# U.S. District Court Southern District of New York (Foley Square) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:13-cv-09198-KMW

American Civil Liberties Union et al v. National Secuirty Agency et al Assigned to: Judge Kimba M. Wood Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

# <u>Plaintiff</u>

# **American Civil Liberties Union**

Date Filed: 12/30/2013 Date Terminated: 08/22/2017 Jury Demand: None Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act Jurisdiction: Federal Question

# represented by Alexander Abraham Abdo

American Civil Liberties Union, Women's Rights Proj 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004 (212) 549–2500 x2517 Fax: (2120 549–2654 Email: <u>alex.abdo@knightcolumbia.org</u> *TERMINATED: 01/04/2017* 

# Ashley Marie Gorski

American Civil Liberties Union Foundation (NYC) 125 Broad Street 18th Floor New York, NY 10004 (212) 284–7305 Email: <u>agorski@aclu.org</u> ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **David A. Schulz**

Ballard Spahr LLP (NYC) 1675 Broadway, 19th Floor New York, NY 10019 (212) 850–6103 Fax: (212) 223–1942 Email: <u>schulzd@ballardspahr.com</u> *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED* 

## Hannah Bloch-Wehba

Media Freedom & Information Access Clinic P.O. Box 208215 New Haven, CT 06520–8215 (203) 436–5824 Email: <u>hannah.bloch-wehba@yale.edu</u> *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED* 

## Jonathan Matthew Manes

MacArthur Justice Center 160 E. Chicago Ave. Ste 6th Floor Chicago, IL 60611 312–503–0012 Fax: 312–503–0891 Email: jonathan.manes@yale.edu ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **Patrick Christopher Toomey**

American Civil Liberties Union

Foundation (NYC) 125 Broad Street 18th Floor New York, NY 10004 (212) 519–7816 Fax: (212) 549–2654 Email: <u>ptoomey@aclu.org</u> *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED* 

#### **Plaintiff**

American Civil Liberties Union Foundation

#### represented by **Alexander Abraham Abdo** (See above for address)

*TERMINATED: 01/04/2017* 

Ashley Marie Gorski (See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David A. Schulz (See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### Hannah Bloch-Wehba

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

## Jonathan Matthew Manes

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **Patrick Christopher Toomey**

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

# <u>Defendant</u> National Security Agency

## represented by Jean-David Barnea

U.S. Attorney's Office, SDNY (Chambers Street) 86 Chambers Street New York, NY 10007 (212) 637–2679 Fax: (212) 637–2717 Email: jean–david.barnea@usdoj.gov LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **David Stuart Jones**

U.S. Attorney's Office, SDNY (86 Chambers St.) 86 Chambers Street New York, NY 10007 212–637–2200 Fax: 212–637–2686 Email: <u>david.jones6@usdoj.gov</u> *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED* 

<u>Defendant</u> Central Intelligence Agency

# represented by Jean–David Barnea

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

## ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**David Stuart Jones** (See above for address) *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED* 

# represented by Jean-David Barnea

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

> **David Stuart Jones** (See above for address) *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

represented by Jean–David Barnea (See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# David Stuart Jones

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# <u>Defendant</u> Department of State

# represented by Jean–David Barnea

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### David Stuart Jones

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
12/30/2013	1	COMPLAINT against Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Filing Fee \$ 350.00, Receipt Number 1084393)Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(laq) Modified on 1/17/2014 (jd). (Entered: 01/07/2014)
12/30/2013		SUMMONS ISSUED as to Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (laq) Modified on 1/17/2014 (jd). (Entered: 01/07/2014)
12/30/2013		Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger is so designated. (laq) (Entered: 01/07/2014)
12/30/2013		Case Designated ECF. (laq) (Entered: 01/07/2014)
01/10/2014	2	INITIAL PRETRIAL CONFERENCE ORDER: Initial Conference set for 3/31/2014 at 04:00 PM in Courtroom 15D, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Analisa Torres. The parties are directed to submit a joint letter by 2/21/2014, addressing the information further set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 1/10/2014) (tn) (Entered: 01/10/2014)
01/16/2014	<u>3</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jonathan Matthew Manes on behalf of American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Manes, Jonathan) (Entered: 01/16/2014)
01/16/2014	<u>4</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by David A Schulz on behalf of American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Schulz, David)

