

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:17-cv-07661-AJN**

S. et al v. The City of New York  
Assigned to: Judge Alison J. Nathan  
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses (Settlement)  
Cause: 42:12101 The Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990

Date Filed: 10/06/2017  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 446 Civil Rights:  
Americans with Disabilities – Other  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Josefina S.**

represented by **Alexa B Lutchen**  
Davis Polk & Wardwell LLP (NYC)  
450 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10017  
(212)–450–3270  
Email: [alexa.lutchen@davispolk.com](mailto:alexa.lutchen@davispolk.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Cindy Siyao McNair**  
Davis Polk & Wardwell LLP (NYC)  
450 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10017  
(212)–450–4160  
Email: [cindy.mcnair@davispolk.com](mailto:cindy.mcnair@davispolk.com)  
**TERMINATED: 09/19/2019**  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**

**Dara Lynn Sheinfeld**  
Davis Polk & Wardwell LLP (NYC)  
450 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10017  
(212)–450–3622  
Fax: (212)–450–5536  
Email: [dara.sheinfeld@davispolk.com](mailto:dara.sheinfeld@davispolk.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Iris Hsiao**  
Mintz Levin Cohn Ferris Glovsky & Popeo  
PC  
666 Third Avenue  
Ste 30th Flr.  
New York, NY 10017  
212–935–3000  
Fax: 212–983–3141  
Email: [IHsiao@mintz.com](mailto:IHsiao@mintz.com)  
**TERMINATED: 04/30/2019**  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**

**Jane Greengold Stevens**  
New York Legal Assistance Group  
7 Hanover Square, 7th Floor  
New York, NY 10004  
(212) 613–5031  
Fax: (212) 750–0820  
Email: [jstevens@nylag.org](mailto:jstevens@nylag.org)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Sharon Katz**

Davis Polk & Wardwell LLP (NYC)  
450 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10017  
212-450-4000  
Fax: 212-450-3508  
Email: [skatz@dpw.com](mailto:skatz@dpw.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Anne Jois**  
New York Legal Assistance Group  
7 Hanover Square  
New York, NY 10004  
(212)-613-5093  
Fax: (212)-714-7575  
Email: [ejois@nylag.org](mailto:ejois@nylag.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Katelyn Trionfetti Wolfgang**  
Davis Polk & Wardwell LLP (NYC)  
450 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10017  
212-450-4000  
Fax: 212-701-5800  
Email: [katelyn.wolfgang@davispolk.com](mailto:katelyn.wolfgang@davispolk.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Meredith Mckinley Manning**  
Davis Polk & Wardwell LLP (NYC)  
450 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10017  
(914)-384-3792  
Email: [meredith.manning@davispolk.com](mailto:meredith.manning@davispolk.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Thalia Julme**  
New York Legal Assistance Group  
7 Hanover Square, 7th Floor  
New York, NY 10004  
(718)-564-9241  
Email: [thalia.julme@gmail.com](mailto:thalia.julme@gmail.com)  
*TERMINATED: 08/02/2019*

**James H.R. Windels**  
Davis Polk & Wardwell LLP (NYC)  
450 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10017  
(212) 450-4000  
Email: [james.windels@dpw.com](mailto:james.windels@dpw.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Deaja D.**

represented by **Alexa B Lutchen**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Cindy Siyao McNair**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/19/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Dara Lynn Sheinfeld**  
(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Iris Hsiao**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 04/30/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jane Greengold Stevens**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sharon Katz**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Anne Jois**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Katelyn Trionfetti Wolfgang**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Meredith Mckinley Manning**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Thalia Julme**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/02/2019*

**James H.R. Windels**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Cynthia Q.**

represented by **Alexa B Lutchen**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Cindy Siyao McNair**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/19/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Dara Lynn Sheinfeld**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Iris Hsiao**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 04/30/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jane Greengold Stevens**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sharon Katz**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Anne Jois**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Katelyn Trionfetti Wolfgang**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Meredith Mckinley Manning**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Thalia Julme**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/02/2019*

**James H.R. Windels**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Shantell S.**

represented by **Alexa B Lutchen**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Cindy Siyao McNair**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/19/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Dara Lynn Sheinfeld**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Iris Hsiao**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 04/30/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jane Greengold Stevens**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sharon Katz**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Anne Jois**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Katelyn Trionfetti Wolfgang**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Meredith Mckinley Manning**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Thalia Julme**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/02/2019*

