

United States Court of Appeals
For the Eighth Circuit

No. 15-1022

Rita Jernigan; Pam Jernigan; Becca Austin; Tara Austin

Plaintiffs - Appellees

v.

Larry Crane, In his official capacity as Circuit and County Clerk of Pulaski
County, Arkansas, and his successors in interest

Defendant

Dustin McDaniel, In his official capacity as Attorney General for the State of
Arkansas, and his successors in interest; Richard Weiss, In his official capacity as
Director of the Arkansas Department of Finance and Administration, and his
successors in interest; George Hopkins, In his official capacity as Executive
Director of the Arkansas Teacher Retirement System, and his successors in interest

Defendants - Appellants

North Carolina Values Coalition; Liberty, Life, and Law Foundation; Dr. Paul
McHugh; Robert P. George; Sherif Girgis; Liberty Counsel; Eagle Forum
Education and Legal Defense Fund

Amici on Behalf of Appellant(s)

National Women's Law Center; Connecticut Women's Education and Legal Fund;
Legal Momentum; Legal Voice; National Association of Women Lawyers;
National Partnership for Women and Families; Women's Bar Association of the
District of Columbia; Women's Bar Association of Illinois; Women's Law Project;
Williams Institute Scholars of Sexual Orientation and Gender Law; Howard

University School of Law Civil Rights Clinic; American Sociological Association; American Psychological Association; Arkansas Psychological Association; American Psychiatric Association; American Association for Marriage and Family Therapy; American Psychoanalytic Association; National Association of Social Workers; National Association of Social Workers Missouri, Arkansas, South Dakota, and Nebraska Chapters; Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights; President of the House of Deputies of the Episcopal Church and the Episcopal Bishops of Missouri and Nebraska; General Synod of the United Church of Christ; Reconstructionist Rabbinical Association; Reconstructionist Rabbinical College and Jewish Reconstructionist Communities; Union for Reform Judaism; Unitarian Universalist Association; Affirmation; Covenant Network of Presbyterians; Friends for Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, and Queer Concerns; Reconciling Ministries Network; Reconciling Works: Lutherans for Full Participation; Parity; Muslims for Progressive Values; More Light Presbyterians; Methodist Federation for Social Action; Family Equality Council; COLAGE; Constitutional Law Scholars; Historians of Marriage; Historians of Antigay Discrimination; 24 Employers; Gary J. Gates; Leadership Conference Education Fund; Americans United For Separation of Church and State; Religious Institute, Inc.

Amici on Behalf of Appellee(s)

Appeal from United States District Court
for the Eastern District of Arkansas - Little Rock

Submitted: July 8, 2015
Filed: August 11, 2015
[Published]

Before WOLLMAN, SMITH, and BENTON, Circuit Judges.

PER CURIAM.

Plaintiffs are two same-sex couples seeking to marry in Arkansas or to have their marriage in another state recognized in Arkansas. They also seek state benefits incident to marriage. The district court¹ granted Plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment, finding laws denying them the right to marry (in Arkansas Constitution Amendment 83 and Arkansas Code Annotated §§ 9-11-107, 9-11-109, and 9-11-208) violate the U.S. Constitution's guarantees of due process and equal protection. In addition to a declaratory judgment, the court issued a permanent injunction, but stayed it pending appeal. Arkansas appeals. Having jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. § 1291, this court affirms.

While the appeal was pending, the Supreme Court decided *Obergefell v. Hodges*, 135 S. Ct. 2584 (2015), *abrogating Citizens for Equal Protection v. Bruning*, 455 F.3d 859 (8th Cir. 2006). This court asked the parties for their positions on the proper disposition of this case. Arkansas filed a suggestion of mootness and a motion to vacate the district court's judgment.