# <u>Defendant</u>

**Department of Justice** 

**Department of Defense** 

**Defendant** 

		(Entered: 01/16/2014)
01/16/2014	<u>5</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 01/16/2014)
01/16/2014	<u>6</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons served on Eric H. Holder, Attorney General of the United States on 1/3/2014. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 01/16/2014)
01/16/2014	7	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons served on Central Intelligence Agency on 1/3/2014. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 01/16/2014)
01/16/2014	<u>8</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons served on United States Department of Defense on 1/3/2014. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 01/16/2014)
01/16/2014	<u>9</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons served on United States Department of Justice on 1/3/2014. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 01/16/2014)
01/16/2014	<u>10</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons served on United States Department of State on 1/3/2014. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 01/16/2014)
01/16/2014	<u>11</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons served on National Security Agency on 1/3/2014. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 01/16/2014)
01/16/2014	<u>12</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons served on United States Attorney for the Southern District of New York on 1/3/2014. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 01/16/2014)
02/03/2014	<u>13</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to file Answer and joint letter</i> addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Jonathan M. Manes dated 02/03/2014. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Manes, Jonathan) (Entered: 02/03/2014)
02/03/2014	<u>14</u>	ORDER granting <u>13</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time: that Defendants' current deadline of February 5, 2014 to Answer the original Complaint, filed December 30, 2013, is adjourned and Defendants shall file their Answer to Plaintiffs' Amended Complaint by no later than February 21, 2014; the parties' current deadline of February 21, 2014, to submit to the Court their joint letter and proposed Case Management Plan and Scheduling Order is adjourned to February 28, 2014; and the initial pretrial conference, scheduled for March 31, 2014 at 4:00 p.m., will not be disturbed. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 2/3/2014) (tn) Modified on 2/3/2014 (tn). (Entered: 02/03/2014)
02/03/2014		Set/Reset Hearings: Initial Conference set for 3/31/2014 at 04:00 PM before Judge Analisa Torres. (tn) (Entered: 02/03/2014)
02/07/2014	<u>15</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to file Answer and joint letter</i> addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Jonathan M. Manes dated 02/07/2014. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Manes, Jonathan) (Entered: 02/07/2014)
02/07/2014	<u>16</u>	ORDER granting <u>15</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time: Not later than February 18, 2014, Plaintiffs shall file any Amended Complaint. Not later than March 3, 2014,

		Defendants shall file their Answer to the Amended Complaint. Not later than March 10, 2014, the parties shall submit to the Court the joint letter and proposed Case Management Plan and Scheduling Order currently due on February 28, 2014. The initial pretrial conference, scheduled for March 31, 2014 at 4:00 p.m., will not be disturbed. Amended Pleadings due by 2/18/2014. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 2/7/2014) (tn) (Entered: 02/10/2014)
02/18/2014	<u>17</u>	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>1</u> Complaint, against Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(cd) (ca) (Entered: 02/19/2014)
02/18/2014		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO E-MAIL PDF. Note to Attorney Alex Abdo for noncompliance with Section 14.3 of the S.D.N.Y. Electronic Case Filing Rules & Instructions. E-MAIL the PDF for Document <u>17</u> Amended Complaint, to: caseopenings@nysd.uscourts.gov. (cd) (Entered: 02/19/2014)
03/03/2014	<u>18</u>	ANSWER to <u>17</u> Amended Complaint, Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, Nationa Security Agency.(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 03/03/2014)
03/11/2014	<u>19</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – WRONG PDF FILE ASSOCIATED WITH DOCKET</b> <b>ENTRY</b> – INITIAL REPORT OF PARTIES BEFORE PRETRIAL CONFERENCE. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Manes, Jonathan) Modified on 3/18/2014 (lb). (Entered: 03/11/2014)
03/11/2014	<u>20</u>	INITIAL REPORT OF PARTIES BEFORE PRETRIAL CONFERENCE. <i>Corrected</i> Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Manes, Jonathan) (Entered: 03/11/2014)
03/11/2014	<u>21</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Initial Report of Parties Before</i> <i>Pretrial Conference, nunc pro tunc</i> addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Jonathan M. Manes dated 03/11/2014. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Manes, Jonathan) (Entered: 03/11/2014)
03/12/2014	<u>22</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Patrick Christopher Toomey on behalf of American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Toomey, Patrick) (Entered: 03/12/2014)
03/12/2014	23	ORDER granting <u>21</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File: Plaintiffs' late filing is EXCUSED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Analisa Torres)(Text Only Order) (Torres, Analisa) (Entered: 03/12/2014)
03/31/2014	24	ORDER: The initial pre-trial conference scheduled for March 31, 2014 is ADJOURNED to April 16, 2014 at 4:30 p.m. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on March 31, 2014) (Torres, Analisa) (Entered: 03/31/2014)
04/14/2014	<u>25</u>	LAW STUDENT INTERN APPEARANCE FORM. Consent of Judge. I authorize thi student, Conor Clarke: (a) to appear in court or other proceedings on behalf of the above client, and (b) to prepare documents on behalf of the above client, and as furthe set forth. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 4/14/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 04/15/2014)
04/16/2014		Minute Order Proceedings held before Judge Analisa Torres: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 4/16/2014. (mo) (Entered: 04/17/2014)
04/18/2014	<u>26</u>	LETTER MOTION for Conference addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from David A. Schulz dated 4/18/2014. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, America Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Schulz, David) (Entered: 04/18/2014)
04/18/2014	<u>27</u>	ORDER granting <u>26</u> LETTER MOTION for Conference addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from David A. Schulz dated 4/18/2014. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. So ordered. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 4/18/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 04/21/2014)
05/07/2014	<u>28</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Joint Stipulation</i> addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Jonathan M. Manes dated 05/07/2014.

		Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Manes, Jonathan) (Entered: 05/07/2014)
05/08/2014	<u>29</u>	ORDER granting <u>28</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Joint Stipulation. ENDORSEMENT: The parties' request to extend the deadline to submit a joint stipulation to May 9, 2014 is GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 5/8/2014) (kgo) (Entered: 05/08/2014)
05/09/2014	<u>30</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING DOCUMENT SEARCHES. It is hereby STIPULATED and AGREED between the Parties as follows: The searches the Agencies agree to undertake that are described herein are deemed to fulfill in full the Agencies' search obligations under the respective Requests. OLC will continue to search for and process only those documents encompassed by the agreement it reached with Plaintiffs during the administrative processing of the relevant Request. NSA, CIA, DIA, FBI, and State will search for and process only the categories of documents as further specified herein, and as further set forth in this Stipulation and Order Regarding Document Searches. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 5/9/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 05/12/2014)
05/21/2014	<u>31</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Jonathan M. Manes dated 5/21/2014 re: The parties hereby request that the Court endorse this letter to set deadlines by when the defendant agencies are to complete any required remaining searches for potentially responsive documents in connection with Plaintiffs' FOIA requests, as those requests have been modified or construed by so–ordered stipulation of the parties (Dkt. No. 30). The parties' agreed–upon deadlines are as further specified in this letter. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 5/21/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 05/22/2014)
06/23/2014	<u>32</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Jonathan M. Manes dated 6/20/2014 re: As directed by the Court's so-ordering of an April 18 joint letter of the parties (Dkt. No. 27), the parties hereby request that the Court endorse this letter to set deadlines by when the defendant agencies are to complete any required review and processing of potentially responsive documents in connection with Plaintiffs' FOIA requests, as those requests have been modified or construed by so-ordered stipulation of the parties (Dkt. No. 30). ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 6/23/2014) (Imb) (Entered: 06/23/2014)
08/08/2014	<u>33</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to extend deadline for completion of CIA's search for records to August 27, 2014, and to extend to September 5, 2014 the last date for parties to propose modification of the CIA's processing completion date, addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from AUSA David S. Jones dated 08/08/2014. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Jones, David) (Entered: 08/08/2014)
08/11/2014	<u>34</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Patrick Toomey dated August 11, 2014 re: Opposition to CIA Motion for Extension of Search Deadline. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Toomey, Patrick) (Entered: 08/11/2014)
08/12/2014	<u>35</u>	ORDER. Having reviewed the parties' letters dated August 8, 2014 and August 11, 2014, it is ORDERED that Defendant's request for an extension is GRANTED, and Plaintiffs' requests are DENIED. By August 27, 2014, the CIA shall complete its search for potentially responsive documents. By September 3, 2014, the parties shall submit any proposed modifications to the February 9, 2015 deadline for the CIA to complete its review and processing of responsive documents. Granting <u>33</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 8/12/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 08/13/2014)
09/03/2014	<u>36</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from AUSA Jean–David Barnea dated 9/3/14 re: CIA Production Schedule. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 09/03/2014)
09/05/2014	<u>37</u>	ORDER: Defendant's request is GRANTED. By February 27, 2015, the CIA shall complete its review and processing of all potentially responsive documents. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 9/4/2014) (ajs) (Entered: 09/05/2014)

09/16/2014	<u>38</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by David Stuart Jones on behalf of Central Intelligence
		Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Jones, David) (Entered: 09/16/2014)
09/16/2014	<u>39</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>as to NSA's review and processing of</i> <i>potentially responsive records</i> addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from David S. Jones dated September 16, 2014. Document filed by National Security Agency.(Jones, David) (Entered: 09/16/2014)
09/17/2014	<u>40</u>	MEMO ENDORSED ORDER granting <u>39</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. ENDORSEMENT: Defendant's request is GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 9/17/2014) (ajs) (Entered: 09/17/2014)
10/09/2014	<u>41</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ashley Marie Gorski on behalf of American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 10/09/2014)
10/30/2014	<u>42</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Ashley Gorski dated October 30, 2014 re: Joint Stipulation and Proposed Order. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 10/30/2014)
10/30/2014	<u>43</u>	JOINT STIPULATION AND ORDER: Plaintiffs may file a Second Amended Complaint in the form attached hereto as Exhibit A. Within two weeks of the date of this Joint Stipulation, the parties will submit to the Court an agreed upon schedule for the search and processing of records responsive to the FOIA request submitted by Plaintiffs on July 29, 2014 to the National Security Division of the Department of Justice. In the event that that the parties cannot reach an agreement as to the search and processing schedule, they will each submit their respective proposed schedules to the Court for a decision. Defendants will file their Answer to the Second Amended Complaint no later than thirty days after it is filed. Nothing in this Stipulation shall affect existing orders of the Court setting certain deadlines for Defendants' search, review, and processing of potentially responsive documents. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 10/30/2014) (ajs) (Entered: 10/31/2014)
10/31/2014	<u>44</u>	SECOND AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>17</u> Amended Complaint, against Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. Related document: <u>17</u> Amended Complaint, filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 10/31/2014)
11/14/2014	<u>45</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from David S. Jones dated November 14, 2014 re: proposed schedule for processing documents responsive to plaintiffs' July 2014 FOIA request to the DOJ National Security Division. Document filed by Department of Justice.(Jones, David) (Entered: 11/14/2014)
11/17/2014	<u>46</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>45</u> Letter, filed by Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 11/17/2014) (ajs) (Entered: 11/17/2014)
11/24/2014	<u>47</u>	ANSWER to <u>44</u> Amended Complaint,. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, Nationa Security Agency.(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 11/24/2014)
02/27/2015	<u>48</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>for CIA to complete production</i> addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from AUSA Jean–David Barnea dated 2/27/15. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency.(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/27/2015)
03/02/2015	<u>49</u>	ORDER granting <u>48</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. Defendant's request is GRANTED. By April 30, 2015, the CIA shall complete its review and processing of all potentially responsive documents. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 3/2/2015) (ajs) (Entered: 03/02/2015)
03/16/2015	<u>50</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING NSD DOCUMENT SEARCHES FOR PRODUCTION: 1. Date Limitations for Document Searches. a. With respect to the categories of documents described in Paragraphs 1–3 of the Second Request, NSD with