**James H.R. Windels**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Bianca M.**  
*on behalf of themselves and all others  
similarly situated*

represented by **Alexa B Lutchen**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Cindy Siyao McNair**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/19/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Dara Lynn Sheinfeld**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Iris Hsiao**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 04/30/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jane Greengold Stevens**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sharon Katz**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Anne Jois**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Katelyn Trionfetti Wolfgang**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Meredith Mckinley Manning**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Thalia Julme**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/02/2019*

**James H.R. Windels**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**The City of New York**

represented by **Elizabeth Edmonds**  
Nyc Law Department  
100 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 788-0860  
Fax: (212) 788-8877  
Email: [eedmonds@law.nyc.gov](mailto:eedmonds@law.nyc.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Evan Robert Schnittman**  
Martin Clearwater & Bell LLP  
220 East 42nd Street  
New York, NY 10017  
212-916-0931  
Email: [evan.schnittman@mcblaw.com](mailto:evan.schnittman@mcblaw.com)  
**TERMINATED: 01/30/2019**  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**

**Lesley Berson Mbaye**  
New York City Law Department  
100 Church Street Room 6-188  
New York, NY 10007  
(212)-788-0408  
Fax: (212)-788-0940  
Email: [lmbaye@law.nyc.gov](mailto:lmbaye@law.nyc.gov)  
**TERMINATED: 09/19/2019**  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**

**Rosemary Yogiaveetil**  
City of New York Law Department  
100 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
212-356-0877  
Email: [ryogiave@law.nyc.gov](mailto:ryogiave@law.nyc.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Son K. Le**  
New York City Law Department  
100 Church Street, 4th Floor  
New York, NY 10007  
212 356-3556  
Fax: 212 356-2509  
Email: [sle@law.nyc.gov](mailto:sle@law.nyc.gov)  
**TERMINATED: 09/19/2019**  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**

**Agnetha Elizabeth Jacob**  
New York City Law Department  
100 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
212-356-0881  
Fax: 212-788-0940  
Email: [ajacob@law.nyc.gov](mailto:ajacob@law.nyc.gov)  
**TERMINATED: 12/21/2018**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
------------	---	-------------

10/06/2017	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against The City of New York. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number 0208-14216074) Document filed by Shantell S., Josefina S., Cynthia Q., Deaja D., Bianca M..(Windels, James) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Windels, James) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/06/2017	<u>3</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to The City of New York c/o Corporation Counsel, re: <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
10/10/2017		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above-entitled action is assigned to Judge Alison J. Nathan. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District</a> . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php</a> . (kl) (Entered: 10/10/2017)
10/10/2017		Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php</a> . (kl) (Entered: 10/10/2017)
10/10/2017		Case Designated ECF. (kl) (Entered: 10/10/2017)
10/10/2017	<u>4</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to The City of New York. (kl) (Entered: 10/10/2017)
10/12/2017	<u>5</u>	NOTICE OF INITIAL PRETRIAL CONFERENCE: Initial Conference set for 1/26/2018 at 02:45 PM in Courtroom 906, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Alison J. Nathan. Parties ordered to submit via ECF proposed case management plan and joint letter seven days before conference, as further set forth in this order. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 10/12/2017) (jwh) (Entered: 10/12/2017)
10/16/2017	<u>6</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons in a Civil Action, Complaint, Civil Cover Sheet, Individual Practice in Civil Cases of Judge Alison J. Nathan and Electronic Case Filing Rules & Instructions served on The City of New York c/o Corporation Counsel on 10/10/2017. Service was accepted by Betty Mazyck, Authorized Agent. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 10/16/2017)
10/16/2017	<u>7</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jane Greengold Stevens on behalf of Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Stevens, Jane) (Entered: 10/16/2017)
10/16/2017	<u>8</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Thalia Julme on behalf of Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Julme, Thalia) (Entered: 10/16/2017)
10/17/2017	<u>9</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Elizabeth Anne Jois on behalf of Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Jois, Elizabeth) (Entered: 10/17/2017)
10/17/2017	<u>10</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by James H.R. Windels on behalf of Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 10/17/2017)
10/17/2017	<u>11</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Sharon Katz on behalf of Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Katz, Sharon) (Entered: 10/17/2017)
10/17/2017	<u>12</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Iris Hsiao on behalf of Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Hsiao, Iris) (Entered: 10/17/2017)
10/17/2017	<u>13</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Alexa B Lutchen on behalf of Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Lutchen, Alexa) (Entered: 10/17/2017)
10/17/2017	<u>14</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Dara Lynn Sheinfeld on behalf of Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Sheinfeld, Dara) (Entered: 10/17/2017)
10/18/2017	<u>15</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Cindy Siyao McNair on behalf of Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (McNair, Cindy) (Entered: 10/18/2017)

