Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 1 of 21

SEALDC, CLOSED, STANDARD

# United States District Court Eastern District of Pennsylvania (Philadelphia) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:06-cv-05304-ER

KAPLAN et al v. CHERTOFF et al Assigned to: HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO Cause: 08:1329 Writ of Mandamus to Adjudicate Visa Petiti Date Filed: 12/06/2006 Date Terminated: 03/05/2008

Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

# **Plaintiff**

SHMUL KAPLAN

## represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

HIAS AND COUNCIL
2100 ARCH ST., 3RD FL
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103
215–832–0900
Fax: 215–832–0919
Email: ayogansallo@yahoo.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JOHN BOUMAN

SARGENT SHRIVER NATIONAL CENTER ON POVERTY LAW 50 E. WASHINGTON SUITE 500 CHICAGO, IL 60153 312–368–2671 Fax: 312–263–3846 Email: johnbouman@povertylaw.org LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

COMMUNITY LEGAL SERVICES, INC. 1424 CHESTNUT STREET
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19102–2505
215–981–3762
Email: jstein@clsphila.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JORDANA L. GREENWALD

U.S. DEPT OF LABOR
OFFICE OF THE REGIONAL
SOLICITOR
SUITE 630 EAST – THE CURTIS CTR
170 S. INDEPENDENCE MALL WEST
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106
215–861–5129
Email: greenwald.jordana@dol.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# SABRINA M. RUDNICK

BALLARD SPAHR ANDREWS &INGERSOLL LLP 1735 MARKET ST., 51ST FL PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103–7599 215–665–8500 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 2 of 21

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

COMMUNITY LEGAL SERVICES INC 1424 CHESTNUT ST PHILADELPHIA, PA 19102 215–981–3707

Fax: 267-765-6481

Email: <u>mfroehlich@clsphila.org</u> *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED* 

# RICHARD P. WEISHAUPT

COMMUNITY LEGAL SERVICES, INC. 1424 CHESTNUT STREET PHILADELPHIA, PA 19102–2505 215–981–3773

Fax: 215–981–0436

Email: <a href="mailto:rweishaupt@clsphila.org">rweishaupt@clsphila.org</a>
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### THOMAS B. ROBERTS

Hamburg & Golden, P.C. 1601 Market Street, Suite 3310 PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103–7599 215–255–8594

Fax: 215-255-8583

Email: <a href="mailto:robertstb@hamburg-golden.com">robertstb@hamburg-golden.com</a>

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

TASIM MANDIJA

# represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JOHN BOUMAN

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

## RICHARD P. WEISHAUPT

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# THOMAS B. ROBERTS

(See above for address)

Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 3 of 21

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

### **Plaintiff**

#### FERIDE MANDIJA

#### represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JOHN BOUMAN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# RICHARD P. WEISHAUPT

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### THOMAS B. ROBERTS

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

## **Plaintiff**

**ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI**BY AND THROUGH HIS PARENTS AND
GUARDIANS AD LITEM

#### represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

## JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address) *LEAD ATTORNEY* 

Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 4 of 21

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# THOMAS B. ROBERTS

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

**MASHAALAH** 

# represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# RICHARD P. WEISHAUPT

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# THOMAS B. ROBERTS

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI

# represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 5 of 21

#### JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### THOMAS B. ROBERTS

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **Plaintiff**

LIDIYA BURTSEVA

# represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### THOMAS B. ROBERTS

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **Plaintiff**

**NELLI OLEVSKAYA** 

#### represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JONATHAN M. STEIN

## Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 6 of 21

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### THOMAS B. ROBERTS

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

ESHETU MERI INDIVIDUALLY AND ON BEHALF OF ALL OTHERS SIMILARLY SITUATED

# represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# RICHARD P. WEISHAUPT

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# THOMAS B. ROBERTS

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

**SARA BACHMAN** 

represented by **AYODELE A. GANSALLO** (See above for address)

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

#### Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 7 of 21

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

**MOISEY BACKMAN** 

#### represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

**JOE BEOPLUE** 

#### represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

## Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 8 of 21

LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

## MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

**SONYUNOR BEOPLUE** 

# represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **Plaintiff**

**GLAYON BLOUE** 

#### represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JONATHAN M. STEIN

## Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 9 of 21

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

IZAAK ROZENBLIT

# represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

**SEMEN SAVRANSKIY** 

# represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

## **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

## Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 10 of 21

#### JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

LYUDMILA SHIROKAYA

# represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

**IGOR STEPANOV** 

# represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Plaintiff**

YEVGENIYA STRIZHEVSKAYA INDIVIDUALLY AND ON BEHALF OF ALL OTHERS SIMILARLY SITUATED

# represented by AYODELE A. GANSALLO

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **JOHN BOUMAN**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### JONATHAN M. STEIN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# JORDANA L. GREENWALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

### SABRINA M. RUDNICK

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

#### **Defendant**

MICHAEL CHERTOFF AS SECRETARY OF THE DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY represented by ELIZABETH J. STEVENS

