

**U.S. District Court
District of New Mexico – Version 3.2.2 (Albuquerque)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:07-cv-01044-WPL-LCS**

Robinson, et al v. Board of County Commissioners, et al
Assigned to: Magistrate Judge William P Lynch
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Leslie C. Smith
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 10/16/2007
Date Terminated: 05/28/2008
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

David Robinson

TERMINATED: 04/27/2008

next friend

Daniel T.

TERMINATED: 04/27/2008

next friend

John T.

TERMINATED: 04/27/2008

next friend

Lucy T.

TERMINATED: 04/27/2008

represented by **David H Urias**
Freedman Boyd Hollander Goldberg
&Ives PA
20 First Plaza, NW Suite 700
Albuquerque , NM 87108
505-842-9960
Fax: 505- 842-0761
Email: dhu@fbdlaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

George L Bach , Jr.
ACLU of New Mexico
P.O. Box 566
Albuquerque , NM 87103-0566
5052430046
Fax: 5052665916
Email: gbach@aclu-nm.org
LEAD ATTORNEY

Joleen K. Youngers
PO Box 7256
Las Cruces , NM 88006
575-541-8000
Fax: 575-541-9000
Email: jyoungers@zianet.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa Shawn Graybill
ACLU Foundation of Texas
PO Box 12905
1210 Rosewood Avenue
Austin , TX 78711-2905
(512) 478-7300
Fax: (512) 478-7303
Email: lgraybill@aclutx.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marisol L Perez
MALDEF
110 Broadway
Suite
San Antonio , TX 78205
(210) 224-5476
Fax: (210) 224-5382
Email: mperez@maldef.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nina Perales
MALDEF
110 Broadway
Suite 300
San Antonio , TX 78205
(210) 224-5476
Fax: (210) 224-5382
Email: nperales@maldef.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Mary T

represented by **David H Urias**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

George L Bach , Jr.
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joleen K. Youngers
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa Shawn Graybill
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marisol L Perez
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nina Perales
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Hilda T

represented by **David H Urias**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

George L Bach , Jr.
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Joleen K. Youngers
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa Shawn Graybill
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marisol L Perez
(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Nina Perales
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Plaintiff

Veronica Moreno

represented by **David H Urias**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

George L Bach , Jr.
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Joleen K. Youngers
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Lisa Shawn Graybill
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Marisol L Perez
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Nina Perales
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Plaintiff

Norma Estrada

represented by **David H Urias**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

George L Bach , Jr.
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Joleen K. Youngers
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Lisa Shawn Graybill
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Marisol L Perez
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Nina Perales

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Francisco Rodriguez

next friend

Juan C.

next friend

Alma C.

next friend

George C.

next friend

Jesse C.

next friend

Roberto C.

represented by **David H Urias**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

George L Bach , Jr.

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

Joleen K. Youngers

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa Shawn Graybill

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marisol L Perez

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nina Perales

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Ida V.

next friend

Chris V.

represented by **David H Urias**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

George L Bach , Jr.

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

Joleen K. Youngers

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa Shawn Graybill

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marisol L Perez

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nina Perales

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**Board of County Commissioners for
the County of Otero, New Mexico**

represented by **William D. Slease**
Slease & Martinez, P.A.
P.O. Box 1805
Albuquerque, NM 87103-1805
505-247-9488
Fax: 505-247-9566
Email: bill@sleasantmartinez.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

John Blansett

represented by **William D. Slease**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Leon Ledbetter
*Otero County Sheriffs, in their individual
and official capacities*

represented by **William D. Slease**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

John Does
Deputy, #1-12
TERMINATED: 04/03/2008

Defendant

Jane Doe
*Deputy, #1, in their individual and official
capacities*
TERMINATED: 04/03/2008

Defendant

Rob Hansen

Defendant

Lewis Reeves

Defendant

Clark Kinzler

Defendant

Geraldine Martinez

Defendant

John Does
1-7

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
10/17/2007	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against all defendants (Filing Fee – Online Payment), filed by Hilda T, Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Chris V, IDA V, Daniel T, John T, Lucy T,

