CLOSED

U.S. District Court United States District Court for the District of Connecticut (New Haven) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 3:96-cv-00646-JBA

DeSario, et al v. Thomas

Assigned to: Judge Janet Bond Arterton

Demand: \$0

Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 04/11/1996 Date Terminated: 09/21/2000

Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other

Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Concetta DeSario

Individually &o/b/o All Others Similarly

Situated

represented by Shelley A. White

New Haven Legal Assistance

426 State St.

New Haven, CT 06510-2018

203-946-4811 Fax: 203-498-9271 Email: swhite@nhlegal.org

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Betty Emerson

Individually &o/b/o All Others Similarly

Situated

represented by Shelley A. White

(See above for address) **LEAD ATTORNEY**

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Intervenor Plaintiff

Caroline Stevenson

represented by Sheldon V. Toubman

New Haven Legal Assistance

426 State St.

New Haven, CT 06510-2018

203-946-4811

Email: stoubman@nhlegal.org

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor Plaintiff

Howard Wolan

represented by Sheldon V. Toubman

(See above for address) **LEAD ATTORNEY**

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor Plaintiff

Thomas Slekis

V.

Defendant

Jovce A. Thomas

Commissioner, CT Dept. of Social

Services

represented by Hugh Barber

Attorney General's Office Health & Human Services 55 Elm St., Po Box 120 Hartford, CT 06141-0120

860-808-5210 Fax: 860-808-5385

Email: hugh.barber@ct.gov LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Judith A. Merrill

Attorney General's Office Health &Human Services 55 Elm St., PO Box 120 Hartford, CT 06101 860–808–5318 Email: judith.merrill@po.state.ct.us LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard J. Lynch

Attorney General's Office Health &Human Services 55 Elm St., Po Box 120 Hartford, CT 06101 860–808–5210 Fax: 860–808–5385 Email: richard.lynch@ct.gov TERMINATED: 04/14/1997 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Intervenor Defendant

Joyce A. Thomas

represented by Hugh Barber

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Judith A. Merrill

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard J. Lynch

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 04/14/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ThirdParty Plaintiff

Joyce A. Thomas

represented by **Hugh Barber**

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Judith A. Merrill

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard J. Lynch

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 04/14/1997
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Case: 3:96-cv-646 As of: 03/16/2011 03:44 PM EDT 3 of 11

V.

ThirdParty Defendant

HHS

TERMINATED: 09/16/1999

represented by Lauren M. Nash
U.S. Attorney's Office-NH
157 Church St., 23rd floor
New Haven, CT 06510
203-821-3700 Fax: 203-773-5373

Email: <u>lauren.nash@usdoj.gov</u> TERMINATED: 09/16/1999 LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
04/11/1996	1	COMPLAINT Filing Fee \$ 120.00 Receipt # 154100 (Villano, P.) (Entered: 04/15/1996)
04/11/1996		SUMMONS(ES) issued for Joyce A. Thomas (Villano, P.) (Entered: 04/15/1996)
04/11/1996	2	ORDER on Pretrial Deadlines handed to counsel. Discovery cutoff 10/11/96; Dispositive Motions due 11/10/96 Amended Pleadings due 6/11/96 Motions to Dismiss due 7/11/96 (Villano, P.) (Entered: 04/15/1996)
04/11/1996	3	MOTION by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson for Preliminary Injunction (Villano, P.) Modified on 04/16/1996 (Entered: 04/15/1996)
04/11/1996	4	MEMORANDUM by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson in support of their [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction (Lopez, B.) (Entered: 04/16/1996)
04/15/1996	5	MOTION by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson for Shortened Briefing Period re Motion for Preliminary Injunctive Relief, to 12 days, to 4/23/96 (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/16/1996)
04/15/1996	6	MEMORANDUM by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson in support of [5–1] motion for Shortened Briefing Period re Motion for Preliminary Injunctive Relief, to 12 days, to 4/23/96 (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/16/1996)
04/18/1996		ENDORSEMENT granting [5–1] motion for Shortened Briefing Period re Motion for Preliminary Injunctive Relief Brief Deadline set for 4/23/96 [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/18/1996)
04/18/1996	7	SCHEDULING ORDER: opposition to Motion for Preliminary Injunction filed by 4/23/96. Oral argument re motion on 4/24/96 (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/18/1996)
04/18/1996		Motion hearing re: [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario set at 1:00 4/23/96 (JBA) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/18/1996)
04/23/1996	8	APPEARANCE of Attorney for Joyce A. Thomas, official capacity — Richard J. Lynch, Hugh Barber, Judith A. Merrill (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/23/1996)
04/24/1996		SUMMONS re issued for Joyce A. Thomas (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/24/1996)
04/24/1996	9	MEMORANDUM by Joyce A. Thomas in opposition to [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/25/1996)
04/24/1996	10	SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM by Joyce A. Thomas in opposition to [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/25/1996)
04/24/1996	14	Show Cause Hearing held regarding preliminary injunction application—decision reserved. (JBA) (Smith, S.) (Entered: 05/01/1996)