		search for and process only documents that are currently in use or effect, or that were created or modified on or after September 11, 2001. b. With respect to the categories of documents described in Paragraph 4 of the Second Request, NSD will search for and process only documents that are currently in use or effect. c. With respect to the categories of documents described in Paragraph 5 of the Second Request, NSD will initially search for and process only documents created or modified on or after September 11, 2001; after the completion of NSD's production of these documents, the parties agree to continue their discussions regarding whether searches for documents created before September 11, 2001 will be undertaken, including whether conducting such searches would be unduly burdensome to NSD. 2. Document Production Deadlines. By May 1, 2015, NSD shall complete its processing of the Second Request and produce all documents, or portions thereof, it deems to be responsive and non–exempt. By March 13, 2015, NSD shall make an interim production that includes any documents for which it does not need to consult with other agencies. 3. Nothing in this Stipulation and Order, including the fact of its entry, should be taken as a concession by NSD that Plaintiffs have "substantially prevailed" in this action in whole or in part, as that term is used in 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(E). SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 3/16/2015) (ajs) (Entered: 03/16/2015)
12/02/2015	<u>51</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU –</b> LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Cross Motions for Partial Summary Judgment addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Jonathan Manes dated 12/2/2015. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Manes, Jonathan) Modified on 12/8/2015 (ldi). (Entered: 12/02/2015)
12/08/2015		***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – EVENT TYPE ERROR. Notice to Attorney Jonathan Matthew Manes to RE-FILE Document <u>51</u> LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Cross Motions for Partial Summary Judgment addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Jonathan Manes dated 12/2/2015. Use the event type Letter found under the event list Other Documents. (Idi) (Entered: 12/08/2015)
12/08/2015	<u>52</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Jonathan Manes dated 12/2/2015 re: Proposed Schedule for Cross Motions for Summary Judgment. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Manes, Jonathan) (Entered: 12/08/2015)
12/09/2015	<u>53</u>	ORDER re: <u>52</u> LETTER addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Jonathan Manes dated 12/2/2015 re: Proposed Schedule for Cross Motions for Summary Judgment. Having reviewed the parties' joint letter dated December 2, 2015, it is ORDERED that: 1. By January 15, 2016, the Defendants shall submit their motion for partial summary judgment; 2. By February 16, 2016, Plaintiffs shall submit their cross-motion for partial summary judgment and opposition to the Defendants' motion; 3. By March 18, 2016, the Defendants shall submit their opposition to Plaintiffs' cross-motion and reply in support of partial summary judgment; and 4. By April 8, 2016, Plaintiffs shall submit their reply in support of partial summary judgment. In addition, the parties' request to forego the exchange of Local Civil Rule 56.1 Statements is GRANTED. (Motions due by 1/15/2016. Cross Motions due by 2/16/2016. Responses due by 3/18/2016. Replies due by 4/8/2016.) (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 12/9/2015) (adc) (Entered: 12/10/2015)
01/11/2016	<u>54</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Partial Summary</i> <i>Judgment Motion</i> addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from AUSA Jean–David Barnea dated 1/11/16. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 01/11/2016)
01/12/2016	<u>55</u>	ORDER granting <u>54</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Partial Summary Judgment Motion. Having reviewed the parties' joint letter dated January 11, 2016, it is ORDERED that: 1. By February 5, 2016, the Defendants shall submit their motion for partial summary judgment; 2. By March 8, 2016, Plaintiffs shall submit their cross-motion for partial summary judgment and opposition to the Defendants' motion; 3. By April 8, 2016, the Defendants shall submit their opposition to Plaintiffs' cross-motion and reply in support of partial summary judgment; and 4. By April 29, 2016, Plaintiffs shall submit their reply in support of partial summary judgment. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 1/12/2016) (kko) (Entered: 01/12/2016)