10/25/2017	<u>16</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Lesley Berson Mbaye on behalf of The City of New York. (Mbaye, Lesley) (Entered: 10/25/2017)
10/26/2017	<u>17</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Evan Robert Schnittman on behalf of The City of New York. (Schnittman, Evan) (Entered: 10/26/2017)
10/26/2017	<u>18</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Notice of Initial Pretrial Conference and Judge Alison J. Nathan's Individual Practices in Civil Cases served on Lesley Mbaye and Evan Schnittman on October 26, 2017. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 10/26/2017)
10/27/2017	<u>19</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>a response to the Complaint</i> addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from Lesley Berson Mbaye and Evan Robert Schnittman dated October 27, 2017. Document filed by The City of New York.(Mbaye, Lesley) (Entered: 10/27/2017)
10/30/2017	<u>20</u>	ORDER granting <u>19</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 10/30/2017) (mml) (Entered: 10/30/2017)
10/30/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: The City of New York answer due 11/30/2017. (mml) (Entered: 10/30/2017)
11/27/2017	<u>21</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>1</u> Complaint addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from Lesley Berson Mbaye and Evan Robert Schnittman dated November 27, 2017. Document filed by The City of New York.(Mbaye, Lesley) (Entered: 11/27/2017)
11/27/2017	<u>22</u>	ORDER: granting <u>21</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply. SO ORDERED. The City of New York answer due 1/2/2018. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 11/27/2017) (ama) Modified on 11/27/2017 (ama). (Entered: 11/27/2017)
11/27/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: The City of New York answer due 1/2/2018. (ama) (Entered: 11/27/2017)
12/05/2017	<u>23</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Katelyn Trionfetti Wolfgang on behalf of Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Wolfgang, Katelyn) (Entered: 12/05/2017)
01/02/2018	<u>24</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by The City of New York.(Schnittman, Evan) (Entered: 01/02/2018)
01/19/2018	<u>25</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan dated January 19, 2018 re: Pre-Trial Conference. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Case Management Plan)(Windels, James) (Entered: 01/19/2018)
01/19/2018	<u>26</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from James H.R. Windels dated January 19, 2018 re: Appearances at Pretrial Conference. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(Windels, James) (Entered: 01/19/2018)
01/22/2018	<u>27</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>26</u> Letter filed by Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Deaja D., Josefina S., Shantell S. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 1/22/2018) (cf) (Entered: 01/22/2018)
01/22/2018	<u>28</u>	STIPULATION AND PROTECTIVE ORDER...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material...So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 1/22/18) (yv) (Entered: 01/22/2018)
01/25/2018	<u>29</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from James H.R. Windels dated January 19, 2018 re: /Corrected Joint Pretrial Conference Letter Providing Information Requested by the Court in its October 12, 2017 Notice of Initial Pretrial Conference. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> [Proposed] Case Management Plan)(Windels, James) (Entered: 01/25/2018)
01/29/2018	<u>30</u>	CIVIL CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN AND SCHEDULING ORDER: All parties do not consent to conducting all further proceedings before a United States Magistrate Judge, including motions and trial pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 636(c). Depositions due by 10/12/2018. Expert Deposition due by 1/28/2019. Fact Discovery due by 12/14/2018.