		David Robinson, Mary T. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(Bach, George) (Entered: 10/17/2007)
10/17/2007		Filing Fee Received: \$ 350 receipt number 330977 re <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by John T, Chris V, Daniel T, IDA V, Mary T, Francisco Rodriguez, Lucy T, Hilda T, Norma Estrada, David Robinson, Veronica Moreno (Payment made via Pay.gov)(Bach, George) (Entered: 10/17/2007)
10/17/2007	<u>2</u>	DEMAND for Trial by Jury by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Chris V, IDA V, Daniel T, John T, Lucy T, David Robinson, Mary T, Hilda T (Bach, George) (Entered: 10/17/2007)
10/17/2007		Judge William P. Johnson and William P Lynch assigned. (nm) (Entered: 10/17/2007)
10/17/2007		Summons Issued as to Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter. (nm) (Entered: 10/17/2007)
10/31/2007	<u>3</u>	MOTION for Pro Hac Vice of <i>Nina Perales</i> by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Ida V., David Robinson, Mary T, Hilda T. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 10/31/2007)
10/31/2007	<u>4</u>	MOTION for Pro Hac Vice of <i>Marisol L. Perez</i> by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Ida V., David Robinson, Mary T, Hilda T. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Perez, Marisol) (Entered: 10/31/2007)
11/13/2007	<u>5</u>	ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF SERVICE Executed <i>Effective November 10, 2007</i> Acknowledgement filed by Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter. (Sleese, William) (Entered: 11/13/2007)
11/13/2007	<u>6</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by William D. Sleese on behalf of Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter (Sleese, William) (Entered: 11/13/2007)
11/13/2007	<u>7</u>	FILED IN ERROR—ORDER by Judge William P Lynch granting <u>3</u> ORDER on Motion for Pro Hac Vice Attorney Marisol L Perez for representing Plaintiffs in this matter (ctg) Modified on to add error text 11/14/2007 (ctg) (Entered: 11/14/2007)
11/13/2007	<u>8</u>	ORDER by Judge William P Lynch granting <u>4</u> ORDER on Motion for Pro Hac Vice Attorney Marisol L Perez for Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Ida V., David Robinson, Mary T &Hilda T(ctg) (Entered: 11/14/2007)
11/13/2007	<u>9</u>	ORDER by Judge William P Lynch granting re <u>3</u> MOTION for Pro Hac Vice of <i>Nina Perales</i> filed by Ida V., Francisco Rodriguez, Norma Estrada, Hilda T, David Robinson, Veronica Moreno &Mary T (ctg) (Entered: 11/14/2007)
11/28/2007	<u>10</u>	<i>Defendants'</i> ANSWER to Complaint by Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by Ida V., Francisco Rodriguez, Norma Estrada, Hilda T, David Robinson, Veronica Moreno, Mary T.(Sleese, William) (Entered: 11/28/2007)
11/28/2007	<u>11</u>	DEMAND for Trial by Jury by Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter (Sleese, William) (Entered: 11/28/2007)
11/29/2007	<u>12</u>	ORDER by Judge William P. Lynch: Telephonic Initial Scheduling Conference set for 1/17/2008 at 09:00 AM before Magistrate Judge