Arkansas no longer disputes the merits of the district court's ruling. The challenged laws are unconstitutional. As *Obergefell* concluded:

[T]he right to marry is a fundamental right inherent in the liberty of the person, and under the Due Process and Equal Protection Clauses of the Fourteenth Amendment couples of the same-sex may not be deprived of that right and that liberty. The Court now holds that same-sex couples may exercise the fundamental right to marry. No longer may this liberty be denied to them. *Baker v. Nelson* [, 409 U.S. 810 (1972),] must be and now is overruled, and the State laws challenged by Petitioners in these cases are now held invalid to the extent they exclude same-sex couples from civil marriage on the same terms and conditions as opposite-sex couples.

¹The Honorable Kristine G. Baker, United States District Judge for the Eastern District of Arkansas.

Obergefell, 135 S. Ct. at 2604-05. The Supreme Court also noted,

[I]t must be emphasized that religions, and those who adhere to religious doctrines, may continue to advocate with utmost, sincere conviction that, by divine precepts, same-sex marriage should not be condoned. The First Amendment ensures that religious organizations and persons are given proper protection as they seek to teach the principles that are so fulfilling and so central to their lives and faiths, and to their own deep aspirations to continue the family structure they have long revered. The same is true of those who oppose same-sex marriage for other reasons. In turn, those who believe allowing same-sex marriage is proper or indeed essential, whether as a matter of religious conviction or secular belief, may engage those who disagree with their view in an open and searching debate. The Constitution, however, does not permit the State to bar same-sex couples from marriage on the same terms as accorded to couples of the opposite sex.

Id. at 2607.

Arkansas suggests that *Obergefell* moots this case. But the Supreme Court specifically stated that “the State laws *challenged by Petitioners in these cases* are now held invalid.” *Id.* at 2605 (emphasis added). *Cf. United States v. Nat’l Treasury Emps. Union*, 513 U.S. 454, 477-78 (1995) (limiting relief to the parties before the Court and noting “we neither want nor need to provide relief to nonparties when a narrower remedy will fully protect the litigants”). The Court invalidated laws in Michigan, Kentucky, Ohio, and Tennessee—not Arkansas. *See Campaign for S. Equal. v. Bryant*, 2015 WL 4032186, at *2 (5th Cir. July 1, 2015) (ordering district court to enter final judgment that Texas laws denying same-sex couples the right to marry are unconstitutional); *Conde-Vidal v. Rius-Armendariz*, No. 14-2184 (1st Cir. July 8, 2015) (judgment vacating and remanding district court judgment that dismissed challenge to law denying same-sex marriage). Arkansas acknowledges this: “The Supreme Court did not address many of the claims asserted by Appellees and

addressed by the district court in this case” Arkansas has not repealed the challenged laws.

Arkansas’s general assurances of compliance with *Obergefell* also do not moot the case. See *Friends of the Earth, Inc. v. Laidlaw Envtl. Servs. (TOC), Inc.*, 528 U.S. 167, 190 (2000) (“[A] defendant claiming that its voluntary compliance moots a case bears the formidable burden of showing that it is absolutely clear the allegedly wrongful behavior could not reasonably be expected to recur.”). These assurances may, however, impact the necessity of continued injunctive relief. The district court is better positioned to consider the issue on appropriate motion. See *United States v. Bailey*, 571 F.3d 791, 804 (8th Cir. 2009) (noting this court reviews permanent injunctions for abuse of discretion, reversing when the injunction is based on “a legal error or a clearly erroneous finding of fact”).

The judgment is affirmed. Arkansas’s motion to vacate the district court’s order is denied.

United States Court of Appeals

For The Eighth Circuit

Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse
111 South 10th Street, Room 24.329

St. Louis, Missouri 63102

Michael E. Gans
Clerk of Court

VOICE (314) 244-2400
FAX (314) 244-2780
www.ca8.uscourts.gov

August 11, 2015

West Publishing
Opinions Clerk
610 Opperman Drive
Building D D4-40
Eagan, MN 55123-0000

RE: 15-1022 Rita Jernigan, et al. v. Dustin McDaniel, et al.

Dear Sirs:

An opinion was filed today in the above case.

Counsel who represented the appellant was Colin Jorgensen, AAG, of Little Rock, AR.

The following attorney(s) appeared on the amici briefs in support of appellant:

Brief of North Carolina Values Coalition and Liberty, Life and Law Foundation – Deborah J. Dewart of Swansboro, NC.