		Expert Discovery due by 1/28/2019. Case Management Conference set for 1/11/2019 at 02:00 PM before Judge Alison J. Nathan. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 1/26/2018) (mml) (Entered: 01/29/2018)
01/29/2018		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Alison J. Nathan. Initial Pretrial Conference held on 1/26/2018. See transcript for complete details. (Court Reporter Paula Speer) (qs) (Entered: 01/29/2018)
02/13/2018	<u>31</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 1/26/2018 before Judge Alison J. Nathan. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Paula Speer, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 3/6/2018. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 3/16/2018. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 5/14/2018.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 02/13/2018)
02/13/2018	<u>32</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 1/26/18 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 02/13/2018)
02/23/2018	<u>33</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>concerning discovery and settlement issues raised at the Initial Pretrial Conference</i> Document filed by The City of New York.(Mbaye, Lesley) (Entered: 02/23/2018)
02/23/2018	<u>34</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from Katelyn Trionfetti Wolfgang dated February 23, 2018 re: The Court's Order to the Parties to Submit Letters by February 23, 2018, to Address a Stay of Discovery for Settlement. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(Wolfgang, Katelyn) (Entered: 02/23/2018)
03/27/2018	<u>35</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Agnetha Elizabeth Jacob on behalf of The City of New York. (Jacob, Agnetha) (Entered: 03/27/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>36</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from James H. R. Windels dated September 28, 2018 re: Parties' Proposed Briefing Schedule. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>37</u>	MOTION to Certify Class . Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>38</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class . . Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>39</u>	DECLARATION of Josefina S. in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>40</u>	DECLARATION of Deaja D. in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>41</u>	DECLARATION of Cynthia Q. in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>42</u>	DECLARATION of Shantell S. in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>43</u>	DECLARATION of Bianca M. in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)

09/28/2018	<u>44</u>	DECLARATION of Michelle Burrell in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>45</u>	DECLARATION of Michele Cortese in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>46</u>	DECLARATION of Emma Ketteringham, Esq. in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: January 12, 2016 letter from Joseph Cardieri)(Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>47</u>	DECLARATION of Donald Lash in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
09/28/2018	<u>48</u>	DECLARATION of Lauren Shapiro, Esq. in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 09/28/2018)
10/02/2018	<u>49</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>36</u> Letter filed by Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Deaja D., Josefina S., Shantell S. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. ( Responses due by 11/20/2018, Replies due by 12/20/2018.) (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 10/2/2018) (mro) (Entered: 10/02/2018)
11/16/2018	<u>50</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to complete briefing on Plaintiffs' <u>37</u> motion for class certification</i> addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from Agnetha E. Jacob dated 11/16/2018. Document filed by The City of New York.(Jacob, Agnetha) (Entered: 11/16/2018)
11/21/2018	<u>51</u>	ORDER granting <u>50</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. The deadline for Defendant to file its opposition to Plaintiffs' motion to class certification is hereby adjourned to January 31, 2019, and the deadline for Plaintiffs to reply is adjourned to March 4, 2019. No further extensions will be granted. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 11/21/2018) (ne) (Entered: 11/21/2018)
11/21/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines as to <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class. Responses due by 1/31/2019, Replies due by 3/4/2019. (ne) (Entered: 11/21/2018)
12/10/2018	<u>52</u>	LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Motion to Withdraw as Counsel of Record <i>for Defendant</i> addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from Agnetha E. Jacob dated 12/10/2018. Document filed by The City of New York.(Jacob, Agnetha) (Entered: 12/10/2018)
12/11/2018	<u>53</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Son K. Le on behalf of The City of New York. (Le, Son) (Entered: 12/11/2018)
12/12/2018	<u>54</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from James H.R. Windels dated December 12, 2018. Document filed by Josefina S..(Windels, James) (Entered: 12/12/2018)
12/13/2018	<u>55</u>	ORDER granting <u>54</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery. The parties' request for extensions of the deadlines for fact and expert discovery to April 15, 2019, and May 30, 2019, respectively, is hereby granted. No further extensions will be granted. The conference currently scheduled for January 11, 2019, is adjourned to May 17, 2019, at 3:00 p.m. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 12/13/2018) (cf) (Entered: 12/13/2018)
12/13/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: (Expert Discovery due by 5/30/2019., Fact Discovery due by 4/15/2019.), Set/Reset Hearings: (Case Management Conference set for 5/17/2019 at 03:00 PM before Judge Alison J. Nathan.) (cf) (Entered: 12/13/2018)
12/21/2018	<u>56</u>	ORDER granting <u>52</u> Letter Motion for Leave to File Document. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 12/21/2018) (jca) (Entered: 12/21/2018)
12/26/2018	<u>57</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Elizabeth Edmonds on behalf of The City of New York. (Edmonds, Elizabeth) (Entered: 12/26/2018)