01/12/2016		Set/Reset Deadlines: Motions due by 2/5/2016. Cross Motions due by 3/8/2016. Responses due by 4/8/2016. Replies due by 4/29/2016. (kko) (Entered: 01/12/2016)
01/29/2016	<u>56</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>on briefing for summary</i> <i>judgment</i> addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from David S. Jones dated January 29, 2016. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.(Jones, David) (Entered: 01/29/2016)
02/02/2016	<u>57</u>	ORDER granting <u>56</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time on briefing for summary judgment. GRANTED. The parties shall adhere to the schedule set forth above. SO ORDERED. (Motions due by 2/26/2016. Cross Motions due by 4/20/2016.) (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 2/2/2016) (kko) (Entered: 02/02/2016)
02/02/2016		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 5/18/2016. Replies due by 6/8/2016. (kko) (Entered: 02/02/2016)
02/26/2016	<u>58</u>	MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
02/26/2016	<u>59</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Attachments: <u># 1</u> Addendum: Document Index)(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
02/26/2016	<u>60</u>	DECLARATION of Antoinette B. Shiner (CIA) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Vaughn, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C)(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
02/26/2016	<u>61</u>	DECLARATION of Arthur R. Sepeta (DHS) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
02/26/2016	<u>62</u>	DECLARATION of Alesia Y. Williams (DIA) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibits A–E, # <u>2</u> Exhibit F)(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
02/26/2016	<u>63</u>	DECLARATION of David M. Hardy (FBI) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Attachments: <u>#1</u> Exhibit A, <u>#2</u> Exhibit B, <u>#3</u> Exhibit C, <u>#4</u> Exhibit D, <u>#5</u> Exhibit E, <u>#6</u> Exhibit F, <u>#7</u> Exhibit G, <u>#8</u> Exhibit H, <u>#9</u> Exhibit I)(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
02/26/2016	<u>64</u>	DECLARATION of David J. Sherman (NSA) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration (part 2), # <u>2</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 18)(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
02/26/2016	<u>65</u>	DECLARATION of John Bradford Wiegmann (NSD) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Attachments: <u># 1</u> Exhibits)(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
02/26/2016	<u>66</u>	DECLARATION of Christina M. Butler (OIP) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/26/2016)

02/26/2016	<u>67</u>	DECLARATION of Paul P. Colborn (OLC) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E–1, # <u>7</u> Exhibit E–2 (part 1), # <u>8</u> Exhibit E–2 (part 2), # <u>9</u> Exhibit E–3, # <u>10</u> Exhibit F, # <u>11</u> Exhibit G)(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
02/26/2016	<u>68</u>	DECLARATION of John F. Hackett (State) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibits)(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
04/20/2016	<u>69</u>	CROSS MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 04/20/2016)
04/20/2016	<u>70</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>69</u> CROSS MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . <i>and in Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Partial Summary Judgment</i> . Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 04/20/2016)
04/20/2016	<u>71</u>	DECLARATION of Jonathan Manes in Support re: <u>69</u> CROSS MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Attachments: <u># 1</u> Exhibit A, <u># 2</u> Exhibit B, <u># 3</u> Exhibit C, <u># 4</u> Exhibit D–Part 1, <u># 5</u> Exhibit D–Part 2, <u># 6</u> Exhibit E, <u># 7</u> Exhibit F, <u># 8</u> Exhibit G, <u># 9</u> Exhibit H, <u># 10</u> Exhibit I, <u># 11</u> Exhibit J, <u># 12</u> Exhibit K, <u># 13</u> Exhibit L, <u># 14</u> Exhibit M, <u># 15</u> Exhibit N, <u># 16</u> Exhibit O–Part 1, <u># 17</u> Exhibit O–Part 2, <u># 18</u> Exhibit P, <u># 19</u> Exhibit Q)(Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 04/20/2016)
05/11/2016	<u>72</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>57</u> Order on Motion for Extension of Time, <i>on cross-motions for summary judgment</i> ( <i>ECF Nos. 59, 70</i> ), also to extend plaintiff's time to reply in support of their <i>cross-motion</i> addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from David S. Jones dated 05/11/2016. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.(Jones, David) (Entered: 05/11/2016)
05/11/2016	<u>73</u>	ORDER granting <u>72</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply re <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment, <u>69</u> CROSS MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment. GRANTED. Defendants shall file their opposition and reply by June 8, 2016. Plaintiffs shall file their reply by July 1, 2016. No further extensions shall be granted. SO ORDERED. (Replies due by 6/8/2016. Responses due by 6/8/2016. Replies due by 7/1/2016.) (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 5/11/2016) (kko) (Entered: 05/11/2016)
06/08/2016	<u>74</u>	NOTICE of filing of classified document on 2/29/2016 re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Jones, David) (Entered: 06/08/2016)
06/08/2016	<u>75</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . <i>and in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Cross–Motion</i> . Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 06/08/2016)
06/08/2016	<u>76</u>	DECLARATION of Antoinette B. Shiner (CIA) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 06/08/2016)
06/08/2016	<u>77</u>	DECLARATION of Alesia Y. Williams (DIA) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 06/08/2016)
06/08/2016	<u>78</u>	DECLARATION of David M. Hardy (FBI) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.