		William P. Lynch. (age) (Entered: 11/29/2007)
12/12/2007	<u>13</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Joleen K. Youngers on behalf of all plaintiffs (Youngers, Joleen) (Entered: 12/12/2007)
12/20/2007	<u>14</u>	MOTION to Consolidate Cases by Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter. (Slease, William) (Entered: 12/20/2007)
12/20/2007	<u>15</u>	MOTION to Consolidate Cases (<i>Memorandum in Support of</i>) by Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter. (Slease, William) (Entered: 12/20/2007)
12/21/2007	<u>16</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>15</u> MOTION to Consolidate Cases (<i>Memorandum in Support of</i>), <u>14</u> MOTION to Consolidate Cases by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Ida V., David Robinson, Mary T, Hilda T. (Bach, George) (Entered: 12/21/2007)
12/21/2007	<u>17</u>	ORDER by Judge William P. Johnson granting <u>16</u> Unopposed Motion for Extension of Time to File Response. Response due by 1/11/2008. THIS IS A TEXT ONLY ENTRY. NO DOCUMENTS ARE ATTACHED.(mag) (Entered: 12/21/2007)
12/21/2007	<u>18</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Ida V., David Robinson, Mary T, Hilda T of <i>Initial Disclosures</i> (Bach, George) (Entered: 12/21/2007)
01/07/2008	<u>19</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter, John Does, Jane Doe <i>Defendants' Initial Rule 26 Disclosures</i> (Slease, William) (Entered: 01/07/2008)
01/07/2008	<u>20</u>	Joint Status Report and <i>Provisional Discovery Plan</i> by David Robinson (Bach, George) (Entered: 01/07/2008)
01/11/2008	<u>21</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>15</u> MOTION to Consolidate Cases (<i>Memorandum in Support of</i>), <u>14</u> MOTION to Consolidate Cases filed by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Ida V., David Robinson, Mary T, Hilda T. (Bach, George) (Entered: 01/11/2008)
01/17/2008	<u>22</u>	Clerk's Minutes for proceedings held before Judge William P. Lynch : Scheduling Conference held on 1/17/2008. (age) (Entered: 01/17/2008)
01/17/2008	<u>23</u>	ORDER SETTING PRETRIAL DEADLINES AND ADOPTING JOINT STATUS REPORT by Judge William P. Lynch (age) (Entered: 01/17/2008)
01/17/2008	<u>24</u>	ORDER by Judge William P. Lynch: Settlement Conference set for 4/3/2008 at 09:00 AM before Magistrate Judge William P. Lynch. (age) (Entered: 01/17/2008)
01/22/2008	<u>25</u>	<i>Defendants' REPLY in Support of</i> re <u>15</u> MOTION to Consolidate Cases (<i>Memorandum in Support of</i>), <u>21</u> Response in Opposition to Motion filed by Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter. (Slease, William) (Entered: 01/22/2008)
01/22/2008	<u>26</u>	NOTICE of Briefing Complete by Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter re <u>15</u> MOTION to Consolidate Cases (<i>Memorandum in Support of</i>) filed by Leon Ledbetter, Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, <u>14</u> MOTION to Consolidate Cases filed by Leon Ledbetter, Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero,

		New Mexico, John Blansett (Slease, William) (Entered: 01/22/2008)
01/29/2008	<u>27</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter <i>regarding Defendant Otero County's First Set of Interrogatories and First Request for Production of Documents to Plaintiffs Francisco Rodriguez, Hilda T., Mary T., Norma Estrada, Veronica Moreno, Ida V., Ida V., as Next Friend of Chris V., a Minor, David Robinson, David Robinson, as Next Friend of Daniel T., John T., and Lucy T., Minors</i> (Slease, William) (Entered: 01/29/2008)
02/21/2008	<u>28</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Ida V. <i>re: Plaintiffs First Set of Interrogatories to Defendant Otero County Sheriffs Deputy Rob Hansen, Plaintiffs First Set of Interrogatories to Defendant Otero County Sheriffs Deputy Leon Ledbetter, Plaintiffs First Request for Production of Documents to Defendant Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, and Plaintiffs First Request for Production of Documents to Defendant Otero County Sheriff John Blansett</i> (Bach, George) (Entered: 02/21/2008)
02/21/2008	<u>29</u>	CERTIFICATE by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Ida V., David Robinson, Mary T, Hilda T <i>of Service of Third Party subpoena for documents on US Customs & Border Protection</i> (Perez, Marisol) Modified on 2/27/2008 to correct text (pmr). (Entered: 02/21/2008)
02/21/2008	<u>30</u>	CERTIFICATE by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Ida V., David Robinson, Mary T, Hilda T <i>of Service of Third Party subpoena for documents on NM Homeland</i> (Perez, Marisol) Modified on 2/27/2008 to correct text (pmr). (Entered: 02/21/2008)
03/03/2008	<u>31</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Order <i>Stipulated Protective Order</i> by David Robinson. (Bach, George) (Entered: 03/03/2008)
03/04/2008	<u>32</u>	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER by Judge William P Lynch <u>31</u> Unopposed MOTION for Order <i>Stipulated Protective Order</i> filed by David Robinson (ctg) (Entered: 03/04/2008)
03/10/2008	<u>33</u>	ORDER by Judge William P. Lynch: Telephonic Status Conference set for 3/11/2008 at 01:30 PM before Magistrate Judge William P. Lynch. (age) (Entered: 03/10/2008)
03/10/2008	<u>34</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Norma Estrada <i>Certificate of Service for Plaintiffs' Answers to Defendants Interrogatories and Requests for Production</i> (Bach, George) (Entered: 03/10/2008)
03/12/2008	<u>35</u>	Clerk's Minutes for proceedings held before Judge William P Lynch : Status Conference held on 3/11/2008. (age) (Entered: 03/12/2008)
03/13/2008	<u>36</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter <i>regarding Defendant Robert Hansen's Answers to Plaintiffs' First Set of Interrogatories to Otero County Sheriff's Deputy Rob Hansen; Defendant Leon Ledbetter's Answers to Plaintiffs' First Set of Interrogatories, Defendant County's Responses to Plaintiffs' First Request for Production of Documents; and Sheriff John Blansett's Responses to Plaintiffs' First Request for Production of Documents</i> (Slease, William) (Entered: 03/13/2008)
03/20/2008	<u>37</u>	ORDER by Judge William P. Johnson denying <u>14</u> Motion to Consolidate Cases. (mag) (Entered: 03/20/2008)
04/01/2008	<u>38</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Leave to File <i>First Amended Complaint</i> by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Ida V., David Robinson, Mary T, Hilda T. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Urias, David) (Entered: 04/01/2008)