Brief of Dr. Paul McHugh – Kevin T. Snider of Oakland, CA and Gerard V. Bradley of Notre Dame, Indiana.

Brief of Robert P. George and Sherif Girgis – Jefferson Downing and Thomas P. McCarty of Lincoln, NE.

Brief of Liberty Counsel – Mary E. McAlister of Lynchburg, VA and Mathew D. Staver, Anita L. Staver and Horatio G. Mihet of Orlando, FL.

Brief of Eagle Forum Education & Legal Defense Fund – Lawrence J. Joseph of Washington, DC.

Counsel who represented the appellees was Jack Wagoner, III, and Angela M. Mann of Little Rock, AR.

The following attorney(s) appeared on the amici briefs in support of appellees:

Brief of the National Women's Law Center, Connecticut Women's Education and Legal Fund, Legal Momentum, Legal Voice, National Association of Women Lawyers, National Partnership for Women and Families, Women's Bar Association of the District of Columbia, Women's Bar Association of Illinois, Women's Law Project, and Williams Institute Scholars of Sexual

Orientation and Gender Law – Marcia D. Greenberger, Emily J. Martin, Elizabeth Johnston all of Washington, DC.

Brief of Howard University School of Law Civil Rights Clinic – Prof. Aderson B. Francois of Washington, DC, Benjamin G. Shatz and Brad W. Seiling of Los Angeles, CA

Brief of American Sociological Association – Carmine D. Boccuzzi, Jr., Mark A. Lightner, Grant A. Bermann, Alexandra Eber all of New York, NY.

Brief of American Psychological Association, Arkansas Psychological Association, American Psychiatric Association, American Association for Marriage and Family Therapy, American Psychanalytic Association, National Association of Social Workers, and National Association of Social Workers Missouri, Arkansas, South Dakota, and Nebraska Chapters – Nathalie F.P. Gilfoyle, Paul M. Smith, Aaron M. Panner all of Washington, DC.

Brief of the Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights and the Leadership Conference Education Fund – Wade J. Henderson, Lisa M. Bornstein, Matthew M. Hoffman and Andrew Hudson all of Washington, DC.

Brief of Americans United for Separation of Church and State – Ayesha N. Khan, Alex J. Luchenitser, Charles A. Rothfeld, Miriam R. Nemetz, Richard B. Katskee and Scott M. Noveck all of Washington, DC.

Brief of President of the House of Deputies of the Episcopal Church and the Episcopal Bishops of Missouri and Nebraska, General Synod of the United Church of Christ, Reconstructionist Rabbinical Association, Reconstructionist Rabbinical College and Jewish Reconstructionist Communities, Union for Reform Judaism, Unitarian Universalist Association, Affirmation, Covenant Network of Presbyterians, Friends for Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, and Queer Concerns, Methodist Federation for Social Action, More Light Presbyterians, Muslims for Progressive Values, Parity, Reconciling Ministries Network, Reconciling Works, Lutherans for Full Participation, and Religious Institute, Inc. – Jeffrey S. Trachtman, Norman C. Simon, Jason M. Moff, Kurt M. Denk, Michelle Ben-David, and Catherine Hoge of New York, NY.

Brief of Family Equality Council and Colage – Thomas E. Nanney of Kansas City, MO and Brian C. Walsh of St. Louis, MO.

Brief of Constitutional Law Scholars – Geoffrey R. Stone of Chicago, IL and Diane M. Soubly of Ann Arbor, MI.

Brief of Historians of Marriage – Pratik A. Shah of Washington, DC, Daniel McNeel Lane, Jr. of San Antonio, TX and Jessica M. Weisel of Los Angeles, CA.

Brief of Historians of Antigay Discrimination – Catherine E. Stetson, Erica Knievel Songer, Mary Helen Wimberly, Madeline H. Gitomer, Katherine J. Duncan (supervised by members of the firm) all of Washington, DC.

Brief of 24 Employers – Susan Baker Manning, Michael L. Whitlock, Jawad Muaddi, Kimberley E. Lunetta, and Jacquelynne M. Hamilton all of Washington, DC.