01/28/2019	<u>58</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>until February 8, 2019 for Defendant to Oppose Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification</i> addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from Elizabeth Edmonds dated January 28, 2019. Document filed by The City of New York.(Edmonds, Elizabeth) (Entered: 01/28/2019)
01/29/2019	<u>59</u>	MOTION for Evan Schnittman to Withdraw as Attorney <i>for defendant the City of New York</i> . Document filed by The City of New York.(Schnittman, Evan) (Entered: 01/29/2019)
01/29/2019	<u>60</u>	DECLARATION of Evan Schnittman in Support re: <u>59</u> MOTION for Evan Schnittman to Withdraw as Attorney <i>for defendant the City of New York..</i> Document filed by The City of New York. (Schnittman, Evan) (Entered: 01/29/2019)
01/30/2019	<u>61</u>	ORDER granting <u>58</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. SO ORDERED. No further extensions. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 1/30/2019) (kv) (Entered: 01/30/2019)
01/30/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 2/8/2019 Replies due by 3/12/2019. (kv) (Entered: 01/30/2019)
01/30/2019	<u>62</u>	ORDER granting <u>59</u> Motion to Withdraw as Attorney. SO ORDERED. Attorney Evan Robert Schnittman terminated. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 1/30/2019) (kv) (Entered: 01/30/2019)
02/08/2019	<u>63</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class . . Document filed by The City of New York. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Roslyn Norrell–Fleming in Support of Defendant's Opposition to Class Certification, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Nancy Thomson in Support of Defendant's Opposition to Class Certification)(Edmonds, Elizabeth) (Entered: 02/08/2019)
02/21/2019	<u>64</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU –</b> FIRST LETTER MOTION for Discovery addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from Jane Greengold Stevens dated February 21, 2019. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit)(Julme, Thalia) Modified on 3/12/2019 (db). (Entered: 02/21/2019)
02/26/2019	<u>65</u>	ORDER granting <u>64</u> Letter Motion for Discovery. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 2/26/2019) (kv) (Entered: 02/26/2019)
02/26/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Deposition due by 2/27/2019. (kv) (Entered: 02/26/2019)
03/12/2019	<u>66</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class . . Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Windels, James) (Entered: 03/12/2019)
03/12/2019	<u>67</u>	DECLARATION of Sharon Katz in Support re: <u>37</u> MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A–The American with Disabilities Act (ADA) Procedure, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B–Foster Care Quality Assurance Standards, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C–Jackson Deposition Transcript Excerpts, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D–Ovadek Deposition Transcript Excerpts, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E–McLeod Deposition Transcript Excerpts, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F–Louallen Deposition Transcript Excerpts, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G–Shapiro (Brooklyn Defender Services) Declaration, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H–Ketteringham (Bronx Defenders) Declaration, # <u>9</u> Exhibit I–Burrell (Neighborhood Defender Service of Harlem) Declaration, # <u>10</u> Exhibit J–Cortese (Center for Family Representation) Declaration, # <u>11</u> Exhibit K–Lash (Sinergia) Declaration, # <u>12</u> Exhibit L–Shantell S. Declaration, # <u>13</u> Exhibit M–Josefina S. Declaration, # <u>14</u> Exhibit N–Deaja D. Declaration, # <u>15</u> Exhibit O–Cynthia Q. Declaration, # <u>16</u> Exhibit P–Bianca M. Declaration)(Windels, James) (Entered: 03/12/2019)
04/01/2019	<u>68</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery <i>until August 15, 2019</i> addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from Elizabeth Edmonds dated April 1, 2019. Document filed by The City of New York.(Edmonds, Elizabeth) (Entered: 04/01/2019)
04/08/2019	<u>69</u>	ORDER granting <u>68</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery. The deadlines for fact and expert discovery are hereby extended to August 15, 2019, and September 27, 2019, respectively. The case management conference currently

