Further Findings of Fact on Matters Raised by the March 26, 1970, Motions of Defendants dated April 3, 1970

On March 26, 1970, the defendant school board filed "Objections and Exceptions to Supplementary Findings of Fact of March 21, 1970, and Motion for Modification and Clarification Thereof." The court has reviewed the questions raised in that document and makes further findings of fact with reference to certain of its numbered paragraphs as follows:

III 1, 4, 16, 40. The annual school bus cost per pupil transported, including everything except the original cost of the bus, parking arrangements and certain local administrative costs, for the 1968-69 year, was \$19.92. The state reimburses the Charlotte-Mecklenburg school system approximately this \$19.92 per pupil. The April 23, 1969, and February 5, 1970, findings of fact estimated the original cost and periodic replacement of the busses themselves at \$18 to \$20 per pupil per year, which, added to the \$19.92, resulted in the estimate of \$40 as the total annual per pupil transportation cost. That estimate assumed that the local schools would have to pay for periodic replacement of busses as well as for their original purchase. Since it is now clear from the deposition of D. J. Dark that the replacement of worn out or obsolescent busses is included in the \$19.92 figure, the overall estimate of \$40 per pupil per year is far too high. Instead of a continuing annual local per pupil cost of \$18 or \$20 to supply and replace busses, as the court originally understood, the local board will have to bear only administrative and parking expenses, plus the original, one-time purchase of the busses. This cuts the annual cost of bus transportation from nearly \$40 per pupil per year as originally estimated, to a figure closer

Further Findings of Fact on Matters Raised by the March 26, 1970, Motions of Defendants dated April 3, 1970

to \$20 per pupil per year, and reduces the capital outlay required of the local board to the one-time purchase of about 138 busses at a cost of about \$745,200.00, plus whatever may prove to be actually required in the way of additional parking facilities. Paragraphs 1, 4, 16 and 40 of the supplemental findings of fact are amended accordingly.

- ¶¶ 2, 4, 11, 34. Although the evidence concerning the 5,000 children currently transported by City Coach Lines lacks clarity, the court agrees with the defendant that it should not be inferred that they are the source of payment for this transportation, and the court specifically corrects the previous finding so as to delete any reference to the source of payment for this transportation.
- ¶ 21. The school board's July 29, 1969 plan (see pages 457-459 of the record on appeal) proposed the transfer and transportation of over 4,200 black children. The court on November 7, 1969, on the basis of the then evidence, found that the number actually transferred was 1,315. The affidavit of J. D. Morgan dated February 13, 1970 (paragraph 4, page 770 of the record on appeal), indicated that the number of these students being transported was 738, requiring 13 busses. The findings of fact proposed by the defendants gave the number as "over 700." The J. D. Morgan affidavit of March 21, 1970, indicated that the number of busses was 30 instead of 13. From this conflicting evidence the court concluded that "several hundred" was as accurate as could be found under the circumstances.
- ¶ 33. Paragraph 33 is amended as requested by adding after the word "schools" in the eleventh line of the paragraph:

Further Findings of Fact on Matters Raised by the March 26, 1970, Motions of Defendants dated April 3, 1970

"—and about 5,000 black children, grades one through four, to outlying white schools."

¶ 34(f). The average straight line mileage between the elementary schools paired or grouped under the "cross-bussing" plan is approximately 5½ miles. The average bus trip mileage of about seven miles which was found in paragraph 34(f) was arrived at by the method which J. D. Morgan, the county school bus superintendent, testified he uses for such estimates—taking straight line mileage and adding 25%.

As to the other items in the document, the court has analyzed them carefully and finds that they do not justify any further changes in the facts previously found.

This the 3rd day of April, 1970.

/s/ James B. McMillan
James B. McMillan
United States District Judge