Case: 3:96-cv-646 As of: 03/16/2011 03:44 PM EDT 4 of 11

04/26/199611REPLY by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson to response to [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/29/1996)04/26/199612SUMMONS Returned Executed on 4/25/96 as to Joyce A. Thomas, personal service (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/29/1996)04/30/199613SECOND SUPPLEMENTAL OBJECTION by Joyce A. Thomas to [3–1] motion Preliminary Injunction by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/30/1996)05/03/199615MOTION by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson to Certify Class (Brief Due 5.) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/07/1996)05/03/199616MEMORANDUM by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson in support of [15–1] motion to Certify Class (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/07/1996)05/06/199617MOTION by Caroline Stevenson to Intervene as party plaintiff (Brief Due 5/2)	otion (.) /24/96
service (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/29/1996) 13 SECOND SUPPLEMENTAL OBJECTION by Joyce A. Thomas to [3–1] mo for Preliminary Injunction by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V (Entered: 04/30/1996) 15 MOTION by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson to Certify Class (Brief Due 5.) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/07/1996) 16 MEMORANDUM by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson in support of [15–1] motion to Certify Class (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/07/1996)	/24/96
for Preliminary Injunction by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V (Entered: 04/30/1996) 15 MOTION by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson to Certify Class (Brief Due 5.) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/07/1996) 16 MEMORANDUM by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson in support of [15–1] motion to Certify Class (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/07/1996)	/24/96
) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/07/1996) 05/03/1996 16 MEMORANDUM by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson in support of [15–1] motion to Certify Class (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/07/1996)	
motion to Certify Class (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/07/1996)	
05/06/1996 17 MOTION by Caroline Stevenson to Intervene as party plaintiff (Brief Due 5/	77/06
) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/08/1996)	21/90
05/06/1996 18 MEMORANDUM by Caroline Stevenson in support of [17–1] motion to Interest as party plaintiff (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/08/1996)	rvene
05/06/1996 19 MOTION by Howard Wolan to Intervene as party plaintiff (Brief Due 5/27/9 (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/08/1996)	6)
05/06/1996 20 MEMORANDUM by Howard Wolan in support of [19–1] motion to Interver party plaintiff (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/08/1996)	ne as
05/08/1996 21 MOTION by Caroline Stevenson, Howard Wolan for Preliminary Injunction Due 5/29/96) (Lopez, B.) (Entered: 05/09/1996)	(Brief
05/08/1996 22 MEMORANDUM by Caroline Stevenson, Howard Wolan in support of their [21–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction (Lopez, B.) (Entered: 05/09/1996)	
05/08/1996 23 MOTION by Caroline Stevenson, Howard Wolan for Shortened Briefing Perifor Intervenors' Motion for Preliminay Injunctive Relief, 7 days from filing (IB.) (Entered: 05/09/1996)	
05/08/1996 24 MEMORANDUM by Caroline Stevenson, Howard Wolan in support of their [23–1] motion for Shortened Briefing Period for Intervenors' Motion for Preliminay Injunctive Relief, 7 days from filing (Lopez, B.) (Entered: 05/09/1	
05/10/1996 25 OBJECTIONS by Joyce A. Thomas to [23–1] motion for Shortened Briefing Period for Intervenors' Motion for Preliminay Injunctive Relief, 7 days from by Howard Wolan, Caroline Stevenson (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/13/1996)	
05/14/1996 26 MOTION by Joyce A. Thomas to Extend Time to respond to Class Certificate until 2 weeks after rules on Motion to Intervene (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/14/1996)	ion,
05/15/1996 ENDORSEMENT granting [17–1] motion to Intervene as party plaintiff. Cle directed to docket Intervernor's Complaint (signed by Judge Janet B. Artertor (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/15/1996)	
05/15/1996 27 Intervenor's COMPLAINT by Caroline Stevenson against Joyce A. Thomas (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/15/1996)	
05/15/1996 28 OBJECTIONS by Joyce A. Thomas to [19–1] motion to Intervene as party pl by Howard Wolan (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/16/1996)	aintiff
05/16/1996 29 REPLY by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson to response to [19–1] motion to Intervene as party plaintiff by Howard Wolan (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/17/	
05/17/1996 30 THIRD-PARTY COMPLAINT by Joyce A. Thomas against HHS (Jefferson (Entered: 05/20/1996)	, V.)
05/17/1996 SUMMONS(ES) issued for HHS (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/20/1996)	
05/20/1996 31 REPORT of Parties Planning Meeting (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/21/1996)	