		scheduled for May 17, 2019, is rescheduled to September 20, 2019, at 3:00 p.m. Absent extraordinary circumstances, no further extensions will be granted. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 4/5/2019) (kv) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/08/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: ( Expert Discovery due by 9/27/2019., Fact Discovery due by 8/15/2019.), Set/Reset Hearings:( Case Management Conference set for 9/20/2019 at 03:00 PM before Judge Alison J. Nathan.) (kv) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/26/2019	<u>70</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from Iris Hsiao dated April 26, 2019 re: Withdrawing as Counsel of Record for Plaintiffs. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(Hsiao, Iris) (Entered: 04/26/2019)
04/30/2019	<u>71</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>70</u> Letter filed by Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Deaja D., Josefina S., Shantell S.. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. Attorney Iris Hsiao terminated. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 4/30/2019) (kv) (Entered: 04/30/2019)
06/11/2019	<u>72</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from James H.R. Windels dated June 11, 2019 re: Advising the Court that Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification has been Fully Briefed for 90 Days. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(Windels, James) (Entered: 06/11/2019)
07/29/2019	<u>73</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY</b> – FIRST MOTION for Thalia Julme to Withdraw as Attorney . Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(Julme, Thalia) Modified on 9/30/2019 (db). (Entered: 07/29/2019)
08/02/2019	<u>74</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT granting <u>73</u> FIRST MOTION for Thalia Julme to Withdraw as Attorney. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. Attorney Thalia Julme terminated. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 8/2/2019) (jca) (Entered: 08/02/2019)
08/08/2019	<u>75</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from James H.R. Windels dated August 8, 2019. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(Windels, James) (Entered: 08/08/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>76</u>	ORDER granting <u>75</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery. The deadlines for fact and expert discovery are hereby extended to September 5, 2019 and October 18, 2019 respectively. No further extensions will be granted. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 8/9/2019) (kv) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Expert Discovery due by 10/18/2019. Fact Discovery due by 9/5/2019. (kv) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
09/09/2019	<u>77</u>	ORDER: According to the Court's April 8, 2019, order in the above-captioned matter, a post-discovery status conference is scheduled for September 20, 2019. In light of this deadline, it is hereby ORDERED that by September 13, 2019, the parties shall meet and confer and submit a joint letter to the Court. The joint letter shall: as further set forth in this Order. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 9/9/2019) (kv) (Entered: 09/10/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>78</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>Joint Letter on the Status of Discovery, Settlement, Summary Judgment Motions, and Proposed Trial Dates</i> Document filed by The City of New York.(Edmonds, Elizabeth) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/17/2019	<u>79</u>	NOTICE of Substitution of Attorney. Old Attorney: Lesley Berson Mbaye and Son K. Le, New Attorney: Rosemary C. Yogiaveetil, Address: New York City Law Department, 100 Church Street, Room 2-168, New York, New York, 10007, 212-356-0877. Document filed by The City of New York. (Yogiaveetil, Rosemary) (Entered: 09/17/2019)
09/17/2019	<u>80</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from Cindy S. McNair dated September 16, 2019 re: Withdrawing as Counsel of Record. Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(McNair, Cindy) (Entered: 09/17/2019)