The judge who heard the case in the district court was Honorable Kristine G. Baker. The judgment of the district court was entered on November 25, 2014.

If you have any questions concerning this case, please call this office.

Michael E. Gans
Clerk of Court

LMT

Enclosure(s)

cc: Lois Law
MO Lawyers Weekly

District Court/Agency Case Number(s): 4:13-cv-00410-KGB

United States Court of Appeals

For The Eighth Circuit

Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse
111 South 10th Street, Room 24.329

St. Louis, Missouri 63102

Michael E. Gans
Clerk of Court

VOICE (314) 244-2400
FAX (314) 244-2780
www.ca8.uscourts.gov

August 11, 2015

Mr. Colin Jorgensen
ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE
200 Catlett-Prien Building
323 Center Street
Little Rock, AR 72201-0000

RE: 15-1022 Rita Jernigan, et al v. Dustin McDaniel, et al

Dear Counsel:

The court has issued an opinion in this case. Judgment has been entered in accordance with the opinion. The opinion will be released to the public at 10:00 a.m. today. Please hold the opinion in confidence until that time.

Please review [Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure](#) and the [Eighth Circuit Rules](#) on post-submission procedure to ensure that any contemplated filing is timely and in compliance with the rules. Note particularly that petitions for rehearing and petitions for rehearing en banc must be received in the clerk's office within 14 days of the date of the entry of judgment. Counsel-filed petitions must be filed electronically in CM/ECF. Paper copies are not required. No grace period for mailing is allowed, and the date of the postmark is irrelevant for pro-se-filed petitions. Any petition for rehearing or petition for rehearing en banc which is not received within the 14 day period for filing permitted by FRAP 40 may be denied as untimely.

Michael E. Gans
Clerk of Court

LMT

Enclosure(s)

cc: Ms. Michelle Ben-David
Grant A. Bermann
Ms. Carmine D Boccuzzi Jr.
Ms. Lisa Bornstein
Mr. Gerard Bradley
Ms. Hannah Y.S. Chanoine
Mr. Kurt Denk
Ms. Deborah Jane Dewart
Mr. Jefferson Downing
Ms. Katherine J. Duncan

Aderson Francois
Ms. Nathalie F.P. Gilfoyle
Ms. Madeline H. Gitomer
Ms. Marcia D. Greenberger
Jacquelynne M. Hamilton
Mr. Wade Henderson
Mr. Matthew Michael Hoffman
Ms. Catherine L Hoge
Mr. Andrew S. Hudson
Elizabeth Johnston
Mr. Lawrence John Joseph
Mr. Richard Brian Katskee
Ms. Ayesha N Khan
Mr. Daniel McNeel Lane Jr.
Mark A. Lightner
Mr. Alexander Joseph Luchenitser
Kimberley E. Lunetta
Ms. Angela M. Mann
Ms. Susan Baker Manning
Ms. Cheryl Kathleen Maples
Ms. Emily Martin
Ms. Mary Elizabeth McAlister
Mr. Thomas McCarty
Mr. Jim McCormack
Ms. Lori Alvino McGill
Mr. Horatio Gabriel Mihet
Mr. Jason Moff
Jawad Muaddi
Mr. Thomas E. Nanney
Ms. Miriam Nemetz
Mr. Aaron Panner
Mr. R. Keith Pike
Adam P. Romero
Mr. Charles Alan Rothfeld
Brad Seiling
Mr. Pratik A. Shah
Mr. Benjamin G. Shatz
Mr. Norman Simon
Mr. Paul March Smith
Mr. Kevin Snider
Ms. Erica Songer
Ms. Diane M. Soubly
Ms. Anita Staver
Mr. Mathew D. Staver
Ms. Catherine Emily Stetson
Mr. Geoffrey Stone
Mr. Jeffrey S. Trachtman
Mr. Jack Wagoner III
Mr. Brian C. Walsh
Ms. Jessica Weisel
Michael L. Whitlock
Ms. Mary Helen Wimberly