Case: 3:96-cv-646 As of: 03/16/2011 03:44 PM EDT 5 of 11

05/20/1996	32	Evidentiary Hearing held. Post–hearing briefs due 5/28/96 (JBA) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/21/1996)
05/20/1996	33	Marked Exhibit/witness List as to Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Joyce A. Thomas (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/21/1996)
05/28/1996	34	APPEARANCE of Attorney for HHS — Lauren M. Nash (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/29/1996)
05/28/1996	35	MOTION by HHS to Extend Time to file brief re issues, to 6/27/96 (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/29/1996)
05/28/1996	36	SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM by Joyce A. Thomas in opposition to [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/29/1996)
05/28/1996	37	SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Caroline Stevenson, Howard Wolan in support of [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/29/1996)
05/28/1996	38	PROPOSED Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Caroline Stevenson, Howard Wolan . (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/29/1996)
06/07/1996	39	ANSWER and Affirmative Defenses by Joyce A. Thomas to amended complaint (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/07/1996)
06/07/1996	40	MOTION by Joyce A. Thomas to Strike [38–1] findings of fact proposed by Howard Wolan, Caroline Stevenson, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Brief Due 6/28/96) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/07/1996)
06/07/1996	41	REPLY by Joyce A. Thomas to response to [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, to Post–Hearing Memo of 5/28/96 (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/10/1996)
06/10/1996	42	MEMORANDUM by Joyce A. Thomas in opposition to [15–1] motion to Certify Class by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/11/1996)
06/10/1996	43	NOTICE of filing of Affidavit re Motion for Preliminary Injunction by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/11/1996)
06/10/1996	44	AFFIDAVIT of Sheldon Toubman Re [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/11/1996)
06/12/1996	45	MOTION by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson for Leave to File reply to Memo in Response to Post–Hearing Memo (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/12/1996)
06/12/1996	46	OBJECTIONS by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson to [40–1] motion to Strike [38–1] findings of fact proposed by Howard Wolan, Caroline Stevenson, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario by Joyce A. Thomas (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/12/1996)
06/13/1996	47	SCHEDULING ORDER granting [35–1] motion to Extend Time to file brief. Third–Party Defendant Shalala shall file her brief by 6/19/96. Any response by parties filed by 6/26/96 @ 12 noon. granting [26–1] motion to Extend Time, Brief Deadline set for 6/10/96 [15–1] motion to Certify Class Any reply by plaintiff shall be filed by 6/17/96. Courtesy copies of briefs to chambers (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/13/1996)
06/14/1996	48	Response by Joyce A. Thomas to [43–1] notice by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, [44–1] affidavit by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/17/1996)
06/17/1996	49	REPLY by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson to response to [15–1] motion to Certify Class by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/17/1996)
06/19/1996	50	TRANSCRIPT for date of May 20, 1996 (Court reporter: Montini) (Former Employee) (Entered: 06/19/1996)