04/02/2008	<u>39</u>	ORDER by Judge William P. Johnson granting <u>38</u> Motion for Leave to File Amended Complaint. THIS IS A TEXT ONLY ENTRY. NO DOCUMENTS ARE ATTACHED. (mag) (Entered: 04/02/2008)
04/02/2008	<u>40</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT against all defendants., filed by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Ida V., David Robinson, Mary T, Hilda T.(Urias, David) (Entered: 04/02/2008)
04/03/2008	<u>41</u>	NOTICE of Hearing: Pretrial Conference set for 11/24/2008 09:00 AM – 640 Judge William P. Johnson Chambers; Call of the Calendar set for 12/2/2008 03:00 PM – 540 Bonito Courtroom; Jury Trial set for 12/8/2008 09:00 AM – 540 Bonito Courtroom; (mag) (Entered: 04/03/2008)
04/04/2008	<u>42</u>	Clerk's Minutes for proceedings held before Judge William P Lynch : Settlement Conference held on 4/3/2008. (age) (Entered: 04/04/2008)
04/10/2008	<u>43</u>	ORDER of reference referring case to Magistrate Judge William P. Lynch by Judge William P. Johnson (vv) (Entered: 04/10/2008)
04/10/2008		Judge Leslie C. Smith assigned. (eh) (Entered: 04/10/2008)
04/14/2008	<u>44</u>	Joint MOTION to Approve Settlement <i>and, thereafter to Dismiss Plaintiffs' Complaint With Prejudice</i> by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Rob Hansen, Lewis Reeves, Clark Kinzler, Ida V., Geraldine Martinez, Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter, David Robinson, Mary T, Hilda T. (Slease, William) (Entered: 04/14/2008)
04/18/2008	<u>45</u>	ORDER by Judge William P. Lynch: Telephonic Fairness Hearing set for 4/29/2008 at 09:00 AM before Magistrate Judge William P. Lynch. (age) (Entered: 04/18/2008)
04/29/2008	<u>49</u>	Clerk's Minutes for proceedings held before Judge William P Lynch : Fairness Hearing held on 4/29/2008. (age) (Entered: 04/29/2008)
05/22/2008	<u>52</u>	FILED IN ERROR – STIPULATION of Dismissal <i>with Prejudice of John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter, Rob Hansen, Lewis Reeves, Clark Kinzler and Geraldine Martinez</i> by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Rob Hansen, Lewis Reeves, Clark Kinzler, Ida V., Geraldine Martinez, Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter, Mary T, Hilda T (Slease, William) Modified on 5/22/2008 (jm). (Entered: 05/22/2008)
05/22/2008	<u>53</u>	STIPULATION of Dismissal <i>with Prejudice of John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter, Rob Hansen, Lewis Reeves, Clark Kinzler and Geraldine Martinez</i> by Veronica Moreno, Norma Estrada, Francisco Rodriguez, Rob Hansen, Lewis Reeves, Clark Kinzler, Ida V., Geraldine Martinez, John Does, Board of County Commissioners for the County of Otero, New Mexico, John Blansett, Leon Ledbetter, Mary T, Hilda T (Slease, William) (Entered: 05/22/2008)
05/27/2008	<u>54</u>	ORDER by Magistrate Judge William P. Lynch Approving Resolution and Dismissing Plaintiffs' Complaint with Prejudice and granting <u>44</u> Motion to Approve Settlement. (age) (Entered: 05/27/2008)