District Court/Agency Case Number(s): 4:13-cv-00410-KGB



15-1022 Rita Jernigan, et al v. Dustin McDaniel, et al "per curiam opinion filed" (4:13-cv-00410-KGB)
ca08ml_cmecf_Notify
to:
08/11/2015 09:14 AM
Hide Details
From: ca08ml_cmecf_Notify@ca8.uscourts.gov
To:

NOTE TO PUBLIC ACCESS USERS Judicial Conference of the United States policy permits attorneys of record and parties in a case (including pro se litigants) to receive one free electronic copy of all documents filed electronically, if receipt is required by law or directed by the filer. PACER access fees apply to all other users. To avoid later charges, download a copy of each document during this first viewing.

Eighth Circuit Court of Appeals

Notice of Docket Activity

The following transaction was filed on 08/11/2015

Case Name: Rita Jernigan, et al v. Dustin McDaniel, et al

Case Number: [15-1022](#)

Document(s): [Document\(s\)](#)

Docket Text:

PER CURIAM OPINION FILED - THE COURT: Roger L. Wollman, Lavenski R. Smith and Duane Benton (PUBLISHED) [4304552] [15-1022] (Lisa Tobias)

Notice will be electronically mailed to:

Ms. Michelle Ben-David: Mbendavid@kramerlevin.com
Ms. Carmine D Bocuzzi, Jr.: cbocuzzi@cgsh.com, maofiling@cgsh.com
Ms. Lisa Bornstein: Bornstein@civilrights.org
Ms. Hannah Y.S. Chanoine: hchanoine@mayerbrown.com
Mr. Kurt Denk: kdenk@kramerlevin.com
Ms. Deborah Jane Dewart: debcpalaw@earthlink.net
Mr. Jefferson Downing: jd@keatinglaw.com
Ms. Nathalie F.P. Gilfoyle: Ngilfoyle@apa.org
Ms. Marcia D. Greenberger: mgreenberger@nwlc.org
Jacquelynn M. Hamilton: jhamilton@morganlewis.com
Mr. Wade Henderson: beecham@civilrights.org
Mr. Matthew Michael Hoffman: mhoffman@goodwinprocter.com
Ms. Catherine L Hoge: choge@kramerlevin.com
Mr. Andrew S. Hudson: ahudson@ftc.gov
Mr. Colin Jorgensen: colin.jorgensen@arkansasag.gov, johnna.hoffman@arkansasag.gov, agcivil@arkansasag.gov
Mr. Lawrence John Joseph: ljoseph@larryjoseph.com
Mr. Richard Brian Katskee: rkatskee@mayerbrown.com
Ms. Ayesha N Khan: khanayeshan@gmail.com
Kimberley E. Lunetta: klunetta@morganlewis.com
Ms. Angela M. Mann: angela@wagonerlawfirm.com, niki@wagonerlawfirm.com
Ms. Susan Baker Manning: susan.manning@morganlewis.com, erika.tillery@bingham.com
Ms. Cheryl Kathleen Maples: ckmaples@aol.com
Ms. Emily Martin: emartin@nwlc.org
Ms. Mary Elizabeth McAlister: court@lc.org
Mr. Thomas McCarty: tmccarty@keatinglaw.com
Mr. Jim McCormack, Clerk of Court: ared_appeals@ared.uscourts.gov
Mr. Horatio Gabriel Mihet: hmihet@lc.org, court@lc.org
Mr. Jason Moff: jmoff@kramerlevin.com
Jawad Muaddi: jawad.muaddi@morganlewis.com
Mr. Thomas E. Nanney: tom.nanney@bryancave.com, gmbenedict@bryancave.com, mafosdick@bryancave.com
Ms. Miriam Nemetz: mnemetz@mayerbrown.com
Mr. R. Keith Pike: keith@pikefirm.com
Adam P. Romero: romero@law.ucla.edu
Mr. Charles Alan Rothfeld: crothfeld@mayerbrown.com, wdc.docket@mayerbrown.com
Mr. Pratik A. Shah: pshah@akingump.com, ahicks@akingump.com
Mr. Benjamin G. Shatz: bshatz@manatt.com, ben_shatz@yahoo.com
Mr. Norman Simon: nsimon@kramerlevin.com
Mr. Paul March Smith: psmith@jenner.com
Ms. Diane M. Soubly: dsoubly@skalaw.com
Ms. Anita Staver: court@lc.org
Mr. Mathew D. Staver: court@lc.org
Ms. Catherine Emily Stetson: cate.stetson@hoganlovells.com, nymanagingclerk@hoganlovells.com
Mr. Jeffrey S. Trachtman: jtrachtman@kramerlevin.com, cduffield@kramerlevin.com, dschumeister@kramerlevin.com, docketing@kramerlevin.com
Mr. Jack Wagoner, III: jack@wagonerlawfirm.com, niki@wagonerlawfirm.com
Mr. Brian C. Walsh: brian.walsh@bryancave.com
Ms. Jessica Weisel: jweisel@akingump.com, ssteiner@akingump.com
Michael L. Whitlock: michael.whitlock@morganlewis.com
Ms. Mary Helen Wimberly: mary.wimberly@hoganlovells.com

