Joinder of Parties due by 6/8/2007; Pltf Expert Witness List due by 7/16/2007; Pltf Expert Report due by 7/16/2007; Deft Expert Witness List due by 8/17/2007; Deft Expert Report due by 8/17/2007; Discovery due by 10/26/2007; Mediation due by 9/7/2007; Dispositive Motion Filing due by 11/16/2007; Non-Dispositive Motion Filing due by 1/18/2008; Docket Call set for 1/25/2008 at 02:00 PM is Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal.(Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Partinotified.(leddins,) (Entered: 01/24/2007) | | |
| 02/07/2007 | 8 | CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PARTIES, filed.(Harmeyer, William) (Entered: 02/07/2007) | | |
| 06/08/2007 | 9 | Opposed MOTION to Amend by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, filed. Motion Docket Date 6/28/2007. (Attachments: # 1 Complaint First Amended Original Complaint# 2 Proposed Order)(Boutchee, Kathy) (Entered: 06/08/2007) | | |
| 07/19/2007 | <u>10</u> | ORDER granting 9 Motion to Amend.(Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(ypippin,) (Entered: 07/23/2007) | | |
| 07/19/2007 | 11 | AMENDED complaint with Jury Demand against Denville Business Inc, Heaven Star Enterprises LLC, Heaven Star Enterprises I LP, Anna Naaz Inc, Bellair Cleaners Inc filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission.(ypippin,) (Entered: 07/23/2007) | | |
| 01/18/2008 | <u>12</u> | Joint Proposed Pretrial Order by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, filed. | | |

| 51/201/ | | De civillet Livil of District Court Texts foutifier | | | |
|------------|-----------|---|--|--|--|
| | | (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Plaintiff's Proposed Voir Dire Questions# 2 Exhibit Plaintiff's Exhibit List# 3 Exhibit Plaintiff's Witness List# 4 Exhibit Plaintiff's Mmorandum of Law# 5 Exhibit Parties Proposed Jury Charge# 6 Exhibit Defendant's Proposed Voir Dire Questions# 7 Exhibit Defendant's Exhibit List# 8 Exhibit Defendant's Witness List) (Boutchee, Kathy) (Entered: 01/18/2008) | | | |
| 01/18/2008 | 13 | MOTION in Limine by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, filed. Motion Docket Date 2/7/2008. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order Order on Plaintiff's Motion Limine)(Boutchee, Kathy) (Entered: 01/18/2008) | | | |
| 01/22/2008 | 14 | NOTICE of Resetting. Parties notified.Docket Call reset for 1/28/2008 at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal, filed. (leddins,) (Entered: 01/22/2008) | | | |
| 01/24/2008 | <u>15</u> | Opposed EXHIBITS re: 12 Proposed Pretrial Order, by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission Related document: 12 Proposed Pretrial Order,, filed. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order)(Boutchee, Kathy) (Entered: 01/24/2008) | | | |
| 01/24/2008 | <u>16</u> | TRIAL BRIEF <i>on Jurisdiction</i> by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, filed. (Boutchee, Kathy) (Entered: 01/24/2008) | | | |
| 01/27/2008 | <u>17</u> | NOTICE <i>OF BANKRUPTCY</i> by Bellair Cleaners Inc, filed. (Harmeyer, William) (Enter 01/27/2008) | | | |
| 01/28/2008 | 18 | RESPONSE to <u>17</u> Notice (Other) <i>of Bankruptcy</i> , filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Bowne, Timothy) (Entered: 01/28/2008) | | | |
| 01/28/2008 | 19 | Minute entry for docket call held before Judge Lee H. Rosenthal on 1/28/2008Trial is scheduled to begin on 2/4/2008 at 1:30 p.m. The court granted the motions in limine as stated in the record. The EEOC's exhibits 7 through 20 and 22 are admitted into evidence The defendants withdrew the only exhibit offered. Appearances: Kathy Boutchee/Timoth Bowne for Pltf. EEOC and William Harmeyer for Defts.(Court Reporter: Ed Reed), filed (leddins,) (Entered: 01/28/2008) | | | |