		(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 06/08/2016)
06/08/2016	<u>79</u>	DECLARATION of David J. Sherman (NSA) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 06/08/2016)
06/08/2016	<u>80</u>	DECLARATION of John Bradford Wiegmann (NSD) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Transmittal Letter)(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 06/08/2016)
06/08/2016	<u>81</u>	DECLARATION of Eric F. Stein (State) in Support re: <u>58</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 06/08/2016)
07/01/2016	<u>82</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>69</u> CROSS MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 07/01/2016)
08/17/2016		Magistrate Judge James C. Francis IV is so redesignated. (wb) (Entered: 08/17/2016)
08/18/2016	<u>83</u>	ORDER. It is ORDERED that by September 30, 2016, State shall complete its review of the materials for responsiveness to Plaintiffs' requests, whereupon Defendants shall submit a letter informing the Court as to the number of responsive documents found and proposing a date by which Defendants will produce the responsive documents and a Vaughn index justifying any withholdings. By October 5, 2016, Plaintiffs shall respond to Defendants' letter. Decision on the parties' cross-motions for partial summary judgment is held in abeyance pending Defendants' review of these additional materials. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate the motions at ECF Nos. 58 and 69. SO ORDERED. Terminating <u>58</u> Motion for Partial Summary Judgment; Terminating <u>69</u> Motion for Partial Summary Judgment. (Signed by Judge Analisa Torres on 8/18/2016) (rjm) (Entered: 08/19/2016)
08/23/2016	<u>84</u>	MOTION for Hannah Corey Bloch–Wehba to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208–12682205. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order, # 2 Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing for District of Columbia Bar, # 3 Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing for State Bar of Texas)(Bloch–Wehba, Hannah) (Entered: 08/23/2016)
08/23/2016		>>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>84</u> MOTION for Hannah Corey Bloch–Wehba to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208–12682205. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (wb) (Entered: 08/23/2016)
08/25/2016	85	ORDER granting <u>84</u> Motion for Hannah Corey Bloch–Wehba to Appear Pro Hac Vice (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Analisa Torres)(Text Only Order) (Torres, Analisa) (Entered: 08/25/2016)
09/26/2016	<u>86</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from David S. Jones dated September 26, 2016 re: outcome of supplemental review of additional files (submitted as directed by order dated August 18, 2016 (ECF No. 83)). Document filed by Department of State.(Jones, David) (Entered: 09/26/2016)
09/29/2016	<u>87</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from Ashley Gorski dated September 29, 2016 re: outcome of supplemental review of additional files (submitted as directed by order dated August 18, 2016 (ECF No. 83)). Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 09/29/2016)
09/30/2016	<u>88</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Analisa Torres from David S. Jones dated 09 30 2016 re: response and non-objection to plaintiffs' September 29 letter; request for simultaneous reinstatement of defendants' motion for partial summary judgment. Document filed by

		Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.(Jones, David) (Entered: 09/30/2016)
11/22/2016		NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge Kimba M. Wood. Judge Analisa Torres is no longer assigned to the case. (wb) (Entered: 11/22/2016)
12/19/2016	<u>89</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Kimba M. Wood from Ashley Gorski dated 12/19/2016 re: Status Update and Request to Reinstate Cross–Motions. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 12/19/2016)
12/21/2016	<u>90</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>89</u> Letter filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. ENDORSEMENT SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Kimba M. Wood on 12/21/2016) (cf) (Entered: 12/21/2016)
01/03/2017	<u>91</u>	MOTION for Alex Abdo to Withdraw as Attorney . Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 01/03/2017)
01/04/2017	<u>92</u>	ORDER granting <u>91</u> MOTION OF ALEX ABDO TO WITHDRAW AS COUNSEL. SO ORDERED. Attorney Alexander Abraham Abdo terminated. (Signed by Judge Kimba M. Wood on 1/04/2017) (ama) (Entered: 01/04/2017)
03/27/2017	<u>93</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER: The parties each move for partial summary judgment on the adequacy of certain agencies' searches and the applicability of certain FOIA exemptions to 150 responsive documents that were partially or fully withheld by Defendants. (As further set forth in this Order.) For the reasons stated above, Defendants' motion is GRANTED in part and DENIED in part, and Plaintiffs' motion is DENIED without prejudice. The parties are directed to confer and jointly submit a proposed briefing schedule on any further motions on or before April 26, 2017. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate the motions at ECF Nos. 58 and 69. (Signed by Judge Kimba M. Wood on 3/27/2017) (cf) (Entered: 03/27/2017)
03/27/2017	<u>94</u>	INTERNET CITATION NOTE: Material from decision with Internet citation re: <u>93</u> Memorandum & Opinion. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Internet Citation, # <u>2</u> Internet Citation, # <u>3</u> Internet Citation, # <u>4</u> Internet Citation, # <u>5</u> Internet Citation, # <u>6</u> Internet Citation, # Internet Citation, # <u>8</u> Internet Citation, # <u>9</u> Internet Citation) (vf) (Entered: 04/19/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>95</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Kimba M. Wood from AUSA Jean–David Barne dated 4/25/17 re: Schedule for Supplemental Filings. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/26/2017	<u>96</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>95</u> Letter, filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Cross Motions due by 7/10/2017. Motions due by 6/12/2017. Responses due by 7/10/2017. Replies due by 7/24/2017.) (Signed by Judge Kimba M. Wood on 4/25/2017) (ras) (Entered: 04/26/2017)
06/07/2017	<u>97</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time for submissions on motion for partial summary judgment addressed to Judge Kimba M. Wood from David S. Jones dated June 7, 2017. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.(Jones, David) (Entered: 06/07/2017)
06/08/2017	<u>98</u>	ORDER granting <u>97</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. GRANTED. The parties shall follow the schedule set forth above. (Cross Motions due by 7/14/2017. Motions due by 6/14/2017.) (Signed by Judge Kimba M. Wood on 6/8/2017) (ras) (Entered: 06/08/2017)
06/08/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 7/14/2017. Replies due by 7/28/2017. (ras) (Entered: 06/08/2017)
06/14/2017	<u>99</u>	SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. Responses due by 7/14/2017(Jones, David) (Entered