Case: 3:96-cv-646 As of: 03/16/2011 03:44 PM EDT 6 of 11

06/10/1006	£ 1	Decreased by IIIIS to [47, 1] and are [15, 1] meeting to Continuo (I.SS. VI)
06/19/1996	51	Response by HHS to [47–1] order re [15–1] motion to Certify Class (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/21/1996)
06/26/1996	52	Reply by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson to [51–1] response by HHS re [47–1] order Brief Deadline set for 6/10/96 re [15–1] motion to Certify Class, [15–1] motion to Certify Class by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 06/26/1996)
07/16/1996	53	ANSWER and defenses by HHS to [30–1] third–party complaint by Joyce A. Thomas (Former Employee) (Entered: 07/18/1996)
07/23/1996	54	MOTION by Howard Wolan to Withdraw [19–1] motion to Intervene as party plaintiff by Howard Wolan, [20–1] support memorandum by Howard Wolan (Former Employee) (Entered: 07/24/1996)
11/08/1996	55	MOTION by Joyce A. Thomas to Stay scheduling order (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 11/13/1996)
11/26/1996	56	MOTION by Howard Wolan for Preliminary Injunction (Brief Due 12/17/96) (Torday, B.) (Entered: 11/27/1996)
11/26/1996	57	MEMORANDUM by Howard Wolan in support of [56–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction (Torday, B.) (Entered: 11/27/1996)
11/26/1996	58	MOTION by Howard Wolan to Intervene (Brief Due 12/17/96) (Torday, B.) (Entered: 11/27/1996)
11/26/1996	59	MEMORANDUM by Howard Wolan in support of [58–1] motion to Intervene (Torday, B.) (Entered: 11/27/1996)
12/11/1996		ENDORSEMENT granting [55–1] motion to Stay scheduling order. Court's scheduling order deadlines are stayed pending ruling on Motion for Preliminary Injunction (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 12/11/1996)
12/13/1996	60	MOTION by Thomas Slekis to Intervene as party plaintiff (Brief Due 1/3/97) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 12/17/1996)
12/13/1996	61	MEMORANDUM by Thomas Slekis in support of [60–1] motion to Intervene as party plaintiff (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 12/17/1996)
12/13/1996	68	MOTION by Thomas Slekis for Preliminary Injunction (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/03/1997)
12/13/1996	69	MEMORANDUM by Thomas Slekis in support of [68–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/03/1997)
12/16/1996	62	MOTION by Joyce A. Thomas to Extend Time to respond to Motion to Intervene and Preliminary Injunction, to 12/30/96 (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 12/17/1996)
12/18/1996		ENDORSEMENT granting [62–1] motion to Extend Time to respond to Motion to Intervene and Preliminary Injunction, to 12/30/96, Brief Deadline set for 12/30/96 [58–1] motion to Intervene, set for 12/30/96 [56–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 12/18/1996)
12/20/1996	63	OBJECTIONS by Joyce A. Thomas to [60–1] motion to Intervene as party plaintiff by Thomas Slekis (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 12/26/1996)
12/26/1996	64	NOTICE of filing of Affidavit of Treating Physician, R. Kostecki, MD by Thomas Slekis (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 12/27/1996)
12/26/1996	65	AFFIDAVIT of Richard J. Kostecki, MD by Thomas Slekis Re [60–1] motion to Intervene as party plaintiff by Thomas Slekis (affidavit in support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 12/27/1996)
12/27/1996	66	OBJECTIONS by Joyce A. Thomas to [60–1] motion to Intervene as party plaintiff by Thomas Slekis (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 12/27/1996)