| 01/31/2008 | <u>20</u> | NOTICE of Resetting. Parties notified. Jury Trial reset for 2/5/2007 at 08:30 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal, filed. (leddins,) (Entered: 01/31/2008) | | | |
| 01/31/2008 | 21 | NOTICE of Resetting as to 20 Notice of Resetting. Parties notified. Jury Trial reset for 2/5/2008 at 08:30 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal, filed. (leddins, (Entered: 01/31/2008) | | | |
| 02/01/2008 | 22 | NOTICE <i>Amended Notice of Bankruptcy</i> re: <u>17</u> Notice (Other) by Bellair Cleaners Inc, filed. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Harmeyer, William) (Entered: 02/01/2008) | | | |
| 02/01/2008 | 23 | MOTION for William F. Harmeyer to Withdraw as Attorney by Bellair Cleaners Inc, filed Motion Docket Date 2/21/2008. (Harmeyer, William) (Entered: 02/01/2008) | | | |
| 02/01/2008 | 24 | NOTICE <i>OR ORAL HEARING</i> re: 23 MOTION for William F. Harmeyer to Withdraw a Attorney by Bellair Cleaners Inc, filed. (Harmeyer, William) (Entered: 02/01/2008) | | | |
| 02/04/2008 | <u>25</u> | RESPONSE to 22 Notice (Other) <i>Amended Notice of Bankruptcy</i> , filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Bowne, Timothy) (Entered: 02/04/2008) | | | |
| 02/04/2008 | <u>26</u> | RESPONSE in Opposition to <u>23</u> MOTION for William F. Harmeyer to Withdraw as Attorney, filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Bowne, Timothy) (Entered: 02/04/2008) | | | |
| 02/04/2008 | 27 | RETURN of Service Executed as to Nizar Ali on 2/1/08 re: Subpoena, filed.(dpower,) (Entered: 02/05/2008) | | | |
| 02/04/2008 | 28 | RETURN of Service Executed as to Parrish Payne on 1/31/08 re: Subpoena, filed.(dpower, | | | |
| | | | | | |

| | |) (Entered: 02/05/2008) | | | |
|------------|-----------|--|--|--|--|
| 02/04/2008 | <u>29</u> | RETURN of Service Executed as to Maria Rossana Ruiz on 1/31/08 re: Subpoena, filed. (smurdock,) (Entered: 02/05/2008) | | | |
| 02/04/2008 | <u>30</u> | RETURN of Service Executed as to Munita Ali on 2/4/08 re: Subpoena, filed.(smurdock, (Entered: 02/05/2008) | | | |
| 02/04/2008 | <u>31</u> | RETURN of Service Executed as to Antonio Reyes on 2/2/08 re: 2/4/08, filed.(dpower,) (Entered: 02/05/2008) | | | |
| 02/05/2008 | 32 | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Day 1 of Jury trial hel on 2/5/2008. Jury selected and sworn. Court adjourned until 9:00 a.m. on 2/6/08. Appearances: Kathy Boutchee/Timothy Bowne for Pltf. and William Harmeyer for Defts (Court Reporter: K. Metzger), filed.(leddins,) (Entered: 02/06/2008) | | | |
| 02/06/2008 | 33 | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Second day of JURY TRIAL held on 2/6/2008. Opening statements heard. Plfts. case begins. Witness testimon taken. Exhibits admitted as stated on the record. Plffs. rest. Defts. case begins. Defts. rest. Court is adjourned until 2/7/08, at 9:00 a.m. when closing arguments will be presented. Witnesses: Munira Ali, Maria Rosanna Ruiz, Nizar Ali and Parrish Payne. Appearances: Kathy Boutchee/Timothy Bowne for Pltf. and William Harmeyer for Defts (Court Reporter: K. Metzger), filed. (leddins,) (Entered: 02/07/2008) | | | |
| 02/07/2008 | 34 | ORDER entered for the Clerk's office to enter the attached jury instructions as part of the record. (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) (Attachments: # 1 jury iinstructions) Parties notified.(leddins,) (Entered: 02/07/2008) | | | |
| 02/07/2008 | 35 | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Lee H Rosenthal. THIRD day of JURY TRIAL held on 2/7/2008. Closing arguments presented. Exhibits certified. Case presented to the jury and deliberations begin. Jury note 1 received and answered. Verdict returned in favor of the Pltf. Trial ends. Appearances: Kathy Boutchee/Timothy Bowne for Pltf. and William Harmeyer for Defts.(Court Reporter: K. Metzger), filed.(leddins,) (Entered: 02/07/2008) | | | |