Lois Law: FED08@loislaw.com
MO Lawyers Weekly: stephanie.maniscalco@molawyersmedia.com
West Publishing: us08@westdcs.west.thomson.com

Mr. Alexander Joseph Luchenitser: luchenitser@au.org, alexjluch@yahoo.com, scott@au.org (*daily summary*)

Notice will be mailed to:

Grant A. Bermann
CLEARY & GOTTLIEB
One Liberty Plaza
New York, NY 10006-0000

Mr. Gerard Bradley
NOTRE DAME LAW SCHOOL
3156 Eck Hall
Notre Dame, IN 46556

Ms. Katherine J. Duncan
HOGAN & LOVELLS
Columbia Square
555 13th Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20004-0000

Aderson Francois
HOWARD UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW CIVIL RIGHTS CLINIC
2400 Sixth Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20059

Ms. Madeline H. Gitomer
HOGAN & LOVELLS
Columbia Square
555 13th Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20004-0000

Elizabeth Johnston
NATIONAL WOMEN'S LAW CENTER
Suite 800
11 Dupont Circle
Washington, DC 20036-0000

Mr. Daniel McNeel Lane, Jr.
AKIN & GUMP
1500 National Bank Plaza
300 Convent Street
San Antonio, TX 78205-0000

Mark A. Lightner
CLEARY & GOTTLIEB
One Liberty Plaza
New York, NY 10006-0000

Ms. Lori Alvino McGill
QUINN & EMANUEL
11th Floor
777 Sixth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20001-3706

Mr. Aaron Panner
KELLOGG & HUBER
Suite 400
1615 M Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20036-3209

Brad Seiling
MANATT & PHELPS
11355 W. Olympic Boulevard
Los Angeles, CA 90064-0000

Mr. Kevin Snider
PACIFIC JUSTICE INSTITUTE
Suite 208
212 Ninth Street
Oakland, CA 94607

Ms. Erica Songer

HOGAN & LOVELLS
Columbia Square
555 13th Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20004-0000

Mr. Geoffrey Stone
UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO LAW SCHOOL
1111 E. 60th Street
Chicago, IL 60637

The following document(s) are associated with this transaction:

Document Description: Opinion filed

Original Filename: 151022P.pdf

Electronic Document Stamp:

[STAMP acecfStamp_ID=1105112566 [Date=08/11/2015] [FileNumber=4304552-0]

[904fa268adfa8c044e70dc802162d74fd4f94a845b52fe7831d2e0016d5096dd5541ee40dd8157597318241b163acebc17fc802e72b2d44e3622fe6a26820593]]

Document Description: Letter To Publishing

Original Filename: /opt/ACECF/live/forms/ltobias_151022_4304552_LettersToPublishing_284.pdf

Electronic Document Stamp:

[STAMP acecfStamp_ID=1105112566 [Date=08/11/2015] [FileNumber=4304552-1]