		06/14/2017)
06/14/2017	100	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>99</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Jones, David) (Entered: 06/14/2017)
06/14/2017	<u>101</u>	DECLARATION of Antoinette B. Shiner (CIA) in Support re: <u>99</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Jones, David) (Entered: 06/14/2017)
06/14/2017	<u>102</u>	DECLARATION of David M. Hardy (FBI) in Support re: <u>99</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Jones, David) (Entered: 06/14/2017)
06/14/2017	<u>103</u>	DECLARATION of David J. Sherman (NSA) in Support re: <u>99</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Jones, David) (Entered: 06/14/2017)
06/14/2017	<u>104</u>	DECLARATION of Kevin G. Tiernan (NSD) in Support re: <u>99</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Jones, David) (Entered: 06/14/2017)
07/07/2017	<u>105</u>	DECLARATION of David M. Hardy (FBI) (Supplemental) in Support re: <u>99</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 07/07/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>106</u>	SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. Responses due by 7/28/2017(Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/14/2017	<u>107</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>106</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . <i>and in Opposition to Defendants' Second Motion for Partial</i> <i>Summary Judgment</i> . Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 07/14/2017)
07/25/2017	<u>108</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>99</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . addressed to Judge Kimba M. Wood from AUSA Jean–David Barnea dated 7/25/17. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 07/25/2017)
07/25/2017	<u>109</u>	ORDER granting <u>108</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply. GRANTED. Defendants' reply brief shall be filed no later than August 4, 2017. SO ORDERED. (Replies due by 8/4/2017.) (Signed by Judge Kimba M. Wood on 7/25/2017) (ras) (Entered: 07/25/2017)
08/04/2017	<u>110</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>99</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . <i>and in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Cross-Motion</i> . Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 08/04/2017)
08/04/2017	<u>111</u>	REPLY AFFIRMATION of David J. Sherman (NSA) in Support re: <u>99</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency. (Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 08/04/2017)
08/17/2017	112	ORDER granting <u>99</u> Motion for Partial Summary Judgment; denying <u>106</u> Motion for Partial Summary Judgment. The parties now each move for partial summary judgment as to the remaining 46 documents that are contested. In accordance with the Order, the Government has conducted additional review and searches, and provided additional support for its motion. (As further set forth in this Order.) For the reasons stated above,