Case: 3:96-cv-646 As of: 03/16/2011 03:44 PM EDT 7 of 11

12/30/1996	67	Evidentiary Hearing held. Motion to Intervene, #60, GRANTED. Motion to Withdraw, #54, GRANTED. Motion for Leave to File #45, GRANTED. Motion for Preliminary Injunction, GRANTED. Hearing continued until 1/9/97 @ 9:00 (JBA) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/03/1997)
12/30/1996		MINUTE Entry: granting [60–1] motion to Intervene as party plaintiff, granting [54–1] motion to Withdraw [19–1] motion to Intervene as party plaintiff by Howard Wolan, [20–1] support memorandum by Howard Wolan, withdrawing [58–1] motion to Intervene, withdrawing [56–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction, granting [45–1] motion for Leave to File reply to Memo in Response to Post–Hearing Memo, granting [68–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction (JBA) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/03/1997)
12/30/1996	70	Intervenor's COMPLAINT by Thomas Slekis against Joyce A. Thomas (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/03/1997)
01/07/1997	71	TRANSCRIPT for date of December 30, 1996 (Court reporter: Montini) (Cody, C.) (Entered: 01/07/1997)
01/07/1997	72	RULING granting [15–1] motion to Certify Class. See Ruling for details 22 pgs. (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Lopez, B.) (Entered: 01/09/1997)
01/08/1997	73	MEMORANDUM of Supplemental Authorities by Thomas Slekis in support of [68–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction (Lopez, B.) (Entered: 01/09/1997)
01/09/1997	76	Evidentiary Hearing held. Hearing continued until 1/10/97 @ 2:00 (JBA) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/15/1997)
01/10/1997		ENDORSEMENT denying [40–1] motion to Strike [38–1] findings of fact proposed by Howard Wolan, Caroline Stevenson, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, for the reasons set forth in footnote #1 of Court's Ruling on Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification #72 (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/13/1997)
01/10/1997	74	RULING on Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction: granting [68–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction, granting [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction. This order shall remain in effect until further order of the Court. SEE for details. 58 pgs. (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/13/1997)
01/10/1997	75	MEMORANDUM by Joyce A. Thomas in opposition to [58–1] motion to Intervene by Howard Wolan, [56–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Howard Wolan (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/13/1997)
01/10/1997	77	NOTICE of filing of Amended Certification re Renewed Motion to Intervene by Howard Wolan (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/15/1997)
01/10/1997	78	AFFIDAVIT of Nancy Lansing by Howard Wolan Re [77–1] notice by Howard Wolan (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/15/1997)
01/10/1997	79	Marked exhibit List for 1/9/97 as to Joyce A. Thomas (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/15/1997)
01/10/1997	80	Marked witness List as to Concetta DeSario, Joyce A. Thomas (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/15/1997)
01/10/1997	81	Marked wxhibit List as to Concetta DeSario (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/15/1997)
01/10/1997	82	Motion hearing held re: [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, GRANTED (JBA) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/15/1997)
01/10/1997		Deadline updated; 26(f) Report of Conference Due 1/24/97 (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/15/1997)
01/16/1997	85	MOTION by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson for Expansion of Preliminary Injunction to Include Absent Class Members (Brief Due 2/6/97) (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 01/22/1997)
01/22/1997	83	MOTION by Joyce A. Thomas to Reargue [74–1] ruling dated 1/10/97 &[72–1] ruling dated 1/7/97, re: [68–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction, [15–1] motion to