09/17/2019	<u>81</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Meredith Mckinley Manning on behalf of Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S.. (Manning, Meredith) (Entered: 09/17/2019)
09/19/2019	<u>82</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>80</u> Letter filed by Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Deaja D., Josefina S., Shantell S. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. Attorney Cindy Siyao McNair terminated. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 9/18/2019) (cf) (Entered: 09/19/2019)
09/19/2019	<u>83</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>79</u> Notice of Substitution of Attorney, filed by The City of New York. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. Attorney Rosemary Yogiaveetil for The City of New York added. Attorney Son K. Le and Lesley Berson Mbaye terminated. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 9/18/2019) (jca) (Entered: 09/19/2019)
09/23/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Alison J. Nathan. Scheduling conference held. Referral to Magistrate Judge Moses for settlement entered. See transcript for complete details. (Court Reporter Kelly Surina) (qs) (Entered: 09/23/2019)
09/23/2019	<u>84</u>	ORDER OF REFERENCE TO A MAGISTRATE JUDGE. Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for Settlement. Referred to Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 9/20/2019) (kv) (Entered: 09/23/2019)
09/24/2019	<u>85</u>	ORDER denying <u>37</u> Motion to Certify Class. As stated on the record in the conference on September 20, 2019, the deadline for the completion of expert discovery is hereby adjourned to November 18, 2019. Plaintiffs' pending motion to certify a class is also hereby administratively denied with leave to refile. The parties shall file a joint letter on or before November 1, 2019, providing the Court with a status update and indicating whether Plaintiffs intend to refile their class certification motion at that time. If Plaintiffs do intend to refile their motion, they shall file a notice of motion on the public docket, and the Court will rely on the parties' motion papers previously filed electronically, see Dkt. Nos. 37-48, 63, 66-67, and the courtesy copies previously mailed to Chambers. The Clerk of Court is ordered to terminate the motion to certify a class at Dkt. No. 37. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 9/23/2019) (rro) Modified on 9/26/2019 (rro). Modified on 9/26/2019 (rro). (Entered: 09/24/2019)
09/24/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Expert Discovery due by 11/18/2019. (rro) (Entered: 09/24/2019)
10/02/2019	<u>86</u>	ORDER SCHEDULING SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE: A settlement conference is scheduled before Magistrate Judge Barbara Moses on Thursday, November 19, 2019, at 2:15 p.m., in Courtroom 20A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007. (As further set forth in this Order.) Neither the scheduling of a settlement conference nor any adjournment affects the parties' other litigation deadlines or obligations. (Settlement Conference set for 11/19/2019 at 02:15 PM in Courtroom 20A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses.) (Signed by Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses on 10/2/2019) (cf) (Entered: 10/02/2019)
10/31/2019	<u>87</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to complete expert discovery, as the parties continue to have productive settlement discussions</i> addressed to Judge Alison J. Nathan from Elizabeth Edmonds dated October 31, 2019. Document filed by The City of New York.(Edmonds, Elizabeth) (Entered: 10/31/2019)
11/01/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Expert Discovery due by 1/2/2020. (ks) (Entered: 11/01/2019)
11/01/2019	<u>88</u>	ORDER granting <u>87</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 11/1/2019) (ks) (Entered: 11/04/2019)
11/12/2019	<u>89</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>sine die, as the parties continue to make progress in settlement discussions</i> addressed to Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses from Elizabeth Edmonds dated November 12, 2019. Document filed by The City of New York.(Edmonds, Elizabeth) (Entered: 11/12/2019)
11/12/2019	<u>90</u>	ORDER granting <u>89</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. Application GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses on 11/12/2019) (kv) (Entered: 11/12/2019)

12/16/2019	<u>91</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>concerning settlement negotiations; the parties continue to make progress</i> Document filed by The City of New York.(Edmonds, Elizabeth) (Entered: 12/16/2019)
12/16/2019	<u>92</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>to Magistrate Judge Moses; settlement negotiations ongoing and fruitful</i> Document filed by The City of New York.(Edmonds, Elizabeth) (Entered: 12/16/2019)
12/19/2019	<u>93</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>92</u> Status Report filed by The City of New York. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Expert Discovery due by 2/17/2020.) (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 12/18/2019) (kv) (Entered: 12/19/2019)
01/30/2020	<u>94</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>Joint Status Update Letter to Judge Nathan Pursuant to the December 19, 2019 Order</i> Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(Windels, James) (Entered: 01/30/2020)
01/30/2020	<u>95</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>Joint Status Update Letter to Judge Moses</i> Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(Windels, James) (Entered: 01/30/2020)
01/31/2020	<u>96</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>95</u> Status Report filed by Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Deaja D., Josefina S., Shantell S. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. The parties shall provide a further status update to Judge Moses no later than March 16, 2020. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses on 1/31/2020) (cf) (Entered: 01/31/2020)
02/03/2020	<u>97</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>94</u> Status Report filed by Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Deaja D., Josefina S., Shantell S. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED., Expert Discovery due by 4/2/2020. (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 1/31/2020) (rj) (Entered: 02/03/2020)
03/16/2020	<u>98</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>Joint Status Update Letter to Judge Nathan Pursuant to the December 19, 2019 Order</i> Document filed by Deaja D., Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Josefina S., Shantell S..(Windels, James) (Entered: 03/16/2020)
03/19/2020	<u>99</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>98</u> Status Report filed by Bianca M., Cynthia Q., Deaja D., Josefina S., Shantell S.. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Expert Discovery due by 5/18/2020.) (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 3/17/2020) (kv) (Entered: 03/19/2020)
04/29/2020	<u>100</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>Joint Status Update to Judge Nathan Pursuant to the March 17, 2020 Order</i> Document filed by The City of New York..(Yogiaveetil, Rosemary) (Entered: 04/29/2020)
05/01/2020	<u>101</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>100</u> STATUS REPORT. <i>Joint Status Update to Judge Nathan Pursuant to the March 17, 2020 Order</i> Document filed by The City of New York. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. (Expert Discovery due by 7/17/2020.) (Signed by Judge Alison J. Nathan on 5/1/2020) (rjm) (Entered: 05/01/2020)