		Defendants' motion is GRANTED and Plaintiffs' motion is DENIED. The Court believes that this order resolves all remaining issues. If the parties disagree, they shall file a letter on the docket within 30 days explaining any outstanding issues. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate the motions at ECF Nos. 99 and 106 and to close the case. (Signed by Judge Kimba M. Wood on 8/17/2017) (cf) (Entered: 08/17/2017)
08/17/2017		Transmission to Judgments and Orders Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>112</u> Order to the Judgments and Orders Clerk. (cf) (Entered: 08/17/2017)
08/22/2017	<u>113</u>	CLERK'S JUDGMENT: It is, ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED: That for the reasons stated in the Court's Order dated August 17, 2017, Defendants' motion is granted and Plaintiffs' motion is denied. The Court believes that the Order resolves all remaining issues. If the parties disagree, they shall file a letter on the docket within 30 days explaining any outstanding issues; accordingly, the case is closed. (Signed by Clerk of Court Ruby Krajick on 8/22/2017) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Right to Appeal, # <u>2</u> Right to Appeal)(km) (Entered: 08/22/2017)
10/20/2017	<u>114</u>	NOTICE OF APPEAL from <u>113</u> Clerk's Judgment, Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. Filing fee \$ 505.00, receipt number 0208–14269822. Form C and Form D are due within 14 days to the Court of Appeals, Second Circuit. (Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 10/20/2017)
10/20/2017		Transmission of Notice of Appeal and Certified Copy of Docket Sheet to US Court of Appeals re: <u>114</u> Notice of Appeal, (nd) (Entered: 10/20/2017)
10/20/2017		Appeal Record Sent to USCA (Electronic File). Certified Indexed record on Appeal Electronic Files for <u>114</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation were transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals. (nd) (Entered: 10/20/2017)
02/02/2018	<u>115</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by David A. Schulz on behalf of American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. New Address: Ballard Spahr LLP, 1675 Broadway, 19th Floor, New York, NY, US 10019–5820, 212–850–6103. (Schulz, David) (Entered: 02/02/2018)
07/19/2019	<u>116</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION to Reopen Case addressed to Judge Kimba M. Wood from Ashley Gorski dated 07/19/2019. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation.(Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 07/19/2019)
07/24/2019	<u>117</u>	ORDER granting <u>116</u> Letter Motion to Reopen Case. The parties shall report to the court regarding fees on or before September 20, 2019. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Kimba M. Wood on 7/24/2019) (ne) Modified on 7/24/2019 (ne). (Entered: 07/24/2019)
08/12/2019	<u>118</u>	TRUE COPY OPINION of USCA as to <u>114</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation USCA Case Number 17–3399. USCA Case Number 17–3399. For the foregoing reasons, the August 22, 2017 judgment of the District Court is AFFIRMED. Catherine O'Hagan Wolfe, Clerk USCA for the Second Circuit. Certified: 8/12/2019. (tp) (Entered: 08/12/2019)
08/12/2019	<u>119</u>	MANDATE of USCA (Certified Copy) as to <u>114</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation USCA Case Number 17–3399. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED and DECREED that the judgment of the District Court is AFFIRMED. Catherine O'Hagan Wolfe, Clerk USCA for the Second Circuit. Issued As Mandate: 8/12/2019. (tp) (Entered: 08/12/2019)
08/12/2019		Transmission of USCA Mandate/Order to the District Judge re: <u>118</u> USCA Order, <u>119</u> USCA Mandate. (tp) (Entered: 08/12/2019)
09/20/2019	<u>120</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Kimba M. Wood from AUSA Jean–David Barne dated 9/20/19 re: Status of Discussions Re Attorney's Fees. Document filed by Central Intelligence Agency, Department of Defense, Department of Justice, Department of State, National Security Agency.(Barnea, Jean–David) (Entered: 09/20/2019)
09/24/2019	<u>121</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>120</u> Letter Status of Discussions Re Attorney's Fees filed by Department of Defense, Department of State, Department of Justice, Central Intelligence Agency, National Security Agency. ENDORSEMENT: The parties shall

		report to the Court regarding fees on or before October 11, 2019. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Kimba M. Wood on 9/23/19) (yv) (Entered: 09/24/2019)
10/11/2019	<u>122</u>	PROPOSED STIPULATION AND ORDER. Document filed by American Civil Liberties Union, American Civil Liberties Union Foundation. (Gorski, Ashley) (Entered: 10/11/2019)
10/16/2019	123	ORDER OF SETTLEMENT AND DISMISSAL IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between the parties, as follows: Pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(E), as soon as reasonably practicable after the Court has endorsed and docketed this Stipulation and Order, NSA and OLC shall each pay to Plaintiffs the sum of \$8,250; and NSD, FBI, and CIA shall each pay to Plaintiffs the sum of \$4,500, for a total settlement payment of \$30,000 (collectively, the "Settlement Payments"). Defendants shall make their best effort to make payment to Plaintiffs within 90 days following the dismissal of this Action and will submit appropriate requests for payment within 14 days of the entry of the Stipulation and Order. Plaintiffs agree to accept the Settlement Payments in full satisfaction of any possible claim, demand or entitlement for attorney's fees and costs they have incurred or will incur in this action for services performed up to the date of this Stipulation and Order. Any subsequent claim for attorney's fees and costs in connection with this matter will be limited to a claim for fees and/or costs in connection with any future application to enforce the Stipulation and Order. This action is hereby dismissed with prejudice, provided that the Court shall retain jurisdiction over any issues that may arise relating to this Stipulation and Order. Effective upon payment of the Settlement Amounts set forth in Paragraph 1, Plaintiffs release the United States, its agencies, departments, officers, employees, servants, and agents, including the Agencies, from any claims for attorney's fees, costs, and expenses of any kind, and however denominated, relating to services performed in connection with this instant action, except as set forth in paragraph 3. Nothing in this Stipulation and Order shall constitute an admission by United States of America or its agencies, including the Agencies, that Plaintiffs or their counsel are eligible for or entitled to attorney's fees and costs under 5 U.S.C. § 552(a) (4)(E) in this action. SO ORDERED. (Signe