Case: 3:96-cv-646 As of: 03/16/2011 03:44 PM EDT 8 of 11

		Certify Class, [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction (Brief Due 2/12/97) (Lopez, B.) (Entered: 01/22/1997)
01/22/1997	84	MEMORANDUM by Joyce A. Thomas in support of [83–1] motion to Reargue [74–1] ruling dated 1/10/97 &[72–1] ruling dated 1/7/97, re: [68–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction, [15–1] motion to Certify Class, [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction (Lopez, B.) (Entered: 01/22/1997)
01/27/1997	86	MOTION by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario for Clarification of [74–1] order re Preliminary Injunction (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/28/1997)
01/27/1997	87	REPORT of Parties Planning Meeting (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 01/28/1997)
02/07/1997	88	TRANSCRIPT for date of 1/9/97 (Court reporter: MONTINI, R.) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 02/07/1997)
02/07/1997	89	NOTICE OF INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL of [74–1] order by Joyce A. Thomas FILING FEE \$ 105.00 RECEIPT # 156629, Certified Copy of Inter. Appeal and Docket mailed to USCA. (Villano, P.) (Entered: 02/11/1997)
02/10/1997	92	NOTICE of filing (of Stipulation of Parties re Motion to Intv.) by Howard Wolan (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 02/14/1997)
02/10/1997	93	STIPULATION of Parties re Wolan's Motions to Intervene and Preliminary Relief by Howard Wolan, Joyce A. Thomas (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 02/14/1997)
02/12/1997	90	RULING on Pending Motions: granting [86–1] motion for Clarification of [74–1] order re Preliminary Injunction, granting in part, denying in part [83–1] motion to Reargue [74–1] ruling dated &[72–1] ruling dated 1/7/97, re: [68–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction, [15–1] motion to Certify Class, [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction, granting [58–1] motion to Intervene, denying [56–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction. SEE for details (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 02/13/1997)
02/12/1997	91	Intervenor's COMPLAINT by Howard Wolan against Joyce A. Thomas (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 02/13/1997)
02/18/1997	94	AMENDED NOTICE OF APPEAL by Joyce A. Thomas; regarding [89–1] appeal by Joyce A. Thomas Certified Copies of Amended Notice of Appeal and Docket to USCA. (Warren, C.) (Entered: 02/21/1997)
02/27/1997	95	MEMORANDUM by Joyce A. Thomas in opposition to [85–1] motion for Expansion of Preliminary Injunction to Include Absent Class Members by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 03/03/1997)
03/03/1997	96	MANDATE OF USCA (certified copy) dated 2/21/97 dismissing [89–1] appeal for default. (Lange, III, Clerk) (Villano, P.) (Entered: 03/05/1997)
03/03/1997	97	REPLY Memorandum by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario to response to [85–1] motion for Expansion of Preliminary Injunction to Include Absent Class Members by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (Lopez, B.) (Entered: 03/07/1997)
03/07/1997	98	ORDER granting [85–1] motion for Expansion of Preliminary Injunction to Include Absent Class Members (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Former Employee) (Entered: 03/07/1997)
03/12/1997	99	MOTION by Thomas Slekis, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, Caroline Stevenson for Contempt (Brief Due 4/2/97) (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 03/14/1997)
03/14/1997	100	AMENDED NOTICE OF APPEAL by Joyce A. Thomas; regarding Certified Copies of Amended Notice of Appeal and Docket to USCA. (Villano, P.) (Entered: 03/19/1997)
03/17/1997	101	Scheduling Order from USCA regarding USCA Number: 97–6027 (Villano, P.) Modified on 03/19/1997 (Entered: 03/19/1997)
03/17/1997	102	MOTION by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario for Clarification re [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (Brief Due 4/7/97) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 03/19/1997)

Case: 3:96-cv-646 As of: 03/16/2011 03:44 PM EDT 9 of 11

03/17/1997	103	MEMORANDUM by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario in support of [102–1] motion for Clarification re [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 03/19/1997)
03/19/1997	104	TRANSCRIPT for date of 4/24/96 (Court reporter: MONTINI, R.) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 03/19/1997)
03/19/1997	105	TRANSCRIPT for date of 1/10/97 (Court reporter: MONTINI, R.) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 03/19/1997)
04/02/1997	106	MOTION by Joyce A. Thomas to Strike [99–1] motion for Contempt by Caroline Stevenson, Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Thomas Slekis or an Order Denying Motion for Contempt (Brief Due 4/23/97) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/03/1997)
04/02/1997	107	MEMORANDUM by Joyce Thomas in support of [106–1] motion to Strike [99–1] motion for Contempt by Caroline Stevenson, Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Thomas Slekis (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/03/1997)
04/02/1997	108	MOTION by Joyce A. Thomas to Expedite consideration of Motion to Strike (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/03/1997)
04/04/1997		INDEX to Record on Appeal mailed to USCA: 97–6027 (Villano, P.) (Entered: 04/04/1997)
04/08/1997	110	Revised MOTION by Thomas Slekis, Howard Wolan, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario for Contempt (Brief Due 4/29/97) referring to: [99–1] motion for Contempt by Caroline Stevenson, Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Thomas Slekis (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 04/09/1997)
04/08/1997	111	MOTION by Thomas Slekis, Howard Wolan, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario to Withdraw [99–1] motion for Contempt by Caroline Stevenson, Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Thomas Slekis (Brief Due 4/29/97) (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 04/09/1997)
04/09/1997	109	MEMORANDUM by Joyce A. Thomas in opposition to [102–1] motion for Clarification re [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 04/09/1997)
04/11/1997	112	MOTION by Joyce A. Thomas for Richard Lynch to Withdraw as Attorney (Lopez, B.) (Entered: 04/11/1997)
04/11/1997	113	MOTION by Thomas Slekis, Howard Wolan, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, Caroline Stevenson for Expedited Briefing With Respect to Plaintiffs' Motion for An Order Maintaining the Status Quo (Brief Due 5/2/97 (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 04/15/1997)
04/11/1997	114	MOTION by Thomas Slekis, Howard Wolan, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, Caroline Stevenson for Order Maintaining the Status Quo (Brief Due 5/2/97) (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 04/15/1997)
04/11/1997	115	MEMORANDUM by Thomas Slekis, Howard Wolan, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, Caroline Stevenson in support of [114–1] motion for Order Maintaining the Status Quo (Inferrera, L.) Modified on 04/15/1997 (Entered: 04/15/1997)
04/14/1997		ENDORSEMENT granting [112–1] motion for Richard Lynch to Withdraw as Attorney (Terminated attorney Richard J. Lynch for Joyce A. Thomas (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/14/1997)
04/14/1997	117	ACKNOWLEDGED receipt of Index to Record on Appeal at USCA on 4/7/97 received re: USCA Number: 97–6027 (Villano, P.) (Entered: 04/22/1997)
04/15/1997	116	OBJECTIONS by Joyce A. Thomas to [113–1] motion for Expedited Briefing With Respect to Plaintiffs' Motion for An Order Maintaining the Status Quo by Caroline Stevenson, Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Howard Wolan, Thomas Slekis (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 04/15/1997)
04/16/1997		ENDORSEMENT approving and adopting [111–1] motion to Withdraw [99–1] motion for Contempt by Caroline Stevenson, Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Thomas Slekis, withdrawing [99–1] motion for Contempt (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/16/1997)