[5fe31ffc1ce2d6362ea07f97c772a612319d7c85afee7cbe4c77ccf518b7edda0f33788d6ec638ad8a1ef2961728925b0f82b05b20e9c3b5a067a07c22170617]]

Recipients:

- [Lois Law](#)
- [MO Lawyers Weekly](#)
- [West Publishing](#)

Document Description: Counsel Opinion Letter

Original Filename: /opt/ACECF/live/forms/ltobias_151022_4304552_CounselOpinionLetters_285.pdf

Electronic Document Stamp:

[STAMP acecfStamp_ID=1105112566 [Date=08/11/2015] [FileNumber=4304552-2]

[41030d39d8d694c0536e9faa32ce3c722cdd1ba7d199c2d7bce2ea8edd92c7e4c6cfea157aef9cc0fb9170e2b9addf91f88fccdd2954b740163f9a38a36d6369]]

Recipients:

- [Ms. Michelle Ben-David](#)
- [Grant A. Bermann](#)
- [Ms. Carmine D Boccuzzi, Jr.](#)
- [Ms. Lisa Bornstein](#)
- [Mr. Gerard Bradley](#)
- [Ms. Hannah Y.S. Chanoine](#)
- [Mr. Kurt Denk](#)
- [Ms. Deborah Jane Dewart](#)
- [Mr. Jefferson Downing](#)
- [Ms. Katherine J. Duncan](#)
- [Aderson Francois](#)
- [Ms. Nathalie F.P. Gilfoyle](#)
- [Ms. Madeline H. Gitomer](#)
- [Ms. Marcia D. Greenberger](#)
- [Jacquelynne M. Hamilton](#)
- [Mr. Wade Henderson](#)
- [Mr. Matthew Michael Hoffman](#)
- [Ms. Catherine L Hoge](#)
- [Mr. Andrew S. Hudson](#)
- [Elizabeth Johnston](#)
- [Mr. Colin Jorgensen](#)
- [Mr. Lawrence John Joseph](#)
- [Mr. Richard Brian Katskee](#)
- [Ms. Ayesha N Khan](#)
- [Mr. Daniel McNeel Lane, Jr.](#)
- [Mark A. Lightner](#)
- [Mr. Alexander Joseph Luchenitser](#)
- [Kimberley E. Lunetta](#)
- [Ms. Angela M. Mann](#)
- [Ms. Susan Baker Manning](#)
- [Ms. Cheryl Kathleen Maples](#)
- [Ms. Emily Martin](#)
- [Ms. Mary Elizabeth McAlister](#)
- [Mr. Thomas McCarty](#)
- [Mr. Jim McCormack, Clerk of Court](#)
- [Ms. Lori Alvino McGill](#)
- [Mr. Horatio Gabriel Mihet](#)
- [Mr. Jason Moff](#)
- [Jawad Muaddi](#)
- [Mr. Thomas E. Nanney](#)
- [Ms. Miriam Nemetz](#)

- [Mr. Aaron Panner](#)
- [Mr. R. Keith Pike](#)
- [Adam P. Romero](#)
- [Mr. Charles Alan Rothfeld](#)
- [Brad Seiling](#)
- [Mr. Pratik A. Shah](#)
- [Mr. Benjamin G. Shatz](#)
- [Mr. Norman Simon](#)
- [Mr. Paul March Smith](#)
- [Mr. Kevin Snider](#)
- [Ms. Erica Songer](#)
- [Ms. Diane M. Soubly](#)
- [Ms. Anita Staver](#)
- [Mr. Mathew D. Staver](#)
- [Ms. Catherine Emily Stetson](#)
- [Mr. Geoffrey Stone](#)
- [Mr. Jeffrey S. Trachtman](#)
- [Mr. Jack Wagoner, III](#)
- [Mr. Brian C. Walsh](#)
- [Ms. Jessica Weisel](#)
- [Michael L. Whitlock](#)
- [Ms. Mary Helen Wimberly](#)

The following information is for the use of court personnel:

DOCKET ENTRY ID: 4304552

RELIEF(S) DOCKETED:

for publication

DOCKET PART(S) ADDED: 5363118, 5363119, 5363120