US DEPT OF JUSTICE POBOX 878 BEN FRANKLIN STATION WASHINGTON, DC 20044 202–616–9752 Fax: 202–233–0397 Email: elizabeth.stevens@usdoj.gov LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### RICHARD M. BERNSTEIN

U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE 615 CHESTNUT ST SUITE 1250 PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106–4476 215–861–8334 Fax: 215–861–8349 Email: righard bernstein@usdoi.gov

Email: <u>richard.bernstein@usdoj.gov</u> *LEAD ATTORNEY*  Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 12 of 21

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Defendant** 

ALBERTO GONZALES

AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE **UNITED STATES** 

represented by **ELIZABETH J. STEVENS** 

(See above for address) **LEAD ATTORNEY** 

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

RICHARD M. BERNSTEIN

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Defendant** 

EMILIO T. GONZALEZ

AS DIRECTOR OF U.S. CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES

represented by **ELIZABETH J. STEVENS** 

(See above for address) **LEAD ATTORNEY** 

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

RICHARD M. BERNSTEIN

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Defendant** 

ROBERT S. MUELLER, III

AS DIRECTOR OF THE FEDERAL BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION

represented by ELIZABETH J. STEVENS

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

RICHARD M. BERNSTEIN

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Defendant** 

JO ANNE B. BARNHART

AS COMMISSIONER OF SOCIAL

**SECURITY** 

represented by **ELIZABETH J. STEVENS** 

(See above for address) **LEAD ATTORNEY** 

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

RICHARD M. BERNSTEIN

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Defendant** 

DONALD MONICA

AS DISTRICT DIRECTOR OF THE U.S. CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, PHILADELPHIA DISTRICT **OFFICE** 

represented by ELIZABETH J. STEVENS

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

RICHARD M. BERNSTEIN

(See above for address) **LEAD ATTORNEY** 

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
12/04/2006	1	MOTION for Leave to Proceed in forma pauperis filed by MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA,

# Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 13 of 21

		ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, FERIDE MANDIJA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI.(tj, ) (Entered: 12/05/2006)
12/06/2006	2	ORDER THAT THE PLAINTIFF MAY PROCEED IN FORMA PAUPERIS IN THIS MATTER, WITHOUT BEING REQUIRED TO PAY FEES AND COSTS OR GIVE SECURITY FOR THEM. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 12/06/06.12/06/06 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND FAXED. (ac, ) (mk, ). (Entered: 12/06/2006)
12/06/2006	3	COMPLAINT AGAINST MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA FILED BY MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, FERIDE MANDIJA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI. (IFP STATUS) (ac, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 12/13/2006 (ac, ). (Entered: 12/06/2006)
12/06/2006		7 Original Summons(es) Issued as to MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA. Forwarded To: U.S. Marshal on 12/07/06. (ac, ) (Entered: 12/06/2006)
12/07/2006	4	Acceptance of Service by U.S. Attorney Re: accepted summons and complaint for MICHAEL CHERTOFF on 12/7/2006, answer due 2/5/2007; ALBERTO GONZALES on 12/7/2006, answer due 2/5/2007; EMILIO T. GONZALEZ on 12/7/2006, answer due 2/5/2007; ROBERT S. MUELLER, III on 12/7/2006, answer due 2/5/2007; JO ANNE B. BARNHART on 12/7/2006, answer due 2/5/2007; DONALD MONICA on 12/7/2006, answer due 2/5/2007. (ac, ) (Entered: 12/07/2006)
12/22/2006	<u>5</u>	Praecipe to Issue Summons filed by SHMUL KAPLAN.Praecipe—Notice to Clerk. (Attachments: #_1) (STEIN, JONATHAN) Modified on 12/27/2006 (np). (Entered: 12/22/2006)
12/22/2006		3 Alias Summons(es) Issued as to Robert S. Mueller, III, Donald Monica, and Emilio T. Gonzalez. Forwarded to Counsel 12/27/06. (ac, ) (Entered: 12/27/2006)
01/24/2007	<u>6</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by RICHARD P. WEISHAUPT on behalf of MASHAALAH, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, FERIDE MANDIJA, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEL, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA (WEISHAUPT, RICHARD) Modified on 1/26/2007 (afm, ). (Entered: 01/24/2007)
01/31/2007	7	MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, FERIDE MANDIJA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI.Memorandum and Certificate of Service.(ROBERTS, THOMAS) (Entered: 01/31/2007)
01/31/2007	8	MOTION to Certify Class and for Appointment of Class Counsel filed by MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, FERIDE MANDIJA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI.Memorandum of Law and Certificate of Service.(ROBERTS, THOMAS) (Entered: 01/31/2007)
01/31/2007	9	APPLICATION OF AYODELE A. GANSALLO, ESQUIRE TO PRACTICE IN THIS COURT BY MASHAALAH, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, FERIDE MANDIJA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI, STATEMENT, CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE. (ac, ) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
01/31/2007	10	EXHIBITS TO MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION BY MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, FERIDE MANDIJA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI. (Attachments: #_1 Exhibits#_2 Exhibits#_3 Exhibits#_4 Exhibits#_5 Exhibits#_6 Exhibits#_7 Exhibits#_8 Exhibits)(ac, ) (Entered: 02/01/2007)

# Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 14 of 21

01/31/2007	11	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT FOR DECLARATORY, INJUNCTIVE AND MANDAMUS RELIEF AGAINST MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA FILED BY MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, SARA BACHMAN, FERIDE MANDIJA, MOISEY BACKMAN, JOE BEOPLUE, SONYUNOR BEOPLUE, GLAYON BLOUE, IZAAK ROZENBLIT, SEMEN SAVRANSKIY, LYUDMILA SHIROKAYA, IGOR STEPANOV, YEVGENIYA STRIZHEVSKAYA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI. (Attachments: #1 Exhibits#2 Exhibits)(ac, ) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
01/31/2007		7 Original Summons Issued as to MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA. Forwarded To: Counsel on 02/01/07. (ac, ) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
02/01/2007	12	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, SARA BACHMAN, FERIDE MANDIJA, MOISEY BACKMAN, JOE BEOPLUE, SONYUNOR BEOPLUE, GLAYON BLOUE, IZAAK ROZENBLIT, SEMEN SAVRANSKIY, LYUDMILA SHIROKAYA, IGOR STEPANOV, YEVGENIYA STRIZHEVSKAYA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI (FROEHLICH, MICHAEL) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
02/01/2007	13	Acceptance of Service by U.S. Attorney Re: accepted summons and complaint for MICHAEL CHERTOFF on 2/1/2007, answer due 4/2/2007; ALBERTO GONZALES on 2/1/2007, answer due 4/2/2007; EMILIO T. GONZALEZ on 2/1/2007, answer due 4/2/2007; ROBERT S. MUELLER, III on 2/1/2007, answer due 4/2/2007; JO ANNE B. BARNHART on 2/1/2007, answer due 4/2/2007; DONALD MONICA on 2/1/2007, answer due 4/2/2007. (ac, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 6/18/2007 (bj, ). (Entered: 02/01/2007)
02/01/2007	14	NOTICE of Appearance by MICHAEL R. FROEHLICH on behalf of MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, SARA BACHMAN, FERIDE MANDIJA, MOISEY BACKMAN, JOE BEOPLUE, SONYUNOR BEOPLUE, GLAYON BLOUE, IZAAK ROZENBLIT, SEMEN SAVRANSKIY, LYUDMILA SHIROKAYA, IGOR STEPANOV, YEVGENIYA STRIZHEVSKAYA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI with Certificate of Service (Attachments: #1)(FROEHLICH, MICHAEL) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
02/01/2007	<u>15</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by ELIZABETH J. STEVENS on behalf of MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA with Certificate of Service (STEVENS, ELIZABETH) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
02/01/2007	<u>16</u>	APPLICATION OF SABRINA M. RUDNICK, ESQUIRE TO PRACTICE IN THIS COURT BY MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, SARA BACHMAN, FERIDE MANDIJA, MOISEY BACKMAN, JOE BEOPLUE, SONYUNOR BEOPLUE, GLAYON BLOUE, IZAAK ROZENBLIT, SEMEN SAVRANSKIY, LYUDMILA SHIROKAYA, IGOR STEPANOV, YEVGENIYA STRIZHEVSKAYA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI, STATEMENT, CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE. (ac, ) (Entered: 02/02/2007)
02/02/2007	<u>17</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by RICHARD M. BERNSTEIN on behalf of MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA with Certificate of Service (BERNSTEIN, RICHARD) (Entered: 02/02/2007)
02/05/2007	<u>18</u>	ORDER THAT THE APPLICATION OF SABRINA M. RUDNICK, ESQUIRE, TO PRACTICE IN THIS COURT IS GRANTED. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 02/02/07. 02/06/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND FAXED.(ac, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 6/4/2007 (mbh,

# Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 15 of 21

		). (Entered: 02/06/2007)
02/07/2007	<u>19</u>	ORDER THAT THE APPLICATION OF AYODELE A. GANSALLO, ESQUIRE TO PRACTICE IN THIS COURT IS GRANTED. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 02/06/07. 02/07/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND FAXED.(ac, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 6/1/2007 (mbh, ). (Entered: 02/07/2007)
02/08/2007	<u>20</u>	ORDER THAT A TELEPHONE STATUS CONFERENCE IS SCHEDULED ON FEBRUARY 9, 2007, AT 9:30 A.M. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 02/08/07. 02/08/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND FAXED.(ac, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 2/9/2007 (ac, ). (Entered: 02/08/2007)
02/09/2007	21	ORDER THAT DEFENDANT SHALL RESPOND TO PLAINTIFFS' FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT FOR DECLARATORY, INJUNCTIVE AND MANDAMUS RELIEF THROUGH THE FILING OF A MOTION TO DISMISS BY FEBRUARY 14, 2007. PLAINTIFFS SHALL FILE A RESPONSE TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS BY FEBRUARY 21, 2007. DEFENDANTS MAY FILE A REPLY IN SUPPORT OF THEIR MOTION TO DISMISS, IF ANY, BY FEBRUARY 28, 2007. A HEARING ON DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS IS SCHEDULED FOR MARCH 7, 2007, T 9:30 A.M. IN COURTROOM 11A. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 02/09/07. 02/12/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E–MAILED.(ac, ) Modified on 2/16/2007 (ac, ). (Entered: 02/12/2007)
02/14/2007	<u>22</u>	MOTION to Dismiss filed by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA.Memorandum, Certificate of Service. (Attachments: #1 Exhibit List of Exhibits#2 Exhibit A#3 Exhibit B#4 Exhibit C#5 Exhibit D#6 Exhibit E#7 Attachment A#8 Attachment B)(STEVENS, ELIZABETH) (Entered: 02/14/2007)
02/14/2007	<u>23</u>	APPLICATION OF JOHN BOUMAN, ESQUIRE TO PRACTICE IN THIS COURT BY MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, SARA BACHMAN, FERIDE MANDIJA, MOISEY BACKMAN, JOE BEOPLUE, SONYUNOR BEOPLUE, GLAYON BLOUE, IZAAK ROZENBLIT, SEMEN SAVRANSKIY, LYUDMILA SHIROKAYA, IGOR STEPANOV, YEVGENIYA STRIZHEVSKAYA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI, STATEMENT, CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE. (ac, ) (Entered: 02/15/2007)
02/15/2007	24	AMENDED DOCUMENT by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA. Amendment to <u>22</u> MOTION to Dismiss Certificate of Service. (STEVENS, ELIZABETH) (Entered: 02/15/2007)
02/15/2007	<u>25</u>	ORDER THAT THE APPLICATION OF JOHN BOUMAN, ESQUIRE TO PRACTICE IN THIS COURT ON BEHALF OF PLAINTIFFS IS GRANTED. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 02/15/07. 02/15/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND FAXED.(ac, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 6/4/2007 (mbh, ). (Entered: 02/15/2007)
02/15/2007	<u>26</u>	Stipulation and Confidentiality Order filed by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA (Attachments: #1 Sample Acknowledgement)(STEVENS, ELIZABETH) Modified on 2/16/2007 (afm, ). (FILED IN ERROR BY ATTORNEY, FORWARDED TO JUDGE FOR APPROVAL) (Entered: 02/15/2007)
02/20/2007	<u>27</u>	ORDER THAT THE APPLICATION OF JOHN M. BOUMAN, ESQUIRE TO PRACTICE IN THIS COURT IS GRANTED. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 02/20/07. 02/20/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND FAXED.(ac, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 6/4/2007 (mbh, ). (Entered: 02/20/2007)

# Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 16 of 21

02/20/2007	<u>28</u>	STIPULATION AND CONFIDENTIALITY ORDER THAT THIS CONFIDENTIALITY ORDER SHALL APPLY TO ALL INITIAL DISCLOSURES AND ALL FUTURE DISCOVERY IN THIS ACTION SUBJECT TO MODIFICATIONS IN WRITING BY THE PARTIES OR BY THE COURT, ETC. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 02/20/07. 02/20/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND FAXED.(ac, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 6/4/2007 (mbh, ). (Entered: 02/20/2007)
02/20/2007	29	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings held on 2/9/07 before Judge ROBRENO. Court Reporter: JOSEPH MATKOWSKI. TELEPHONE CONFERENCE (jl, ) (Entered: 02/20/2007)
02/21/2007	30	Amended Transcript of Telephone Conference held on 02/09/07 before Judge Robreno. Court Reporter: ESR. (ac, ) (Entered: 02/21/2007)
02/21/2007	31	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re 22 MOTION to Dismiss, Certificate of Service filed by MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, SARA BACHMAN, FERIDE MANDIJA, MOISEY BACKMAN, JOE BEOPLUE, SONYUNOR BEOPLUE, GLAYON BLOUE, IZAAK ROZENBLIT, SEMEN SAVRANSKIY, LYUDMILA SHIROKAYA, IGOR STEPANOV, YEVGENIYA STRIZHEVSKAYA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI. (GREENWALD, JORDANA) Modified on 2/23/2007 (afm, ). Additional attachment(s) added on 2/23/2007 (np, ). (Entered: 02/21/2007)
02/28/2007	<u>32</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>22</u> MOTION to Dismiss filed by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA. (STEVENS, ELIZABETH) (Entered: 02/28/2007)
03/07/2007	33	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge EDUARDO C. ROBRENO: Hearing on Motion to Dismiss held on 03/07/07. Court Reporter: ESR. (ac, ) (Entered: 03/08/2007)
03/08/2007	<u>34</u>	ORDER THAT DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS IS GRANTED IN PART AND DENIED IN PART, ETC. DEFENDANTS SHALL FILE AN ANSWER TO BOTH PLAINTIFFS' FIRST AMENDED COMPLANT FOR DECLARATORY, INJUNCTIVE AND MANDAMUS RELIEF AND PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO CERTIFY CLASS AND FOR APPOINTMENT OF CLASS COUNSEL BY MARCH 19, 2007. PLAINTIFFS MAY FILE A REPLY IN SUPPORT OF THEIR MOTION TO CERTIFY CLASS AND FOR APPOINTMENT OF CLASS COUNSEL, IF ANY, BY MARCH 26, 2007. DISCOVERY IS TO CONTINUE. A STATUS AND SCHEDULING CONFERENCE IS SCHEDULED FOR MARCH 21, 2007, A T 9:30 A.M. IN COURTROOM 11A. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 03/07/07.03/08/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 03/08/2007)
03/08/2007		Set/Reset Deadlines as to <u>8</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>and for Appointment of Class Counsel</i> . RESPONSES DUE BY 3/19/2007. REPLIES DUE BY 3/26/2007. (ac, ) (Entered: 03/08/2007)
03/08/2007		STATUS AND SCHEDULING CONFERENCE SET FOR 3/21/2007 09:30 AM IN COURTROOM BEFORE HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO. (ac, ) (Entered: 03/08/2007)
03/08/2007		Update Answer Deadline (ac, ) (Entered: 03/08/2007)
03/09/2007	35	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings held on 3/7/07 before Judge ROBRENO. Court Reporter: JOE MATKOWSKI. HEARING ON MOTION TO DISMISS (jl, ) (Entered: 03/12/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>36</u>	Defendants' ANSWER to Amended Complaint WITH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES For Declaratory, Injunctive And Mandamus Relief by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA, CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE.(STEVENS, ELIZABETH) Modified on 3/21/2007 (afm, ). (Entered: 03/19/2007)

# Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 17 of 21

03/19/2007	37	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>8</u> MOTION to Certify Class and for Appointment of Class Counsel filed by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA, CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE. (Attachments: #1 Exhibit A)(STEVENS, ELIZABETH) Modified on 3/21/2007 (afm, ). (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/20/2007	38	ORDER THAT THE STATUS AND SCHEDULING CONFERENCE PREVIOUSLY SCHEDULED ON MARCH 21, 2007, IS RESCHEDULED ON MARCH 22, 2007, AT 11:00 A.M. IN COURTROOM 11A. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 03/20/07. 03/20/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 03/20/2007)
03/22/2007	39	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge EDUARDO C. ROBRENO: Status Conference held on 03/21/07. Court Reporter: ESR. (ac, ) (Entered: 03/22/2007)
03/23/2007	40	ORDER THAT DISCOVERY SHALL CONTINUE AS OUTLINED HEREIN AND IN FURTHER ORDER THAT PARTIES SHALL MEET AND CONFER TO AGREE UPON POINTS LISTED HEREIN SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 3/22/07. 3/23/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED, E–MAILED.(mas, ) (Entered: 03/23/2007)
03/26/2007	41	REPLY to Response to Motion re 8 MOTION to Certify Class and for Appointment of Class Counsel filed by MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, SARA BACHMAN, FERIDE MANDIJA, MOISEY BACKMAN, JOE BEOPLUE, SONYUNOR BEOPLUE, GLAYON BLOUE, IZAAK ROZENBLIT, SEMEN SAVRANSKIY, LYUDMILA SHIROKAYA, IGOR STEPANOV, YEVGENIYA STRIZHEVSKAYA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI, Certificate of Service. (Attachments: #1 Exhibit 1#2 Exhibit 2#3 Exhibit 3#4 Exhibit 4) (FROEHLICH, MICHAEL) Modified on 3/27/2007 (np). (Entered: 03/26/2007)
03/29/2007	<u>42</u>	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER THAT DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS IS GRANTED IN PART AND DENIED IN PART, ETC. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 03/29/07. 03/29/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 03/29/2007)
03/30/2007	43	LETTER TO JUDGE ROBRENO WITH COURT APPROVAL THAT DISCOVERY IS TO BE COMPLETED ON OR BEFORE MAY 25, 2007. ALL PRETRIAL MEMORANDUM IS TO BE FILED BY EACH SIDE ON OR BEFORE MAY 25, 2007. MOTIONS IN LIMINE ARE TO BE FILED BY MAY 29 AND RESPONDED TO BY JUNE 1, 2007 SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 03/29/07. 04/02/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND FAXED.(ac, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 7/9/2007 (ac, ). (Entered: 04/02/2007)
04/13/2007	44	ORDER THAT THE LETTER TO JUDGE ROBRENO FROM ELIZABETH J. STEVENS, ESQUIRE, DATED 04/10/07, IS TO BE FILED OF RECORD (LETTER ATTACHED). SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 04/12/07. 04/13/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND FAXED.(ac, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 5/25/2007 (le, ). (Entered: 04/13/2007)
04/13/2007	45	ORDER THAT THE LETTER TO JUDGE ROBRENO FROM THOMAS B. ROBERTS, ESQUIRE, DATED 04/11/07 IS TO BE FILED OF RECORD. (LETTER ATTACHED). SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 04/12/07. 04/13/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND FAXED.(ac, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 5/25/2007 (le, ). (Entered: 04/13/2007)
04/17/2007	<u>46</u>	ORDER THAT DEFENDANTS' REQUEST TO CORRECT AND/OR AMEND THE MEMORANDUM AND ORDER DATED MARCH 29, 2007 IS GRANTED IN PART AND DENIED IN PART, ETC. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 04/16/07. 04/18/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E–MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 04/18/2007)

# Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 18 of 21

05/03/2007	<u>47</u>	ORDER THAT A STATUS AND SCHEDULING CONFERENCE IS SCHEDULED FOR THURSDAY, MAY 10, 2007 AT 2:00 P.M. IN COURTROOM 11A. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 05/03/07. 05/03/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 05/03/2007)
05/04/2007	48	PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO COMPEL DEFENDANTS THE DIRECTOR OF USCIS AND THE SECRETARY OF HOMELAND SECURITY TO PRODUCE DOCUMENTS FILED BY MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, SARA BACHMAN, FERIDE MANDIJA, MOISEY BACKMAN, JOE BEOPLUE, SONYUNOR BEOPLUE, GLAYON BLOUE, IZAAK ROZENBLIT, SEMEN SAVRANSKIY, LYUDMILA SHIROKAYA, IGOR STEPANOV, YEVGENIYA STRIZHEVSKAYA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI, MEMORANDUM, CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE.(ac, ) (Entered: 05/07/2007)
05/09/2007	49	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>48</u> MOTION to Compel <i>Defendants the Director of USCIS and the Secretary of Homeland Security to Produce Documents</i> filed by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA. (Attachments: #1 Exhibit A#2 Exhibit B)(STEVENS, ELIZABETH) (Entered: 05/09/2007)
05/10/2007	50	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge EDUARDO C. ROBRENO: Status and Scheduling Conference held on 05/10/07. Court Reporter: ESR. (ac, ) (Entered: 05/11/2007)
05/11/2007	51	STIPULATION AND SUPPLEMENTAL CONFIDENTIALITY ORDER THAT THE SUPPLEMENTAL CONFIDENTIALITY ORDER SHALL APPLY TO ALL INITIAL DISCLOSURES AND FUTURE DISCOVERY IN THIS ACTION, SUBJECT FO FURTHER STIPULATED AGREEMENTS BY THE PARTIES OR ORDERS BY THE COURT. CONDITIONALLY APPROVED SUBJECT TO COURT REVIEW OF DOCUMENTS DESIGNATED FOR COMPLIANCE WITH FED. R. CIVL. P. 26 (C). SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 05/10/07. 05/11/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 05/11/2007)
05/11/2007	<u>52</u>	ORDER THAT THE HEARING ON PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION SHALL BE CONSOLIDATED WITH A FINAL DETERMINATION ON THE MERITS OF PLAINTIFFS' FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT FOR DELCLARATORY, INJUNCTIVE AND MANDAMUS RELIFE. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT PLAINTIFF SHALL FILE ANY MOTIONS TO COMPEL DISCOVERY AND DEFENDANTS SHALL FILE ANY MOTIONS FOR A PROTECTIVE ORDER BY MAY 25, 2007. PLAINTIFFS AND DEFENDANTS SHALL FILE THIER RESPECTIVE RESPONSES TO ANY SUCH MOTIONS BY JUNE 15, 2007. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT A HEARING ON PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO COMPEL DEFENDANTS, THE DIRCTOR OF CIS AND THE SECRETARY OF HOMELAND SECURITY TO PRODUCE DOCUMENTS AND ANY ADDITIONAL MOTION TO COMPEL OR MOTIONS FOR A PROTECTITVE ORDER IS SCHEDULED FOR FRIDAY, JUNE 29, 2007, AT 9:30 A.M., IN COURTROOM 11A MOTIONS DUE BY 5/25/2007 SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 05/10/07. 05/11/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 05/11/2007)
05/11/2007		Set/Reset Deadlines as to <u>48</u> MOTION to Compel. MOTION HEARING SET FOR 6/29/2007 09:30 AM IN COURTROOM BEFORE HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO. (ac, ) (Entered: 05/11/2007)
05/14/2007	53	Certified Administrative Record for Defendant Robert S. Mueller, III, as Director of the Federal Bureau of Investigation, Certificate of Service. (3 Volumes) (ac, ) (Entered: 05/14/2007)
05/17/2007	<u>54</u>	MOTION for Protective Order filed by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA. Certificate of Counsel; Certificate of

# Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 19 of 21

		Service.(STEVENS, ELIZABETH) (Entered: 05/17/2007)
05/25/2007	<u>55</u>	Second MOTION to Compel Defendants the Director of USCIS, the Secretary of Homeland Security and the Director of the FBI to Answer Interrogatories and to Produce Documents filed by MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, SARA BACHMAN, FERIDE MANDIJA, MOISEY BACKMAN, JOE BEOPLUE, SONYUNOR BEOPLUE, GLAYON BLOUE, IZAAK ROZENBLIT, SEMEN SAVRANSKIY, LYUDMILA SHIROKAYA, IGOR STEPANOV, YEVGENIYA STRIZHEVSKAYA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI.Memorandum of Law and Certificate of Service. (Attachments: #1 Exhibit P-U#2 Exhibit V - CC#3 Exhibit DD - Part 1 of 2#4 Exhibit DD - Part 2 of 2#5 Exhibit EE - GG)(GREENWALD, JORDANA) (Entered: 05/25/2007)
06/12/2007	<u>56</u>	Supplemental MOTION for Protective Order filed by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA. Certificate of Counsel, Certificate of Service, Exhibit A, Exhibit B. (STEVENS, ELIZABETH) (Entered: 06/12/2007)
06/15/2007	<u>57</u>	Memorandum in Opposition re <u>56</u> Supplemental MOTION for Protective Order, <u>54</u> MOTION for Protective Order filed by SHMUL KAPLAN, Certificate of Service. (ROBERTS, THOMAS) Modified on 6/20/2007 (fh) (Entered: 06/15/2007)
06/15/2007	<u>58</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re 55 Second MOTION to Compel Defendants the Director of USCIS, the Secretary of Homeland Security and the Director of the FBI to Answer Interrogatories and to Produce Documents, 48 MOTION to Compel filed by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA. (Attachments: #1 Exhibit A#2 Exhibit B#3 Exhibit C#4 Exhibit D#5 Exhibit E#6 Exhibit F)(STEVENS, ELIZABETH) (Entered: 06/15/2007)
06/22/2007	<u>59</u>	ORDER THAT THE HEARING SCHEDULED ON JUNE 29, 2007, IS CANCELLED UNTIL FURTHER ORDER OF THE COURT. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 06/22/07. 06/22/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 06/22/2007)
06/28/2007	<u>60</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re 55 Second MOTION to Compel Defendants the Director of USCIS, the Secretary of Homeland Security and the Director of the FBI to Answer Interrogatories and to Produce Documents, 48 MOTION to Compel Answers to Interrogatories and Production of Documents filed by MASHAALAH, MARY AMREZAEI ALIAGHAEI, LIDIYA BURTSEVA, NELLI OLEVSKAYA, ESHETU MERI, SHMUL KAPLAN, TASIM MANDIJA, SARA BACHMAN, FERIDE MANDIJA, MOISEY BACKMAN, JOE BEOPLUE, SONYUNOR BEOPLUE, GLAYON BLOUE, IZAAK ROZENBLIT, SEMEN SAVRANSKIY, LYUDMILA SHIROKAYA, IGOR STEPANOV, YEVGENIYA STRIZHEVSKAYA, ROUZBEH ALIAGHAEI. (GREENWALD, JORDANA) (Entered: 06/28/2007)
07/20/2007	<u>61</u>	ORDER THAT MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION AND MOTION TO CERTIFY CLASS AND FOR APPOINTMENT OF CLASS COUNSEL ARE DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 7/19/2007.7/20/2007 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E–MAILED.(ap, ) (Entered: 07/23/2007)
08/10/2007	<u>62</u>	ORDER THAT PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO COMPEL DEFENDANTS THE DIRECTOR OF USCIS AND THE SECRETARY OF HOMELAND SECURITY TO PRODUCE DOCUMENTS, DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR A PROTECTIVE ORDER, AND PLAINTIFFS' SECOND MOTION TO COMPEL DEFENDANTS THE DIRECTOR OF USCIS, THE SECRETARY OF HOMELAND SECURITY AND THE DIRECTOR OF THE FBI TO ANSWER INTERROGATORIES AND TO PRODUCE DOCUMENTS ARE DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 08/09/07.08/10/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 08/10/2007)

# Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 20 of 21

09/06/2007	<u>63</u>	ORDER THAT THE PARTIES SHALL SUBMIT A JOINT WRITTEN STATUS REPORT TO THE HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO AND THE UNDERSIGNED ON OR BEFORE SEPTEMBER 28, 2007. SIGNED BY JUDGE THOMAS J. RUETER ON 09/06/07. 09/06/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 09/06/2007)
09/21/2007	<u>64</u>	ORDER THAT DEFENDANTS' SUPPLEMENTAL MOTION FOR A PROTECTIVE ORDER IS HEREBY DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 09/21/07.09/24/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E–MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 09/24/2007)
10/03/2007	<u>65</u>	ORDER THAT THE PARTIES SHALL SUBMIT A JOINT WRITTEN STATUS REPORT TO MAGISTRATE JUDGE THOMAS R. RUETER AND THE UNDERSIGNED ON OR BEFORE THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 1, 2007. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 10/02/07. 10/03/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 10/03/2007)
11/02/2007	<u>66</u>	ORDER THAT A TELEPHONE STATUS AND SCHEDULING CONFERENCE IS SET FOR 11/14/2007 04:00 PM BEFORE HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO. SIGNED BY JUDGE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 11/2/07. 11/2/07 ENTERED AND COPIES E–MAILED.(stb, ) (Entered: 11/02/2007)
11/30/2007	67	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge THOMAS J. RUETER: Telephone Conference held on 11/30/07. (ac, ) (Entered: 11/30/2007)
12/05/2007	68	Minute Entry for proceedings held before MAGISTRATE JUDGE THOMAS J. RUETER: Telephone Conference held on 12/05/07. (ac, ) (Entered: 12/05/2007)
12/06/2007	<u>69</u>	ORDER THAT THERE WILL BE A TELEPHONE STATUS AND SCHEDULING CONFERENCE ON TUESDAY, DECEMBER 18, 2007,A T 3:00 P.M. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 12/05/07. 12/06/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E–MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 12/06/2007)
12/12/2007	<u>70</u>	ORDER THAT THE TELEPHONE CONFERENCE PREVIOUSLY SCHEDULED ON DECEMBER 18, 2007, IS RESCHEDULED ON DECEMBER 13, 2007, AT 9:30 A.M. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 12/12/07. 12/12/07 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E–MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 12/12/2007)
01/04/2008	71	Joint MOTION for Approval ( <i>Preliminary</i> ) of Settlement Agreement and Approval of Notice to Class Members of Proposed Settlement filed by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA (Attachments: #1 Attachment A: Stipulation, #2 Stipulation Exhibit A, #3 Stipulation Exhibit B, #4 Stipulation Exhibit C, #5 attachment B to Joint Motion)(STEVENS, ELIZABETH) (Entered: 01/04/2008)
01/04/2008	<u>72</u>	NOTICE by MICHAEL CHERTOFF, ALBERTO GONZALES, EMILIO T. GONZALEZ, ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, JO ANNE B. BARNHART, DONALD MONICA re 71 Joint MOTION for Approval (Preliminary) of Settlement Agreement and Approval of Notice to Class Members of Proposed SettlementJoint MOTION for Approval (Preliminary) of Settlement Agreement and Approval of Notice to Class Members of Proposed Settlement Certificate of Service (STEVENS, ELIZABETH) (Entered: 01/04/2008)
01/08/2008	73	ORDER THAT THERE WILL BE A HEARING ON THE JOINT MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF THE SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND APPROVAL OF NOTICE TO CLASS MEMBERS ON 1/18/08 AT 10:30 A.M.; ETC SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 1/7/08. 1/8/08 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED, E–MAILED.(jl,) (Entered: 01/08/2008)
01/18/2008	74	Minute Entry for proceedings held before HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO: Motion Hearing in re: Joint Motion for Approval held on 1/18/08. (stb, ) (Entered: 01/18/2008)

# Case: 2:06-cv-5304 As of: 02/19/2013 11:33 PM EST 21 of 21

01/18/2008	<u>75</u>	PARTIAL AGENDA FOR HEARING ON PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF THE PROPOSED SETTLEMENT WITH COURT APPROVAL. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 01/17/08. 01/22/08 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 01/22/2008)
01/23/2008	76	Transcript of Hearing held on 01/18/08 before Judge Robreno. Court Reporter: ESR. (ac, ) (Entered: 01/23/2008)
01/24/2008	77	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER THAT THE JOINT MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF THE PROPOSED SETTLEMENT AND APPROVAL OF NOTICE TO THE CLASS MEMBERS IS HEREBY GRANTED. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT THERE WILL BE A HEARING TO CONSIDER WHETHER THE PROPOSED SETTLEMENT SHOULD RECRIVE FINAL APPROVAL UNDER FEDERAL RULE OF CIVIL PROCEDURE 23(e) ON FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 29, 2008, AT 10:30 A.M. IN COURTROOM 11A. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 01/24/08. 01/25/08 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 01/25/2008)
01/29/2008	78	ORDER THAT THE HEARING THAT WAS PREVIOUSLY SCHEDULED FOR FEBRUARY 29, 2008, AT 10:30 A.M. IS RESCHEDULED FOR FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 29, 2008, AT 2:00 P.M SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 01/28/08. 01/29/08 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E–MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 01/29/2008)
02/29/2008	79	Minute Entry for proceedings held before HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO: Final Approval of Settlement Hearing held on 02/29/08. (ac, ) (Entered: 03/03/2008)
03/05/2008	80	ORDER THAT THE PROPOSED SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT (ATTACHED AS EXHIBIT A) IS APPROVED. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT THE CASE IS DISMISSED WITH PREJUDICE. THE COURT SHALL RETAIN JURISDICTION OVER THIS MATTER FOR PURPOSES OF ENFORCING THE SETTLEMENT. THE CLERK OF THE COURT SHALL MARK THIS CASE AS CLOSED. SIGNED BY HONORABLE EDUARDO C. ROBRENO ON 03/05/08. (Attachments: #1 Stipulation) 03/05/08 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(ac, ) (Entered: 03/05/2008)