Case: 3:96-cv-646 As of: 03/16/2011 03:44 PM EDT 10 of 11

04/16/1997		ENDORSEMENT denying as moot [106–1] motion to Strike [99–1] motion for Contempt by Caroline Stevenson, Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Thomas Slekis, in light of plaintiffs' withdrawal of Motion for Contempt (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/16/1997)
04/16/1997		ENDORSEMENT denying as moot [99–1] motion for Contempt, in light of Plaintiff's Motion to Withdraw (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/16/1997)
04/29/1997	118	ORDER denying [113–1] motion for Expedited Briefing With Respect to Plaintiffs' Motion for An Order Maintaining the Status Quo, denying [108–1] motion to Expedite consideration of Motion to Strike, denying [102–1] motion for Clarification re [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 04/30/1997)
05/01/1997	119	MEMORANDUM by Joyce A. Thomas in opposition to [110–1] supplemental amended motion for Contempt by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Howard Wolan, Thomas Slekis (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/02/1997)
05/05/1997	120	MOTION by Thomas Slekis, Howard Wolan, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, Caroline Stevenson to Withdraw [114–1] motion for Order Maintaining the Status Quo by Caroline Stevenson, Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Howard Wolan, Thomas Slekis (Brief Due 5/26/97) (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 05/06/1997)
05/05/1997	121	MOTION by Thomas Slekis, Howard Wolan, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, Caroline Stevenson to Withdraw [102–1] motion for Clarification re [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (Brief Due 5/26/97) (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 05/06/1997)
05/13/1997	122	MOTION by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario to Withdraw [110–1] supplemental amended motion for Contempt by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Howard Wolan, Thomas Slekis (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/13/1997)
05/15/1997		ENDORSEMENT granting [122–1] motion to Withdraw [110–1] supplemental amended motion for Contempt by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Howard Wolan, Thomas Slekis withdrawing [110–1] supplemental amended motion for Contempt (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 05/15/1997)
11/21/1997	123	MOTION by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario for Contempt (Brief Due 12/12/97) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 11/24/1997)
11/21/1997	124	MEMORANDUM by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario in support of [123–1] motion for Contempt (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 11/24/1997)
12/03/1997	125	ENDORSEMENT ORDER granting [120–1] motion to Withdraw [114–1] motion for Order Maintaining the Status Quo by Caroline Stevenson, Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, Howard Wolan, Thomas Slekis, denying as moot [114–1] motion for Order Maintaining the Status Quo (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Depino, F.) Modified on 12/04/1997 (Entered: 12/04/1997)
12/08/1997	126	OBJECTIONS by Joyce A. Thomas to [123–1] motion for Contempt by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 12/08/1997)
12/12/1997	127	REPLY by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario to response to [123–1] motion for Contempt by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (Depino, F.) (Entered: 12/15/1997)
12/16/1997	128	ORDER granting [121–1] motion to Withdraw [102–1] motion for Clarification re [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson, withdrawing [102–1] motion for Clarification re [3–1] motion for Preliminary Injunction by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 12/16/1997)
01/09/1998	129	Motion hearing held re: [123–1] motion for Contempt by Concetta DeSario, Betty Emerson (JBA) (Torday, B.) (Entered: 01/09/1998)
01/09/1998		MINUTE Entry: withdrawing in open court [123–1] motion for Contempt (JBA) (Torday, B.) (Entered: 01/09/1998)