| 02/07/2008 | <u>36</u> | Proposed Definitions on Jury Instructions Regarding Punitive Damages by Bellair Cleaners Inc, filed.(sbyrum,) (Entered: 02/08/2008) | | | |
| 02/07/2008 | 38 | Certification of Trial Exhibits by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, Bellair Cleaners Inc, filed.(rvazquez,) (Entered: 02/08/2008) | | | |
| 02/07/2008 | <u>39</u> | Exhibit List by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, filed.(rvazquez,) (Entered: 02/08/2008) | | | |
| 02/07/2008 | <u>40</u> | Exhibit List by Bellair Cleaners Inc, filed.(rvazquez,) (Entered: 02/08/2008) | | | |
| 02/07/2008 | 41 | Jury Note No. 1, filed.(rvazquez,) Additional attachment(s) added on 2/8/2008 (rvazquez). (Entered: 02/08/2008) | | | |
| 02/07/2008 | 42 | Jury Note No. 2, filed.(rvazquez,) Additional attachment(s) added on 2/8/2008 (rvazquez,). (Entered: 02/08/2008) | | | |
| 02/07/2008 | 43 | JURY VERDICT, filed.(rvazquez,) Additional attachment(s) added on 2/8/2008 (rvazquez). (Entered: 02/08/2008) | | | |
| 02/07/2008 | 44 | Certification of Withdrawal of Trial Exhibits by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, filed.(rvazquez,) (Entered: 02/08/2008) | | | |
| 02/07/2008 | 45 | Certification of Withdrawal of Trial Exhibits by Bellair Cleaners Inc, filed.(rvazquez,) (Entered: 02/08/2008) | | | |
| | + | | | | |

| 37 | ORDER entered that the Clerk is hereby ordered to provide the lunch meal for the jury. This order is directed to the Financial Section for reimbursement to the Clerk providing to meal. (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(leddins,) (Entered: 02/08/2008) | | | |
|-----------|--|--|--|--|
| 46 | TRANSCRIPT of Excerpt of Trial, Testimony of Munira N. Ali held on 2/6/08 before Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Court Reporter: K. Metzger. Transcript is available for viewing the office of the clerk, filed. (kmetzger,) (Entered: 02/27/2008) | | | |
| 47 | TRANSCRIPT of Excerpt of Trial, Testimony of Nizar R. Ali held on 2/6/08 before Jud Lee H Rosenthal. Court Reporter: K. Metzger. Transcript is available for viewing in the office of the clerk, filed. (kmetzger,) (Entered: 02/27/2008) | | | |
| 48 | MOTION for <i>Entry of Judgment</i> Judgment by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, filed. Motion Docket Date 3/18/2008. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order) (Boutchee, Kathy) (Entered: 02/27/2008) | | | |
| 49 | MOTION for Permanent Injunction by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, file Motion Docket Date 3/18/2008. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order)(Boutchee, Kathy) (Entered: 02/27/2008) | | | |
| <u>50</u> | ORDER granting Injunctive Relief <u>48</u> , <u>49</u> . (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(chorace) (Entered: 02/29/2008) | | | |
| <u>51</u> | JUDGMENT. Case terminated on February 29, 2008. (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified. (chorace) (Entered: 02/29/2008) | | | |
| <u>52</u> | BILL OF COSTS in total amount \$530.00 by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, filed.(kosborne,) (Entered: 03/05/2008) | | | |
| <u>53</u> | Abstract of Judgment Issued, filed.(mmapps,) (Entered: 04/22/2010) | | | |
| | 46 47 48 49 50 51 52 | | | |

| PACER Service Center | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------|------------------|------------------|---------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| Transaction Receipt | | | | | | | | |
| 05/31/2017 20:25:12 | | | | | | | | |
| PACER Login: | hs0328:2563377:0 | Client Code: | | | | | | |
| Description: | Docket Report | Search Criteria: | 4:06-cv-03004 | | | | | |
| Billable Pages: | 4 | Cost: | 0.40 | | | | | |