Case: 3:96-cv-646 As of: 03/16/2011 03:44 PM EDT 11 of 11

01/09/1998	130	Exhibits by Joyce A. Thomas, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario to [129–1] hearing (Torday, B.) (Entered: 01/09/1998)
01/12/1998		ENDORSEMENT withdrawing [123–1] motion for Contemptin light of parties representations and agreements on the record and Plaintiffs' withdrawal of Contempt Motion (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Brown, S.) Modified on 01/26/1998 (Entered: 01/14/1998)
02/25/1998	131	NOTICE of Death of Named Plaintiff (Concetta DeSario) by Howard Wolan, Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, Caroline Stevenson (Inferrera, L.) (Entered: 02/26/1998)
02/27/1998	132	ORDER: Parties are requested to file their Supplemental 26(f) Planning Report by 3/13/98 26(f) Report of Conference Due 3/13/98 (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Jefferson, V.) (Entered: 03/02/1998)
03/06/1998	133	MOTION by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario to Extend Time of fourteen days for submissionj of supplemental planning report (Sherman, M.) (Entered: 03/09/1998)
03/12/1998		ENDORSEMENT granting [133–1] motion to Extend Time of submission of supplemental planning report 14 days after final disposition from Court of Appeals terminated deadlines (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Brown, S.) (Entered: 03/13/1998)
07/20/1998	134	MANDATE OF USCA (certified copy) dated 07/13/98 remanding case re: [100–1] modifier appeal (Hon. DJ,GC &CLB) (Former Employee) (Entered: 07/21/1998)
07/22/1998	136	True copy of USCA Order dated 07/16/98 recalling [134–1] mandate regarding [89–1] appeal (Samuel McLamore) (Former Employee) (Entered: 09/15/1998)
09/10/1998	135	Notice to counsel regarding 26(f). Report of Conference due 9/20/98 (signed by Clerk) (Depino, F.) (Entered: 09/10/1998)
06/18/1999	137	MOTION by Betty Emerson, Concetta DeSario, Joyce A. Thomas To Approve Settlement Agreement (Brown, S.) (Entered: 06/21/1999)
06/23/1999	138	ORDER approving Settlement Agreement and granting [137–1] motion To Approve Settlement Agreement (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Brown, S.) (Entered: 06/24/1999)
09/13/1999	139	STIPULATION of dismissal of party as to HHS by Joyce A. Thomas (Brown, S.) (Entered: 09/14/1999)
09/16/1999		ENDORSEMENT granting [139–1] stipulation of dismissal as to Donna Shalala (signed by Judge Janet B. Arterton) (Brown, S.) (Entered: 09/17/1999)
08/30/2000	140	NOTICE of Voluntary Dismissal as to HHS (Brown, S.) (Entered: 08/31/2000)
09/01/2000		ENDORSEMENT re: [140–1] notice of voluntary dismissal ordered accordingly (signed by Clerk) (Brown, S.) (Entered: 09/01/2000)
09/01/2000		Case closed (Brown, S.) (Entered: 09/21/2000)
03/27/2001	141	Acknowledgement of Receipt from Attorney for exhibits (Brown, S.) (Entered: 03/27/2001)
04/02/2001	142	Acknowledgement of Receipt from Hugh Barber of exhibits (Depino, F.) (Entered: 04/02/2001)
01/07/2002	143	MANDATE OF USCA (certified copy) dated 1/2/02 dismissing appeal(Roseann Mackechnie) (Basile, F.) (Entered: 01/07/2002)